

Comments on "Taylor draft 2.pdf": The History and Composition of the Carnegie *Diplodocus*

Overview

Thank you for creating this initial proof. As always, it's a delightful moment to first see a long-running project in something like its final form.

The list below of changes to be made is a mix of minor errors introduced in typesetting, some that were in the initial submission but have only now become apparent to us, and a small number of (tiny) additions that clarify some matters. But more important than these specifics are four systemic issues, which we will address up front.

Systemic issues

First and most importantly, this manuscript uses and needs three levels of headings to communicate its organization. In the proof PDF, these levels are collapsed, so that we lose the sense of structure. For example, the level-1 heading "Historical background" on page 5 is set like the level-2 headings "Nomenclature" and "Institutional abbreviations" that precede it, giving the impression that this section is part of a very long introduction. A very obvious manifestation occurs on page 15, where the first-level heading "Material in the mounted skeleton" is followed immediately by the second-level heading "The original mount at the Carnegie Museum" typeset in exactly the same way, so we seem to have an empty section. Similarly on page 20, the level-2 heading "Changes made to the mount at the Carnegie Museum" and level-3 heading "Replacement of skull with replica of CM 11161" are adjacent and identically set.

So we ask that each level of heading is set distinctly from the others, and that the structure is followed as shown:

- Introduction
 - Nomenclature
 - Institutional abbreviations
- Historical background
- Material in the mounted skeleton
 - The original mount at the Carnegie Museum
 - Changes made to the mount at the Carnegie Museum
 - Replacement of skull with replica of CM 11161
 - Suspension of neck
 - 1999 replacement of forefeet with CM 662 replicas
 - 2007–2008 refurbishment of the dinosaur exhibition
 - Forefeet WDC-FS001A
 - Forelimb elements from BYU material

- Caudal vertebrae
 - The casts made from the Carnegie molds
- Discussion
 - The length of the Carnegie Diplodocus
 - Documenting skeletal mounts
- Acknowledgments
- Literature Cited

Secondly, the manuscript contains four long quotes, the extent of which we indicated in the submission by indentation. In the present proof, these are typeset as normal paragraphs, so it's impossible to tell where they end. Some typographic convention is needed to mark these out. (We mentioned these individually below.)

Third, it seems that every URL has been expunged from the manuscript. For the single URL in the body text, this leaves behind unintelligible language (as well as contravening one of the reviewer recommendations). But in the references, it's much more severe, as for many of the referenced items the URL is the only way to find the material.

Fourth, and least important, the illustrations often appear quite a long way away from where they are referenced. For example, Figure 10 is referenced on page 10, but does not appear until page 14. We understand that page layout is an art and that many factors are involved, so that illustrations cannot always appear on or next to the page where they are first referenced, but we wonder whether some tightening is possible in this respect?

Specific changes

Page 1, header

"VOL 91, NUMBER1" has no space after "NUMBER".

Page 1, Key Words

A completely new set of keywords has been provided (Ecology, life history, predation, reproduction), none of which is relevant to the content of the paper. Perhaps a template set of keywords were accidentally included? Please reinstate the key words from the submitted manuscript (cast, Carnegie Museum, dinosaur, history, sauropod, skeletal mount).

Page 1, column 1, paragraph 1.

"the eleven casts that were made from its molds used slightly different elements again". Delete "again".

Page 2, caption to Figure 1.

"at Carnegie Museum": insert "the".

Page 2, column 1, paragraph 2.

After "contributes most of the original fossil material to the mount", replace the comma with a semicolon.

Page 2, column 2, paragraph 1.

"as because it was initially installed in St. Petersburg but currently stands in Moscow". Delete "as".

Page 2, column 2, paragraph 1.

New paragraph for "The diplodocine specimen initially designated".

Page 3, caption to Figure 2.

"Olof A. Peterson". Add "(in later years)".

Page 4, caption to Figure 3.

"Cant you buy this for Pittsburgh", transcribed from Carnegie's handwritten note: reinstate the underlining of the word "buy".

Page 4, caption to Figure 3.

"isnt rich -- -- hurry AC", transcribed from Carnegie's handwritten note: put back the removed double-underlined text "get an offer" between the two dashes.

Page 5, column 1, paragraph 5.

"Humboldt Museum für Naturkunde": remove "Humboldt".

Page 5, column 2, paragraph 2.

"Cant you buy this for Pittsburgh", transcribed from Carnegie's handwritten note: reinstate the underlining of the word "buy" (as in the figure caption).

Page 5, column 2, paragraph 2.

"isnt rich -- -- hurry AC", transcribed from Carnegie's handwritten note: put back the removed double-underlined text "get an offer" between the two dashes.

Page 5, column 2, paragraph 2.

"\$10,000 (about \$380,000 today according to)". Reinstall the address of the website used to calculate this, <https://www.in2013dollars.com/> (<https://www.in2013dollars.com/>) -- as requested by one of the reviewers.

Page 6, column 2, paragraph 2.

"In Coggeshall's (1951a:240 version)": insert close parenthesis after "240"

Page 6, column 2, paragraph 4.

"Hatcher's (1901:56–57 diagnosis of the new species)": insert close parenthesis after "57".

Page 7, caption to Figure 6.

"mostly cropped from image field collector William H. Utterback": insert comma after "image".

Page 7, caption to Figure 6.

"sitting at far table, facing left": change "sitting" to "seated"

Page 7, caption to Figure 6.

"sitting on bench": change "sitting" to "seated"

Page 9, column 1, paragraph 1.

New paragraph for "At any rate".

Page 8, column 2, paragraph 2.

From "To produce the plaster dinosaurs" to "were then added to the bones" (the end of the paragraph) is an extended quote from Seneff 1947, and must be typographically distinguished. In the manuscript as submitted, we used indentation, but if the journal has a different typographical convention, that's fine.

Page 9, column 2, paragraph 2.

"20th Century": the word "century" should not be capitalized, it turns out.

Page 11, column 1, paragraph 2.

"The German cast was erected at the Humboldt Museum für Naturkunde". Delete "Humboldt".

Page 12, caption to Figure 9.

In the transcription of Carnegie's handwriting, delete "the" from before "British Museum".

Page 12, column 1, paragraph 1.

"He may have spent some time in Berlin": replace "He" with "Holland".

Page 12, column 2, paragraph 2.

From "It would be just as wise" (the start of the paragraph) to "from your mind" (near the top of the next page) is an extended quote from Holland's letter, and must be typographically distinguished. In the manuscript as submitted, we used indentation, but if the journal has a different typographical convention, that's fine.

Page 13, column 2, paragraph 1.

"at 12% as much": replace "at" with "just".

Page 16, column 2, paragraph 3.

From the heading "*Diplodocus carnegii* Hatcher, 1901" to "partial pes CM 33985" (first paragraph of the next page) is an extended quote from McIntosh 1981, and must be typographically distinguished. In the manuscript as submitted, we used indentation, but if the journal has a different typographical convention, that's fine.

Page 17, column 1, paragraph 2.

"the right "tibia-fibula-pes" of the mounted skeleton was furnished from CM 94,". The final comma should be a period.

Page 17, column 2, paragraph 2.

"chevrons, and left ilium, femur". Delete "and".

Page 18, caption to Figure 12.

And the end of the caption, "than shown in parts B and C". Change to "than in part C".

Page 20, column 1, paragraph 1.

"the left femur and tibia are indeed sculptures". Replace "sculptures" with "not real bone".

Page 21, table row 1 (Skull), column 3 (Changes to mount).

Replace "Maybe 1962" with "between 1912 and 1947"

Page 21, table rows 7, 8 and 9 (caudals), column 3 (Changes to mount).

Append the date "2007" in each cell.

Page 21, table row 21 (Left humerus, radius, ulna), column 3 (Changes to mount).

change "BYU 681 (S)" to "BYU 681/4742, BYU 681/4726, BYU 681/4708 (S), 2007"

Page 21, table row 22 (Right humerus, radius, ulna), column 3 (Changes to mount).

change "BYU 681 (S)" to "BYU 681/4742, BYU 681/4726, BYU 681/4708 (S), 2007"

Page 21, table row 23 (Forefeet), column 3 (Changes to mount).

Replace with "CM 662 (S), 1999; replaced again by WDC-FS001A (S), 2007".

Page 23, column 2, paragraph 2.

"For this reason". Replace with "Nevertheless".

Page 24, column 1, paragraph 1.

New paragraph from "The Smithsonian (National Museum of Natural History)".

Page 24, column 2, paragraph 2.

New paragraph for "Enquiries were made about".

Page 25, caption to Figure 17.

Delete "(CM)" from the end of the caption.

Page 30, column 1, paragraph 4.

"(Fig.e 19)". Delete the stray "e".

Page 30, column 1, paragraph 5.

In the first entry of the list, "Ca1–Ca12: real fossils for CM 84", replace "for" with "from".

Page 30, column 2, paragraph 4.

"Ken Carpenter (in prep.) has noted": replace "in prep." with "pers. comm., 2024"

Page 32, column 1, paragraph 7.

From "The beast turns out to be" to "putting on this long tail" (end of the paragraph, at the top of column 2) is an extended quote from Holland 1904b, and must be typographically distinguished. In the manuscript as submitted, we used indentation, but if the journal has a different typographical convention, that's fine.

Page 33, column 1, paragraph 3.

"in the early to mid 2010s (Fig. 22)": replace "22" with "22A".

Page 33, column 1, paragraph 4.

New paragraph for "Additional posterior caudals". (This list would be more clearly formatted as a bullet list, as in the submitted manuscript, but if the journal formal insists that bullets not be used, that at least separate paragraphs are necessary.)

Page 34, table row 2 (Holland 1904a), column 3 (Length (m)).

Change "21.3" to "23.8".

Page 34, table row 4 (Holland 1904b), column 3 (Length (m)).

Change "21.3" to "23.8".

Page 34, table row 7 (Seneff 1947), column 3 (Length (m)).

Change "23.77" to "23.8" (since we are otherwise converting only with precision of 0.1 of a meter).

Page 35, column 1, paragraph 1.

"Now, six years on". Sadly, "six" must now become "eight"!

Page 25, column 1, paragraph 3.

After "photographs of caudals from the original mount", append "(Fig. 19)".

Page 25, column 1, paragraph 3.

New paragraph for "We thank Ken Carpenter".

Pages 35ff

In all the references, the URLs have been removed. We think this must have been a poorly calibrated automatic process, as it has left us with silly references like "Dystylosaurus reminds you to beware of taking measurements from casts. Sauropod Vertebra Picture of the Week, 4 November 2019. — , archived at ", where both the original URL and the archived URL are absent, but the "archived at phrase" has remained. These URLs are crucial parts of the references, and must be reinstated.

Pages 35ff

In many cases, multiple references have been concatenated together into one. For example, the penultimate paragraph of the whole paper conjoins the references for Wedel 2009, Wedel 2019, and Wilhite 2003.

Because of the systemic problems affecting the references, we have not yet made a thorough effort at proofing them. When we get the next round of proofs, we will review them properly.