

Proofreading notes for *The Concrete Diplodocus of Vernal*

Cover

- Title: set "Diplodocus" in italics

Page 65

- Title: set "Diplodocus" in italics.
- Title: remove "Northeastern Utah", since we now have the second clause.
- Title: "Cultural", not "Cutltural".
- In summary, the title should read read: "The Concrete *Diplodocus* of Vernal—A Cultural Icon of Utah", as on the cover.
- Abstract: in "the Carnegie Museum's iconic Diplodocus", the apostrophe here (""') should be asymmetric (""'") like those elsewhere in the paper.
- Abstract: "The concrete Diplodocus was the museum's icon": *Diplodocus* should be set in italics.
- Abstract: "This cast moved to the Field House's new location in 2004 and was remounted in the atrium." Please move the "was" to before "moved", as follows: "This cast was moved to the Field House's new location in 2004 and remounted in the atrium."
- Heading "NTRODUCTION": should be "INTRODUCTION".
- Introduction: "As described by Taylor and others (in preparation)". This needs to specify "in preparation, a", since there is also a separate "in preparation, b".

Page 66

- Running header (here and on *all* subsequent pages): "Cultural", not "Cutltural".
- "In this paper, we will briefly summarize the history of the original Carnegie *Diplodocus*, discuss how the concrete cast came to be, and consider its legacy." For some reason this is set in a different font from the rest of the paper.
- Figure 1: this image is incorrect. We should be using the one at https://raw.githubusercontent.com/MikeTaylor/palaeo-concrete/master/figures/Figure-1-mounted-Diplodocus-in-2019--IMG_5787.JPG and it should be the full width of the page.
- "As related by Taylor and others (in preparation)". This needs to specify "in preparation, a", since there is also a separate "in preparation, b".

Page 67

- In "(see Taylor and others, in preparation, for details)", that should be "in preparation, a".
- "Buoyed by success of his donation program": please insert "the" before "success".
- Not only had the two remaining skeletons not been donated, the museum was left relatively impoverished". Please insert "but" before "the museum".
- "Whereas Holland had considered". Please reinstate the word "While" at the beginning of this sentence, as "whereas" subtly changes the meaning.

Page 68

- After repeated edits, the second paragraph has become a bit of a mess. I suggest breaking the opening sentence in two as follows: "As recounted by Untermann and Untermann (1971), the genesis of the Utah Field House lay with Arthur G. Nord, supervisor of the Ashley National Forest. In the 1930s, he and others became concerned that the fossil wealth of the Vernal area was being stripped by museums outside the locality."
- "The work was begun on October 16, 1947, completed on July 1, 1948". Please reinstate the "and" between these two clauses. Its removal means that the present version has a false parallelism that reads "The work was [...] the building was dedicated".
- "Writing to museum director Douglas Stewart on 20 September 1922 as follows". Did you want to convert this date to the American format, like the others? I notice several other dates throughout the manuscript that have been left in British format. I have no strong feelings either way about this, but if you want to be consistent throughout then there is more work to be done.

Page 69

- Caption to Figure 2 and elsewhere in the manuscript, you have replaced the phrase "some time" with the word "sometime", which does not mean quite the same thing. Is this something imposed on you by the style guide?
- Caption to Figure 2: please delete "In the middle of the foreground is the mold for a posterior cervical vertebra in ventral view with anterior to the lower left." On re-examining the photo, I am not at all confident about this identification.
- "[...] which then had to be assembled into a skeleton": please change "assembled" to "put together", as there are altogether too many uses of "assembled" in this paragraph.

Page 70

- If it's easy to set Figure 3 to full page width, I think that would be nice. It's the best image we have both of the concrete elements themselves and also the Untermanns, who are really the heroes of this story.
- "Sauropods, like extant tetrapods, habitually hold their necks elevated": replace "hold" with "held".
- "The last time the Carnegie Museum's original molds were used to create a completely new cast". In the manuscript as submitted, this says "complete", which is correct. The change to "completely" alters the meaning and makes the sentence incorrect. Please change back to "complete", as the molds probably *were* used to create some cast elements but not a complete skeleton.
- "Theodore Downs, Curator of Vertebrate Paleontology at the LACM". This is the first use of the abbreviation LACM: perhaps it should be spelled out? "Los Angeles County Museum (LACM)".
- "Tentative plans were already in place for molds to subsequently be used": please insert "the" before "molds".
- "Downs' intention was": please replace with "Downs's".

Page 71

- In the caption of Figure 4, please change the word "hindlimbs" to the phrase "hind limbs", for consistency with the rest of the manuscript.
- In the figure caption, do you want to change the citation "Untermann (1959:367–368)" to your usual format?
- "a *Diplodocus* of their own": please reinstate italics for *Diplodocus*.
- "The *Diplodocus* on the lawn of the Utah Field House": please reinstate italics for *Diplodocus*.
- "Ilja Nieuwland (written communication, 2022; see acknowledgments for affiliation)": why the indirection here and in some other personal communications, rather than including the affiliation directly as in the others?

Page 72

- I would love to see Figure 5, the only good colour photograph of the completed outdoor mount, displayed across both columns of the page.
- Caption to Figure 6: "in what was likely an annual event": replace "annual" with "periodic".

Page 73

- Caption to Figure 7: please reinstate italics for *Diplodocus*.
- "This optimism was to prove misplaced, however, nearly two years later". Please change the second comma back to a colon. The sentence as modified makes no sense.
- "The last mention of the project in the Telegram": please reinstate the italics for *Telegram*.

Page 74

- "the eventual outcome, if any, of the *Diplodocus* project". Once more, please reinstate italics for *Diplodocus*.
- "Already two inquiries have come to the Children's Museum asking 'Who has them next?.'" Rea (2001, p. 210)" That mess of punctuation in the middle -- question-mark period single-quote double-quote -- surely can't be right, even using the American system. I suggest question-mark single-quote period double-quote: "Already two inquiries have come to the Children's Museum asking 'Who has them next?.'" Rea (2001, p. 210)". Failing that, we could just delete the period.
- "Wann Langston [written communication, 1989; see acknowledgments for affiliation]": Langston's 1990 affiliation is not included in the acknowledgements, and doesn't really seem relevant as the personal communication in question was not to us.

Page 75

- "Yet another account of the molds is described by David S Berman". Reinstate the period after David's middle initial.
- "Relating a written communication from John S. McIntosh": my apologies, this was a verbal communication, not written.
- "John S. McIntosh (see acknowledgments for affiliation)". McIntosh's historical affiliation is not included in the acknowledgements, and doesn't really seem relevant as the personal communication in question was not to us.

Page 76

- "Molds that it would make from the Field House concrete cast": please change to "Field House's".

Page 77

- "However, it seems that this was not done. The present Field House cast has the same old-style forefeet as the original Carnegie mount had, with unguals on all of the first three digits; by contrast, the cast in the Museum für Naturkunde Berlin ...". Please repunctuate as follows: replace the period after "done" with a colon, and replace the semi-colon after "digits" with a period.
- "Jerry Miller (Director of Utah Division of Parks and Recreation)". I'm not sure of local usage, but would it be better to insert "the" before "Director"?

- "The museum moved to a new and much larger purpose-built facility on 22 May 2004". Perhaps it's worth inserting "in Vernal" after "facility"?

Page 79

- Caption to Table 1: "(3) and an accounting". Would read better as "and (3) an accounting".
- "To create a unique exhibit at the MOSI in Tampa, Florida". This is the first mention of MOSI, so we should spell out "Museum of Science and Industry (MOSI)".

Page 81

- "At present, this cast is on display at the CMNH as a filler". Insert "in Cleveland, Ohio" after "CMNH". (This will help to prevent people assuming CMNH refers to the Carnegie Museum.)

Page 82

- "But when the cast was returned to them some time before the end of June 1991, this was not a simple matter to re-mount it outside the museum, as the scaffolding on which was the cast mounted had been cut in order to take it down." The text as submitted had an error (a missing "it") but something strange has happened here, perhaps in an attempt to fix that error. I suggest the following: "... it was not a simple matter to re-mount it outside the museum, as the scaffolding on which it was mounted had been cut in order to take it down."

Page 83

- "Jim Madsen died in 2009 at age 77": please change "at age" to "aged".

Page 84

- There is very little margin between Figure 12 and the text immediately below it.
- "The double-*Diplodocus* display at MOSI": please remove the hyphen for consistency with other mentions of the double *Diplodocus*.

Page 85

- Caption to Figure 13: "stored in in the basement storage area". Please delete the spare "in"!
- Caption to Figure 13: append "Photograph by Jason Huntzinger (Utah State University)".
- "the double *Diplodocus* mount at MOSI.": please remove the hyphen for consistency with other mentions of the double *Diplodocus*.

Page 86

- Acknowledgements: after "the photograph of the double-*Diplodocus* mount for figure 10.", add "Jason Huntzinger (Utah State University) supplied the photograph of the concrete elements in collections for figure 13."
- "David S Berman (late of the Carnegie Museum)" is listed as allowing us to cite a written communication. However, Berman's communication, unlike all the others, was verbal.

- Poor David has once more lost the period after his middle initial. Please give it back to him!

Page 87

- It seems that *all* font information has been lost from the references. In particular, taxonomic names like *Diplodocus* and *Allosaurus* have all lost their italics. Please reinstate all these.

Page 89

- From here onwards, the vertical line-spacing is wider than in all the previous pages.
- The two Taylor et al. in prep references do not have the links we decided to add:
 - <https://github.com/MikeTaylor/palaeo-carnegie>
 - <https://github.com/MikeTaylor/palaeo-baromount>