The concrete *Diplodocus* of Vernal

**Michael P. Taylor.** Department of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Bristol BS8 1RJ, UK. [dino@miketaylor.org.uk](mailto:dino@miketaylor.org.uk) (corresponding author)

**Steven D. Sroka.** Utah Field House of Natural History State Park Museum, 496 E. Main Street, Vernal, UT 84078.

**Kenneth Carpenter.** University of Colorado Museum, Boulder, CO 80309.

**Abstract**

XXX to follow

**Keywords:** Diplodocus, sauropod, skeletal mount, history, Utah, Carnegie

Table of Contents

[Introduction 2](#__RefHeading___Toc2161_3455334573)

[Nomenclature 2](#__RefHeading___Toc943_1155462304)

[Institutional abbreviations 2](#__RefHeading___Toc5349_68767826)

[History of the concrete *Diplodocus* 3](#__RefHeading___Toc1946_2786159041)

[The original Carnegie *Diplodocus* 3](#__RefHeading___Toc1948_2786159041)

[The first casts of the Carnegie *Diplodocus* 3](#__RefHeading___Toc1950_2786159041)

[The Field House Museum in Vernal 4](#__RefHeading___Toc947_1155462304)

[The concrete cast in Vernal 4](#__RefHeading___Toc416_3962850034)

[The fate of the original molds 5](#__RefHeading___Toc430_3962850034)

[The lightweight cast in Vernal 6](#__RefHeading___Toc949_1155462304)

[New casts made from molds of the concrete *Diplodocus* 7](#__RefHeading___Toc418_3962850034)

[The fate of the concrete *Diplodocus* 10](#__RefHeading___Toc953_1155462304)

[Discussion 10](#__RefHeading___Toc3401_68767826)

[Acknowledgements 10](#__RefHeading___Toc3529_2542618767)

[References 11](#__RefHeading___Toc3405_68767826)

[Figure Captions 14](#__RefHeading___Toc3407_68767826)

# Introduction

*Diplodocus* is a sauropod dinosaur from the Late Jurassic of North America, found in the extensive Morrison Formation of the western states. Although larger and more complete sauropods are now known, *Diplodocus* was the first giant dinosaur known from a substantially complete skeleton: the Carnegie Museum’s iconic specimen CM 84 (Figure A). As summarised in Taylor et al. (in prep, a) and expounded in detail by Nieuwland (2019), casts of this important specimen were sent all around the globe, and as a result this individual became — and remains — the single best-known dinosaur in the world.

Among the numerous *Diplodocus* casts that have been mounted, many have been made in plaster, including all the oldest ones; and many have been made in modern lightweight materials such as water-expanded polyester (WEP). But one stands alone, having been cast in concrete by the Utah Field House museum in Vernal.

In this paper, we will briefly summarise the history of the original Carnegie *Diplodocus*, discuss how the concrete cast came to be, and consider its legacy.

## Nomenclature

A distinction is made between molds and casts. A mold is a negative structure made from an original specimen (or, less commonly, a cast), in which the spaces inside the mold match the shapes of the original specimen. A cast is a positive structure, a copy made of a specimen made by filling a mold, and its shape matches that of the original specimen.

## Institutional abbreviations

* AMNH — American Museum of Natural History, New York, New York, USA.
* CM — Carnegie Museum of Natural History, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, USA.
* CMNH — Cleveland Museum of Natural History, Cleveland, Ohio, USA.
* HMNS — Houston Museum of Nature and Science, Houston, Texas, USA.
* MOSI — Museum of Science and Industry, Tampa, Florida, USA.

# History of the concrete *Diplodocus*

## The original Carnegie *Diplodocus*

As related in Taylor et al. (in prep, a), the industrialist and philanthropist Andrew Carnegie was inspired by a newspaper article in the late 1800s to ask the director of the museum that bears his name to obtain a giant dinosaur skeleton for exhibit. In July 1989, an expedition from the museum found a largely complete specimen of the sauropod *Diplodocus*, which when excavated and prepared was given the specimen number CM 84 and described in Hatcher’s (1901) monograph as the new species *Diplodocus carnegii*. In 1907, this specimen was mounted in the new dinosaur hall of the Carnegie Museum, its missing portions filled in with bones from a second *Diplodocus carnegii* specimen CM 94, and casts and sculptures based on other closely related specimens, some of them from other museums.

This mounted skeleton quickly became the icon of the Carnegie Museum, and has remained so up to the present, even after the addition to the dinosaur hall of the even larger apatosaurine mounted skeleton CM 3018 which would subsequently be designated the holotype of the new species *Apatosaurus louisae* (Gilmore 1936). The *Diplodocus* skeleton, known by the rather inelegant nickname “Dippy”, has been moved and modified several times in the years since its initial mounting, most recently in the 2005–2007 major redesign of the Carnegie Museum. It presently co-stars with CM 3018 in the new Jurassic Hall.

## The first casts of the Carnegie *Diplodocus*

Well before the mounting of the real bones of CM 84, Carnegie was asked by King Edward VII of England for a copy of the skeleton to be displayed in the British Museum (Natural History). Carnegie optimistically hoped to put an end to war by encouraging arbitration instead (Nieuwland 2019:55), and to this end was always keen to gain influence with heads of state. He therefore enthusiastically agreed to the King’s request and instructed museum director William. J. Holland to create a replica.

Holland oversaw the creation of a set of plaster molds corresponding to the bones of CM 84 and the other bones that were to be included in the real-bone mount a few years later. Some differences exist between the molds and the real skeleton (see Taylor et al. in prep., a for details) but the molds corresponded closely to the original skeleton. These molds were used to create not just the cast skeleton requested by King Edward VII, but four further casts. After the British Museum unveiled its mounted cast to great fanfare on 12th May 1905, and after the original bones were mounted at the Carnegie Museum in 1907, Carnegie went on to gift the other four casts to Kaiser Wilhelm II of Germany, Président Armand Fallières of France, Emperor Franz Joseph of Austria and King Victor Emmanuel III of Italy in 1908 and 1909. As with the London mount, Holland and his chief preparator Arthur S. Coggleshall travelled to each recipient country to supervise the mounting of the casts.

Buoyed by success of his donation program, Carnegie authorised the creation of five further casts from the same molds, destined to be donated to other heads of state. Between 1910 and 1913 three of these were given to Tsar Nicholas II of Russia, President Roque Sáenz Peña Lahitte of Argentina and King Alfonso XIII of Spain. But the outbreak of the Great War in 1914 put an end to Carnegie’s dream of arbitration replacing warfare, and left him a broken man. When he died in 1919, not only had the two remaining skeletons not been donated, the museum was left relatively impoverished. As noted by Gangewere (2011:24), Carnegie’s gifts to his Institute and Library during the last 20 years of his life amounted to $11,729,471 (about $200,000,000 in modern money); but in the 20 years after his death, only a further $1.4M was provided — and relatively little of this would have gone to the Natural History Museum. While Holland had considered closing the Carnegie Quarry as early as 1917 (Carpenter 2018:13), the reduction in funding must have played some part in the eventual decision to abandon in 1922. Only years later, with the aid of funds from Carnegie’s widow Louise, would the last two casts be sent to Mexico City (1930) and Munich (1934) — the latter never even being mounted.

The molds, having last been used in the 1910s, then lay forgotten in the basement of the Carnegie Museum for more than 40 years (Untermann 1959:364).

## The Field House Museum in Vernal

XXX For update, see my article Rocky Start to Dinosaur National Monument

As Harvey (1991) explains in detail, the Carnegie Quarry in northeastern Utah (now Dinosaur National Monument) was exploited extensively in the early 20th Century by teams from the Carnegie Museum led by Earl Douglas. Although Douglas himself was on good terms with local Utah palaeontologists, all of the dinosaur material excavated at this quarry was shipped to Pittsburgh, leading to growing resentment among Utahns that their own state was not benefitting from the discoveries being made there. The inhabitants of Vernal, only 20 miles from the quarry, were frequent visitors and supplied Douglas’s crew. Two of these local crew members would go on to work at museums: Golden York at the University of Utah, and LeRoy “Pop” Kay at the Carnegie Museum. Commercial concerns at Vernal hoped that a visitor centre at the quarry would provide some revenue for the state and the town, but William Holland, the director of the Carnegie Museum, treated these plans with contempt, exacerbating existing tensions between the western state and the eastern museum.

As recounted by Untermann and Untermann (1970), the genesis of the Field House lay with Arthur G. Nord, supervisor of the Ashley National Forest, one of those who was concerned that the fossil wealth of the Vernal area was being shipped to museums outside the locality. The creation of a museum in Vernal was first proposed by Dr. J. E. Broadus of the State Museum Association at the Vernal Lions Club meeting of 9 September 1934 (Anonymous 1969), and it was reported in the local press only 18 days later (Anonymous 1934). However, the idea languished for nine years until the Club returned to it on 6 September 1943 (see Anonymous 1969). A museum committee was then formed to advocate for a local museum (Anonymous 1943). A senate bill approving the museum was passed in 1945, and the next year Governor Herbert B. Maw made $200,000 available to construct the museum building (Anonymous 1969). G. Ernest Untermann was appointed director of the museum project, and was assisted by his wife Billie, a capable scientist and administrator in her own right. Based on drawings created by the Untermanns, the Salt Lake City architect Miles E. Miller drew up the plans, and the building was erected by Dorland Construction Company. The work was begun on 16 October 1947 and completed on 1 July 1948, and the building was dedicated on 29 October 1948 by Governor Maw.

## The concrete cast in Vernal

As noted above, Vernal native J. LeRoy Kay had gained his entry to palaeontology by working with Earl Douglass at what was then the Carnegie Quarry. After digging there ended, Douglass had recommended that the Carnegie Museum hire Kay to continue work on removing the collected dinosaur bones from their encasing rock, writing to museum director Stewart on 20 September 1922 as follows:

I understand that you are contemplating giving Mr. J. LeRoy Kay the opportunity to gain a wider experience by allowing him the opportunity of going to Pittsburg where he can for a time have the advantages of the laboratory, museum, and library. While I would not advise any man to take up museum work if he has a family to support an[d] is not wealthy, Mr Kay is a very capable and resourceful man and can later turn his hand to more remunerative work if he wishes. If the museum is to continue the work of collecting especially in this field it will undoubtedly be the gainer by giving him this opportunity.

Working at the Carnegie Museum for the next 30 years, Kay rose to become the head of the museum’s department of vertebrate paleontology. He was in this post when, in 1952, museum director Graham Netting started thinking about purging the collections of the dinosaur material (Rodeck 1952, Tschopp et al. 2019:10) because the dinosaur bones took up too much storage space (Lee 1955a, Lee 1955b). Kay would later announce to the vertebrate paleontology community that the specimens had been “unfrozen” (Wright 1956:26).

Before this announcement, the downsizing plan was scaled back to removing only the duplicate specimens. Among the materials to be disposed of were the plaster of Paris molds that had been used for the *D*. *carnegii* casts. The molds were large, some were damaged and coated with coal dust from the coal fired heating system. Kay was close to retirement and planned to move back to Vernal, and wanted to find a home for the molds in his own state. He first contacted the Utah State Museum (now the Museum of Natural History of Utah), but the museum was not willing to pay for the molds to be shipped. Ernest Untermann had been trying to obtain a dinosaur skeleton for the Field House Museum and stepped in at this point.

In 1952 (not 1955 as stated by Untermann and Untermann 1970), Kay gifted the original plaster molds of the Carnegie *Diplodocus* to the Field House (Untermann 1952, 1959), on the condition that the Field House would arrange transportation. As the molds weighed several tons (Untermann 1952) this was no small undertaking. Local trucker Grant Southam used his own equipment to transport the molds at cost, and the Utah Lions Club provided the necessary $1000 payment. The molds arrived on or shortly before 7 August (Untermann 1952) (Figure B). However, having already been used to create ten casts, they were by this time “deteriorating” (Gangewere 1999:17), “almost unusable” (Nieuwland 2019:251) and “in pretty bad shape” (Ken Carpenter, pers. comm. 2022).

Curiously, the poor condition of the molds is not discussed in Untermann’s (1959) otherwise comprehensive account of the creation of Vernal’s cast. He recounts that the molds were dirty with Pittsburgh soot, requiring a steam bath, and that some repairs were necessary for molds that were actually broken, but the erosion and decay arising from ten prior castings are not mentioned.

Since the mounted skeleton’s 76-foot length was too long for the museum’s 50-foot exhibit halls, plans were made to situate it outside the museum. Wind, rain and extreme temperatures — the Vernal climate ranges from –40˚F to 100˚F (–40˚C to 38˚C) — required a more robust casting material than the usual plaster. After some experimentation with different materials, the team settled on a mix of one part cement to three parts Aggra-lite (a lightweight aggregate made of volcanic pumice). A complete cast would consist of about 600 pieces — many more than the number of bones, as the complex vertebrae were made from multiple pieces. About 100 of these had been completed when Otto Buehner, president of Salt Lake City’s Otto Buehner Concrete Products Company, visited the museum, became interested in the casting, and expressed doubts about the use of Aggra-lite. Further experimentation, aided by Buehner’s experienced workers, resulted in the selection of new mixture, one part cement to three parts aragonite (the high pressure polymorph of calcium carbonate). Most of the pieces were cast in this material by Grant Merrell, the museum’s preparator, at the Otto Buehner facilities, with the more intricate parts completed at the museum. Reinforcing wire and rods were used where necessary, and the completed bones were coated in fibreglass to protect them from the elements. (The Buehner Company benefitted from its involvement with the casting, as they discovered in the course of the process that fibreglass made a better and cheaper adhesive than they had previously been using to repair Italian marble when it was broken in transit. The Field House also adopted fibreglass as its bonding agent of choice after positive experiences with the concrete cast.)

The result of all this work was nearly 600 concrete elements which then had to be assembled into a skeleton. First, the individual bones were assembled from their pieces — work done by the Untermanns and Merrell. Identifying numbers on the molds had mostly faded with age, so this had to be done from anatomical principles. Pieces were fastened together with steel rods and bonded by fibreglass. The assembled bones were then laid out in the workshop to verify that everything was present and correct (Figure D; Untermann 1959:figures 1, 2).

With this done, the work moved outside. On a concrete base, and surrounded by a chain-link fence — the latter provided by the same Vernal Lions Club that had paid for the molds to be transported — the cast bones were assembled: sacrum and pelvis first (Figure E.A), then hind limbs, dorsal vertebrae, cervical and caudal vertebrae and skull (Figure E.B), then finally the front limbs and ribs. The skull was mounted 21 feet (6.4 m) above the ground at the end of a somewhat elevated neck. The whole skeleton was not only supported on a steel scaffolding, but also guyed by thinner rods, enabling it to withstand 70 mph winds that uprooted nearby trees (Untermann 1959:367–368).

The completed outdoor cast was dedicated on 6 June, 1957 (Untermann and Untermann 1970). The work had taken about a year and a half, from early 1956, and cost only $10,000 in total (about $105,449 in 2022 money) — almost all of it in salary. The cast stood for 32 years (Figure F). It was repainted on 22 June 1967 (Figure G) in what was likely an annual event (Anonymous 1967).

## The fate of the original molds

So far as we have been able to determine, the casting of the concrete *Diplodocus* of Vernal was probably the last time the Carnegie Museum’s original molds are used. However, that was not Untermann’s intention. In his 1959 account, he wrote (p368–369):

Several museums in the United States and from lands as distant as Japan and Italy have expressed a desire to acquire the molds and cast a *Diplodocus* of their own from either plaster or some of the newer synthetics. To date no museum has apparently been able to make satisfactory arrangement for the acquisition of the molds and the casting of a skeleton. We still have the molds in Vernal, and any museum, anywhere, is welcome to them just for hauling them off. […] The Diplodocus on the lawn of the Utah Field House is the eleventh replica to be cast from the molds […] Does anyone wish to cast the twelfth?

From here, though, the story becomes contradictory. Sassaman (1988) reported that “the molds finally fell apart because of old age soon after it [the concrete *Diplodocus*] was made”. However, Ilja Niewland (pers. comm., 2022) said that “The original moulds were thrown away somewhere during the 1960s (nobody at the [Carnegie Museum] could be more specific than that)”, suggesting that the molds may have been returned to their origin.

Both these accounts seem to be in error, as shown by a 1960 report in the *Vernal Express* newspaper (Anonymous 1960; Figure H; see also Carr and Hansen 2005). This says that in the middle of July 1960, the molds were collected by the Rocky Mount Children’s Museum (now the Rocky Mount Imperial Center, Children’s Museum & Science Centre) in North Carolina, with the intention that they would be used to create a twelfth cast which would be mounted outside the museum building next to the Tar River in Rocky Mount’s Sunset Park. Hurricane Floyd devastated Rocky Mount in 1999, with flooding from the River Tar destroying the original Children's Museum along with all its exhibits and records (Leigh White, pers. comm., 2022), so no records survive of the molds’ arrival and subsequent use. The museum was located next door to a municipal water treatment facility that also flooded and released unknown chemicals, so museum property that may have otherwise been salvageable in that area was deemed contaminated and required to be destroyed.

The Children’s Museum was re-established at the newly built Imperial Centre, where it still resides, but no trace exists of their outdoor *Diplodocus*. In fact it seems possible that it never existed: most staff who worked at the museum in the 1980s do not recall any such cast (Leigh White, pers. comm., 2022). Corroborating this, Rea (2001:210) reported that “from Vernal the molds kept travelling — first, to the Rocky Mount Children’s Museum in Rocky Mount, North Carolina, although a cast was never made there”. Similarly, Moore (2014:234-235) stated that “From Vernal, Utah, [CM] molds of *Diplodocus carnegii* are shipped to Rocky Mount Children’s Museum in Rocky Mount, North Carolina. Because of the age-related damage to the molds, a cast was never prepared”. However, Jan Engle Hicks, Curator of Education at the Rocky Mount Children’s Museum from 1971–2002, has a memory of *Diplodocus* casts being on exhibit at the museum when she started work in 1971. She does not recall if they were still part of the museum collection in 1999. XXX follow up.

Even this may not have been the end for the molds. Rea (2001:210) continues: “Eventually the molds found their way to the Houston Museum of Science, where they were used to fill in gaps in the *Diplodocus* *hayi* skeleton that had been swapped from Pittsburgh to Cleveland before ending up in Houston”, citing a personal communication from John S. McIntosh. (The skeleton in question is that of CM 662, which became CMNH 10670 in Cleveland, then HMNS 175 in Houston. Having been nominated as the holotype of the new species *Diplodocus* *hayi* by Holland (1924:399), the species was later moved to its own new genus *Galeamopus* by Tschopp et al. (2015:267).)

What happened to the molds after that, we do not know. Due to the destruction of the Rocky Mount Children’s Museum records, we cannot tell whether they ever shipped the molds to Houston; and we have not been able to obtain information from the Houston Museum. Brian Curtice (pers. comm., 2022) reports that he was in Houston in 1995 and did not see the molds in the collection, nor hear of their having been there.

XXX Find out more. Try https://newspaperarchive.com/tags/diplodocus/?pc=24962&psi=68&pci=7&ob=1/

## The lightweight cast in Vernal

During the late 1980s, museum staff decided they wanted a new, lightweight cast of *Diplodocus* to mount indoors. As noted above, the 50-foot-long galleries could not accommodate a 76-foot-long mount at its full length, but it was decided to curve the tail to enable it to fit. That is course had been an option in 1957 when the concrete cast was created, but perhaps Untermann, then the museum director, had wanted the tail laid straight out. Untermann had died in 1975, two years after his wife Billie (Lewis 1977): a decade after his death, his preference would not have held such weight.

XXX expand this bit when Steve sends documents.1988, January: plans are made to have a lightweight indoor replica of the Field House concrete cast created by the Las Vegas Museum (as noted by Krishtalka 1988:17), but these plans fall through — possibly because the museum went bankrupt and closed in 1990 (Jones, pers. comm., 2022).

According to the records here, molds/replicas were to be made for/by the Las Vegas Museum of Natural History (before DINOLABs got involved), but apparently never did. We have a few letters dated in Jan 1988 and early spring 1989 about this. There seems to be some conflicting information between the Vegas Museum agreement and letters. According to an unassigned agreement, the Vegas Museum (through some unnamed contractor) was supposed to disassemble the cement Dippy, transport it to Las Vegas and make two replicas. One for their museum and one for us, and return the original cement version and new molds to the Utah Field House. A letter dated Jan 28, 1989 from Willima Murdock Jr., then Director of the Vegas Museum, says the opposite. We would get a replica and they keep cement Dippy and new molds, with permission to cast more. In April 1989 Jim Madsen at DINOLABS was contacted to help with the plans of making a replica since Vegas dropped.

With the Las Vegas plans having fallen through, in April 1989, Jim Madsen of Dinolab was contacted to make new plans for creating a replica from the concrete cast. A contract dated 30 June 1989 (Madsen et al. 1989) formalised the deal, though in fact the concrete skeleton had been disassembled and shipped to Dinolab some days earlier (Anonymous 1989).

The Dinolab work was to take nearly two full years. During this time, they repaired the deteriorated concrete cast, stabilizing, restoring and sealing the bones. They then made new molds from the repaired concrete *Diplodocus* elements, and used these new molds to create a new lightweight indoor *Diplodocus* for the Field House, using WEP (water-expanded polyester). Using the new molds, which they retained, Dinolab reserved the right to make up to 20 additional casts, with the Field House to receive $5,000 for each one sold (Madsen et al. 1989).

Dinolab was contracted to deliver the indoor mount not later than June 30, 1991, and it arrived only a few days before this (Anonymous 1991). The concrete skeleton had been returned to the Field House, too, but it “remain[ed] in a back room in the fieldhouse. It [could] not be reassembled because when it was taken apart linking material had to be cut”.

The new cast was expected to be assembled that winter (Anonymous 1991), but delays would prevent the public from seeing it for nearly three further years. By 23 June 1993, only the ribs and torso had been erected (Anonymous 1993). In June 1994, the mount of the new cast was finally completed, with its head and neck looming over the admission counter. It was unveiled as part of the Dinosaur Days festival on Saturday 18th June (Morrison 1994), having been “pieced together by maintenance employee, Danny Anderson, who worked on him over a two year period only as time allowed.” Thus very nearly five years passed in total between the removal of the outdoor concrete *Diplodocus* and the unveiling of its indoor WEP successor (Figure C).

The lightweight *Diplodocus* that dominated the old Field House was in place for only ten years before the museum moved to a new and much larger purpose built facility on May 22, 2004. The WEP cast was taken down and remounted in a more dynamic pose in the entry hall of the new museum, where it remains to this day (Figure I).

## New casts made from molds of the concrete *Diplodocus*

XXX write up: Some time subsequent to 1989: Jack McIntosh arranges a deal between Dinolab and RCI whereby the Dinolab creates casts of the Diplodocus elements needed to make up the missing part of the AMNH *Barosaurus* mount. See Gordy (1991), Norell et al. (1991), Dingus (1996:20–29), Taylor et al (in prep, b).

In subsequent years: further casts were made from the Dinolab molds, but some of these have proven difficult to track down. For example, Nieuwland (2010:68) reported that the new molds “opened up the possibility of a whole slew of further copies of this particular copy, which was immediately exploited by the Las Vegas Natural History Museum. One of these has been placed in the Las Vegas Natural History Museum”. But this seems to be an error based on misunderstanding Krishtalka’s (1988:17) report of a Las Vegas museum’s intention to make its own molds of the concrete *Diplodocus* as discussed above. The Las Vegas Museum of Natural History (note the subtly different name) went bankrupt and closed in 1990, before the new molds were available for casting, so can not have received a *Diplodocus* cast. The Las Vegas Natural History Museum, a completely different institution which opened in June 1991, has never had a *Diplodocus* (Jones, pers. comm., 2022).

XXX get Dinolab documentation from Brian Curtice.

And one in the Houston Natural History Museum (XXX probably referring to the CM 662 mount).

The molds taken from the concrete *Diplodocus* were used again in an eighteen-month project in 1996 and 1997, led by David Letasi, to create a unique exhibit at the Museum of Science and Industry in Tampa, Florida (David Letasi, pers. comm., 2022). Susan Swartz of MOSI obtained a $500,000 grant from the National Science Foundation for the “Assemble a Sauropod” project. The museum board were initially interested in purchasing a cast of a large sauropod skeleton from China. However, based on photographs of this skeleton, Letasi was sceptical about its authenticity. On advice from Mark Norell, Letasi consulted Paul Sereno, who had recently seen the specimen in question, and discovered that it was almost entirely extrapolated from handful of bones, these so restored with plaster that it was impossible to determine what was real. Sereno therefore wrote to the museum directors, recommending that the project take a different form. Jim Kirkland, who was lecturing at a MOSI event at this time, recommended that a *Diplodocus* skeletons could be used, and that Jim Madsen was able to produce the casts — using the molds taken from the concrete *Diplodocus* of Vernal..

The museum directors approached Madsen, who recommended that two individuals be created and posed together, creating a unique tableau. Letasi conceived the idea of mounting one of them in a rearing position: to better understand what this would entail, he consulted Mark Norrell of the American Museum of Natural History, who six years earlier had mounted a cast *Barosaurus* skeleton in the AMNH atrium (Taylor et al. in prep, b). Letasi also consulted Robert Bakker on the dynamic, defensive pose of the quadrupedal skeleton; Phil Currie on the dynamics of the whiplash tail; and Kent Stevens on the mechanics of the rearing posture. Sauropod specialist John S. McIntosh reviewed the design.

The elements of the mounts were cast by Jim Madsen of Dinolab, using hollow core resin casting with lightweight foam filler to reduce weight. While the postcranial skeleton was created from the second-generation Vernal molds, the cast skull was based on a separate Carnegie Museum individual, CM 11161. All these elements were then shipped to Ontario to be assembled into their selected postures by Peter May of Research Casting International (RCI) with guidance from Letasi.

Aside from biological and mechanical verisimilitude, it was also necessary to consider the space the skeletons were to be mounted in. Letasi was concerned that it would be difficult to place the mounts in the main lobby without restricting evening events, as the space was used for public dinner engagements and rotating exhibits. With space in the lobby limited, it was not clear that the skeletons, widely cited in the literature as being 85 feet (25.9 m) in length, would fit. At Letasi’s request, Jim Madsen laid out the skull and axial skeleton at his lab, and measured it at 75 feet (22.9 m) — so it appears that the 84 feet given by Holland (1905:448) for the London cast was an exaggeration.

Letasi visited RCI for the trial mountings of both skeletons. The only problem that became apparent was the position of the tail on the upright mount, which when installed at the museum would have collided with a balcony. The tail posture was changed and the problem avoided. The two mounted skeletons at their true size of 75 feet and with the tail posture modified were able to fit perfectly into the MOSI lobby. The upright mount was placed on a ten foot high pedestal and an existing concrete bunker was used for quadrupedal mount, so neither encroached greatly on floor space. (Figure XXX trying to source).

Sadly, this impressive exhibit was to last only twenty years in its original form. On 13 August 2017, the museum, in financial difficulties, closed 85% of its space (Contorno 2017, Schreiner and Ochoa 2017) and many exhibits had to be discarded. Happily, in 2019 the rearing mounted *Diplodocus* was moved to a new position in the Kids In Charge Gallery in the remaining part of the museum. The quadrupedal mount was sold to a company that in turn sold it to a Canadian exhibition company. XXX Anthony Pelaez to supply details

## The fate of the concrete *Diplodocus*

XXX to do

The old Dippy was never remounted by us after it was taken down.

In March 2000, when Steve Sroka began working at the Field House, the concrete cast was stored in the building crawl space.

May 22, 2004: As noted above The Field House moves to a new building, and the WEP cast is remounted in the entry hall. The concrete cast was left behind.

2012: The collections are moved from the old Field House building to the new one, but there is no space for the concrete cast.

2013: The concrete cast is sent to Utah State University Eastern Prehistoric Museum on effectively permanent loan, and to be repaired (Carpenter and Hayes 2013; Figure J). The museum got a $5000 grant from the Utah Museums Association for the repair of the casts. Practically every bone was damaged and it took preparator Carrie Herbel nine months to sand blast the old paint off, repair the broken and missing pieces using a concrete patch used to patch airport runways. The patch material, a powder, was supposed to be tinted tan, but when mixed turned a greenish-tan. It was intended to be mounted outside a new museum in Price, but this museum was never built and the cast remains in storage on the Utah State University Eastern campus.

2019: Dinolab storage in Ogden, Utah, is scheduled for demolition. The Diplodocus molds that were taken from the concrete cast are moved to RCI, where they are kept in storage: some in good condition, some in rough shape. These are probably the only Carnegie Diplodocus molds in the world.

“After the tour, in all likelihood the plaster dinosaur will meet an inglorious end in the basement of the museum; meanwhile, there has been talk of a more weather-resistant cast gracing the garden in front of the museum. And yes, that would mean that in this case, a cast is to be recast. What that means for “authenticity” or “relevance” is anybody’s guess.” (Nieuwland 2019:4).

# Discussion

XXX To do. Photographs of the concrete *Diplodocus* can be found at the J. Willard Marriott Digital Library of the University of Utah: <https://collections.lib.utah.edu/>

1. XXX To do. It's interesting, as I work on this, how sad the endings of various things are. The original Carnegie molds that were lost or destroyed in the 1960s; the Sunset Park *Diplodocus* that either never existed or was destroyed by Hurricane Floyd; the concrete *Diplodocus* that was supposed to be repaired by Dinolab but was never remounted; the molds that were made from the concrete casts sitting unloved in the Dinolab building until it was torn down, and now lurking the RCI's storage; the MOSI quadrupedal *Diplodocus* sitting unloved in a building used mostly for storage.I suppose most endings are sad, but the project definitely has a melancholy feel.

# Acknowledgements

XXX To do

John Foster

Ilja Niewland’s unparalelled knowledge of the Carnegie casts proved invaluable.

Elaine Carr of the Uintah County Regional History Center provided with high-resolution images from the archives and helped us to trace the history associated with some of them.

Leigh White, Curator of Education at Rocky Mount Children’s Museum, North Carolina.

David Letasi provided extensive information about the double *Diplodocus* mount at the Museum of Science and Industry, Tampa, Florida.

Tom Rea

Michele Jones (Natural History Collections Manager, Las Vegas Natural History Museum)

Anthony Pelaez (Senior Director of Exhibits, Museum of Science & Industry, Tampa, FL)

All other pers. Comms.

XXX More to follow.

# References

XXX Many of these are unused and should be removed.

Anonymous. 1898. Most colossal animal ever on Earth just found out west. *New York Journal and Advertiser*, 11 December 1898, p29. <https://www.loc.gov/resource/sn83030180/1898-12-11/ed-1/?sp=33&r=-0.061,-0.031,0.196,0.117,0>

Anonymous. 1934. Construction of Museum at Vernal urged. *Vernal Express*, 27 September 1934, page 1. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=21512583>

Anonymous. 1943. Committee for museum to make plans for project. *Vernal Express*, 23 September 1943, page 1. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=21493559>

Anonymous. 1960. Dinosaur molds take long ride to No. Carolina children’s home. *Vernal Express*, 14 July 1960, page 15. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/ark:/87278/s6zk6w6s/21338221>

Anonymous. 1967. Dippy and a friend share a coat of fresh linseed oil mixed with brown stain. *Vernal Express*, 22 June 1967, page 1. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/ark:/87278/s6pk1vwz/21595150>

Anonymous. 1969. Early plans for Utah Field House started by Vernal Lions Club in 1934. *Vernal Express*, 24 April 1969, page 1B. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/ark:/87278/s6515c19/21656624>

Anonymous. 1989. Museum, gardens make changes, add new displays. *Vernal Express*, 29 June 1989, page 12. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/ark:/87278/s62v6594/22643733>

Anonymous. 1991. Dippy returns as beast of new mold. *Vernal Express*, 26 June 1991, page 1. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/ark:/87278/s6rv4bxq/22646163>

Anonymous. 1993. “Dippy” the *Diplodocus* is being reassembled. *Vernal Express*, 23 June 1993. [https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/ark:/87278/s6b88zdc/22648688](https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/details?id=22648688&page=3&q=Dippy&sort=date_tdt+asc%2Cparent_i+asc%2Cpage_i+asc&facet_paper="Vernal+Express")

Brinkman, Paul. D. 2010. The second Jurassic dinosaur rush and the dawn of dinomania. *Endeavour* **34(3)**:104–111. doi:10.1016/j.endeavour.2010.06.004

Carpenter, Kenneth. 2018. Rocky start of Dinosaur National Monument (USA), the world's first dinosaur geoconservation site. *Geoconservation Research* **1(1)**:1–20.

Carpenter, Kenneth, and Fred Hayes. 2013. Memorandum of understanding between the State of Utah Division of Parks and Recreation and Prehistoric Museum – Utah State University Eastern for loan of concrete Diplodocus model. Private agreement.

Carr, Elaine, and Aric Hansen. 2005. William Randolf Turnage, Dee Hall, and Ernest Untermann [archive photograph with metadata]. University of Utah, J. Willard Marriott Digital Library, image 1086142. <https://collections.lib.utah.edu/details?id=1086142>

Contorno, Steve. 2017. MOSI to close most of its building, IMAX to save money before move to downtown Tampa. *Tampa Bay Times*, 18 May 2017. <https://www.tampabay.com/news/business/tourism/mosi-to-close-part-of-its-building-to-save-money-before-move-to-downtown/2324358/>, archived at <https://web.archive.org/web/20211125120642/https://www.tampabay.com/news/business/tourism/mosi-to-close-part-of-its-building-to-save-money-before-move-to-downtown/2324358/>

Dingus, Lowell. 1996. *Next of Kin: Great Fossils at the American Museum of Natural History*. Rizzoli, New York.

Gangewere, R. Jay. 1999. This is huge, really huge. *Carnegie Magazine* July/August 1999:12–18.

Gordy, Molly. Dinosaur’s Last Stand? Exhibit’s pose is all wrong, experts assert. 1991. *New York Newsday* **52(88)** for 29 November 1991:3, 27.

Harvey, Mark W. T. 1991. Utah, the National Park Service, and Dinosaur National Monument, 1909–56. *Utah Historical Quarterly* **59(3)**:243–263.

Hatcher, John B. 1901. *Diplodocus* (Marsh): its osteology, taxonomy and probable habits, with a restoration of the skeleton. *Memoirs of the Carnegie Museum* **1**:1–63 and plates I–XIII.

Hay, Oliver P. 1908. On the habits and the pose of the sauropodous dinosaurs, especially of *Diplodocus*. *The American Naturalist* **42**:672–681.

Hay, Oliver P. 1910. On the manner of locomotion of the dinosaurs, especially *Diplodocus*, with remarks on the origin of birds. *Proceedings of the Washington Academy of Sciences* **12**:1–25.

Holland, William J. 1906. Osteology of *Diplodocus* Marsh with special reference to the restoration of the skeleton of *Diplodocus carnegiei* [sic] Hatcher presented by Mr. Andrew Carnegie to the British Museum, May 12 1905. *Memoirs of the Carnegie Museum* **2(6)**:225–278.

Holland, William J. 1910. A review of some recent criticisms of the restorations of sauropod dinosaurs existing in the museums of the United States, with special reference to that of *Diplodocus carnegiei* [sic] in the Carnegie museum. *American Naturalist* **44**:259–283.

Holland, William J. 1924. The skull of *Diplodocus*. *Memoirs of the Carnegie Museum* **9(3)**:379–403.

Krishtalka, Leonard. 1988. Body double: duplicating dinosaurs. *Carnegie Magazine* **59(4)**:12–20.

Lee, Ronald F. 1955a. Untitled memorandum from the Chief, Division of Interpretation, National Parks Service to Howard W. Baker, Regional Director, Region Two. 16 June 1955.

Lee, Ronald F. 1955b. Draft letter from the Chief, Division of Interpretation, National Parks Service to M. Graham Netting, Director the Carnegie Museum. Draft date 16 June 1955.

Lewis, Marlene. 1977. G. Ernest Untermann papers, 1893–1975. Archives West for University of Utah Libraries, Special Collections. <https://archiveswest.orbiscascade.org/ark:/80444/xv38626>, archived at <https://web.archive.org/web/20220610005257/https://archiveswest.orbiscascade.org/ark:/80444/xv38626>

Madsen, James H., James E. King, Jerry A. Miller, Alden H. Hamblin and Richard L. Barker. 1989. Agreement between Dinolab, inc., and the Utah Field House of Natural History State Park. Private agreement.

McIntosh, John S. 1981. Annotated catalogue of the dinosaurs (Reptilia, Archosauria) in the collections of Carnegie Museum of Natural History. *Bulletin of the Carnegie Museum* **18**:1–67.

Moore, Randy. 2014. *Dinosaurs by the Decades: A Chronology of the Dinosaur in Science and Popular Culture*. Greenwood, Westport, Connecticut.

Morrison, Melanie. 1994. Museum unveils new exhibits during Dino-Day. *Vernal Express*, 15 June 1994. <https://newspapers.lib.utah.edu/ark:/87278/s6r53f0k/22649899>

Nieuwland, Ilja. 2010. The colossal stranger. Andrew Carnegie and *Diplodocus* intrude European Culture, 1904–1912. *Endeavour* **34(2)**:61–68.

Nieuwland, Ilja. 2019. *American dinosaur abroad: a cultural history of Carnegie’s plaster* Diplodocus. University of Pittsburgh Press. ISBN: 978-0822945574. doi:10.2307/j.ctvh4zh5n

Norell, Mark A., Lowell W. Dingus and Eugene S. Gaffney. 1991. *Barosaurus* on Central Park West. *Natural History* **100(12)**:36-41. <http://hdl.handle.net/2246/6497>

Rodeck, Hugo G. 1952. Untitled letter from the Director of the University of Colorado Museum to David Canfied, Superintendant of Rocky Mountain National Park. 2 July 1952.

Sassaman, Richard. 1988. Carnegie had a dinosaur too. *American Heritage* **39(2)**:72–73.

Schreiner, Mark, and Julio Ochoa. 2017. MOSI to close IMAX, other exhibits in cost-saving reconfiguration. *WUSF Public Media* — WUSF 89.7. 18 May 2017. <https://wusfnews.wusf.usf.edu/news/2017-05-18/mosi-to-close-imax-other-exhibits-in-cost-saving-reconfiguration>, archived at <https://web.archive.org/web/20210507091810/https://wusfnews.wusf.usf.edu/news/2017-05-18/mosi-to-close-imax-other-exhibits-in-cost-saving-reconfiguration>

Steenhard, Rens. 2017. *Diplodocus carnegii*, peace diplomacy by dinosaur. Peace Palace Library, 13 July 2017. <https://peacepalacelibrary.nl/blog/2017/diplodocus-carnegii-peace-diplomacy-dinosaur>

Taylor, Michael P. 2022. Almost all known sauropod necks are incomplete and distorted. *PeerJ* **10**:e12810. doi:10.7717/peerj.12810

Taylor, Michael P., Matthew C. Lamanna, Amy Henrici, Linsly Church and Ilja Nieuwland. In prep a. The history and composition of the Carnegie *Diplodocus*. XXX replace with reference to preprint.

Taylor, Michael P., Peter May, Lowell Dingus and Eugene S. Gaffney. In prep, b. The skeletal reconstruction of Barosaurus lentus in the American Museum of Natural History. XXX replace with reference to preprint.

Tschopp, Emanuel, Susannah C. R. Maidment, Matthew C. Lamanna and Mark A. Norell. 2019. Reassessment of a historical collection of sauropod dinosaurs from the northern Morrison Formation of Wyoming, with implications for sauropod biogeography. *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History* **437**:1–79, 31 figures, 22 tables.

Tornier, Gustav. 1909. Wie war der *Diplodocus carnegii* wirklich gebaut? *Sitzungsbericht der Gesellschaft naturforschender Freunde zu Berlin* **4**:193–209.

Untermann, G. Ernest. 1952. Moulds for huge dinosaur model arrive from Carnegie Museum. *Express* (Utah Press Association), Thursday, August 7, 195, p1.

Untermann, G. Ernest. 1959. A replica of *Diplodocus*. *Curator* **2(4)**:364–369. doi:10.1111/j.2151-6952.1959.tb00520.x

Untermann, Billie R., and G. Ernest Untermann. 1970. Natural History State Museum. (Journal, volume and pagination not known: perhaps *Utah Parks and Recreation newsletter*). XXX find this reference.

Wright, Helda E. 1956. *Society of Vertebrae Paleontology News Bulletin* **46**, February 1956.

# Figure Captions

**Figure A.** The *Diplodocus carnegii* holotype CM 84 as it is today: the original fossil material mounted in the public gallery of the Carnegie Museum. Skeleton in left anterolateral view, with *Homo sapiens* Mathew J. Wedel for scale. Photograph by Michael P. Taylor.

**Figure B.** The original *Diplodocus* molds created by the Carnegie Museum, shown in the Utah Field House some time between 1953 and 1955. In the background to the left is the mold for the sacrum and coalesced ilia, seen in right ventrolateral view with anterior to the top. In the middle of the foreground is the mold for a posterior cervical vertebra in ventral view with anterior to the lower left. The molds closely follow the shapes of the bones they were modelled from, but are noticeably bulkier. Scanned by Eileen Carr for the J. Willard Marriot Digital Library, image ID 1212242. Used by permission, Uintah County Library Regional History Center.

**Figure C.** The second-generation lightweight *Diplodocus* cast as originally displayed at the old Field House building between 1993 and 2006. **A.** Right anterolateral view, showing the head and neck projecting above the admission counter; **B.** Left posterolateral view, emphasizing the curvature of the elevated tail necessary to fit the 76-foot skeleton into the 50-foot exhibit hall. Photographs taken in May 1999 by Chet Gottfried, using a Pentax LX camera with a 17mm rectilinear fisheye lens. Used by kind permission.

**Figure D.** Field House Museum directory G. Ernest Untermann (left), and his wife Billie Untermann (right), grouting the cast dorsal vertebrae of the Field House’s concrete *Diplodocus*. 24 January 1957. Scanned by Aric Hansen for the J. Willard Marriot Digital Library, image ID 1086940. Used by permission, Uintah County Library Regional History Center.

**Figure E.** Assembly of the outdoor concrete *Diplodocus* at the Utah Field Museum in 1957. **A.** In right posterolateral view. The sacrum and fused ilia having been mounted on the main support to begin the process, the hindlimbs, last four dorsal vertebrae and first caudal have now been added. **B.** In left dorsolateral view, probably taken from the room of the museum. The mount is almost complete, with only the forelimbs, their girdles and the dorsal ribs yet to be attached. Note that, contra Untermann (1959:367–368), the skull is already in place. Both images scanned by Aric Hansen for the J. Willard Marriot Digital Library, image IDs 1090660 and 1090647. Used by permission, Uintah County Library Regional History Center.

**Figure F.** The completed outdoor *Diplodocus* mount in a rare colour photograph. Undated. Scanned by Eileen Carr for the J. Willard Marriot Digital Library, image ID 415530. Used by permission, Uintah County Library Regional History Center.

**Figure G.** The outdoor *Diplodocus* mount is repainted on 22 June 1967, in what was likely an annual event. Field House employee Ivan Hall applies a mixture of linseed oil and brown stain while G. Ernest Untermann holds the ladder. Scanned by Eileen Carr for the J. Willard Marriot Digital Library, image ID 1091738. Used by permission, Uintah County Library Regional History Center.

**Figure H.** The original *Diplodocus* molds being loaded onto a truck for shipment to the Rocky Mount Children’s Museum, North Carolina, on or shortly before 14 July 1960. From left to right: truck driver William Randolph Turnage, Field House employee Dee Hall, and Field House director G. Ernest Untermann. Scanned by Aric Hansen for the J. Willard Marriot Digital Library, image ID 1086142. Used by permission, Uintah County Library Regional History Center.

**Figure I.** The second-generation lightweight *Diplodocus* cast as currently displayed at the new Field House building since 2006. Skeleton in right lateral view, with *Homo sapiens* Michael P. Taylor for scale. Photograph by Mathew J. Wedel.

**Figure J.** XXX include image from figures/sources/sroka. XXX get authorship and credit.