

## 1.9.6

The cyclic group of order 6 is the group defined by generators  $a, b$  and relations  $a^2 = b^3 = a^{-1}b^{-1}ab = e$ .

*Proof.* Let  $X = \{a, b\}$  and let  $F(X)$  be the free group on  $X$ . Consider the normal subgroup  $N$  of  $F(X)$  generated by the relations  $a^2 = e$ ,  $b^3 = e$ , and  $a^{-1}b^{-1}ab = e$ . Then  $G \cong F(X)/N$ .

We claim that  $G$  is cyclic of order 6, i.e.,  $G \cong \mathbb{Z}/6\mathbb{Z}$ . The relation  $a^{-1}b^{-1}ab = e$  implies  $ab = ba$ , so  $G$  is abelian. The relations  $a^2 = e$  and  $b^3 = e$  show that the orders of  $a$  and  $b$  are 2 and 3, respectively.

Since  $G$  is abelian and generated by  $a$  and  $b$ , every element of  $F(X)/N$  can be written as  $a^i b^j N$  for  $i \in \{0, 1\}$  and  $j \in \{0, 1, 2\}$ , giving  $2 \times 3 = 6$  elements, so  $|G| \leq 6$ .

Define a homomorphism  $\varphi : F(X)/N \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}/6\mathbb{Z}$  by  $\varphi(a) = 3$  and  $\varphi(b) = 2$ . This is well-defined since  $3 + 3 = 0$  and  $2 + 2 + 2 = 0$  in  $\mathbb{Z}/6\mathbb{Z}$ , matching the relations. The commutativity also matches the structure of  $\mathbb{Z}/6\mathbb{Z}$ .

Since  $\varphi$  is surjective and  $|F(X)/N| \leq 6$ , it follows that  $|F(X)/N| = 6$  and  $\varphi$  is an isomorphism. Thus,  $G \cong F(X)/N \cong \mathbb{Z}/6\mathbb{Z}$ , as claimed.  $\square$

## 1.9.10

The operation of free product is commutative and associative: for any groups  $A, B, C$ ,  $A * B \cong B * A$  and  $(A * B) * C \cong A * (B * C)$ .

*Proof.* Let  $A, B, C$  be groups. First, we show that  $A * B \cong B * A$ . The free product  $A * B$  consists of all reduced words formed by alternating elements from  $A$  and  $B$ , and the same holds for  $B * A$ . Therefore we can define a homomorphism  $\varphi : A * B \rightarrow B * A$  where  $\varphi$  is the identity map. The correspondence that sends each reduced word in  $A * B$  to the same word in  $B * A$  (just swapping the roles of  $A$  and  $B$ ). Clearly we have that  $\varphi$  is surjective. To see that  $\varphi$  is injective, note that if  $\varphi(w) = e$  in  $B * A$ , then  $w$  must be the empty word in  $A * B$ , since the only way for a reduced word to map to the identity is if it is itself the identity. Thus,  $\ker(\varphi) = \{e\}$ , so  $\varphi$  is injective. Thus,  $A * B \cong B * A$ .

Next, we show that  $(A * B) * C \cong A * (B * C)$ . We know that  $(A * B) * C$  consists of reduced words alternating among  $A * B$  and  $C$ , but each letter from  $A * B$  is itself a reduced word in  $A$  and  $B$ . By flattening, every element of  $(A * B) * C$  can be written as a reduced word in  $A, B$ , and  $C$ , with no two consecutive letters from the same group. Likewise,  $A * (B * C)$  consists of reduced words alternating among  $A$  and  $B * C$ , and each letter from  $B * C$  is a reduced word in  $B$  and  $C$ . Again, flattening yields reduced words in  $A, B$ , and  $C$ , with no two consecutive letters from the same group. Define a map  $\Phi : (A * B) * C \rightarrow A * (B * C)$  as follows: Given a reduced word  $w$  in  $(A * B) * C$ , write  $w$  as a sequence of letters  $x_1 x_2 \cdots x_n$ , where each  $x_i$  is either a non-identity element from  $A * B$  or  $C$ . If  $x_i$  is from  $A * B$ , further decompose it into its reduced word in  $A$  and  $B$ . Concatenate all these letters to obtain a reduced word in  $A, B$ , and  $C$ . This word is then interpreted as an element of  $A * (B * C)$ . Similarly, define the inverse map  $\Psi : A * (B * C) \rightarrow (A * B) * C$  by grouping consecutive letters from  $A$  and  $B$  into elements of  $A * B$ , and letters from  $C$  as elements of  $C$ , thus forming a reduced word in  $(A * B) * C$ . To see that  $\Phi$  and  $\Psi$  are well-defined, note that the process of flattening and grouping preserves the reduced word property: no two consecutive letters come from the same group, and the group operation is respected. It is clear that  $\Phi$  and  $\Psi$  are inverses of each other, since flattening and grouping are mutually inverse operations. Therefore,  $\Phi$  is a bijection. Hence,  $(A * B) * C \cong A * (B * C)$ .

Hence, the free product is both commutative and associative.  $\square$

## 1.9.11

If  $N$  is the normal subgroup of  $A * B$  generated by  $A$ , then  $(A * B)/N \cong B$ .

*Proof.* Let  $N$  be the normal subgroup of  $A * B$  generated by  $A$ . We want to show that  $(A * B)/N \cong B$ .

The subgroup  $N$  is the smallest normal subgroup containing all elements of  $A$ , so in the quotient  $(A * B)/N$ , every element of  $A$  becomes identified with the identity. In other words, for any  $a \in A$ ,  $aN = N$  in the quotient.

Now, consider any element  $w \in A * B$ . We can write  $w$  as a reduced word  $x_1 x_2 \cdots x_n$ , where each  $x_i$  is either in  $A$  or  $B$ . In the quotient  $(A * B)/N$ , any occurrence of  $x_i \in A$  can be replaced by the identity, since  $x_i N = N$ . Therefore,  $wN$  is equal to the product of all the  $x_i$  that are in  $B$ , with all  $A$ -letters removed. This product is simply an element of  $B$ , since the group operation in  $B$  is preserved.

Thus, every coset in  $(A * B)/N$  can be uniquely represented by an element  $bN$  for some  $b \in B$ . The identity coset is  $N$ , which corresponds to the identity element  $e_B$  in  $B$ .

Define a map  $\varphi : (A * B)/N \rightarrow B$  by  $\varphi(bN) = b$  for  $b \in B$ . To see that  $\varphi$  is well-defined, note that every element of  $(A * B)/N$  is of the form  $bN$  for a unique  $b \in B$ , as shown above.

Next, we check that  $\varphi$  is a homomorphism. For any  $b_1, b_2 \in B$ ,

$$\varphi(b_1N \cdot b_2N) = \varphi(b_1b_2N) = b_1b_2 = \varphi(b_1N)\varphi(b_2N).$$

So  $\varphi$  preserves the group operation.

To see that  $\varphi$  is surjective, observe that for any  $b \in B$ ,  $bN$  is a coset in  $(A * B)/N$ , and  $\varphi(bN) = b$ .

To check injectivity, suppose  $\varphi(b_1N) = \varphi(b_2N)$ . Then  $b_1 = b_2$ , so  $b_1N = b_2N$ .

Therefore,  $\varphi$  is a well-defined isomorphism. Thus we conclude that  $(A * B)/N \cong B$ . □

### 1.9.12

If  $G$  and  $H$  each have more than one element, then  $G * H$  is an infinite group with center  $\langle e \rangle$ .

*Proof.* Let  $G$  and  $H$  be groups, each with more than one element. We want to show that their free product  $G * H$  is infinite and that its center is trivial.

First, we show that  $G * H$  is infinite. Since both  $G$  and  $H$  have more than one element, pick  $g \in G$  and  $h \in H$  with  $g \neq e_G$  and  $h \neq e_H$ . Consider the sequence of words  $w_n = (gh)^n$  for  $n \geq 1$ . Each  $w_n$  is a reduced word of length  $2n$ , and no two such words are equal in  $G * H$  because the free product imposes no relations between  $g$  and  $h$  other than those in their respective groups. Thus, for every  $n$ ,  $w_n$  is distinct, and we can construct arbitrarily long reduced words. Therefore,  $G * H$  is infinite.

Next, we show that the center of  $G * H$  is trivial. Recall that the center  $Z(G * H)$  consists of all elements  $z \in G * H$  such that  $zw = wz$  for all  $w \in G * H$ . Clearly, the identity element  $e$  is in the center. Suppose  $z$  is a nontrivial reduced word in  $G * H$ . We will show that  $z$  cannot commute with all elements of  $G * H$ .

Let  $z$  be a reduced word of length  $k \geq 1$ , say  $z = x_1x_2 \cdots x_k$ , where each  $x_i$  is in  $G$  or  $H$ , and consecutive  $x_i$  are from different groups. Without loss of generality, suppose  $x_k \in H$ . Pick  $h \in H$  with  $h \neq e_H$  and  $h \neq x_k^{-1}$ . Consider the element  $w = h$ . Then,

$$zw = x_1x_2 \cdots x_kh$$

is a reduced word ending with  $x_kh$  (which is not the identity since  $h \neq x_k^{-1}$ ). On the other hand,

$$wz = hx_1x_2 \cdots x_k$$

is a reduced word starting with  $h$ , which is distinct from  $zw$  because the reduced word structure is different. Thus,  $zw \neq wz$ . A similar argument applies if  $x_k \in G$  by choosing  $g \in G$  with  $g \neq e_G$  and  $g \neq x_k^{-1}$ .

Therefore, the only element that commutes with all elements of  $G * H$  is the identity. Thus, the center of  $G * H$  is trivial:

$$Z(G * H) = \langle e \rangle.$$

□

### 1.9.15

If  $f : G_1 \rightarrow G_2$  and  $g : H_1 \rightarrow H_2$  are homomorphisms of groups, then there is a unique homomorphism  $h : G_1 * H_1 \rightarrow G_2 * H_2$  such that  $h|_{G_1} = f$  and  $h|_{H_1} = g$ .

*Proof.* Let  $f : G_1 \rightarrow G_2$  and  $g : H_1 \rightarrow H_2$  be group homomorphisms. We wish to construct a homomorphism  $h : G_1 * H_1 \rightarrow G_2 * H_2$  such that  $h|_{G_1} = f$  and  $h|_{H_1} = g$ , and show that it is unique.

Recall that every element of the free product  $G_1 * H_1$  can be written uniquely as a reduced word  $a_1a_2 \cdots a_n$ , where each  $a_i$  is a non-identity element from either  $G_1$  or  $H_1$ , and consecutive  $a_i$  are from different groups. The empty word corresponds to the identity element.

Define  $h : G_1 * H_1 \rightarrow G_2 * H_2$  as follows:

- For  $g \in G_1$ , set  $h(g) = f(g)$ .
- For  $h_1 \in H_1$ , set  $h(h_1) = g(h_1)$ .
- For a reduced word  $a_1a_2 \cdots a_n$  in  $G_1 * H_1$ , where each  $a_i$  is in  $G_1$  or  $H_1$ , define

$$h(a_1a_2 \cdots a_n) = h(a_1)h(a_2) \cdots h(a_n).$$

- For the identity element (the empty word), set  $h(e) = e$ .

We first verify that  $h$  is a homomorphism. Let  $w = a_1a_2 \cdots a_n$  and  $w' = b_1b_2 \cdots b_m$  be reduced words in  $G_1 * H_1$ . The product  $ww'$  is obtained by concatenating the words, and if the last letter of  $w$  and the first letter of  $w'$  are from the same group, their product is taken in that group and the result is reduced accordingly. Since  $f$  and  $g$  are homomorphisms,  $h$  respects the group operations within  $G_1$  and  $H_1$ , and the concatenation of images under  $h$  corresponds to the product in  $G_2 * H_2$ , with reduction occurring in the same way. Thus,

$$h(ww') = h(a_1a_2 \cdots a_nb_1b_2 \cdots b_m) = h(a_1)h(a_2) \cdots h(a_n)h(b_1)h(b_2) \cdots h(b_m) = h(w)h(w').$$

Therefore,  $h$  is a homomorphism.

Next, we check that  $h$  restricts to  $f$  on  $G_1$  and to  $g$  on  $H_1$ . For any  $g \in G_1$ ,  $h(g) = f(g)$  by definition, and for any  $h_1 \in H_1$ ,  $h(h_1) = g(h_1)$ . Thus,  $h|_{G_1} = f$  and  $h|_{H_1} = g$ .

Finally, we show that  $h$  is unique with these properties. Suppose  $h' : G_1 * H_1 \rightarrow G_2 * H_2$  is another homomorphism such that  $h'|_{G_1} = f$  and  $h'|_{H_1} = g$ . For any reduced word  $a_1a_2 \cdots a_n$  in  $G_1 * H_1$ , we have

$$h'(a_1a_2 \cdots a_n) = h'(a_1)h'(a_2) \cdots h'(a_n).$$

But  $h'(a_i) = f(a_i)$  if  $a_i \in G_1$ , and  $h'(a_i) = g(a_i)$  if  $a_i \in H_1$ , which matches the definition of  $h(a_i)$ . Therefore,

$$h'(a_1a_2 \cdots a_n) = h(a_1)h(a_2) \cdots h(a_n) = h(a_1a_2 \cdots a_n).$$

Thus,  $h' = h$  on all elements of  $G_1 * H_1$ , so  $h$  is unique.

In summary, there exists a unique homomorphism  $h : G_1 * H_1 \rightarrow G_2 * H_2$  such that  $h|_{G_1} = f$  and  $h|_{H_1} = g$ . □

### 2.1.10

- (a) Show that the additive group of rationals  $\mathbb{Q}$  is not finitely generated.
- (b) Show that  $\mathbb{Q}$  is not free.
- (c) Conclude that Exercise 9 is false if the hypothesis "finitely generated" is omitted.

- (a) *Proof.* Suppose, for contradiction, that  $\mathbb{Q}$  is finitely generated as an abelian group. That is, there exist finitely many elements  $q_1, q_2, \dots, q_n \in \mathbb{Q}$  such that every rational number can be written as an integer linear combination of these generators. Write each  $q_i$  in lowest terms as  $q_i = \frac{a_i}{b_i}$ , where  $a_i \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $b_i \in \mathbb{N}$ , and  $\gcd(a_i, b_i) = 1$ .

Let  $k = b_1b_2 \cdots b_n$  be the product of all denominators. Consider the subgroup  $H = \langle q_1, q_2, \dots, q_n \rangle \leq \mathbb{Q}$ . Any element  $q \in H$  can be written as an integer linear combination:

$$q = d_1q_1 + d_2q_2 + \cdots + d_nq_n = \frac{d_1a_1}{b_1} + \frac{d_2a_2}{b_2} + \cdots + \frac{d_na_n}{b_n}$$

for some  $d_1, \dots, d_n \in \mathbb{Z}$ . By clearing denominators, we can write this sum as a single fraction with denominator  $k$ :

$$q = \frac{d_1a_1 \frac{k}{b_1} + d_2a_2 \frac{k}{b_2} + \cdots + d_na_n \frac{k}{b_n}}{k}$$

Thus, every element of  $H$  is a rational number whose denominator divides  $k$ ; in other words,  $H \subseteq \langle \frac{1}{k} \rangle$ , the subgroup of  $\mathbb{Q}$  consisting of all rational numbers with denominator dividing  $k$ .

However,  $\mathbb{Q}$  contains elements such as  $\frac{1}{k+1}$ , which cannot be written as an integer linear combination of elements with denominator  $k$ . Therefore,  $\langle q_1, \dots, q_n \rangle$  cannot be all of  $\mathbb{Q}$ , contradicting our assumption that  $\mathbb{Q}$  is finitely generated.

Hence, the additive group of rationals  $\mathbb{Q}$  is not finitely generated. □

- (b) *Proof.* Assume  $\mathbb{Q}$  were free, say with a generating set  $X$ . Let  $\iota : X \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}$  be the inclusion map. Define  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$  by  $f(x) = 1$  for all  $x \in X$ . By the universal property of free abelian groups, there exists a unique homomorphism  $\varphi : \mathbb{Q} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $\varphi \circ \iota = f$ . Then, see that  $\varphi(\iota(x)) = f(x) = 1$  for all  $x \in X$ . Since  $\varphi$  is a homomorphism, for any  $q \in \mathbb{Q}$ , which can be expressed as a finite integer linear combination of elements from  $X$ , we have

$$\varphi(q) = \varphi \left( \sum_{i=1}^n d_i x_i \right) = \sum_{i=1}^n d_i \varphi(x_i) = \sum_{i=1}^n d_i.$$

However, this implies that  $\varphi(q)$  is always an integer, which contradicts the fact that  $\mathbb{Q}$  contains elements that cannot be mapped to integers in a way that preserves the group structure. For example, consider  $q = \frac{1}{2}$ . There is no integer  $n$  such that  $\varphi(\frac{1}{2}) = n$  while still satisfying the homomorphism property for all elements of  $\mathbb{Q}$ . Thus,  $\varphi$  cannot be well-defined for all of  $\mathbb{Q}$ , contradicting the assumption that  $\mathbb{Q}$  is free. Therefore,  $\mathbb{Q}$  is not a free abelian group. □

- (c) Since  $\mathbb{Q}$  is an abelian group where no element (except 0) has finite order, exercise 9 does not hold. This is the case as in (a) we showed that  $\mathbb{Q}$  is not finitely generated, and in (b) we showed that  $\mathbb{Q}$  is not free. Thus, the hypothesis "finitely generated" is necessary for exercise 9 to hold.

### Problem 1

(Algebra Qual, Jan 2016) Let  $D_k$  be the dihedral group of order  $2k$ , where  $k \geq 3$ .

- (a) Show that the number of automorphisms of the group  $D_k$  is equal to  $k \cdot \varphi(k)$ . Here  $\varphi$  is the Euler  $\varphi$ -function.  
(b) Automorphisms of  $D_k$  form a group; let us denote it by  $\text{Aut}(D_k)$ . What is the structure of  $\text{Aut}(D_k)$ ? Describe the group as explicitly as you can.

- (a) *Proof.* Recall that  $D_k$  is generated by two elements  $r$  and  $s$  with relations  $r^k = s^2 = e$  and  $sr s = r^{-1}$ . The element  $r$  represents a rotation by  $\frac{2\pi}{k}$  radians, and  $s$  represents a reflection.

An automorphism  $\varphi \in \text{Aut}(D_k)$  is determined by its action on the generators  $r$  and  $s$ . Since  $\varphi$  must preserve the order of elements, we have: -  $\varphi(r)$  must be an element of order  $k$ . The elements of order  $k$  in  $D_k$  are precisely the powers of  $r$ , i.e.,  $\{r^m : 1 \leq m < k, \gcd(m, k) = 1\}$ . There are  $\varphi(k)$  such elements. -  $\varphi(s)$  must be an element of order 2. The elements of order 2 in  $D_k$  are the reflections, which can be written as  $sr^j$  for  $0 \leq j < k$ . There are exactly  $k$  such elements.

Therefore, for each choice of  $\varphi(r) = r^m$  (with  $\gcd(m, k) = 1$ ), there are  $k$  choices for  $\varphi(s)$ . Thus, the total number of automorphisms is given by:

$$|\text{Aut}(D_k)| = k \cdot \varphi(k).$$

□

- (b) The automorphism group  $\text{Aut}(D_k)$  of the dihedral group  $D_k$  can be understood by analyzing how automorphisms act on the generators of  $D_k$ . Recall that  $D_k$  is generated by a rotation  $r$  of order  $k$  and a reflection  $s$  of order 2, with the relation  $sr s^{-1} = r^{-1}$ .

Any automorphism must send  $r$  to another element of order  $k$ , which must be some power  $r^a$  where  $a$  is coprime to  $k$  (i.e.,  $a \in (\mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z})^\times$ ). Similarly,  $s$  can be sent to  $r^b s$  for some  $b \in \mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z}$ , since  $r^b s$  is also a reflection.

The set of possible choices for  $a$  forms the group  $(\mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z})^\times$ , and the choices for  $b$  form the group  $\mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z}$ . However, the way  $a$  and  $b$  interact is not independent: the choice of  $a$  affects how  $b$  acts, so the automorphism group is not a direct product, but a semidirect product.

Therefore, we have:

$$\text{Aut}(D_k) \cong (\mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z})^\times \ltimes \mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z}$$

where  $(\mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z})^\times$  acts on  $\mathbb{Z}/k\mathbb{Z}$  by multiplication.

### Problem 2

(Algebra Qual, Aug 2018) For a finite group  $G$ , denote by  $s(G)$  the number of its subgroups.

- (a) Show that  $s(G)$  is finite.  
(b) Show that if  $H$  is a nontrivial subgroup of  $G$ , then  $s(G/H) < s(G)$ .  
(c) Show that  $s(G) = 2$  if and only if  $G$  is a cyclic of prime order.  
(d) Show that  $s(G) = 3$  if and only if  $G$  is cyclic group whose order is a square of a prime.

Let  $G$  be a finite group.

- (a) *Proof.* Since  $G$  is finite, it has a finite number of elements. Any subgroup  $H \leq G$  is determined by a subset of  $G$  that is closed under the group operation and taking inverses. The number of subsets of a finite set with  $n$  elements is  $2^n$ , which is finite. Since not all subsets are subgroups, the number of subgroups  $s(G)$  is at most  $2^{|G|}$ , which is finite. Therefore,  $s(G)$  is finite. □  
(b) *Proof.* Let  $H$  be a nontrivial subgroup of  $G$ . Consider the quotient group  $G/H$ . There is a natural correspondence between the subgroups of  $G/H$  and the subgroups of  $G$  that contain  $H$ . Specifically, if  $K/H$  is a subgroup of  $G/H$ , then  $K$  is a subgroup of  $G$  containing  $H$ . Conversely, if  $K$  is a subgroup of  $G$  containing  $H$ , then  $K/H$  is a subgroup of  $G/H$ . This correspondence is bijective.

Since  $H$  is nontrivial, there exists at least one subgroup of  $G$  that contains  $H$ , namely  $H$  itself. However, not all subgroups of  $G$  contain  $H$ . Therefore, the number of subgroups of  $G/H$  is strictly less than the number of subgroups of  $G$ . Hence, we have:

$$s(G/H) < s(G).$$

□

(c) *Proof.* ( $\Rightarrow$ ) Suppose  $s(G) = 2$ . The only subgroups of  $G$  are the trivial subgroup  $\langle e \rangle$  and  $G$  itself. Then for any  $g \in G$  with  $g \neq e$ , the subgroup  $\langle g \rangle$  generated by  $g$  must be either  $\langle e \rangle$  or  $G$ . Since  $g \neq e$ , we have  $\langle g \rangle = G$ . Thus,  $G$  is cyclic and generated by any of its non-identity elements. Now, if the order of  $G$  were composite, say  $|G| = mn$  with  $m, n > 1$ , then  $G$  would have a subgroup of order  $m$  (by Cauchy's theorem), contradicting the assumption that  $s(G) = 2$ . Therefore, the order of  $G$  must be prime. Hence,  $G \cong \mathbb{Z}/p\mathbb{Z}$  for some prime  $p$ .

( $\Leftarrow$ ) Conversely, if  $G \cong \mathbb{Z}/p\mathbb{Z}$  for some prime  $p$ , then the only subgroups of  $G$  are  $\langle e \rangle$  and  $G$  itself. Thus,  $s(G) = 2$ .

Hence, we conclude that  $s(G) = 2$  if and only if  $G$  is cyclic of prime order. □

(d) *Proof.* We prove both directions.

( $\Rightarrow$ ) Suppose  $G$  is a cyclic group of order  $p^2$  for some prime  $p$ . Then  $G \cong \mathbb{Z}/p^2\mathbb{Z}$ , and every subgroup of  $G$  is cyclic. The subgroups of a cyclic group of order  $n$  correspond to the divisors of  $n$ . For  $n = p^2$ , the divisors are 1,  $p$ , and  $p^2$ . Thus, the subgroups are:

- The trivial subgroup  $\langle e \rangle$  of order 1,
- The subgroup  $\langle a^p \rangle$  of order  $p$ , where  $a$  is a generator of  $G$ ,
- The whole group  $G$  itself, of order  $p^2$ .

There are no other divisors of  $p^2$ , so these are the only subgroups. Therefore,  $s(G) = 3$ .

( $\Leftarrow$ ) Now suppose  $G$  is a finite group with  $s(G) = 3$ . That is,  $G$  has exactly three subgroups: the trivial subgroup,  $G$  itself, and one proper nontrivial subgroup  $H$ . We claim that  $G$  must be cyclic of order  $p^2$  for some prime  $p$ .

First, note that every group has the trivial subgroup and itself as subgroups, so the only possibility for  $s(G) = 3$  is that there is exactly one proper nontrivial subgroup  $H$ . Consider any  $a \in G$  with  $a \neq e$ . The subgroup  $\langle a \rangle$  generated by  $a$  is a subgroup of  $G$ . Since  $s(G) = 3$ , every non-identity element must generate either  $G$  or  $H$ . If  $a$  generates  $G$ , then  $G$  is cyclic. If  $a$  generates  $H$ , then  $H$  must be cyclic as well.

Suppose  $G$  is not cyclic. Then for every  $a \neq e$ ,  $\langle a \rangle$  is a proper subgroup, so must be  $H$ . But then  $H$  contains all non-identity elements of  $G$ , so  $H = G$ , which is a contradiction. Therefore,  $G$  must be cyclic.

Let  $|G| = n$ . Suppose  $n = pq$  for distinct primes  $p$  and  $q$ . Then  $G$  would have subgroups of orders  $p$  and  $q$ , contradicting the assumption that there is only one proper nontrivial subgroup. Thus,  $n$  must be a power of a single prime, say  $n = p^k$ . If  $k \geq 3$ , then  $G$  would have subgroups of orders  $p$  and  $p^2$ , again contradicting the assumption. Hence,  $k$  must be 1 or 2. If  $k = 1$ , then  $G$  is cyclic of prime order, which has  $s(G) = 2$ . Thus,  $k$  must be 2.

Therefore,  $G$  is cyclic of order  $p^2$  for some prime  $p$ .

Thus, as desired,  $s(G) = 3$  if and only if  $G$  is cyclic of order  $p^2$  for some prime  $p$ . □