

## Double Effect Slides

*Trolley:* A runaway trolley is speeding down a track. If you do nothing, the trolley will hit five people. If you pull a lever, the trolley will be diverted onto another track and hit just one person.

*Large Man:* A runaway trolley is speeding down a track. If you do nothing, the trolley will pass under a tunnel and hit five people. If you push a large man standing over the entrance of the tunnel, the trolley will hit the large man and stop before it reaches the five.

*Terror Bomber.* Aims to bring about civilian deaths as a means to weaken the resolve of the enemy and end the war.

*Tactical Bomber.* Aims to destroy military targets in order to end the war. Foresees that the destruction of such targets result in civilian casualties.

### *The Doctrine of Double Effect*

(DDE): A person may permissibly perform an action that is foreseen to cause an evil if:

- (i) the action is not wrong in itself,
- (ii) the good effect is intended,
- (iii) the evil effect is not intended (either as an end or as a means), and
- (iv) there is proportionally grave reason for permitting the evil.

- Trolley and Tactical Bomber: (i)-(iv) are satisfied.
- Large Man and Terror Bomber: (iii) is not satisfied.

## The Argument from Modified Intentions

- (1) If DDE is true, then the modified terror bomber and large man pusher didn't do anything wrong.
- (2) But they did do something wrong.
- (3) So, DDE is not true.

*Modified Terror Bomber:* Just like *Terror Bomber* with the exception that she doesn't intend to bring about the deaths of the civilians to be the means of ending the war. She only intends to separate out the bodies of civilians in such a way that they look dead long enough to bring about the belief that they are dead and to speed the end the war.

*Modified Large Man:* Just like *Large Man* with the exception that you don't intend to bring about the death of the large man. You only intend to impact the body of the large man in such a way that the trolley stops before it reaches the five.

### *The Normal Circumstances Solution*

(iii\*): there is no intended effect such that under normal circumstances, when that effect happens, something really bad happens.

Replace (iii) in DDE with (iii\*).

- Modified Large Man: Under normal circumstances, when someone's body is impacted with a trolley, that person dies or is seriously injured.
- Trolley: Under normal circumstances, when a lever is pulled, nobody dies or is seriously injured.
- Modified Terror Bomber: Under normal circumstances, when a civilian's body is impacted with a bomb in such a way that they look dead, that civilian dies.
- Tactical Bomber: Under normal circumstances, when a military target is destroyed, no civilians die.

## The Argument Against the Normal Circumstances Solution

- (1) If the Normal Circumstances Solution is true, then the bomber and the pusher in *Munitions Factory* and *Padded Large Man* did something wrong.
- (2) But they didn't do anything wrong.
- (3) So, the Normal Circumstances Solution is not true.

*Munitions Factory*: Normally, munitions factories are located in urban areas near civilians. If the tactical bomber aims to blow up a munitions factor to end the war, she is aiming to do something that normally results in civilian deaths.

*Padded Large Man*: Just like Large Man with the exception that the large man is padded in such a way that the trolley will not harm him. Normally pushing someone into a trolley results in their death or serious injury.