assistant: Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-112] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-1] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. 2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?

assistant:plan\_task-{"query": Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: ### Final Plan for Exploring the Effect of Nb Concentration on Critical Fracture Toughness in NbMo Alloys

#### Step 1: Define the Task Parameters

- Material: NbMo alloys
- Potential: NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential
- Nb concentration range: 0% to 100% in intervals of 20%
- Box size: 50 A... along free surfaces, 20 A... along other directions

## Step 2: Set Up Crack Systems

- · Define the crack systems:
  - System (a): [100] propagation, [010] plane, [001] front
  - System (b): [1-10] propagation, [111] plane, [-1-12] front
  - System (c): [111] propagation, [11-2] plane, [-110] front
  - System (d): [1-1-2] propagation, [110] plane, [1-11] front

## Step 3: Compute Surface Energy for Each Crack System

- Task: For each crack system and each Nb concentration, compute the surface energy.
  - Iterations: Nb concentrations: 0%, 20%, 40%, 60%, 80%, 100%
  - Parameters: Specify the crack plane and use the defined box sizes

# **Step 4: Compute Elastic Constants**

- Task: For each Nb concentration, compute the elastic constants (C11, C12, C44).
  - Purpose: Necessary for calculating the critical stress intensity factor.

#### Step 5: Calculate Critical Stress Intensity Factor (KIc)

- Task: Calculate KIc for each crack system and each Nb concentration
  - Data: Use the surface energy and elastic constants obtained from the previous steps.

## Step 6: Plot Results

- Task: Plot the critical stress intensity factor (KIc) as a function of Nb concentration for each crack system.
  - Visualization: Helps visualize how KIc varies with Nb concentration and identify trends.

## Step 7: Analyze and Discuss Results

- Task: Draw conclusions from the plotted data.
  - · Discussion Points: Discuss the preferential crack plane for each system based on the results.

## Step 8: Final Review and Compilation

- Task: Compile all results, plots, and discussions into a comprehensive report.
- Review: Ensure accuracy and completeness of the analysis.

# Tools to be Used

- computation\_task\_surface\_energy
- computation task
- critical\_stress\_intensity\_cleavage
- save\_image\_data
- analyze plot

This final plan provides a comprehensive and systematic approach to exploring the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness in NbMo alloys for various crack systems. Each step builds upon the previous one, ensuring a thorough analysis and discussion of the results.

assistant:computation tasksurface energy-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 0% Nb concentration along the [010] plane is:

- 0.177 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.837 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 20% Nb concentration along the [010] plane has been computed. The results are as follows:

Surface energy: 0.179 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>

Surface energy: 2.867 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 40% Nb concentration along the [010] plane is:

- 0.171 eV/Ã...Â2
- 2.743 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 60% Nb concentration along the [010] plane is:

- 0.165 eV/Ã...Â2
- 2.636 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

# TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 80% Nb concentration along the [010] plane has been computed. The results are:

- Surface energy: 0.154 eV/Ã...Â2
- Surface energy: 2.470 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 100% Nb concentration along the [010] plane is:

- 0.146 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.335 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

assistant:computationtasksurface\_energy-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [-111] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 0% Nb concentration along the [111] plane is:

- 2.723 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

### TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 20% Nb concentration along the [111] plane is:

- $0.172 \text{ eV/}\tilde{A}...\hat{A}^2$
- 2.751 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

### TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 40% Nb concentration along the [111] plane is:

- 0.167 eV/Ų
- 2.683 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 60% Nb concentration along the [111] plane is:

- 0.160 eV/Ã...²
- 2.570 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 80% Nb concentration along the [111] plane is:

- 0.153 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.452 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

#### TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 100% Nb concentration along the [111] plane has been computed. The results are as follows:

Surface Energy: 0.141 eV/A...Â<sup>2</sup>

## • Surface Energy: 2.264 J/mÂ

#### TERMINATE

assistant:computation tasksurface\_energy-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [011] crack plane, and [011] crack propagation, [111] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack propagation, [11-2] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 0% Nb concentration along the [1, 1, -2] plane is:

- 0.166 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.666 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 20% Nb concentration along the [1, 1, -2] plane is:

- 0.172 eV/Ã...²
- 2.758 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 40% Nb concentration along the [1, 1, -2] plane has been computed. The results are as follows:

- Surface energy: 0.168 eV/A...Â2
- Surface energy: 2.688 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 60% Nb concentration along the [1, 1, -2] plane is:

- 0.160 eV/Ã...Â2
- 2.569 I/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The persistent error indicates that there might be a deeper issue with the input parameters or the function itself. To troubleshoot, I'll break down the parameters and ensure each one is correctly formatted and of the correct type

Let's try a step-by-step approach to identify the issue. I'll start by verifying the orientation vectors and surface orientation. It seems that the error persists despite multiple attempts. The issue might be related to the internal handling of the parameters by the function.

Given the consistent nature of the error, it might be best to escalate this issue for further investigation

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 100% Nb concentration along the [1, 1, -2] plane is:

- 0.138 eV/Ã…Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.211 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

assistant:computation tasksurface energy-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 0% Nb concentration along the [110] plane is

- 0.157 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.511 J/mÂ

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 20% Nb concentration along the [110] plane is:

• 0.181 eV/Ã...Â2

2.905 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

#### TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 40% Nb concentration along the [110] plane is:

- 0.169 eV/Ã...Â2
- 2.704 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

#### TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 60% Nb concentration along the [110] plane is:

- 0.162 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.602 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

## TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 80% Nb concentration along the [110] plane is:

- 0.150 eV/Ã...²
- 2.399 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

### TERMINATE

The surface energy for the NbMo alloy with 100% Nb concentration along the [110] plane is:

- 0.127 eV/Ã...Â<sup>2</sup>
- 2.038 J/mÂ<sup>2</sup>

### TERMINATE

assistant:computation\_task-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [011] crack plane, and [011] crack plane, and [011] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: The elastic constants for the NbMo alloy with 0% Nb concentration are as follows:

- C11: 390.78 GPa
- C12: 174.21 GPa
- C44: 85.21 GPa

The computed elastic constants for the NbMo alloy with 20% Nb concentration are as follows:

- (C {11}) = 397.43 GPa
- (C\_{12}) = 167.77 GPa
- (C\_{44}) = 78.32 GPa

The elastic constants for the NbMo alloy with 40% Nb concentration are as follows:

- C11: 367.65 GPa
- C12: 158.86 GPa
- C44: 60.33 GPa

The computed elastic constants for the NbMo alloy with 60% Nb concentration are as follows:

- C11: 308.61 GPa
- C12: 147.04 GPa
- C44: 34.40 GPa

The elastic constants for the NbMo alloy with 80% Nb concentration are as follows:

- C11: 236.84 GPa
- C12: 132.83 GPa
- **C44**: 11.51 GPa

The elastic constants for the NbMo alloy with 100% Nb concentration are as follows:

- C11: 238.06 GPa
- **C12**: 159.75 GPa
- **C44**: 24.96 GPa

assistant:criticalstressintensity\_cleavage-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [011] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-10] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.275"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.274"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.153"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.944"} {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.644"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.709"}

assistant:criticalstressintensity\_cleavage-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [101] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.229"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.217"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.102"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.886"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m $^1/2$ )": "0.592"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.680"}

assistant:criticalstressintensity\_cleavage-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [1010] crack plane, and [011] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-10] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.223"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.231"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.118"} {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.905"} {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.585"} {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.747"}

assistant:criticalstressintensity\_cleavage-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.178"} {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.248"} {"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "1.102"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.887"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.582"}

{"Critical fracture toughness (MPa\*m^1/2)": "0.642"}

assistant:saveimagedata-{"query": "Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-110] crack front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: The name of the file is KIc\_vs\_Nb\_concentration.png.

assistant:analyze plot-{"query":"Explore the effect of Nb concentration on the critical fracture toughness for the following crack systems in NbMo alloys: (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-10] crack plane, and [-1-10] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-10] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-10] crack plane, front direction. (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction. Use NbMo.mtp moment tensor potential (Nb is the first element and Mo is the second element) and consider Nb concentration from 0 to 100 in intervals of 20. Also, for surface energy calculations, consider 50 Angstrom as the box size along free surfaces and 20 along other directions. Finally, plot the results as a function of Nb concentration and discuss them. What is the preferential crack plane in each system?"}

tool: Based on the provided graph showing the variation of critical fracture toughness (KIc) as a function of Nb concentration for different crack systems in NbMo alloys, we can draw several conclusions and identify the preferential crack planes for each system.

## Observations:

### 1. General Trend:

- For all crack systems, the critical fracture toughness (KIc) generally decreases as the Nb concentration increases from 0% to 80%.
- There is a slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration for all crack systems.

#### 2. Specific Crack Systems:

# • [100][010][001] (Blue Line):

- This system shows the highest KIc values at lower Nb concentrations (0% to 40%).
- The KIc decreases significantly from 40% to 80% Nb concentration.
- There is a slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration.

## • [1-10][111][1-12] (Orange Line):

- This system has relatively stable KIc values up to 20% Nb concentration.
- The KIc decreases steadily from 20% to 80% Nb concentration.
- A slight increase in KIc is observed at 100% Nb concentration.

# • [111][11-2][-110] (Green Line):

- This system shows a similar trend to the orange line, with stable KIc values up to 20% Nb concentration.
- The KIc decreases steadily from 20% to 80% Nb concentration.
- A slight increase in KIc is observed at 100% Nb concentration.

# • [1-1-2][110][1-11] (Red Line):

- This system has the lowest KIc values at lower Nb concentrations (0% to 20%).
  The KIc decreases steadily from 20% to 80% Nb concentration.
- A slight increase in KIc is observed at 100% Nb concentration.

## Conclusions:

## 1. Preferential Crack Plane:

- At lower Nb concentrations (0% to 40%), the [100][010][001] crack system exhibits the highest critical fracture toughness, indicating it is the most resistant to fracture.
- At higher Nb concentrations (80% to 100%), the differences in KIc values among the crack systems are less pronounced, but the [100][010][001] system still shows a slight advantage

## 2. Effect of Nb Concentration:

- Increasing Nb concentration generally reduces the critical fracture toughness for all crack systems, with a significant drop observed between 40% and 80% Nb concentration.
- The slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration suggests a possible change in the fracture mechanism or material properties at this composition.

## **Summary:**

- The [100][010][001] crack system is the preferential crack plane at lower Nb concentrations due to its higher critical fracture toughness.
- All crack systems show a decrease in KIc with increasing Nb concentration, with a slight recovery at 100% Nb concentration.

user: ### Analysis of Critical Fracture Toughness (KIc) in NbMo Alloys

The critical fracture toughness (KIc) as a function of Nb concentration for different crack systems in NbMo alloys is plotted and analyzed. The crack systems considered are: - (a) [100] crack propagation, [010] crack plane, and [001] crack front direction. - (b) [1-10] crack propagation, [111] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack front direction. - (c) [111] crack propagation, [11-2] crack plane, and [-1-12] crack propagation. plane, and [-110] crack front direction. - (d) [1-1-2] crack propagation, [110] crack plane, and [1-11] crack front direction.

## Observations:

## 1. General Trend:

- For all crack systems, the critical fracture toughness (KIc) generally decreases as the Nb concentration increases from 0% to 80%.
- There is a slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration for all crack systems.

## 2. Specific Crack Systems:

## o [100][010][001] (Blue Line):

- This system shows the highest KIc values at lower Nb concentrations (0% to 40%).
- The KIc decreases significantly from 40% to 80% Nb concentration. There is a slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration.

## • [1-10][111][1-12] (Orange Line):

- This system has relatively stable KIc values up to 20% Nb concentration.
   The KIc decreases steadily from 20% to 80% Nb concentration.
- A slight increase in KIc is observed at 100% Nb concentration.

# • [111][11-2][-110] (Green Line):

- This system shows a similar trend to the orange line, with stable KIC values up to 20% Nb concentration.
- The KIc decreases steadily from 20% to 80% Nb concentration.

- A slight increase in KIc is observed at 100% Nb concentration
- [1-1-2][110][1-11] (Red Line):
  - This system has the lowest KIc values at lower Nb concentrations (0% to 20%).
  - $\bullet$  The KIc decreases steadily from 20% to 80% Nb concentration
  - A slight increase in KIc is observed at 100% Nb concentration.

## Conclusions:

### 1. Preferential Crack Plane:

- At lower Nb concentrations (0% to 40%), the [100][010][001] crack system exhibits the highest critical fracture toughness, indicating it is the most resistant to fracture.
- At higher Nb concentrations (80% to 100%), the differences in KIc values among the crack systems are less pronounced, but the [100][010][001] system still shows a slight advantage.

### 2. Effect of Nb Concentration:

- Increasing Nb concentration generally reduces the critical fracture toughness for all crack systems, with a significant drop observed between 40% and 80% Nb concentration.
- The slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration suggests a possible change in the fracture mechanism or material properties at this composition.

## **Summary:**

- The [100][010][010] crack system is the preferential crack plane at lower Nb concentrations due to its higher critical fracture toughness.
- All crack systems show a decrease in KIc with increasing Nb concentration, with a slight recovery at 100% Nb concentration.

The plot of the critical fracture toughness (KIc) as a function of Nb concentration for each crack system is saved as  $KIc_vs_Nb_c$  concentration.png.



assistant: Isn't the preferential crack plane the one with the lowest fracture toughness?

user: You are correct. The preferential crack plane is typically the one with the lowest fracture toughness, as it is the plane along which the material is most likely to fracture. Let's re-evaluate the results with this in mind.

## **Re-evaluation of Results:**

#### Observations:

## 1. General Trend:

- For all crack systems, the critical fracture toughness (KIc) generally decreases as the Nb concentration increases from 0% to 80%.
- There is a slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration for all crack systems.

- [100][010][001] (Blue Line):
  - KIc values: 1.275, 1.274, 1.153, 0.944, 0.644, 0.709
- [1-10][111][1-12] (Orange Line):
- Kic values: 1.229, 1.217, 1.102, 0.886, 0.592, 0.680 [111][11-2][-110] (Green Line):
- - KIc values: 1.223, 1.231, 1.118, 0.905, 0.585, 0.747
- [1-1-2][110][1-11] (Red Line): KIc values: 1.178, 1.248, 1.102, 0.887, 0.582, 0.642

## Conclusions

## 1. Preferential Crack Plane:

- $At lower \ Nb \ concentrations \ (0\% \ to \ 40\%), \ the \ [1-1-2][110][1-11] \ crack \ system \ exhibits \ the \ lowest \ critical \ fracture \ toughness, indicating it is the \ most \ likely \ to \ fracture.$
- At higher Nb concentrations (60% to 100%), the [1-1-2][110][1-11] and [111][11-2][-110] crack systems show the lowest KIc values, indicating they are the most likely to fracture.

## 2. Effect of Nb Concentration:

- Increasing Nb concentration generally reduces the critical fracture toughness for all crack systems, with a significant drop observed between 40% and 80% Nb concentration.
- The slight increase in KIc at 100% Nb concentration suggests a possible change in the fracture mechanism or material properties at this composition.

## Summary:

- The [1-1-2][110][1-11] crack system is the preferential crack plane at lower Nb concentrations due to its lower critical fracture toughness.
- At higher Nb concentrations, both the [1-1-2][110][1-11] and [111][11-2][-110] crack systems are preferential due to their lower KIc values.

## Plot:

The plot of the critical fracture toughness (KIc) as a function of Nb concentration for each crack system is saved as KIc\_vs\_Nb\_concentration.png.

