Effort Displacement Overview

Min-Yang Lee* Greg Ardini† Marina Chaji‡ Melanie Harsch§ Alan Haynie¶ Bryce McManus $^{\parallel}$ Tammy Murphy** Lisa Pfeiffer †† Eric Thunberg ‡‡

March 21, 2022, 08:20

Research Question and Motivation

Plain English

How will wind energy development affect the Limited Access Scallop Fishery? Where will firms choose to fish when areas are closed? Will firms fish less? How much worse off with firms be?

Economic Jargon

What are the annual changes in profits (or producer surplus) when a single wind area is closed? When many are closed? If all are closed?

```
*NEFSC, Min-Yang.Lee@noaa.gov

†NEFSC, Gregory.Ardini@noaa.gov

‡NEFSC, Marina.Chaji@noaa.gov

§AFSC Melanie.Harsch@noaa.gov

¶AFSC, Alan.Haynie@noaa.gov

#AFSC, Bryce.McManus@noaa.gov

**NEFSC, Tammy.Murphy@noaa.gov

††NWFSC, Lisa.Pfeiffer@noaa.gov
```

^{‡‡}NMFS OS&T, Eric.Thunberg@noaa.gov

Empirical Setting

Scallop Fishery

We are modeling the location choices of fishing vessels in the Limited Access Days-at-Sea scallop fishery. There are approximately 300-330 of these fishing vessels. They are allocated "Open Area Days-at-Sea" and a quantity of trips and/or pounds into the "Access Areas." They catch approximately 95% of the scallops. The Limited Access DAS fleet can be further subdivided into Full-Time, Part-Time, and Occasional Fleets. Vessels primarily use the New Bedford scallop dredge, but a few use a smaller dredge or a bottom trawl. Over the 13 years in our dataset, there are approximately 40,000 trips taken by this fleet, split roughly evenly into "Open areas" and "Access Areas."

For Fishing Year 2016 and earlier, the fishing year Ran from March 1 to Feb 28/29. For fishing year 2017, the year ran from March 1 to March 31. For 2018 and later, the fishing year runs from April 1 to March 31.

Wind Energy

Here is a short description of the wind energy areas, how large they are, and how they will close (or not close) area to fishing. 18 wind areas currently under dev. But many more are likely.

How close will fishing be able to occur within Wind Lease Areas / Turbines?

There is no one size fits all approach to the question of distance between wind turbines and where scallop fishing may occur. Based on interviews conducted by the Cooperative Research Branch with scallop industry members, it was determined that operations within 1nm of the turbines are unlikely due to both safety concerns and insurance liability. Captains will have varying levels of risk aversion, and corporations may develop their own guidance to captains of their vessels. The buffer zone between turbines and vessel operations is unlikely to be greater than 5nm.

The wind energy areas do not match the ten minute squares; we are currently planning on simulating the effects of closing a wind energy area by closing an entire ten minute square that is inside or touching a WEA.

Wind energy areas and 10 minute squares frequently have partial overlap. We make an assumption in these cases that if X% (TBD, maybe >0%) of a ten minute square is located in a wind energy lease area, that square will be considered off limits to fishing. The presence of wind energy areas will increase transit times for many scallop trips, even if their fishing location was not impacted by turbines. Our model accounts for the increased cost of transit... (TBD)

The buried cable route from a WEA to shore is likely to be closed as well. Cable buried at shallow depths and marked with concrete. > Scallop dredging will not be possible in areas where buried cables, running from the shore out to the turbines, are located. Cables are buried at shallow depths and reinforced with concrete. Vessel operators will not want to risk damaging their gear by dredging too close to these areas; we estimate that operators will avoid dredging within 0.5nm of any buried cables. The location of the cables is extracted from construction operations plans (there will be more to add here).

Data

There are four main data sources (so far). None are perfect.

We have decided to use the DMIS as our primary dataset. DMIS primarily uses Vessel Trip Reports (VTRs) for "trip" and "effort" data and dealer databases for landings. A drawback of using these data are that there is a single point (latitude and longitude) for each time a vessel deploys a particular type of gear into a statistical area. In the LADAS scallop fleet, vessels rarely, if ever, will switch gears at sea. So, a trip is most likely to have multiple VTRs if it switches statistical areas.

Other possibilities were considered for our primary dataset:

- 1. Observer cover a subset of the fishery. According to the 2021 SBRM report, it was approximately 8-10% of effort for the Limited access fleet. This would provide haul level lat-lon and estimates of catch for the sampled subset. We viewed the subset as too limited it would provide us with observations of approximately 200 Access area and 100 open area trips per year. Observer data contains the sailing and landing port.
- 2. VMS VMS data would provide lat-lon at a high frequency. Other researchers have used this; however we uncomfortable with figuring out how to allocate catch along the VMS track. VMS data contains the sailing and landing port.
- 3. Rasters. The raster data are an intermediate data product that combines trip report with a statistical model describes the distance between observed hauls and the vtr point location. This allows for a smoothing of effort catch across a non-arbitrary grid (like a 10 minute square, statistical area, or just a lat-lon point).

Further detail about our data can be found here.

Some summary statistcs

The filter we are doing is has scallop landings.

```
# Here are a few summary statistics tables. Nothing too fancy. This may be sufficient.
summary(final_product_lease)
```

```
##
        TRIPID
                            OPERATOR
                                                  OPERNUM
                                                                       NSUBTRIP
##
    Min.
            :2.679e+06
                          Length: 165868
                                              Min.
                                                        410392
                                                                           :1.000
                                                      :
##
                                              1st Qu.:10002645
    1st Qu.:3.157e+06
                          Class : character
                                                                   1st Qu.:1.000
##
    Median :4.020e+06
                               :character
                                              Median: 10009375
                                                                   Median :1.000
##
    Mean
            :6.238e+11
                                              Mean
                                                      :10008984
                                                                   Mean
                                                                           :1.031
##
    3rd Qu.:4.891e+06
                                              3rd Qu.:10014818
                                                                   3rd Qu.:1.000
##
    Max.
            :4.105e+13
                                              Max.
                                                      :10024074
                                                                           :8.000
                                                                   Max.
##
                                              NA's
                                                      :4370
##
         CREW
                       VTR_PORTNUM
                                              IMGID
                                                                   YEAR
                                                               Length: 165868
##
    Min.
            : 1.000
                              : 71011
                                         Min.
                                                 :2.468e+06
##
    1st Qu.: 3.000
                       1st Qu.:240403
                                         1st Qu.:2.874e+06
                                                               Class : character
##
    Median : 3.000
                      Median :330127
                                         Median :3.755e+06
                                                               Mode
                                                                    :character
            : 3.843
                              :299650
                                                 :6.228e+13
##
    Mean
                      Mean
                                         Mean
##
    3rd Qu.: 5.000
                       3rd Qu.:330309
                                         3rd Qu.:4.657e+06
##
    Max.
            :33.000
                      Max.
                              :499101
                                         Max.
                                                 :4.105e+15
                                                 :4
##
    NA's
            :138
                      NA's
                              :3
                                         NA's
      VTR_PORT
                          VTR_STATE
##
                                              TRIP_LENGTH
                                                                    PERMIT.y
##
    Length: 165868
                         Length: 165868
                                             Min.
                                                     : 0.0000
                                                                 Min.
                                                                         :110681
##
    Class : character
                         Class : character
                                              1st Qu.: 0.5938
                                                                 1st Qu.:231428
                                             Median: 0.9167
##
    Mode :character
                         Mode : character
                                                                 Median :310979
##
                                             Mean
                                                     : 2.6138
                                                                 Mean
                                                                         :285436
##
                                              3rd Qu.: 2.7083
                                                                 3rd Qu.:330784
##
                                             Max.
                                                     :24.7500
                                                                 Max.
                                                                         :550026
##
      DEALNUM
                             DOLLAR
                                                   POUNDS
##
                                                                         LANDED
                                                              0.5
##
    Length: 165868
                         Min.
                                        0.5
                                              Min.
                                                                    Min.
                                                                                  0.29
    Class : character
                         1st Qu.:
                                     2141.0
                                              1st Qu.:
                                                           2069.9
                                                                    1st Qu.:
                                                                                250.00
    Mode :character
##
                                     3928.0
                                              Median:
                                                           3332.0
                                                                    Median:
                                                                                400.00
                         Median:
                         Mean
##
                                   35550.8
                                              Mean
                                                     :
                                                         31911.1
                                                                    Mean
                                                                               3834.71
```

```
##
                       3rd Qu.:
                                   8697.7
                                            3rd Qu.:
                                                       6147.0
                                                                 3rd Qu.:
                                                                            750.00
##
                               :1413380.0
                                                   :1186125.0
                                                                 Max.
                                                                        :142392.00
                       Max.
                                            Max.
##
      GEARCODE
                       SECGEARFISH
                                             SPPNAME
##
                                                                   geoid
##
    Length: 165868
                       Length: 165868
                                           Length: 165868
                                                              Min.
                                                                      :9.008e+08
    Class : character
                       Class : character
                                           Class : character
                                                               1st Qu.:2.501e+09
##
    Mode :character
                       Mode :character
                                           Mode :character
                                                               Median :3.401e+09
##
                                                                      :3.106e+09
                                                               Mean
##
                                                               3rd Qu.:3.403e+09
##
                                                               Max.
                                                                      :5.170e+09
##
                                                               NA's
                                                                      :1774
                                                            port_lon
##
                         state_fips
                                           port_lat
      namelsad
##
    Length: 165868
                       Min.
                             : 7.00
                                        Min.
                                               :34.71
                                                        Min.
                                                               :-76.86
                       1st Qu.:24.00
                                        1st Qu.:39.57
                                                         1st Qu.:-74.23
##
    Class :character
##
    Mode :character
                       Median :33.00
                                        Median :40.87
                                                        Median :-72.52
##
                       Mean
                               :29.92
                                        Mean
                                              :40.60
                                                         Mean
                                                                :-72.64
##
                       3rd Qu.:33.00
                                        3rd Qu.:41.64
                                                         3rd Qu.:-70.93
##
                       Max.
                               :49.00
                                        Max.
                                               :44.95
                                                         Max.
                                                                :-66.98
##
                               :1643
                                        NA's
                                               :1774
                                                        NA's
                       NA's
                                                                :1774
##
    previous namelsad
                       previous state fips previous geoid
                                                                 previous port lat
##
    Length: 165868
                       Min.
                               : 7.00
                                            Min.
                                                   :9.008e+08
                                                                Min.
                                                                        :34.71
    Class : character
                       1st Qu.:24.00
                                            1st Qu.:2.501e+09
                                                                 1st Qu.:39.57
   Mode :character
##
                       Median :33.00
                                            Median :3.401e+09
                                                                Median :40.87
##
                       Mean
                               :29.96
                                                   :3.110e+09
                                                                Mean
                                            Mean
                                                                       :40.59
##
                       3rd Qu.:33.00
                                            3rd Qu.:3.403e+09
                                                                 3rd Qu.:41.64
##
                       Max.
                               :49.00
                                            Max.
                                                   :5.181e+09
                                                                 Max.
                                                                        :44.95
##
                       NA's
                               :1749
                                            NA's
                                                   :1882
                                                                 NA's
                                                                        :1882
##
    previous_port_lon
                           Date
                                                Time
                                                                  TRIP_ID
    Min.
          :-76.86
                              :2007-05-01
                                            Length: 165868
                                                                Length: 165868
                      Min.
    1st Qu.:-74.23
                      1st Qu.:2009-05-27
                                            Class : character
                                                                Class : character
   Median :-72.52
##
                      Median :2012-08-17
                                            Mode :character
                                                                Mode :character
##
    Mean
          :-72.65
                      Mean
                              :2012-12-30
##
    3rd Qu.:-70.93
                      3rd Qu.:2016-06-17
  Max.
           :-66.98
##
                      Max.
                             :2019-12-31
##
   NA's
           :1882
##
    Plan Code
                       Program Code
                                           Area Identifier
                                                                   ftpt
##
  Length: 165868
                       Length: 165868
                                           Length: 165868
                                                               Length: 165868
##
   Class :character
                       Class : character
                                           Class : character
                                                               Class :character
##
    Mode :character
                       Mode :character
                                           Mode :character
                                                              Mode :character
##
##
##
##
##
        GC
                                                         DB_LANDING_YEAR
                        LA
                                         hours
    Mode :logical
                    Mode :logical
                                     Min. : 0.0333
                                                         Min.
                                                               :2007
                                     1st Qu.: 14.2500
                                                         1st Qu.:2009
##
    FALSE: 34428
                    FALSE:117141
##
    TRUE :131381
                    TRUE: 48727
                                     Median: 22.0000
                                                         Median:2012
##
    NA's :59
                                     Mean
                                           : 62.7184
                                                         Mean
                                                              :2013
##
                                     3rd Qu.: 65.0000
                                                         3rd Qu.:2016
##
                                     Max.
                                            :594.0000
                                                         Max.
                                                                :2019
##
                                                         NA's
                                     NA's
                                            :1
                                                                :1
  TRIP_COST_2020_DOL TRIP_COST_WINSOR_2020_DOL OBSERVED_COST_DUMMY
##
  Min.
          :
               16.78
                       Min.
                             :
                                   29.47
                                                  Min.
                                                          :0.00000
  1st Qu.: 637.13
                       1st Qu.: 637.13
                                                  1st Qu.:0.00000
```

```
## Median : 1223.95 Median : 1223.95
                                               Median :0.00000
## Mean
         : 4742.65 Mean : 4699.89
                                              Mean
                                                     :0.04871
   3rd Qu.: 5377.22 3rd Qu.: 5376.89
                                               3rd Qu.:0.00000
          :52122.12 Max.
                            :30595.61
                                                      :1.00000
##
  Max.
                                               Max.
##
   NA's
          :1
                     NA's
                                               NA's
                                      MN30SQID
##
       DDLAT
                      DDLON
                                                     MN10SQID
          :36.00 Min. :-75.92 Min.
                                          :35734
                                                  Min.
                                                          :357311
   Min.
   1st Qu.:39.38 1st Qu.:-73.53
                                  1st Qu.:39731
                                                  1st Qu.:397331
##
##
   Median :40.20 Median :-72.83
                                  Median :40714
                                                  Median: 407121
##
         :40.34 Mean :-71.95
                                  Mean
                                         :40560
                                                 Mean :405618
  Mean
   3rd Qu.:41.09
                   3rd Qu.:-70.17
                                   3rd Qu.:41691
                                                   3rd Qu.:416922
                  Max. :-66.03
                                   Max. :44691 Max. :446966
##
   Max. :44.77
##
##
       NAME
## Length:165868
   Class :character
##
  Mode :character
##
##
##
##
table(final_product_lease$NSUBTRIP)
##
              2
##
                     3
                           4
                                  5
                                         6
                                                      8
       1
                                 78
## 162045
           2877
                   630
                          228
                                         2
table(final_product_lease$YEAR)
##
## 2007 2008 2009 2010 2011 2012 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018 2019
## 15905 18396 16483 11308 12546 12082 10970 10022 10728 12750 10922 12152 11604
table(final product lease$GEARCODE)
##
##
      DREDGE-CLAM
                     DREDGE-OTHER DREDGE-SCALLOP
                                                   GILLNET-OTHER
                                                                   GILLNET-SINK
##
             7996
                              35
                                          135051
                                                              1
         HANDLINE LONGLINE-BOTTOM
                                           OTHER
##
                                                      POT-OTHER
                                                                    SEINE-OTHER
##
               99
                               3
                                               2
                                                             94
##
     TRAWL-BOTTOM
##
            22488
table(final_product_lease$ftpt)
##
## FullTime
               None PartTime
     42465
##
             117141
                       6262
table(final_product_lease$VTR_STATE)
##
                                  NC
##
     CT
           DE
                 MA
                      MD
                            ME
                                        NH
                                              NJ
                                                   NY
                                                         RΙ
                                                               VA
   2371
          196 58486 6162 5319
                                 453 1831 63180 13779 7514
                                                             6536
table(final_product_lease$`Plan Code`)
```

```
##
##
      DOF
              HER
                       MID
                               MNK
                                       NMS
                                               SCO
                                                       SES
                                                               SMB
     3459
                 2
                                      5644
                                              7280 139898
                                                               222
##
                        12
                               431
table(final_product_lease$`Program Code`)
##
##
     BDP
            \mathtt{CML}
                   COM
                          DOF
                                 HER
                                        MMQ
                                               MNK
                                                      MUL
                                                             NAC
                                                                    NAF
                                                                           NAS
                                                                                 NMA
                                                                                        OQU
                         2190
                                   2
                                                                                       4462
##
        6
           1221
                   324
                                         54
                                               161
                                                     1944
                                                               1
                                                                            15
                                                                                    6
                                                                           SCI
##
     PWD
            REC
                   RSA
                          SAA
                                 SAC
                                                      SCA
                                                             SCF
                                                                    SCG
                                                                                 SEC
                                                                                        SFC
                                        SAM
                                               SAS
##
              5
                   557 22496
                                                67 18086
                                                               1 98498
                                                                                2509
                                                                                       2764
     264
                                   1
                                         13
                                        SWE
##
     SLM
            {\tt SMA}
                   SQI
                          SQL
                                 SQM
                                               TSP
                                                      TST
                                                             USC
##
      25
            327
                      4
                          134
                                  59
                                         11
                                                 3
                                                       35
                                                             698
```

The "SES" Plan code corresponds to declaring into the Scallop Fishery (Limited access or General Category).

The Program codes of most interest are probably:

- 1. SES-SAA Scallop Access Area
- 2. SES-SCA Scallop Days at Sea
- 3. SES-SCG General Category Scallop

Methods

- 1. FishSET
- 2. Spatial Econometrics