

# Equalities between Relations

$\circ$  is associative: for arbitrary relations  $R \subseteq A \times B$  and  $S \subseteq B \times C$  and  $T \subseteq C \times D$ , we have:

$$R \circ (S \circ T) = (R \circ S) \circ T$$

**Proof:** Let  $\langle x, u \rangle$  be an arbitrary member of  $(R \circ S) \circ T$ .

Then there exists  $z \in C$  such that  $x (R \circ S) z$  and  $z T u$ ; but then there also exists  $y \in B$  such that  $x R y$  and  $y S z$ .

So there exists  $y \in B$  such that  $x R y$  and  $y S \circ T u$ , so also  $x R \circ (S \circ T) u$ ; therefore  $(R \circ S) \circ T \subseteq R \circ (S \circ T)$ .

The reverse can be proved in a similar way. □

## Negative Results

Let  $R, S$  be binary relations on  $A$ .

Then, in general,

- $R \neq R^{-1}$
- $R \circ S \neq S \circ R$  (composition is not commutative)
- $R \circ R^{-1} \neq Id_A$

**Proof** The way to prove that a property does not hold is to provide a **counter example**.

A counter example to part 1 is  $R = \{\langle a, b \rangle\} \subseteq \{a, b\}^2$ .

A counter example to part 2 is  $R = \{\langle a, a \rangle\}$  and  $S = \{\langle a, b \rangle\}$  where  $A = \{a, b\}$ . Then  $R \circ S \neq S \circ R$ .

**Exercise:** Solve part 3.