

```

theory Problem-1
  imports Complex-Main
begin

```

Consider a set  $S$  of  $n \geq 3$  positive real numbers. Show that at most  $n - 2$  distinct integer powers of 3 can be expressed as a sum of three distinct elements of  $S$ .

```

definition intpow3 where
  intpow3  $x \longleftrightarrow (\exists k::int. 3 \text{ powr } k = x)$ 

```

```

lemma card3-distinct[elim]:
  card {a, b, c} = 3  $\implies a \neq b \wedge b \neq c \wedge c \neq a$ 
  by (metis One-nat-def add-Suc-right add-cancel-left-right card.empty card.insert card-2-iff
equalityI finite.intros(1) insert-subset nat.simps(3) numeral-eq-Suc one-add-one order-refl pred-numeral-simps(3))+

```

```

definition threepows where
  threepows  $S = \{a + b + c \mid a \ b \ c. \{a, b, c\} \subseteq S \wedge \text{card } \{a, b, c\} = 3 \wedge \text{intpow3 } (a + b + c)\}$ 

```

```

lemma threepows-mono:
   $A \subseteq B \implies \text{threepows } A \subseteq \text{threepows } B$ 
  by (auto simp: threepows-def)

```

```

lemma threepows-intpow3:
   $x \in \text{threepows } S \implies \text{intpow3 } x$ 
  by (auto simp: threepows-def)

```

```

lemma threepowsI[intro]:
  assumes  $\{a, b, c\} \subseteq S$  and  $\text{card } \{a, b, c\} = 3$  and  $\text{intpow3 } (a + b + c)$ 
  shows  $a + b + c \in \text{threepows } S$ 
  using assms by (auto simp: threepows-def)

```

```

lemma threepowsE[elim]:
  assumes  $x \in \text{threepows } S$ 
  assumes  $\bigwedge a \ b \ c. x = a + b + c \implies \{a, b, c\} \subseteq S \implies \text{card } \{a, b, c\} = 3 \implies \text{intpow3 } (a + b + c) \implies P \ x$ 
  shows  $P \ x$ 
  using assms by (auto simp: threepows-def)

```

```

lemma threepows-trivial:
  assumes  $\text{card } S < 3$  and finite S
  shows  $\text{threepows } S = \{\}$ 
proof (rule ccontr)
  assume  $\text{threepows } S \neq \{\}$ 
  then obtain  $x$  where  $x \in \text{threepows } S$  by auto
  thus False
proof (rule threepowsE)
  fix  $a \ b \ c$ 
  assume  $\{a, b, c\} \subseteq S$   $\text{card } \{a, b, c\} = 3$ 
  have  $\text{card } \{a, b, c\} \leq \text{card } S$ 
    using  $\langle \text{finite } S \rangle \langle \{a, b, c\} \subseteq S \rangle$  by (intro card-mono)
  thus False
    using  $\langle \text{card } \{a, b, c\} = 3 \rangle \langle \text{card } S < 3 \rangle$  by simp
qed
qed

```

```

lemma threepows-largest:
  fixes  $k::int$ 
  assumes  $3 \text{ powr } k \in \text{threepows } S$ 
  obtains  $a$  where  $a \in S$  and  $a \geq 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1)$ 
proof -
  {
    assume  $\nexists a. a \in S \wedge a \geq 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1)$ 
    then have  $*$ :  $a \in S \implies a < 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1)$  for  $a$  by auto

```

```

have  $x \in \text{threepows } S \implies x < 3 * 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}$  for  $x$ 
proof (erule threepowsE)
  fix  $a \ b \ c$ 
  assume  $\{a, b, c\} \subseteq S$  and  $x = a + b + c$ 
  with  $*$  have  $a < 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}$  and  $b < 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}$  and  $c < 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}$ 
  by auto
  thus  $x < 3 * 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}$ 
  unfolding  $\langle x = a + b + c \rangle$  by simp
qed

with assms have  $3^{\text{powr } k} < 3 * 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}$ 
by simp
hence False by (simp add: powr-mult-base)
}
thus thesis using that by blast
qed

theorem problem1:
  fixes  $S :: \text{real set}$ 
  assumes  $\text{card } S \geq 3$ 
  assumes  $\bigwedge x. x \in S \implies x > 0$ 
  shows  $\text{card } (\text{threepows } S) \leq \text{card } S - 2$ 
  using assms
proof (induction  $\text{card } S$  arbitrary:  $S$  rule: less-induct)
  case less
  then have finite  $S$ 
  using card-infinite by fastforce
  show ?case
  proof (cases  $\text{card } (\text{threepows } S) = 0$ )
  case False
  then have finite  $(\text{threepows } S)$  and  $\text{threepows } S \neq \{\}$ 
  by (auto intro: card-ge-0-finite)
  then have  $\text{Max } (\text{threepows } S) \in \text{threepows } S$ 
  by (intro Max-in)
  with threepows-intpow3 intpow3-def obtain  $k::\text{int}$  where  $k: 3^{\text{powr } k} = \text{Max } (\text{threepows } S)$ 
  by blast
  let ?discard  $= \{x \in S. x \geq 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}\}$ 
  have  $\text{threepows } S - \{\text{Max } (\text{threepows } S)\} = \text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard})$ 
  proof –
  have  $\text{Max } (\text{threepows } S) \notin \text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard})$ 
  proof
    assume  $\text{Max } (\text{threepows } S) \in \text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard})$ 
    then obtain  $a$  where  $a \in S - ?\text{discard}$  and  $a \geq 3^{\text{powr } (k - 1)}$ 
    unfolding  $k[\text{symmetric}]$  by (rule threepows-largest)
    thus False by simp
  qed
  moreover have  $\text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard}) \subseteq \text{threepows } S$ 
  by (intro threepows-mono; auto)
  moreover have  $x = \text{Max } (\text{threepows } S)$ 
  if  $x \in \text{threepows } S$  and not-in-discard:  $x \notin \text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard})$  for  $x$ 
  using  $\langle x \in \text{threepows } S \rangle$ 
  proof (rule threepowsE)
  fix  $a \ b \ c$ 
  assume  $x = a + b + c$   $\{a, b, c\} \subseteq S$   $\text{card } \{a, b, c\} = 3$   $\text{intpow3 } (a + b + c)$ 
  have  $\{a, b, c\} \cap ?\text{discard} \neq \{\}$ 
  proof
    assume  $\{a, b, c\} \cap ?\text{discard} = \{\}$ 
    with  $\langle \{a, b, c\} \subseteq S \rangle$  have  $\{a, b, c\} \subseteq S - ?\text{discard}$  by simp
    hence  $a + b + c \in \text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard})$ 
    using  $\langle \text{card } \{a, b, c\} = 3 \rangle$   $\langle \text{intpow3 } (a + b + c) \rangle$  by (intro threepowsI)
    with  $\langle x = a + b + c \rangle$  and not-in-discard show False by simp
  qed

```

```

then have  $a \geq 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1) \vee b \geq 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1) \vee c \geq 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1)$ 
  by auto
moreover from less.prems and  $\langle \{a, b, c\} \subseteq S \rangle$  have  $a > 0 \wedge b > 0 \wedge c > 0$ 
  by simp
ultimately have  $*$ :  $a + b + c > 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1)$ 
  by linarith
have  $a + b + c \geq 3 \text{ powr } k$ 
proof (intro leI notI)
  assume **:  $a + b + c < 3 \text{ powr } k$ 
  moreover from  $\langle \text{intpow3 } (a + b + c) \rangle$  obtain  $k'::\text{int}$  where  $a + b + c = 3 \text{ powr } k'$ 
    unfolding intpow3-def by metis
  with * and ** have  $3 \text{ powr } (k - 1) < 3 \text{ powr } k'$  and  $3 \text{ powr } k' < 3 \text{ powr } k$ 
    by auto
  hence  $k - 1 < k'$  and  $k' < k$ 
    by auto
  thus False by auto
qed
moreover from  $\langle x \in \text{threepows } S \rangle$  have  $x \leq \text{Max } (\text{threepows } S)$ 
  using  $\langle \text{finite } (\text{threepows } S) \rangle$  by (intro Max.coboundedI; auto)
ultimately show  $x = \text{Max } (\text{threepows } S)$ 
  using  $\langle x = a + b + c \rangle$  and  $k$  by simp
qed
ultimately show ?thesis
  by auto
qed
hence card-threepows:  $\text{card } (\text{threepows } S) = \text{Suc } (\text{card } (\text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard})))$ 
  by (metis  $\langle \text{Max } (\text{threepows } S) \in \text{threepows } S \rangle$   $\langle \text{finite } (\text{threepows } S) \rangle$  card-Suc-Diff1)

have  $?\text{discard} \neq \{\}$ 
proof -
  from  $k \langle \text{Max } (\text{threepows } S) \in \text{threepows } S \rangle$  threepows-largest
  obtain  $a$  where  $a \in S$  and  $a \geq 3 \text{ powr } (k - 1)$ 
    by metis
  hence  $a \in ?\text{discard}$  by simp
  thus  $?\text{discard} \neq \{\}$  by auto
qed
hence discard-strict:  $\text{card } (S - ?\text{discard}) < \text{card } S$ 
  using  $\langle \text{finite } S \rangle$  by (intro psubset-card-mono; auto)
show ?thesis
proof (cases  $\text{card } (S - ?\text{discard}) < 3$ )
  case True
  then have  $\text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard}) = \{\}$ 
    using  $\langle \text{finite } S \rangle$  by (intro threepows-trivial; auto)
  hence  $\text{card } (\text{threepows } S) = 1$ 
    by (simp add: card-threepows)
  with  $\langle \text{card } S \geq 3 \rangle$  show ?thesis by simp
next
  case False
  hence  $\text{card } (\text{threepows } (S - ?\text{discard})) \leq \text{card } (S - ?\text{discard}) - 2$ 
    using discard-strict  $\langle \text{finite } S \rangle$  by (intro less; auto)
  hence  $\text{card } (\text{threepows } S) \leq \text{Suc } (\text{card } (S - ?\text{discard}) - 2)$ 
    unfolding card-threepows by simp
  then show ?thesis
    using discard-strict False by simp
qed
qed simp
qed
end

```