SECURITY BLURS

THE POLITICS OF PLURAL SECURITY PROVISION

Edited by
Tessa Diphoorn and Erella Grassiani

ROUTLEDGE

Security Blurs

Security Blurs makes an important contribution to anthropological work on security. It introduces the notion of "security blurs" to analyse manifestations of security that are visible and identifiable, yet constructed and made up of a myriad and overlapping set of actors, roles, motivations, values, practices, ideas, materialities and power dynamics in their inception and performance. The chapters address the entanglements and overlaps between a variety of state and non-state security providers, from the police and the military to vigilantes, community organisations and private security companies. The contributors offer rich ethnographic studies of everyday security practices across a range of cultural contexts and reveal the impact on the lives of ordinary citizens. This book presents a new anthropological approach to security by explicitly addressing the overlap and entanglement of the practices and discourses of state and non-state security providers, and the associated forms of cooperation and conflict that permit an analysis of these actors' activities as increasingly "blurred".

Tessa Diphoorn is Assistant Professor in the Department of Cultural Anthropology at Utrecht University, The Netherlands.

Erella Grassiani is Assistant Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands.

Routledge Studies in Anthropology

Security Blurs

The Politics of Plural Security Provision

Edited by Tessa Diphoorn and Erella Grassiani

Contents

Illustrations

Figures

Table

Contributors

Laurens Bakker is Assistant Professor at the Department of Anthropology at the University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands. His research and publications focus on land law and land conflict in Southeast Asia, as well as on the influence of informal militias in local politics, societies and economies. He is presently principal researcher for the "Securing the Local" research programme, which comparatively researched the role of non-state security actors in Indonesia, Kenya and Nigeria.

Lars Buur is Associate Professor at the Department of Social Sciences and Business at Roskilde University, Denmark. He is the coordinator of the research programme "Hierarchies of Rights: Land and Investment in Africa" and has published widely on vigilantism, sovereignty and state formation in South Africa and the recognition of traditional leaders and ruling elite formation in Mozambique.

Tessa Diphoorn is Assistant Professor at the Department of Cultural Anthropology at Utrecht University, The Netherlands. Her research focuses on everyday security and policing, and she is currently conducting research on police reform in Nairobi, Kenya. She is the author of *Twilight Policing: Private Security and Violence in Urban South Africa* (2016).

Erella Grassiani is Assistant Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands. Her current research is part of a wider project on privatisation and globalisation of security and her research traces the flows of (Israeli) security worldwide and looks at the way cultural ideas, technologies and consultants move around globally. In the past she has done extensive research on the Israeli military. She is the author of *Soldiering under Occupation: Processes of Numbing among Israeli Soldiers in the Al-Aqsa Intifada* (2013).

Rivke Jaffe is Professor of Cities, Politics and Culture at the University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands. Working across the boundaries of anthropology, geography and cultural studies, her research focuses primarily on intersections of the urban and the political, and specifically on the spatialisation and materialisation of power, difference and inequality within

cities. Her current work studies public-private security assemblages and the associated transformations of governance and citizenship. Her publications include *Concrete Jungles: Urban Pollution and the Politics of Difference in the Caribbean* (2016) and *Introducing Urban Anthropology* (with Anouk de Koning, 2016).

Line Jakobsen is a PhD candidate at the Danish Institute for International Studies and the Department of Social Sciences and Business at Roskilde University, Denmark. She is currently doing research on security practices and political subjectivities in and around large-scale coal mining in Colombia. Her master's thesis on community policing in Bolivia, which included four months of fieldwork in La Paz, received the prize for the best thesis of the year of the university department.

Helene Maria Kyed is a social anthropologist and currently the head of a research unit at the Danish Institute for International Studies. She has done research on policing, justice provision and post-conflict state formation in Mozambique (since 2002), Swaziland (since 2010) and Myanmar (since 2014), particularly exploring authority, sovereignty and violence in urban as well as rural contexts. Her latest edited book is *Policing and the Politics of Order-Making* (2015).

Erika Robb Larkins is Associate Professor of Anthropology and Sociology and Director of the J. Keith Behner and Catherine M. Stiefel Program on Brazil at San Diego State University, USA. She received her doctorate in Cultural Anthropology from the University of Wisconsin, Madison and also holds an M.A. in Latin American Studies from the University of Chicago. Her research and teaching focus on violence and inequality in urban settings. Her first book, *The Spectacular Favela: Violence in Modern Brazil* (2015), explores the political economy of spectacular violence in one of Rio's most famous favelas. She is presently working on her second book examining the private security industry in Brazil.

Perle Møhl is an anthropologist and filmmaker, specialising in visual and sensory anthropology, everyday communication and pragmatic semiotics. She has carried out fieldwork in rural France and French Amazonia and has published two books based on this fieldwork, as well as a series of films, namely *Village Voices: Coexistence and Communication in a Rural Community in Central France* and *Omens and Effect: Divergent Perspectives on Emerillon Time, Space and Existence*. Her research on biometric technologies and vision in connection with border control is based at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark.

Moritz Schuberth completed his PhD in Peace Studies at the University of Bradford, UK. His research focuses on non-state armed groups, peacekeeping, security governance and urban violence. He is the author of recent articles in *Africa Spectrum*; the *Journal of Eastern African Studies*; *Conflict,*

Security & Development; the *Journal of Peacebuilding and Development*; *Contemporary Security Policy*; *Stability: International Journal of Security and Development*; *International Peacekeeping*; and *Environment and Urbanization*. He currently works as Monitoring, Evaluation and Research Manager for the global humanitarian agency Mercy Corps in the eastern Democratic Republic of the Congo.

Atreyee Sen is Associate Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark. She is a political anthropologist of urban South Asia. Her research and publication trajectory focuses on large-scale militant political movements in the city that create micro-cultures of violence in confined urban spaces. She is the author of *Shiv Sena Women: Violence and Communalism in a Bombay Slum* (2007) and co-editor (with Dr David Pratten) of *Global Vigilantes: New Perspectives on Justice and Violence* (2008).

Jeremy Siegman is a political anthropologist and Lecturer on Social Studies at Harvard University, USA. His research uses ethnography and social and political theory to explore questions of settler colonialism, the market and contemporary politics in Israel/Palestine. His book manuscript in progress is entitled *Enemies in the Aisles: The Politics of Market Encounter on Israel's Settler Frontier*.

Acknowledgements

Research funding

Foreword

Erika Robb Larkins

State Police. Civilian Police. Private Security Guards. Community Police Officers. Neighbourhood Watch. Civil Defence Groups. Military Contractors. Soldiers. Urban Security Patrols. Vigilantes. There is no doubt that security has become a critical, ever-present part of everyday lived experience across the globe. Moreover, in many places, lived experience is shaped by the overlapping presence of multiple security actors, configured in oftentimes confusing and imprecise relationships with one another. This collection of articles reckons with this empirical reality by asking what such muddy, ambiguous forms of security provision can teach us about the workings of power, governance, inequality, sovereignty and citizenship. With contributions that are theoretically expansive and demonstrate a nuanced understanding of the local settings in which security is performed, each author in the volume interrogates the blurring of security in a different way.

While the interdisciplinary literature on security has long noted pluralisation as a central theme, fine-grained examinations of the ways in which different security actors interact with one another have been absent. Scholars have instead focused attention on one particular species of security worker, like "the police" or "the military". Such choices, no doubt, are often the consequence of practical limitations, but it is clear that most security personnel are part of larger security constellations that merit urgent exploration. The articles in this volume do just that. Importantly, they eschew clear lines between providers. This focus directs attention instead to grey areas of productive convergence where we can better understand how security is structured and performed, as well as its effects on those it is intended to secure.

Each of the pieces departs from a focus on a "security blur" to examine the convergent relationships of individual security actors with various kinds of security others. For example, public and private border agents negotiate their work with the non-human actor of ABC (Automated Border Control) software in the Copenhagen Airport. A supermarket in an Israeli settlement is a site for juxtaposition of a seemingly friendly, commercial security placed within an overall climate of militarisation. Vigilante justice coexists with everyday forms of community security provision in the Bolivian city, as boundaries between actors are constantly negotiated. The work of Civilian

and State police officers is at once entangled and structured by power hierarchies in Maputo, Mozambique. Competing actions of local tough guys, police and politicised societal organisations shape the daily experience of citizens in Jakarta. A diverse set of security providers in urban Haiti is simultaneously the provider and creator of insecurity. And citizen-vigilantes engage in politicised forms of moral policing in Mumbai.

Across a great diversity of settings, the pieces in this volume focus on structural and performative features of security. Security blurs in the structural realm stem from a general kind of fuzziness about whose job it is to provide effective security to the population, to which part of the population, and for what motives and with which purposes. In almost all of the cases presented here, we find that not only is security not the exclusive purview of state-led actors, but that what is provided by the state looks different depending on a range of factors, such as social class and location in urban space. Thus, with state-led security being implemented unevenly across global, national and city borders, fissures are shored up by myriad actors (including non-human ones) who both compete and collaborate with state actors. It is exactly these contradictory assemblages that are well captured and analysed by the ethnographies presented here.

Security blurs, like all forms of security, are also actively performed. Performances are key to staking territory and to delineating borders. They often incorporate material culture such as cars, weapons and clothing. The pieces in this volume also take up issues of scale and space in a provocative way, tracing performances from the realm of the body to city to nation to globe. And while the blur itself is often a productive force (one that enables expansion of security regimes in ways that empower certain providers and disempower others), it too has limits. These limits are often expressed through performances that work to curtail the overlap between groups, such as when private security guards are prohibited from wearing uniforms that look too much like the police. The limits of "acceptable" performance indicate that the blur itself is in constant negotiation, and that its boundaries are just as revealing as are the murky spaces between different groups.

Finally, in reading these essays, we should ask: what are the effects of security blurs on those groups that are the most vulnerable to insecurity and exploitation by security actors? In many cases, security blurs flirt with illegality – as actors abuse the authority of their positions for personal gain, benefitting from the impunity that comes from being authorised to uphold (or break) the law. Blurring means that citizens sometimes cannot tell *who* they are dealing with. Motivations are obscured; the political backers of certain security providers may be distinct from those who citizens see and interact with. And while all security is inherently political, we might ask if there is something especially political about the blurs described here because they often work to conceal larger power structures. This helps us to see how citizens – in whose name security is often enacted – are at worst victimised, or at best disempowered, by slippage in roles of security personnel.

In short, these ethnographically grounded pieces address important questions about the nature and consequences of security blurs, suggesting that that security is, perhaps, better understood as the sum of its parts. This book will be an important reference for interdisciplinary readers interested in how security and insecurity intersect with issues of power and governance. Furthermore, the volume highlights precisely why the ethnographic approach to studying security is so crucial, as it is only through the kind of careful and patient portraits of local life presented here that the entanglements of such a pluralised security world can be understood.

Taylor & Francis
Taylor & Francis Group
http://taylorandfrancis.com

Introducing *Security Blurs*

Erella Grassiani and Tessa Diphoorn

In my neighbourhood[1] in Southern Tel Aviv, white cars can be seen patrolling the streets, with blue and yellow markings, looking very much like regular Israeli police cars. I have learnt to distinguish them, though, by their yellow and blue lights, as opposed to the blue and white lights of a "real" national police vehicle. The neighbourhood is known for its poverty, crime, prostitution and, more recently, for the many African refugees who have found shelter in the small houses around the market. The city of Tel Aviv has neglected this "backyard" of its shiny sea front. In reaction to the increasingly "dangerous" situation in this neighbourhood and others like it, the municipality has initiated a combined "Urban Security Patrol" (Sayeret L'Bitachon Ironi or SELA): security cars belonging to the municipality are staffed with municipality security personnel and police officers. Both actors wear similar dark uniforms with comparable emblems on their arms, and often both are armed and carry handcuffs and other security equipment. According to the official site of the municipality, the units are formed to prevent criminality and terror acts, to aid the police in securing the city and its citizens and to protect the city's property.[2]

* * *

This illustration of a specific type of security provision in the first author's everyday life is comprised of what we shall call different *security blurs*: performances aimed at providing a sense of (perceived) safety that includes numerous and different actors, roles, objects and aesthetical appearances that overlap, and through this overlapping, create various forms of blurriness. Such occurrences raise questions about what security is, who is providing it, whom it is provided for, and how it can be interpreted by the actors involved. In this case from South Tel Aviv, we could examine the relationship between the different actors – the municipality security personnel and the police officers – and their motivations and goals during these patrols, or we could focus on the materialities and aesthetics, such as their uniforms and vehicles, in order to uncover and understand what type of security we are observing. More importantly, we could question what such performances

of security teach us about sovereignty, power and the legitimacy of actors in the eyes of the public and of themselves? What social problems can such multi-faceted patrols encounter and produce? What political dynamics are at play that define how such security work targets specific neighbourhoods and populations?

In this volume, we want to explore such questions in order to better make sense of the various security acts and performances observed across the globe that are based on an intermixing of actors, objects, goals and roles, and through this intermixing, create new and different ideas and interpretations of what security is, or can be. We propose to do so by introducing the concept of *security blurs* and showing the complexities that are overlooked when focussing on isolated actors and their activities alone. The idea of "blurs" is often used to indicate ways of obscuring, of producing uncertain and unclear phenomena. Rather, we use it here to show how within security acts (as defined emically by many of the relevant actors), there is a multitude of interrelated dimensions and meanings that are intertwined. Firstly, we use "blurs" as a noun, to refer to the visible and identifiable manifestations of security that constitute multiple, overlapping set of actors, roles, motivations, values, materialities and power dynamics in their inception and performance. Secondly, we use "blurs" as a verb, to refer to the performative and effective characteristic of security performances, namely that through its enactment, a performance of security itself changes and with that our understanding of it. Security blurs are thus identifiable phenomena, like the patrol in Tel Aviv, but also have an effect that blurs our interpretations and understandings of power and social order.

By advancing the concept of security blurs, we aim to present a new anthropological approach to security by explicitly addressing the overlap and entanglement of the practices and discourses of state and non-state security providers, and the associated forms of cooperation and conflict that permit an analysis of these actors' activities as increasingly "blurred". These blurs and the way they come into being are deeply political, with the state/non-state boundary negotiated, crossed and defended according to the underlying interests of the actors involved. The past couple of decades have seen a proliferation of anthropological research on policing, which discusses the range of security providers that include formal state institutions, such as the police and the military, but also non-state actors such as gangs, community policing organisations, vigilante organisations and private security companies. Furthermore, this body of work has highlighted the pluralisation and hybridisation of security provision (Albrecht 2016; Albrecht and Kyed 2015; Colona and Jaffe 2016; Diphoorn 2016; Diphoorn and Kyed 2016), thereby demonstrating that policing and security are inherently relational and processual. Yet, at the same, most of the studies tend to zoom in on the daily security practices of one of these actors as the prime focus of analysis. This edited volume makes an important new contribution to anthropological work on security by going beyond previous research that

considers security actors in (relative) isolation and by specifically engaging with the ways in which practices, ideas and objects are entangled and result in diverse forms of blurring.

Thus, this volume focuses on the indistinct boundaries that characterise the entire spectrum of security providers as it aims to understand how such boundaries and their blurring are inherently political processes and concern issues of sovereignty and power. By doing so, we seek to problematise the use of dichotomies such as "formal" versus "informal", "state" versus "non-state", and "illegal" versus "legal" in our understanding of security. Negotiations over cooperation between different security providers – whether this will occur, and if so how and to what end – and the security act itself always involve (competing) claims of authority and control. Understanding the diverse meanings of such political processes requires detailed ethnographic studies of everyday security practices across a range of cultural and national contexts, which this volume aims to provide.

By focusing on the blur itself, i.e. the point at which blurring comes to the fore and is visible, and on the process of blurring to understand its effects, this volume concentrates on the power struggles and uncertainties that emerge from these entanglements and overlaps between security providers. Drawing on different cases from across the world, this collective work demonstrates how blurriness between security actors and practices involves contestations that (re)produce ambiguities for ordinary citizens and for security actors themselves. Security blurs emerge when different actors interact, thereby reconfiguring security ideas, logics and practices. However, security blurs should not be equated with instances of collaboration or competition; rather, we should understand the negotiation of boundaries – state/non-state, formal/informal, human/non-human and corporate/voluntary – as central to political practice. By elaborating this approach, and by focusing on the everyday encounters through which new understandings and enactments of security develop, this volume provides a novel and critical analysis of security realities across the globe and moves beyond existing concepts such as pluralisation.

Each contribution in this volume explicitly takes a "security blur" as the starting point of its analysis and shows how they come into being by exploring how and why the entanglement between different security actors, materialities or responsibilities occurs in a specific context, and what larger politics this reflects. In the opening chapter, Jeremy Siegman focuses on military/civilian blurring and how security blurs emerge in Super-Israel, a supermarket in an Israeli settlement in the Israeli-occupied West Bank. In the following chapter, Moritz Schuberth analyses the multiplicity of armed groups in Haiti and shows how security blurs emerge in the process of labelling such actors. Also focusing on the assortment of various local security providers, Laurens Bakker investigates the blurs that arise when *ormas* (societal organisations) provide informal security activities within their communities in Indonesia. In the fourth chapter that takes us to Mumbai, Atreyee Sen

analyses how security blurs emerge through militant moral policing practices that are simultaneously performed by a range of actors (low-ranked policemen, security guards, and lower class female civilians) and are shaped by notions of morality, violence, religion and sovereignty. Claims to sovereignty also lie at the heart of Helene Maria Kyed's chapter on Maputo. Kyed analyses the entanglements between civilian and state policing and how both policing actors and police practices produce security blurs. Also focusing on community practices, Line Jakobsen and Lars Buur's chapter on La Paz portrays the entanglements between community policing and vigilante-like practices that result in "blurred (in)securities". And in the last chapter on the Copenhagen airport, Perle Møhl describes the continuous blurring of responsibilities, decision-making and ongoing negotiations between the various human actors, and between human and non-human ones in the process of determining risks.

This volume thus comprises diverse case studies that approach security blurs from different perspectives, even as they all draw on rich, in-depth ethnographic fieldwork. And through this data, they are able to: 1) unravel the complex processes of boundary manipulation and negotiation in relation to national, territorial and economic interests, 2) address the ambiguities of security and uncover the power struggles that lie at the core of processes of blurring and 3) demonstrate how blurs impact the daily lives of ordinary citizens. By unpacking both the similarities and disparities across different cultural, political and geographical contexts, this volume addresses the globally urgent topic of security, demonstrating the range of security performances and their centrality to political contestation.

After a brief discussion of the anthropological focus on security, we will show how we use the concept of "security blurs" through a three-dimensional approach and how these dimensions are discussed throughout the various chapters. We end with a note on the key role that ethnographic fieldwork – a core component of an anthropological approach – plays in identifying and unravelling security blurs.

Anthropology of security

Anthropologists have engaged with issues that could be categorised as security and insecurity for a long time, yet only in the last few decades has the idea of an "anthropology of security" emerged as a potential focus within the discipline whereby security is regarded as "a critical object of study in its own right" (Glück and Low 2017, 283). In a useful overview, Limor Samimian-Darash and Meg Stalcup (2016) divide the existing scholarly work into four main fields. The first focuses on "violence and state terror" and primarily includes work conducted in the 1990s and 2000s that dealt with both urban insecurity and armed conflict (see Feldman 1991; Nordstrom and Robben 1995; Scheper-Hughes and Bourgois 2004; Caldeira 2000; Low 2013). These studies show the complexity of violence and its structural and

everyday nature. They mostly take the individual as focus point and hence overlook the collectivity of feelings of (in) security. The second field consists of works on "military, militarisation, and militarism", where a new focus was found in perpetrators and the organisational aspects of state induced violence. Most studies focused on the military (Ben-Ari 1998; Grassiani 2013; Winslow 1997) and more recently, on state police forces (Denyer Willis 2015; Fassin 2013, 2017; Garriot 2013; Jauregui 2016; Karpiak 2010).

The third field includes work on "para-state securitisation" and security produced "outside" the state, for example, by gangs (Jensen 2008; Rodgers 2006; Van Stapele 2015), vigilante organisations (Bakker 2015; Buur 2006; Pratten and Sen 2007), community policing initiatives (Kyed 2009; Ruteere and Pommerolle 2003), and private security companies (Diphoorn 2016; Grassiani and Volinz 2016; Larkins 2017; Mynster Christensen 2017; Higate and Utas 2017). The influential work by Goldstein (2010) also belongs to this field, in which he calls for a critical anthropology of security and encourages researchers to further reveal the "multiple ways in which security is configured and deployed – not only by states and authorised speakers but by communities, groups and individuals – in their engagements with other local actors and with arms of the state itself" (2010, 492). In line with Goldstein's call, a growing body of work has come into existence, including edited volumes (Maguire et al. 2014; Pedersen and Holbraad 2013; Hurtado and Ercolani 2013) and several special issues in journals such as *Etnofoor* (2015), *Conflict and Society* (2017), *Qualitative Sociology* (2017) and *Anthropological Theory* (2017). In this last issue, Zoltán Glück and Setha Low (2017) introduce a sociospatial framework for the anthropology of security. This framework includes looking at how security is produced through various forces and how "*security operates as a productive process*" (281, italics in original) on its own. With this framework, the authors claim that we can better understand the contradictions and ambiguities that define what they refer to as "states of security".

The last and fourth field that Samimian-Darash and Stalcup (2016) discuss is the one they propose and advocate for; namely the assemblage approach to security that includes "objects, concepts, and rationalities related to different security forms of action as well as the ethical mode of the anthropologist" (12). Abrahamsen and Williams (2009) already promoted such an approach earlier, and we understand that such a comprehensive approach seems both useful and attractive, as it specifically focuses on security actions and includes the various factors that define them, like we intend to do. However, because of its all-encompassing nature, the assemblage approach is, as we have argued elsewhere, too broad to act as a useful analytical tool to understand security practices in depth (Diphoorn and Grassiani 2016). Furthermore, an assemblage approach does not always adequately convey the ambiguities that emerge from policing. In contrast, the idea of security blurs aims to act as an analytical tool that emphasises the various opacities that are inherent to security practices.

Essentially, many of the contributions in this volume could use the security assemblage framework to analyse how various actors, objects, networks and rationalities come together to provide and/or create a sense of security (and Møhl explicitly uses this approach in her chapter). However, in this volume, we regard the assemblage as a prior assumption and go a step further by fleshing out the blurriness that defines so many security practices across the globe and that are observed within the assemblage approach, but not always investigated in detail. This means that we are not only interested in analysing the ways in which security assemblages emerge and exist, but that we are particularly attentive to the blurriness of its context, performance and effects as we will explain further below. In this way this book draws from all of the different bodies of work mentioned above, bringing forth dimensions of violence, militarism and non-state policing, and examines them in more depth through the security blurs that are intrinsically a part of them.

Security blurs

As hinted to in the previous section, we approach security as a performance; as an act that is identified, both by the actors doing it and those affected by it, as a form of "doing security". We want to stay away from defining security as an objective state of being that one can achieve (or does not manage to) and that carries a specific value in society. In fact, we share much of the critique (e.g. Neocleous and Rigakos 2011) against the habitual ways in which "security" has come to equate any form of (perceived) threat and thereby conjures sentiments of fear and uncertainty. We do not intend to reproduce such conventions of security. Yet despite this critique, many people across the globe identify themselves as security providers, as individuals who are involved in "doing" security and we cannot ignore this self-labelling. In the various case studies examined in this volume, individuals use security as a form of self-identification, for example, security actors who are making things, people and places safer. Security is thus very much an emic term that is used by our interlocutors, and conveys different meanings in various parts of the world. We therefore use the idea of security not to refer to an objective state that can be achieved, but as a subjective and self-identified label and act. And within these acts, towards some kind of subjective safe state of being for different actors, blurs emerge and occur – as both a process and as a state of being.

We define security blurs as manifestations of security that are visible and identifiable, yet in their inception and performance, they are constructed and made up of myriad overlapping sets of actors, roles, motivations, values, materialities and power dynamics. If we revisit the example from Tel Aviv, it is clear that security is being enacted; yet the different dynamics, relationships and constituents behind this enactment remain unclear at first sight. The security performance itself is therefore visible and recognisable,

as something that has the aim of providing a sense of safety for a specific group of people, yet the processes and dynamics around the performance demand further investigation.

In order to further unravel such cases, we propose to employ a three-dimensional approach to analyse security blurs by focusing on three different, yet interrelated, simultaneous and fluid layers: the structural, the performative, and the effective. This entails that a blur emerges at its inception due to complex social structures and political dynamics (structural); continues through its performance by different actors, roles and objects (performative); and works through in the effect of its performance, namely on and through different audiences (effective). In each of the contributions to this volume, these three layers are present, yet some layers emerge more prominently in certain chapters than in others. In the following section, we will further discuss these layers by examining how they materialise throughout the chapters.

The structural layer

The structural layer refers to the larger context in which the security performance takes place. This includes the presence of various institutions (both formal and informal), legal frameworks, political and historical trajectories of power and domination, economic structures of power that define matters of class and financial opportunities and social conditions, such as race, ethnicity and gender, to name but a few, that determine the environment in which the security blur manifests itself. In the introductory example from Tel Aviv, for example, the structural layer of the performance refers to the existence of various institutions that are part of this patrolling initiative (the Tel Aviv municipality, the Israeli police and the private security company that provides guards for the patrols); the legal frameworks within which the patrol, the actors, and their duties and rights are embedded in and defined by, such as the laws determining firearm use and ownership and the extensive regulation system of the private security industry. Furthermore, it can include issues of inequalities surrounding the patrols in Israel in general, which only municipalities with certain financial capacities can afford.[3] We can even extend the analysis further by incorporating the larger geo-political context of Israel, and thereby include the occupation of Palestinian land and accompanying ideas about Palestinian (Arab) others and, for example, the thousands of African refugees who do not receive asylum and as such are exposed to inhumane conditions in Southern Tel Aviv. Combined, all of these dimensions and facets constitute the structural layer.

A chapter of this volume that highlights the structural layer is Jeremy Siegman's chapter on the blurring of civilian/military life. In his analysis of Super-Israel, a supermarket in an Israeli settlement in the occupied West Bank, he analyses the co-presence of violent military occupation and setter-colonialism that define Israel's militarised security and counter-terror

apparatus, and he portrays how these political structures shape two blurred processes at the supermarket: the militarisation and civilianisation of security. Through his insightful ethnographic data, he portrays how private forms of security are used to not only normalise the Israeli occupation in everyday life, but also the settler presence that is part of it, even as the Israeli military apparatus comes into full view at times. Although Siegman's chapter is focused on everyday life, it nonetheless highlights the structural layer in a particular way: his operationalisation of terms such as "settler colonialism" and "military occupation" draw continued attention to how everyday life is shaped by these dominant structures, more bluntly than some of the other authors. Nonetheless, in their own ways, all the chapters demonstrate the importance of considering the wider context within which security performances take place.

The performative layer

With the performative layer, we are referring to the security act itself: to the performance of actual practices which includes the actors (state and non-state, armed and non-armed, formal and informal), their motivations and perceptions, and the various materialities that constitute the performance, such as cars, weapons, uniforms, documents and technologies. If we look again at the introductory example, we can identify the various actors involved in the performance; private guards employed by the municipality and police officers. We further recognise the role of the aesthetics of the vehicles, as the municipality patrol car closely resembles a regular police vehicle, and we can see how the uniforms of the different actors are almost similar. The role of the weapon is also important in this example; both actors can carry a weapon (in the case of the guards, this depends on their specific clearance by police and the ministry of defence), but they face different regulations concerning its use. The daily interactions between the dissimilar actors, the different sponsors they have (state and municipality), their use or disuse of specific objects, the way they use these objects and the negotiations surrounding their daily work can all be analysed as blurs.

Most of the contributions of this volume flesh out the security blurs at this performative layer, and portray how they occur across the various actors involved who habitually trespass across so-called borders of state versus non-state and informal versus formal. The chapter where blurs between security providers is most prevalent is that by Moritz Schuberth, who explicitly discusses the blurriness between various armed groups in Haiti. In addition to highlighting the problematic process by which these actors are labelled, which is often done by external actors, Schuberth shows the blurring between providers of security and providers of insecurity, who are often one and the same. He therefore proposes to shift our focus to the sponsors, rather than the producers of security, as this provides more insight into their motivations and makes it possible to discern security blurs.

In Perle Møhl's chapter on border security at Copenhagen airport, she describes the various actors and technologies operating at the airport as an unstable security assemblage and portrays the blurring of responsibilities, decision-making and ongoing negotiations between the human actors, and between human and non-human ones. She distinguishes between two types of blurs. The first occur on a structural level and this refers to the conflicting agendas and interests of the various actors, which appear coherent on the surface, but are in fact blurred and unclear. The second are blurs that occur in the particular instances where control authority is allocated and when decisions are made by the various actors. Combined, this chapter depicts how the presence of numerous actors and the overlapping and intermixing of roles, motivations, responsibilities and practices produce various forms of blurs.

Similarly, in Atreyee Sen's chapter, security blurs also merge through the co-production of (informal) policing activities, this time by resident women with strong Hindu nationalist sympathies, policemen and security guards in an effort to combat "loose girls" and the indecency they bring to the neighbourhoods. Sen shows how issues of responsibilisation become important within the community around questions about who is responsible of "security" and how is security defined (and by whom). In this case, the community members use the moral argument, as they believe that "immoral" behaviour of women will attract criminals, paedophiles and the like. In this chapter we do therefore not necessarily see a blurring among actors, but a blurring of their motivations and goals, making it unclear to identify who is steering policing practices and who will benefit from them in terms of (perceived) safety or status for example.

Sen's chapter also uncovers the crucial role of urban space in defining security blurs by comparing militant moral policing practices conducted in two different spaces – a bridge and a park. Through this analysis, she shows how violence and security are embodied and experienced in everyday urban space and how they impact spatio-temporal milieus that eventually develop gendered geographies of urban fear. The prominence of space is also crucial in areas that can be defined as frontier-like or as in-between settings, which often act as sites of power struggles between the state and non-state security actors working to keep certain groups out and civilians who either are rejected or embraced by the state. In Møhl's chapter, for example, the specific setting of the airport determines that the decision-making processes concerning access to the airport is tricky and unpredictable and that the threshold for facial recognition becomes blurry when machines take over the tasks of humans.

The role of machines is an example of the prominent role of security technologies in Møhl's chapter, where we cannot underestimate the decisive role that objects, materialities and technologies play in shaping the security blur, especially at the performative layer. We do not only learn more about crucial technologies, such as Automated Border Control (ABC) and algorithmic

thresholds, but also about how individuals interact with such technologies (human and non-human) and how this interaction plays a crucial role in the blurring. Møhl, for example, shows how human agents at times disagree with the decisions of the machine and questions are raised about the qualities of risk assessments.

In addition to machines, other non-human entities that surface in several chapters are weapons: their use and at times the normalisation of their presence. The use of weapons, or the ability of individuals to carry arms, brings us to another important aspect within the performative layer of security acts: the centrality of violence, especially in conjuring and gaining legitimacy and authority. Although various forms of policing and security are non-violent, violence – or the potentiality of it – emerges in all of the chapters, either as physical violence or as more structural as "embedded in the political and economic organization of our social world" (Farmer et al. 2006: 1686).

This is particularly evident in Helene Maria Kyed's chapter on contested sovereignty in Maputo, Mozambique, where she analyses the entanglements between civilian and state policing and how this results in both the blurring of types of policing actors as well as a blurring of community-based and state police practices. By focusing on two empirical examples – the theft of a mobile phone and a police uniform ceremony – she shows how the policing roles of the civilian agents and state police officers constantly blur through mutual interdependencies, entanglements and exchanges, and how these practices are equally infused with ongoing competition over power, benefits and legitimacy. By use of these rich empirical examples, Kyed shows that violence is part of the routinised aspects of everyday policing and plays a crucial role in asserting positions of power and overcoming uncertainty. Here too, we observe the crucial role of materialities: in the police uniform ceremony, she describes how uniforms and batons were first given to civilian agents within the community-policing programme, but were then forbidden, as they would look too similar to "real" police officers. This not only shows the immense symbolic power of the uniform, but also highlights how issues of legitimacy and sovereignty foreground such a blur.

Finally, Line Jakobsen and Lars Buur's chapter also addresses matters of violence and insecurity, this time in urban peripheries in La Paz, Bolivia. In their contribution, they demonstrate how community-policing practices have become entangled with local informal vigilante-like practices of order-making, and how these entanglements are largely shaped by the use of violence. They address the implications of the translation of a global security technology into a local setting and examine how "order-making" takes place and security becomes blurred in this process of implementation. By drawing from numerous interviews with local residents, they show how fear and insecurity reigns in these urban peripheral communities. Therefore, while global community-policing "blueprints" were intended to reduce crime and provide "security", they have morphed into new policing practices and structures which tend to produce more insecurity. This facet reaffirms that

security acts intrinsically have flip sides, and are always produced for *and* against someone, either an individual or collective, and this dimension is largely encapsulated in the third layer – the effective.

The effective layer

The effective layer refers to the effect of the security performance on the various actors involved. This includes the performers themselves (i.e. the security providers), but also the receivers, such as clients, members and citizens; both those that are "protected" and targeted. The main dimension of this effective layer concerns the feelings of safety, security, insecurity and feelings of uncertainty that can accompany security performances. To use the introductory example one last time, here one could investigate the way the public in the low-income neighbourhood perceives this patrol. Do some feel they are being targeted? Do others feel safer because of the visible patrols in the streets? And importantly, how does this work impact the security guards and the police officers accompanying them? Are certain ideas and skills transferred during such patrols? And does the cooperation change the status of the actors or the power relations between them? The answers to such questions are by definition fluid and should be analysed as processual and contextual. Only then, by examining such security blurs in detail, can we understand the security performance in its totality.

The chapter that addresses the effective layer head-on is the one by Laurens Bakker. In addition to examining the multitude of local security providers and the various roles that they claim and are ascribed, Bakker primarily analyses how such understandings of policing are infused with understandings of national citizenship and belonging. Furthermore, the *ormas* (societal organisations) play a pivotal role in deciding what and who is the "community", and thereby explicitly engage in exclusive practices, and how this results in a stratified form of citizenship. Bakker thus show how security providers are capable of setting conditions in terms of indigeneity, ethnicity, religion and locality, and how these elements impact upon the quality of citizenship of those affected.

In each of the contributions, we can clearly see that security acts prominently shape the lives of people in a multitude of ways. These can be the actual performers of security, such as the community policing agents in Maputo and La Paz, the security guards working at the Copenhagen airport, and the Hindu nationalist women in Mumbai; the citizens that live in neighbourhoods where policing practices are enacted, such as the residents of Maputo, the inhabitants of the *barrios* in La Paz, the people living in and working for non-governmental organisations in Port-au-Prince and of course, those that are specifically targeted by the security performance, such as the Palestinians working in Super-Israel, the "migrants" that are denied access to enter the Schengen area and the couples that are morally disciplined in various public spaces in Mumbai. Whether you are the performer,

receiver, target or bystander of a security performance, it impacts you and this highlights the differentially effective dimension of the security blur.

Another key effect that emerges from most of the chapters and that is particularly well captured by ethnographic research is the production of uncertainty and "not knowing": due to the various forms of blurring, it is often not clear what exactly is happening and who is doing what. This dimension strongly emerges in Møhl's chapter, where it is often unclear who is responsible for the decisions that are made, especially for the users of the airport. Yet this also results in frustration by the providers and the border guards, and features in their interactions with the various objects. This dimension of not knowing who belongs to whom and not being able to identify the political alliances between the different actors is a big factor Schuberth's chapter. This uncertainty is a crucial component of the effective domain of security blurs, and reaffirms the need to unpack them.

A note on ethnography

A final note we wish to make concerns the ethnographic dimension of this volume, which we believe ties all of the chapters together. All of the authors that contributed to this volume conducted in-depth ethnographic fieldwork in their respective localities. This is clearly evident from the rich empirical data that is presented – not only do we see abundant quotes from interviews, but also conversations and discussions between individuals, and extensive notes deriving from participant observation. The thick descriptions that are offered by the authors not only provide in-depth analytical perspectives, but also demonstrate the benefits from longitudinal research visits that are often conducted by anthropologists.

It is not our intention here to equate ethnographic fieldwork with anthropology, or to assume that ethnographic fieldwork is similarly understood and exercised by all of the contributors to this volume. In fact, the diverse forms of data portrayed here point towards the various ways in which we employ certain methods, the type of data that is yielded from such methods, and the way we use, interpret and analyse this data. Furthermore, we also do not wish to claim that an anthropological approach to security solely rests of ethnographic fieldwork.

However, we do want to emphasise that ethnographic fieldwork, in its various forms and styles, acts as a crucial tool in identifying, observing and analysing security blurs. Ethnographic fieldwork is a key dimension to understanding the core of any security performance and fully unravelling how the various layers – structural, performative and effective – take shape and emerge (see Hansen 2018). Some of the key facets that define ethnographic fieldwork are longitudinal stays and re-visits, learning the local language/dialect, understanding tacit elements of people's behaviour, observing and participating with people in their everyday affairs, taking extensive notes of these observations, experiences and emotions, engaging in small talk, and

conducting diverse types of interviews with people. These are all methods and techniques that allow the researcher to actually be present at the security performances and see the blurs come into being with her own eyes. It is primarily for this reason that we hope this volume will assist us in further developing an anthropological approach to security that is also beneficial for scholars outside the discipline.

Notes

1 This is a description by the first author.
2 www.tel-aviv.gov.il/About/Pages/SELA.aspx, accessed May 25 2018.
3 www.calcalist.co.il/local/articles/0,7340,L-3645934,00.html, accessed May 30 2018.

References

Abrahamsen, Rita, and Michael C. Williams. 2009. "Security Beyond the State: Global Security Assemblages in International Politics". *International Political Sociology* 3 (1): 1–17.

Albrecht, Peter. 2016. "Hybridisation in a Case of Diamond Theft in Rural Sierra Leone". *Ethnos*. https://doi.org/10.1080/00141844.2016.1263229.

Albrecht, Peter, and Helene Maria Kyed, eds. 2015. *Policing and the Politics of Order-Making*. New York: Routledge.

Bakker, Laurens. 2015. "Illegality for the General Good? Vigilantism and Social Responsibility in Contemporary Indonesia". *Critique of Anthropology* 35 (1): 78–93.

Ben-Ari, Eyal. 1998. *Mastering Soldiers: Conflict, Emotions and the Enemy in an Israeli Military Unit*. New York: Berghahn Books.

Buur, Lars. 2006. "Reordering Society: Vigilantism and Expressions of Sovereignty in Port Elizabeth's Townships". *Development and Change* 37 (4): 735–757.

Caldeira, Teresa P.R. 2000. *City of Walls: Crime, Segregation, and Citizenship in Sao Paulo*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Colona, Francesco, and Rivke Jaffe. 2016. "Hybrid Governance Arrangements". *The European Journal of Developmental Research* 28 (2): 175–183.

Denyer Willis, Graham. 2015. *The Killing Consensus: Police, Organised Crime and the Regulation of Life and Death in Urban Brazil*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Diphoorn, Tessa. 2016. *Twilight Policing: Private Security and Violence in Urban South Africa*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Diphoorn, Tessa, and Erella Grassiani. 2016. "Securitizing Capital: A Processual-Relation Approach to Pluralised Security". *Theoretical Criminology* 20 (4): 430–445.

Diphoorn, Tessa, and Helene Maria Kyed. 2016. "Entanglements of Private Security and Community Policing in South Africa and Swaziland". *African Affairs* 115 (461): 710–732.

Farmer, Paul, Bruce Nizeye, Sara Stulac, and Salmaan Keshavjee. 2006. "Structural Violence and Clinical Medicine". *PLoS Med* 3 (10): e449.

Fassin, Didier. 2013. *Enforcing Order: An Ethnography of Urban Policing*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Introducing Security Blurs

Abrahamsen, Rita , and Michael C. Williams . 2009. "Security Beyond the State: Global Security Assemblages in International Politics". International Political Sociology 3 (1): 1–17.

Albrecht, Peter . 2016. "Hybridisation in a Case of Diamond Theft in Rural Sierra Leone". Ethnos. https://doi.org/10.1080/00141844.2016.1263229.

Albrecht, Peter , and Helene Maria Kyed , eds. 2015. Policing and the Politics of Order-Making. New York: Routledge.

Bakker, Laurens . 2015. "Illegality for the General Good? Vigilantism and Social Responsibility in Contemporary Indonesia". Critique of Anthropology 35 (1): 78–93.

Ben-Ari, Eyal . 1998. Mastering Soldiers: Conflict, Emotions and the Enemy in an Israeli Military Unit. New York: Berghahn Books.

Buur, Lars . 2006. "Reordering Society: Vigilantism and Expressions of Sovereignty in Port Elizabeth's Townships". Development and Change 37 (4): 735–757.

Caldeira, Teresa P.R. 2000. City of Walls: Crime, Segregation, and Citizenship in Sao Paulo. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Colona, Francesco , and Rivke Jaffe . 2016. "Hybrid Governance Arrangements". The European Journal of Developmental Research 28 (2): 175–183.

Denyer Willis, Graham . 2015. The Killing Consensus: Police, Organised Crime and the Regulation of Life and Death in Urban Brazil. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Diphoorn, Tessa . 2016. Twilight Policing: Private Security and Violence in Urban South Africa. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Diphoorn, Tessa , and Erella Grassiani . 2016. "Securitizing Capital: A Processual-Relation Approach to Pluralised Security". Theoretical Criminology 20 (4): 430–445.

Diphoorn, Tessa , and Helene Maria Kyed . 2016. "Entanglements of Private Security and Community Policing in South Africa and Swaziland". African Affairs 115 (461): 710–732.

Farmer, Paul , Bruce Nizeye , Sara Stulac , and Salmaan Keshavjee . 2006. "Structural Violence and Clinical Medicine". PLoS Med 3 (10): e449.

Fassin, Didier . 2013. Enforcing Order: An Ethnography of Urban Policing. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Fassin, Didier , ed. 2017. Writing the World of Policing: The Difference Ethnography Makes. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Feldman, Alan . 1991. Formations of Violence: The Narrative of the Body and Political Terror in Northern Ireland. Chicago: Chicago University Press.

Garriot, William , ed. 2013. Policing and Contemporary Governance: The Anthropology of Police in Practice. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Glück, Zoltán , and Setha Low . 2017. "A Sociospatial Framework for the Anthropology of Security". Anthropological Theory 17 (3): 281–296.

Goldstein, Daniel . 2010. "Toward a Critical Anthropology of Security". Current Anthropology 51 (4): 487–517.

Grassiani, Erella . 2013. Soldering Under Occupation: Processes of Numbing Among Israel Soldiers in the Al-Aqsa Intifada. New York: Berghahn Books.

Grassiani, Erella , and Lior Volinz . 2016. "Intimidation, Reassurance, and Invisibility: Israeli Security Agents in the Old City of Jerusalem". Focaal 75: 14–30.

Hansen, Rebecca . 2018. "Ethnographies of Security: Pushing Security Studies Beyond the Bounds of International Relations". Qualitative Sociology: 1–7. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11133-018-9384-0.

Higate, Paul , and Mats Utas , eds. 2017. Private Security in Africa: From the Global Assemblage to the Everyday. London: Zed Books.

Hurtado, Fina Anton , and Giovanni Ercolani . 2013. Anthropology and Security Studies. Univesidad de Murcia, Nottingham Trent University and College of William and Mary.

Jauregui, Beatrice . 2016. Provisional Authority: Police, Order, and Security in India. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Jensen, Steffen . 2008. Gangs, Politics and Dignity in Cape Town. Oxford: James Currey.

Karpiak, Kevin . 2010. "Of Heroes and Polemics: 'The Policemen in Urban Ethnography'". Political and Legal Anthropology Review 33 (1): 7–31.

Kyed, Helene Maria . 2009. "Community Policing in Post-war Mozambique. Policing and Society 19 (4): 354–371.

Larkins, Erika Robb . 2017. "Guarding the Body: Private Security Work in Rio de Janeiro". Conflict and Society 3 (1): 61–72.

Low, Setha . 2013. "Securitization Strategies: Gated Communities and Market-rate Co-operatives in New York". In Policing Cities: Urban Securitization and Regulation in a 21st Century World, edited by Randy K. Lippert and Kevin Walby , 222–230. London: Routledge.

Maguire, Mark , Catarina Frois , and Nils Zurawski , eds. 2014. The Anthropology of Security: Perspectives from the Frontline of Policing, Counter-terrorism and Border Control. London: Pluto Press.

Mynster Christensen, Maya . 2017. "Shadow Soldiering: Shifting Constellations and Permeable Boundaries in 'Private' Security Contracting". Conflict and Society 3 (1): 24–41.

Neocleous, Mark , and George S. Rigakos , eds. 2011. Anti-Security. Ottawa: Red Quill Books.

Nordstrom, Carolyn , and Antonius C.G.M. Robben , eds. 1995. Fieldwork Under Fire: Contemporary Studies of Violence and Survival. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Pedersen, Axel Morten , and Martin Holbraad , eds. 2013. Times of Security: Ethnographies of Fear, Protest and the Future. London: Routledge.

Pratten, David , and Atryee Sen , eds. 2007. Global Vigilantes. London: Hurst & Company.

Rodgers, Dennis . 2006. "The State as a Gang: Conceptualizing the Governmentality of Violence in Contemporary Nicaragua". Critique of Anthropology 26 (3): 315–330.

Ruteere, Mutuma , and Marie-Emmanuelle Pommerolle . 2003. "Democratizing Security or Decentralizing Repression? The Ambiguities of Community Policing in Kenya". African Affairs 102: 587–604.

Samimian-Darash, Limor , and Meg Stalcup . 2016. "Anthropology of Security and Security in Anthropology: Cases of Terrorism in the United States". Anthropological Theory 17 (1): 60–87.

Scheper-Hughes, Nancy , and Philippe Bourgois , eds. 2004. Violence in War and Peace: An Anthology. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Van Stapele, Naomi . 2015. Respectable 'Illegality': Gangs, Masculinities, and Belonging in a Nairobi Ghetto. PhD Dissertation, University of Amsterdam.

Winslow, Donna . 1997. The Canadian Airborne Regiment in Somalia: A Socio-Cultural Inquiry: A Study Prepared for the Commission of Inquiry Into the Deployment of Canadian Forces to Somalia. Ottawa: The Commission.

"The supermarket became an army base!"

Abu El-Haj, Nadia . 2010. "Racial Palestinianization and the Janus-Faced Nature of the Israeli State". Patterns of Prejudice 44 (1): 27–41.

Azoulay, Ariella , and Adi Ophir . 2012. The One-State Condition: Occupation and Democracy in Israel/Palestine. Redwood City: Stanford University Press.

Bachmann, Jan , Colleen Bell , and Caroline Holmqvist , eds. 2014. War, Police and Assemblages of Intervention. New York: Routledge.

Berda, Yael . 2017. Living Emergency: Israel's Permit Regime in the Occupied West Bank. Redwood City: Stanford University Press.

Bishara, Amahl . 2015. "Driving While Palestinian in Israel and the West Bank: The Politics of Disorientation and the Routes of a Subaltern Knowledge". American Ethnologist 42 (1): 33–54.

Bornstein, Avram S. 2002. "Borders and the Utility of Violence: State Effects on the "Superexploitation" of West Bank Palestinians". Critique of Anthropology 22 (2): 201–220.

B'Tselem . 2015. "Your Responsibility for Permitting a de Facto Death Penalty". November 25, 2015. www.btselem.org/download/20151125_letter_to_pm_on_extrajudicial_killings_eng.pdf.

Camp, Jordan T. , and Christina Heatherton , eds. 2016. Policing the Planet: Why the Policing Crisis Led to Black Lives Matter. New York: Verso.

Clarno, Andy . 2017. Neoliberal Apartheid: Palestine/Israel and South Africa after 1994. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Duffield, Mark . 2001. Global Governance and the New Wars: The Merging of Development and Security. New York: Zed Books.

Fanon, Frantz . 2004. The Wretched of the Earth. Translated by Richard Philcox . New York: Grove Press.

Feldman, Ilana . 2015. Police Encounters: Security and Surveillance in Gaza Under Egyptian Rule. Redwood City: Stanford University Press.

Goffman, Erving . 1981. Forms of Talk. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Goldstein, Daniel M. 2012. Outlawed: Between Security and Rights in a Bolivian City. Durham: Duke University Press Books.

Gordon, Neve . 2008. Israel's Occupation. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Grassiani, Erella , and Lior Volinz . 2016. "Intimidation, Reassurance, and Invisibility: Israeli Security Agents in the Old City of Jerusalem". Focaal 2016 (75).

Gregory, Derek . 2004. The Colonial Present: Afghanistan, Palestine, and Iraq. Malden: Blackwell Publishing.

Hall, Kathleen . 2012. "Security and the Neoliberal State: British Political Imaginaries After 7/7". In Ethnographies of Neoliberalism, edited by Carol J. Greenhouse , 13–27. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Human Rights Watch . 2017. "Israel/Palestine: Some Officials Backing 'Shoot-to-Kill': Calls for Extrajudicial Killings of Palestinian Suspects Proliferate". www.hrw.org/news/2017/01/02/israel/palestine-some-officials-backing-shoot-kill.

Jauregui, Beatrice . 2010. "Bluing Green in the Maldives: Countering Citizen Insurgency by 'Civil'-Izing National Security". In Anthropology and Global Counter-insurgency, edited by John D. Kelly , Beatrice Jauregui , Sean T. Mitchell , and Jeremy Walton . Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Kadman, Noga . 2012. Employment of Palestinians in Israel and the Settlements: Restrictive Policies and Abuse of Rights. Tel Aviv: Kav LaOved.

Kelly, John D. , Beatrice Jauregui , Sean T. Mitchell , and Jeremy Walton , eds. 2010. Anthropology and Global Counterinsurgency. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Kelly, Tobias . 2009. Law, Violence and Sovereignty Among West Bank Palestinians. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Kershner, Isabel . 2015. "West Bank Shopping Complex, a Symbol of Coexistence, Is Shaken". New York Times, December 14, 2015. www.nytimes.com/2015/12/15/world/middleeast/west-bank-shopping-complex-a-symbol-of-coexistence-is-shaken.html.

Khalili, Laleh . 2012. Time in the Shadows: Confinement in Counterinsurgencies. Redwood City: Stanford University Press.

Lakoff, Andrew . 2008. "The Generic Biothreat, Or, How We Became Unprepared". Cultural Anthropology 23 (3): 399–428.

Lutz, Catherine A. 2002. Homefront: A Military City and the American Twentieth Century. Boston: Beacon Press.

Masco, Joseph . 2014. The Theater of Operations: National Security Affect From the Cold War to the War on Terror. Durham: Duke University Press.

O'Neill, Kevin Lewis . 2015. Secure the Soul: Christian Piety and Gang Prevention in Guatemala. Oakland: University of California Press.

Rana, Aziz . 2014. "Settler Wars and the National Security State". Settler Colonial Studies 4 (2): 171–175.

Robinson, Shira . 2013. Citizen Strangers: Palestinians and the Birth of Israel's Liberal Settler State. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Salamanca, Omar Jabary , 2012. "Past Is Present: Settler Colonialism in Palestine". Settler Colonial Studies 2 (1): 1–8.

Schmitt, Carl . 2007. The Concept of the Political. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Taussig, Michael . 1999. Defacement: Public Secrecy and the Labor of the Negative. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Weizman, Eyal . 2007. Hollow Land: Israel's Architecture of Occupation. New York: Verso.

Security blurs in Haiti

Andersen, Louise , Bjørn Møller , and Finn Stepputat . 2007. Fragile States and Insecure People? Violence, Security, and Statehood in the Twenty-first Century. New York and Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Aristide, Marx V. , and Laurie Richardson . 1995. "Haiti's Popular Resistance". In Haiti: Dangerous Crossroads, edited by Deidre Mcfadyen and Pierre Laramée , 181–194. Boston: South End Press.

Charles, Jacqueline . 2012. "Haiti Kidnapping: Shrouded in Secrecy". Merced Sun-Star, November 19, 2012.

Cockayne, James . 2009. "Winning Haiti's Protection Competition: Organized Crime and Peace Operations Past, Present and Future". International Peacekeeping 16 (1): 77–99.

Deibert, Michael . 2005. Notes From the Last Testament: The Struggle for Haiti. New York: Seven Stories Press.

del Frate, Anna Alvazzi , and Luigi De Martino . 2013. "Everyday Dangers: Nonconflict Armed Violence". In Small Arms Survey 2013: Everyday Dangers, edited by Emile Lebrun 7–15. Geneva: Small Arms Survey.

Di Razza, Namie . 2010. L'ONU en Haïti Depuis 2004: Ambitions et Déconvenues des Opérations de Paix Multidimensionnelles. Paris: L'Harmattan.

Diederich, Bernard , and Al Burt . 2005. Papa Doc & The Tontons Macoutes. Princeton: Markus Wiener.

Dupuy, Alex . 2005. "From Jean-Bertrand Aristide to Gerard Latortue: The Unending Crisis of Democratization in Haiti". Journal of Latin American Anthropology 10 (1): 186–205.

Dupuy, Alex . 2007. The Prophet and Power: Jean-Bertrand Aristide, the International Community, and Haiti. Plymouth: Rowman & Littlefield.

Elwert, Georg . 1999. "Markets of Violence". In Dynamics of Violence: Processes of Escalation and De-Escalation in Violent Group Conflicts, edited by Georg Elwert 85–102. Berlin: Duncker & Humblot.

Elwert, Georg . 2003. "Intervention in Markets of Violence". In Potentials of Disorder: Explaining Conflict and Stability in the Caucasus and in the Former Yugoslavia, edited by Jan Koehler and Christoph Zürcher , 219–243. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Erickson, Amy . 2014. Exploiting Inequalities: Conflict and Power Relations in Bel Air. Oslo: Norwegian Church Aid.

Fatton Jr., Robert . 2002. Haiti's Predatory Republic: The Unending Transition to Democracy. Boulder: Lynne Rienner.

Fatton Jr., Robert . 2006. "Haiti: The Saturnalia of Emancipation and the Vicissitudes of Predatory Rule". Third World Quarterly 27 (1): 115–133.

Fatton Jr., Robert . 2007. The Roots of Haitian Despotism. Boulder: Lynne Rienner.

Fleurimond, Wiener Kerns . 2009. Haïti de la Crise à l'Occupation, Histoire d'un Chaos (2000–2004) – Tome I: La Chute d'Aristide. Paris: L'Harmattan.

Gambetta, Diego . 1996. The Sicilian Mafia: The Business of Private Protection. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Gros, Jean-Germain . 2012. State Failure, Underdevelopment, and Foreign Intervention in Haiti. London and New York: Routledge.

Hallward, Peter . 2007. Damming the Flood: Haiti, Aristide and the Politics of Containment. London and New York: Verso.

Hammond, Guy . 2012. Saving Port-au-Prince: UN Efforts to Protect Civilians in Haiti in 2006–2007. Washington, DC: The Stimson Center.

Herman, Eduardo Aldunate . 2010. Backpacks Full of Hope: The UN Mission in Haiti. Waterloo: Centre for International Governance Innovation and Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

International Crisis Group . 2006. Haiti: Security and the Reintegration of the State. Brussels: International Crisis Group.

Jean, Jean-Claude , and Marc Maesschalck . 1999. Transition Politique en Haïti: Radiographie du Pouvoir Lavalas. Paris: L'Harmattan.

Kemp, Walter , Mark Shaw , and Arthur Boutellis . 2013. The Elephant in the Room: How Can Peace Operations Deal with Organized Crime? New York: International Peace Institute.

Kivland, Chelsey Louise . 2009. A Report on the Recent Changes in Perceptions of Security and Social Services in Bel Air, Haiti. Geneva: Small Arms Survey.

Kivland, Chelsey Louise . 2014. "Becoming a Force in the Zone: Hedonopolitics, Masculinity, and the Quest for Respect on Haiti's Streets". Cultural Anthropology 29 (4): 672–698.

Kolbe, Athena . 2013. Revisiting Haiti's Gangs and Organized Violence. Rio de Janeiro: HASOW.

Kovats-Bernat, J. Christopher . 2006. Sleeping Rough in Port-Au-Prince: An Ethnography of Street Children and Violence in Haiti. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

Lambach, Daniel . 2007. Oligopolies of Violence in Post-Conflict Societies. Hamburg: German Institute of Global and Area Studies.

Lunde, Henriette . 2012. The Violent Lifeworlds of Young Haitians: Gangs as Livelihood in a Port-au-Prince Ghetto. Oslo: Fafo.

Marcelin, Louis Herns . 2015. "Violence, Human Insecurity, and the Challenge of Rebuilding Haiti: A Study of a Shantytown in Port-au-Prince". Current Anthropology 56 (2): 230–255.

Mehler, Andreas . 2004. "Oligopolies of Violence in Africa South of the Sahara". Nord-Süd-Aktuell 18 (3): 539–548.

Mobekk, Eirin . 2008. "MINUSTAH and the Need for a Context-Specific Strategy: The Case of Haiti". In Security Sector Reform and UN Integrated Missions: Experience From Burundi, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Haiti and Kosovo, edited by Heiner Hänggi and Vincenza Scherrer , 113–168. Münster: Lit Verlag.

Mobekk, Eirin , and Anne M. Street . 2006. Disarmament, Demobilisation and Rein-tegration: What Role should the EU Play in Haiti? Recommendations for Change. London: ActionAid.

Muggah, Robert . 2013. "The Political Economy of Statebuilding in Haiti: Informal Resistance to Security-first Statebuilding". In Political Economy of Statebuilding: Power After Peace, edited by Mats Berdal and Dominik Zaum , 293–305. London and New York: Routledge.

Neiburg, Federico , Natacha Nicaise , and Pedro Braum . 2011. Leaders in Bel Air. Rio de Janeiro: Viva Rio.

Nicolas, Mireille . 2006. Haïti, d'un Coup d'État à l'Autre. Paris: L'Harmattan.

Peirce, Jennifer . 2007. "Protection for Whom? Stabilization and Coercive Rule in Haiti". Paterson Review of International Affairs 8: 96–112.

Perito, Robert M. , and Michael Dziedzic . 2008. Haiti: Confronting the Gangs of Port-au-Prince. Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace.

RNDDH . 2012. Affaire Brandt: Le RNDDH Exige l'Aboutissement de l'Enquête Ouverte et le Jugement de Tous les Membres du Gang. Port-au-Prince: Réseau National de Défense des Droits Humains.

Rodgers, Dennis . 2007. "Gangs, Violence and Asset Building". In Reducing Global Poverty: The Case for Asset Accumulation, edited by Caroline O. N. Moser , 179–195. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2014. "The Impact of Drug Trafficking on Informal Security Actors in Kenya". Africa Spectrum 49 (3): 55–81.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2015a. "The Challenge of Community-based Armed Groups: Towards a Conceptualization of Militias, Gangs, and Vigilantes". Contemporary Security Policy 36 (2): 296–320.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2015b. "A Transformation from Political to Criminal Violence? Politics, Organised Crime and the Shifting Functions of Haiti's Urban Armed Groups". Conflict, Security & Development 15 (2): 169–196.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2016a. "Beyond Gang Truces and Mano Dura Policies: Towards Substitutive Security Governance in Latin America". Stability: International Journal of Security & Development 5 (1): Art. 17.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2016b. "Growing the Grassroots or Backing Bandits? Dilemmas of Donor Support for Haiti's (Un)Civil Society". Journal of Peacebuilding & Development 11 (1): 93–98.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2017a. "Disarmament, Demobilisation and Reintegration in Unconventional Settings: The Case of MINUSTAH's Community Violence Reduction". International Peacekeeping 24 (3): 410–433.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2017b. "To Engage or Not to Engage Haiti's Urban Armed Groups? Safe Access in Disaster-stricken and Conflict-affected Cities". Environment and Urbanization 29 (2): 425–442.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2018a. "Divergent Worldviews among Peacebuilders: Evidence From Haiti". In Blame, Sway, and Vigilante Tactics: How Other Cultures Think Differently and Implications for Planning, edited by Gwyneth Sutherlin , 9–16. Washington, DC: US Department of Defense.

Schuberth, Moritz . 2018b. "Hybrid Security Governance, Post-election Violence and the Legitimacy of Community-based Armed Groups in Urban Kenya". Journal of Eastern African Studies 12 (2): 386–404.

Sprague, Jeb . 2012. Paramilitarism and the Assault on Democracy in Haiti. New York: Monthly Review Press.

Tilly, Charles . 1985. "War Making and State Making as Organized Crime". In Bringing the State Back In, edited by Peter Evans 169–187. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Volkov, Vadim . 2002. Violent Entrepreneurs: The Use of Force in the Making of Russian Capitalism. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.

Wilentz, Amy . 1989. The Rainy Season: Haiti since Duvalier. New York: Simon and Schuster.

Willman, Alys , and Louis Herns Marcelin . 2010. "'If They Could Make Us Disappear, They Would'! Youth and Violence in Cite Soleil, Haiti". Journal of Community Psychology 38 (4): 515–531.

Security blurs and citizenship

Baker, Jacqui . 2015. "The Rhizome State: Democratizing Indonesia's Off-Budget Economy". Critical Asian Studies 47 (2): 309–336.

Bakker, Laurens . 2017a. "Lynching, Public Violence and the Internet in Indonesia". In Global Lynching and Collective Violence. Volume 1 Asia, Africa and the Middle-East, edited by Michael J. Pfeifer , 10–33. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Bakker, Laurens . 2017b. "Militias, Security and Citizenship in Indonesia". In Citizenship and Democratization in Southeast Asia, edited by Ward Berenschot , Henk Schulte Nordholt , and Laurens Bakker , 125–154. Leiden and Boston: Brill.

Barker, Joshua . 1998. "State of Fear: Controlling the Criminal Contagion in Suharto's New Order". Indonesia 66 (October): 6–43.

Berenschot, Ward , Henk Schulte Nordholt , and Laurens Bakker . 2017. "Introduction: Citizenship and Democratization in Postcolonial Southeast Asia". In Citizenship and Democratization in Southeast Asia, edited by Ward Berenschot , Henk Schulte Nordholt , and Laurens Bakker , 1–30. Leiden and Boston: Brill.

Bertrand, Jacques . 2004. Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bubandt, Nils . 2005. "Vernacular Security: The Politics of Feeling Safe in Global, National and Local Worlds". Security Dialogue 36 (3): 275–296.

Colombijn, Freek . 2002. "Maling, Maling! The Lynching of Petty Criminals". In Roots of Violence in Indonesia, edited by Freek Colombijn and Thomas Lindblad , 299–330. Leiden: KITLV Press.

Cribb, Robert . 1991. Gangsters and Revolutionaries: The Jakarta People's Militia and the Indonesian Revolution 1945–1949. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press.

Davies, Sharyn Graham , Adrianus Meliala , and John Buttle . 2016. "Gangnam Style Versus Eye of the Tiger: People, Police and Procedural Justice in Indonesia". Policing and Society 26 (4): 453–474.

Ford, Michelle , and Thomas B. Pepinsky , eds. 2014. Beyond Oligarchy: Wealth, Power and Contemporary Indonesian Politics. Ithaca: Cornell Southeast Asia Program Publications.

Goldstein, Daniel . 2003. "'In Our Own Hands': Lynching, Justice and the Law in Bolivia". American Ethnologist 30 (1): 22–43.

Heriyanto, Anni . 2013. "Berteman Dengan Preman". Kompas, April 3, 2013. https://olahraga.kompas.com/read/2013/04/03/04252037/berteman.dengan.preman.

Lazar, Sian . 2013. The Anthropology of Citizenship: A Reader. Chichester: John Wiley & Sons.

Lindsey, Tim . 2001. "The Criminal State: Premanisme and the New Indonesia". In Indonesia Today: Challenges of History, edited by Grayson Lloyd and Shannon Smith , 283–297. Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield.

Oomen, Barbara . 2004. "Vigilantism or Alternative Citizenship? The Rise of Mapogo a Mathamaga". African Studies 63 (2): 153–171.

Petrus, Theodore . 2015. "Enemies of the 'State': Vigilantism and the Street Gang as Symbols of Resistance in South Africa". Aggression and Violent Behaviour 22: 26–32.

Poskotanews.com . 2018. "Cekcok dengan preman, anggota polisi tertembak". Poskotanews.com , January 4, 2018. http://poskotanews.com/2018/01/04/cecok-dengan-preman-anggota-polisi-tertembak/.

Pramono, Gatot Eddy . 2015. "Transformasi Organisasi Kemasyarakatan (Ormas) Menjadi Kelompok Kekerasan (Studi kekerasan Ormas di Jakarta)". Jurnal Keamanan Nasional 1 (2): 251–274.

Ryter, Loren . 1998. "Pemuda Pancasila: The Last Loyalist Free Men of Suharto's Order?" Indonesia 66 (October): 44–73.

Schulte Nordholt, Henk . 1991. "The Jago in the Shadow. Crime and 'Order' in the Colonial State in Java". RIMA: Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs 25 (1): 74–91.

Sen, Atreyee , and David Pratten . 2007. "Global Vigilantes: Perspectives on Justice and Violence". In Global Vigilantes, edited by David Pratten and Atreyee Sen , 1–24. London: Hurst Publishers.

Siegel, James . 1998. A New Criminal Type in Jakarta: Counter-revolution Today. Durham: Duke University Press.

Stokke, Kristian . 2017. "Politics of Citizenship: Towards an Analytical Framework". In Politics of Citizenship in Indonesia, edited by Eric Hiariej and Kristian Stokke , 23–54. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.

Sundar, Nandini . 2010. "Vigilantism, Culpability and Moral Dilemmas". Critique of Anthropology 30 (1): 113–121.

Tadié, Jérôme , and Risa Permanadeli . 2015. "Night and the City: Clubs, Brothels and Politics in Jakarta". Urban Studies 52 (3): 471–485.

Telle, Kari . 2013. "Vigilante Citizenship: Sovereign Practices and the Politics of Insult in Indonesia". Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Landen Volkenkunde 169: 183–212.

Van Klinken, Gerry . 2007. Communal Violence and Democratization in Indonesia: Small Town Wars. London: Routledge.

Van Stapele, Naomi . 2016. "'We Are Not Kenyans': Extra-Judicial Killings, Manhood and Citizenship in Mathare, a Nairobi Ghetto". Conflict, Security & Development 16 (4): 301–325.

Werbner, Richard . 2004. Reasonable Radicals and Citizenship in Botswana: The Public Anthropology of Kalanga Elites. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Wilson, Ian Douglas . 2006. "Continuity and Change. The Changing Contours of Organized Violence in Post-New Order Indonesia". Critical Asian Studies 38: 265–297.

Wilson, Ian Douglas . 2012. "The Biggest Cock: Territoriality, Invulnerability and Honour Amongst Jakarta's Gangsters". In Men and Masculinities in Southeast Asia, edited by Michelle Ford and Lenore Lyons , 121–138. London and New York: Routledge.

Wilson, Lee . 2017. "How Critical Can Critical Be? Contesting Security in Indonesia". Critical Studies on Security 5 (3): 302–316.

Wilson, Lee , and Laurens Bakker . 2016 "Cutting off the King's Head: Security and Normative Order Beyond the State". Conflict, Security & Development 16 (4): 289–300.

Wiwoho, Bimo . 2017. "Dua Sisi 'Berdamai' Dengan Preman Tanah Abang". CNN Indonesia, November 10, 2017. www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20171108151010-32-254386/dua-sisi-berdamai-dengan-preman-tanah-abang.

"Loose girls bring bad boys into safe neighbourhoods"

Abrahamsen, Rita , and Michael C. Williams . 2007. "Securing the City: Private Security Companies and Non-state Authority in Global Governance". International Relations 21: 237–253.

Atkinson, Rowland . 2003. "Domestication by Cappuccino or a Revenge on Urban Space? Control and Empowerment in the Management of Public Spaces". Urban Studies 40 (9): 1829–1843.

Bannerji, Himani . 2006. "Making India Hindu and Male: Cultural Nationalism and the Emergence of the Ethnic Citizen in Contemporary India". Ethnicities 6 (3): 362–390.

Becker, Anne , and Markus-Michael Müller . 2012. "The Securitization of Urban Space and the 'Rescue' of Downtown Mexico City". Vision and Practice 40 (2): 77–94.

Belur, Jyoti . 2010. Permission to Shoot? Police Use of Deadly Force in Democracies. New York: Springer.

Belur, Jyoti . 2011. "Police Stop and Search in India: Mumbai *Nakabandi* ". Policing and Society 21 (4): 420–431.

Bradford, Ben , Jonathan Jackson , and Elizabeth A. Stanko . 2009. "Contact and Confidence: Revisiting the Impact of Public Encounters With the Police". Policing and Society 19 (1): 20–46.

Caldeira, Teresa . 2002. "The Paradox of Police Violence in Democratic Brazil". Ethnography 3 (3): 235–263.

Diphoorn, Tessa , and Julie Berg . 2014. "Typologies of Partnership Policing: Case Studies from Urban South Africa". Policing and Society 24 (4): 425–442.

Fassin, Didier . 2013. Enforcing Order: An Ethnography of Urban Policing. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hagedorn, John . 2008. A World of Gangs: Armed Young Men and Gangsta Culture. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Holston, James . 2009. "Insurgent Citizenship in an Era of Global Urban Peripheries". City & Society 21 (2): 245–267.

Jauregui, Beatrice . 2013. "Beatings, Beacons, and Big Men: Police Disempowerment and Delegitimation in India". Law & Social Inquiry 38 (3): 643–669.

Kempa, Michael , Philip Stenning , and Jennifer Wood . 2004. "Policing Communal Spaces: A Reconfiguration of the 'Mass Private Property' Hypothesis". The British Journal of Criminology 44 (4): 562–581.

Kil, Sang H. , Cecilia Menjívar , and Roxanne L. Doty . 2009. "Securing Borders: Patriotism, Vigilantism and the Brutalization of the US American Public". In Immigration, Crime and Justice (Sociology of Crime, Law and Deviance, Volume 13), edited by William F. Mcdonald , 297–312. Bingley: Emerald Group Publishing.

Koskela, Hille . 1997. "'Bold Walk and Breakings': Women's Spatial Confidence Versus Fear of Violence". Gender, Place & Culture 4 (3): 301–320.

Marrow, Jocelyn . 2013. "Feminine Power or Feminine Weakness? North Indian Girls' Struggles with Aspirations, Agency, and Psychosomatic Illness". American Ethnologist 40 (2): 347–361.

Pain, Rachel . 2001. "Gender, Race, Age and Fear in the City". Urban Studies 38 (5–6): 899–913.

Pain, Rachel . 2006. "Paranoid Parenting? Rematerializing Risk and Fear for Children". Social & Cultural Geography 7 (2): 221–243.

Phadke, Shilpa . 2007. "Dangerous Liaisons: Women and Men: Risk and Reputation in Mumbai". Economic and Political Weekly 42 (17): 1510–1518.

Pratten, David , and Atreyee Sen , eds. 2007. Global Vigilantes. London: C. Hurst and Co.

Purcell, Mark . 2008. Recapturing Democracy: Neoliberalization and the Struggle for Alternative Urban Futures. New York: Routledge.

Radcliffe, Sarah A. 2007. "Latin American Indigenous Geographies of Fear: Living in the Shadow of Racism, Lack of Development, and Antiterror Measures". Annals of the Association of American Geographers 97 (2): 385–397.

Rao, Mohan . 2011. "Love Jihad and Demographic Fears". Indian Journal of Gender Studies 18 (3): 425–430.

Reid, Kiron . 2009. "Race Issues and Stop-and-Search: Looking Behind the Statistics". The Journal of Criminal Law 73: 165–183.

Roy, Ash Narian , Arputham Jockin , and Ahmad Javed . 2004. "Community Police Stations in Mumbai's Slums". Environment and Urbanization 16 (2): 135–138.

Samara, Tony Roshan . 2010. "Policing Development: Urban Renewal as Neo-liberal Security Strategy". Urban Studies 47 (1): 197–214.

Schielke, Samuli . 2008. "Policing Ambiguity: Muslim Saints-day Festivals and the Moral Geography of Public Space in Egypt". American Ethnologist 35 (4): 539–552.

Sen, Atreyee . 2006. "Reflecting on Resistance: Hindu Women 'Soldiers' Remember the Birth of Female Militancy". Indian Journal of Gender Studies 13 (1): 1–35.

Sen, Atreyee . 2007. Shiv Sena Women: Violence and Communalism in a Bombay Slum. London: C. Hurst and Co.

Sen, Atreyee . 2017. "Sumitai, the Vigilante in a Mumbai Slum". Terrain: Journal of Ethnology, Social and Cultural Anthropology. http://terrain.revues.org/16247.

Stanko, Elizabeth . 1996. "Warnings to Women: Police Advice and Women's Safety in Britain". Violence Against Women 2: 5–24.

Valentine, Gill . 2008. "Living with Difference: Reflections on Geographies of Encounter". Progress in Human Geography 32 (3): 323–337.

Wacquant, Lois . 2007. Urban Outcasts: A Comparative Sociology of Advanced Marginality. Cambridge: Polity.

Waddington, Peter A.J. , Kevin Stenson , and David Don . 2004. "Race, and Police Stop-and-Search". British Journal of Criminology 44: 889–914.

Disputed sovereignty

Abrahamsen, Rita , and Michael C. Williams . 2009. "Security Beyond the State: Global Security Assemblages in International Politics". International Political Sociology 3 (1): 1–17.

Araújo, Sara . 2009. "Legal Pluralism and Interlegality: The Role of Community Justices in Mozambique". In Search of Justice and Peace: Traditional and Informal Justice Systems in Africa, edited by Manfred Hinz and Clever Mapaure , 309–324. Berlin: Verlag.

Baker, Bruce . 2002. Taking the Law into their Own Hands: Lawless Law Enforcers in Africa. Burlington and Hampshire: Ashgate.

Benjamin, Walter . 1978 [1922]. "Critique of Violence". In Reflections, Essays, Aphorisms, Autobiographical Writings, edited by P. Demetz , 277–300. New York: Schocken.

Bertelsen, Bjørn Enge . 2016. Violent Becomings: State Formation, Sociality and Power in Mozambique. New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Brogden, Mike , and Peetri Nijhar . 2005. Community Policing: National and International Models and Approaches. Devon: Willan Publishing.

Comaroff, Jean L. , and John Comaroff , eds. 2006. Law and Disorder in the Post-colony. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.

Gazit, Nir . 2009. "Social Agency, Spatial Practices, and Power: the Micro Foundations of Fragmented Sovereignty in the Occupied Territories". International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society 22 (1): 83–103.

Griffiths, John . 1986. "What Is Legal Pluralism?" Journal of Legal Pluralism 24: 1–50.

Hansen, Thomas B. , and Finn Stepputat . 2001. States of Imagination Ethnographic Explorations of the Postcolonial State. Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Hansen, Thomas B. , and Finn Stepputat , eds. 2005. Sovereign Bodies: Citizens, Migrants and States in the Postcolonial World. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press.

Kyed, Helene M. 2007. State Recognition of Traditional Authority. Authority, Citizenship and State Formation in Rural Post-War Mozambique. PhD Dissertation, Roskilde University.

Kyed, Helene M. 2017a. "Predicament. Interpreting Police Violence (Mozambique)". In Writing the World of Policing, edited by D. Fassin , 113–138. Chicago: Chicago University Press.

Kyed, Helene M. 2017b. "Inside the Police Stations in Maputo City: Between Legality and Legitimacy". In Police in Africa: The Street Level View, edited by J. Beek , M. Güpfert , O. Owen , and J. Steinberg , 213–230. London: C. Hurst and Co.

Kyed, Helene M. 2017c. "Post-War Police Reform in Mozambique. The Case of Community Policing". In Colonial Policing and Transnational Legacy: The Global Dynamics of Policing Across the Lusophone Community, edited by C. O'Reilly , 163–182. New York: Routledge.

Kyed, Helene M. 2017d. "Hybridity and Boundary-Making: Exploring the Politics of Hybridisation". Third World Thematics, 2 (4): 464–480.

Kyed, Helene M. , and Peter Albrecht . 2015. "Introduction: Policing and the Politics of Order-making in Urban Margins". In Policing and the Politics of Order-Making, edited by P. Albrecht and H.M. Kyed . New York: Routledge.

Kyed, Helene M. , João Paulo Borges Coelho , Amelia Neves de Souto , and Sara Araújo , eds. 2012. The Dynamics of Legal Pluralism in Mozambique. Maputo: Kapicua.

Meneses, Paula . 2004. "Toward Interlegality? Traditional Healers and the Law in Postcolonial Mozambique". Beyond Law 30: 1–39.

Merry, Sally Engel . 1988. "Legal Pluralism". Law and Society Review 22 (5): 869–896.

Ministry of Interior (MINT) . 2005. "Políciamento comunitário. Segurança e ordem pública, seminário nacional dos administradores distritais". October 2005.

Santos, Boaventura Souso . 2006. "The Heterogeneous State and Legal Pluralism in Mozambique". Law and Society Review 40 (1): 39–75.

Serra, Carlos , ed. 2008. Linchamento em Moçambique I (Uma desordem que apela à ordem). Maputo: Imprensa Universitária.

Tamanaha, Brian Z. 2008. "Understanding Legal Pluralism. Past to Present, Local to Global". Sydney Law Review 30: 375–411.

Trindade, Joao Carlos , and Boaventura de Souso Santos . 2003. Conflito e Transformação Social. Uma Paisagem das Justiças em Moçambique. Porto: Reino e Neves. Santa Maria da Feira.

Wood, Jennifer , and Clifford Shearing . 2007. Imagining Security. Devon: Willan Publishing.

The blurred (in)security of community policing in Bolivia

Abrahams, David . 2007. "Some Thought on the Comparative Study of Vigilantism". In Global Vigilantes, 419–440. London: Hurst.

Abrahamsen, Rita , and Michael Williams . 2011. Security Beyond the State: Private Security in International Politics. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Agamben, Giorgio . 1998. Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Brenner, Neil , Jamie Peck , and Nik Theodore . 2010. "Variegated Neoliberalization: Geographies, Modalities, Pathways". Global Networks 10 (2): 182–222.

Bubandt, Nils . 2005. "Vernacular Security: The Politics of Feeling Safe in Global, National and Local Worlds". Security Dialogue 36 (3): 275–296.

Buur, Lars . 2006. "Reordering Society: Vigilantism and Expressions of Sovereignty in Port Elizabeth's Townships". Development and Change 37 (4): 735–757.

Buur, Lars . 2008. "Democracy & Its Discontents: Vigilantism, Sovereignty & Human Rights in South Africa". Review of African Political Economy 35 (118): 571–584.

Buur, Lars , and Steffen Jensen . 2004. "Introduction: Vigilantism and the Policing of Everyday Life in South Africa". African Studies 63 (2): 139–152.

Buzan, Barry , Ole Wæver , and Jaap de Wilde . 1998. Security: A New Framework for Analysis. Boulder: Lynne Rienner Pub.

Chatterjee, Partha . 2004. The Politics of the Governed: Reflections on Popular Politics in Most of the World. Leonard Hastings Schoff Memorial Lectures. New York: Columbia University Press.

Das, Veena , and Deborah Poole , eds. 2004. Anthropology in the Margins of the State. 1st edition. School of American Research Advanced Seminar Series. Santa Fe; Oxford: School of American Research Press; James Currey.

Delanty, Gerard . 2010. Community. Key Ideas. 2nd edition. London and New York: Routledge.

Derpic, Jorge . 2013. "Bolivia: Los linchados de El Alto". Revista Anfibia, Universidad de Texas (blog). www.revistaanfibia.com/cronica/bolivia-los-linchados-de-el-alto/.

Derpic, Jorge . 2015. "Vigilantes or Community Police. Citizens' Involvement in Crime Prevention Tasks". Paper Prepared for delivery at the 2015 Congress of the Latin American Studies Association, Puerto Rico, May 27–30, 2015.

Deukmedjian, John Edward . 2013. "Making Sense of Neoliberal Securitization in Urban Policing and Surveillance: Neoliberal Securitization in Urban Policing and Surveillance". Canadian Review of Sociology/Revue Canadienne de Sociologie 50 (1): 52–73.

Diphoorn, Tessa . 2015. "'It's All About the Body': The Bodily Capital of Armed Response Officers in South Africa". Medical Anthropology 34 (4): 336–352. https://doi.org/10.1080/01459740.2015.1027342.

Diphoorn, Tessa . 2016. Twilight Policing: Private Security and Violence in Urban South Africa. Berkeley: University of California Press.

EPB 2013, Perspectivas de la Seguridad Ciudadana en América Latina y Bolivia Intercambio de Buenas Prácticas, Memoria del Seminario Internacional, Santa Cruz de la Sierra, 27–28/12,

Ministerio de Gobierno, Estado Plurinacional de Bolivia

Estado Plurinacional de Bolivia . 2009. "Constitución Política del Estado (CPE)". https://bolivia.infoleyes.com/norma/469/constituci%C3%B3n-pol%C3%ADticadel-estado-cpe.

Garland, David . 2002. The Culture of Control: Crime and Social Order in Contemporary Society. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Goldstein, Daniel M. 2012. Outlawed: Between Security and Rights in a Bolivian City. A John Hope Franklin Center Book. Durham: Duke University Press.

Goldstein, Daniel M. , With Gloria Achá , Eric Hinojosa , and Theo Roncken . 2007 "La Mano Dura and the Violence of Civil Society in Bolivia". Social Analysis 51 (2).

Gupta, Akhil , ed. 1995. "Blurred Boundaries: The Discourse of Corruption the Culture of Politics, and the Imagined State". In The Anthropology of the State: A Reader, 2006: 211–243. Blackwell Readers in Anthropology 9. Malden and Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Hansen, Thomas Blom . 2001. "Governance and State Mythologies in Mumbai". In States of Imagination, edited by Thomas Blom Hansen , Finn Stepputat , George Steinmetz , and Julia Adams , 221–254. Durham: Duke University Press.

Hansen, Thomas Blom , and Finn Stepputat . 2006. "Sovereignty Revisited". Annual Review of Anthropology 35 (1): 295–315.

Higate, Paul R. , and Mats Utas . 2017. Private Security in Africa: From the Global Assemblage to the Everyday. London: Zed Books.

Hönke, Jana , and Markus-Michael Müller . 2012. "Governing (in)Security in a Post-colonial World: Transnational Entanglements and the Worldliness of 'Local' Practice". Edited by Jana Hönke and Markus-Michael Müller . Security Dialogue 43 (5): 383–401.

Jauregui, Beatrice . 2015. "Just War: The Metaphysics of Police Vigilantism in India". Conflict and Society 1 (1).

LAPOP . 2014. "Cultura Política de La Democracia En Bolivia 2014: Hacia Una Democracia de Ciudadanos, Resumen Del Estudio Nacional". Comunidad de Estudios Sociales y Acción Pública and Proyecto de Opinión Pública En América Latina and Ciudadanía Bolivia, La Paz, Bolivia.

Loader, Ian . 2000. "Plural Policing and Democratic Governance". Social & Legal Studies 9 (3): 323–345. https://doi.org/10.1177/096466390000900301.

Observatorio Nacional de Seguridad Ciudadana . 2013. Percepcion de La Inseguridad y Evaluacion de Las Instituciones de Seguridad Ciudadana. La Paz, Bolivia: Ministerio de Gobierno and Vice-ministerio de Seguridad Ciudadana.

PB, Policía Boliviana . 2009. "Diagnostico de Seguridad". PowerPoint Presentation for Training.

PB, Policía Boliviana . 2014a. Aplicación del Modelo de Policía Comunitaria en la Policía Boliviana. La Paz: Bolivia.

PB, Policía Boliviana . 2014b. Modelo de Policía Comunitaria Con Enfoque de Filosofía de Trabajo En La Policía Boliviana. Comando General de la Policia Boliviana, Direcion Nacional de Planeamiento y Operaciones.

Pratten, David , and Atreyee Sen . 2007. Global Vigilantes. London: Hurst.

Risør, Helene . 2010. Violent Closures and New Openings – Civil Insecurity, Citizens and State in El Alto, Bolivia. PhD Dissertation, Department of Anthropology, University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen. https://dignityinstitute.org/media/2066039/violent-closures-and-new-openings-risoer-h.pdf.

Rodgers, Dennis . 2006. "The State as a Gang: Conceptualizing the Governmentality of Violence in Contemporary Nicaragua". Critique of Anthropology 26 (3): 315–330. https://doi.org/10.1177/0308275X06066577.

Rose, Nikolas . 2000. "Government and Control". British Journal of Criminology 40 (2): 321–339. https://doi.org/10.1093/bjc/40.2.321.

Sassen, Saskia . 2008. "Neither Global nor National: Novel Assemblages of Territory, Authority and Rights". Ethics & Global Politics 1 (1–2): 61–79. https://doi.org/10.3402/egp.v1i1.1814.

Schramm, Katharina , and Kristine Krause . 2011. "Thinking Through Political Subjectivity". African Diaspora 4 (2): 115–134. https://doi.org/10.1163/187254611X607741.

Sharma, Aradhana , and Akhil Gupta , eds. 2006. The Anthropology of the State: A Reader. Blackwell Readers in Anthropology 9. Malden and Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Gonzalo Choque, 26/1/14, Interview, Cotahuma, La Paz.

Group interview 29/10/14, Interview with Roselyn, Carmen and Juan, Tembladerani, La Paz.

Jorge, 26/1/14, Interview, Cotahuma, La Paz.
Marcos Guzman, 24/1/14, Interview, Tembladerani, La Paz.
Workshop 21/10/14, Observation at Workshop on Citizen Security, Cotahuma, La Paz.

Border control and blurred responsibilities at the airport

Adey, Peter . 2009. "Facing Airport Security: Affect, Biopolitics, and the Preemptive Securitisation of the Mobile Body". Environment and Planning D: Society and Space 27: 274–296.

Amoore, Louise . 2006. "Biometric Borders: Governing Mobilities in the War on Terror". Political Geography 25: 336–351.

Andrejevic, Mark , and Kelly Gates . 2014. "Big Data Surveillance: Introduction". Surveillance & Society 12 (2): 185–196.

Beck, Ulrich . 2009. "Critical Theory of World Risk Society: A Cosmopolitan Vision". Constellations 16 (1): 3–22.

Bigo, Didier . 2002. "Security and Immigration: Toward a Critique of the Governmentality of Unease". Alternatives 27: 63–92.

Bloom, Tendayi , and Verena Risse . 2014. "Examining Hidden Coercion at State Borders: Why Carrier Sanctions Cannot Be Justified". Ethics & Global Politics 7 (2): 65–82.

Brouwer, Jelmer , Maartje van der Woude , and Joanne van der Leun . 2017. "(Cr) immigrant Framing in Border Areas: Decision-making Processes of Dutch Border Police Officers". Policing and Society 28 (4): 448–463.

Council of the European Union . "Frontex Draft Programming Document 2018–2020". www.statewatch.org/news/2017/feb/eu-frontex-work-programme-2018-20.pdf, accessed June 26, 2017

Deleuze, Gilles , and Félix Guattari . 1980. Mille plateaux (Capitalisme et schizophrénie II). Paris: Éditions de Minuit.

European Commission . 2017. "Commission Recommendation of 12.5.2017 on Proportionate Police Checks and Police Cooperation in the Schengen Area". www.statewatch.org/news/2017/may/eu-com-recommendation-police-checks-final-17-2923.pdf, accessed July 16, 2017.

Fassin, Didier . 2013. Enforcing Order: An Ethnography of Urban Policing. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Frontex . 2013. Frontex Evaluation Report 2013 – Joint Operation METEOR 2013 – Air Border Cooperation. Warsaw: Frontex.

Haggerty, Kevin D. , and Richard V. Ericson . 2000. "The Surveillant Assemblage". British Journal of Sociology 51 (4): 605–622.

Holmberg, Lars . 2000. "Discretionary Leniency and Typological Guilt: Results From a Danish Study of Police Discretion". Journal of Scandinavian Studies in Criminology and Crime Prevention 1 (2): 179–194.

Holmberg, Lars . 2003. Policing Stereotypes: A Qualitative Study of Police Work in Denmark. Glienicke and Madison: Galda + Wilch Verlag.

Hönig, Patrick . 2014. "States, Borders and the State of Exception: Framing the Unauthorised Migrant in Europe". Etnofoor 26 (1): 125–145.

Kasparek, Bernd . 2010. "Borders and Populations in Flux: Frontex's Place in the European Union's Migration Management". In The Politics of International Migration Management, edited by M. Geiger and A. Pécoud , 119–140. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.

Lyon, David . 2006. "Airport Screening, Surveillance, and Social Sorting: Canadian Responses to 9/11 in Context". Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice 48 (3): 397–411.

Lyon, David . 2008. "Filtering Flows, Friends, and Foes: Global Surveillance". In Politics at the Airport, edited by Mark B. Salter , 29–49. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Møhl, Perle . 2011. "Mise en scène, Knowledge and Participation: Considerations of a Filming Anthropologist". Visual Anthropology 24 (3): 227–245.

Murphy, Eileen , and Mark Maguire . 2015. "Speed, Time and Security: Anthropological Perspectives on Automated Border Control". Etnofoor 27 (2): 157–177.

Patton, Paul . 1994. "MetamorphoLogic: Bodies and Powers in A Thousand Plateaus". Journal of the British Society for Phenomenology 25(2): 157–169.

Rabinow, Paul . 2004. Anthropologie des Zeitgenö ssischen. In Anthropologie der Vernunft: Studien zu Wissenschaft und Lebensführung, 56–65. Suhrkamp: Frankfurt am Main.

Rheinberger, Hans-Jörg . 2009. "Recent Science and Its Exploration: The Case of Molecular Biology". Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences 40: 6–12.

Salter, Mark B. 2008. "The Global Airport: Managing Space, Speed, and Security". In Politics at the Airport, edited by Mark B. Salter , 1–28. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Serres, Michel . 1991. Rome: The Book of Foundations. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Svendsen, Mette N. 2011. "Articulating Potentiality: Notes on the Delineation of the Blank Figure in Human Embryonic Stem Cell Research". Cultural Anthropology 26 (3): 414–437.

Tsianos, Vassilis S. , and Brigitta Kuster . 2016. "How to Liquefy a Body on the Move: Eurodac and the Making of the European Digital Border". In EU Borders and Shifting Internal Security, edited by R. Bossong and H. Carrapico , 45–63. Cham: Springer International Publishing.

Tsing, Anna . 2005. Friction: An Ethnography of Global Connection. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Xovis. www.xovis.com/en/xovis/, accessed August 18, 2017.