

Who guarded them until now

עד האידנא מאן נטרינהו –

OVERVIEW

Captive women were brought to אבוי דשמואל (for ransom), who placed them under guard (to protect them [from their captors]). שמואל asked his father; 'Who guarded them until now'? תוספות explains the intent of שמואל's question.

פירוש דכבר נאסרו:

The explanation is that שמואל told his father, that there is no purpose in guarding them now in order that they should be לכהונה, since **they are already forbidden** to marry כהנים, for we know that they were שבויות.¹ However שמואל did not mean that they should not be protected now from their captors.

SUMMARY

שמואל argued that even if they are guarded now, it would not affect their אסורות לכהונה, since they are already אסורות.

THINKING IT OVER

1. תוספות, by saying 'פירוש', is negating a different explanation.² Why would we have thought that the other explanation is preferable (that תוספות needs to negate it); and why indeed does תוספות negate the other explanation?

2. According to the interpretation of תוספות; why did אבוי דשמואל respond so harshly to his son שמואל? All that שמואל meant was that they are אסורות לכהונה!³

¹ תוספות is negating (see previous footnote # 1) an alternate interpretation; that שמואל was asking why are you guarding them from being נבעל by the captors, it makes no difference whether they will be נבעל now (again), since previously no one guarded them and they were נבעל then, and thus אסורות לכהן. תוספות does not accept this (more callous) interpretation. See 'Thinking it over' # 1. See מהרש"א.

² See previous footnote # 1.

³ See מהרש"א