

# Terms for Classical Sequents

## Proof Invariants & Strong Normalisation

*Greg Restall*



THE UNIVERSITY OF  
MELBOURNE

MELBOURNE LOGIC SEMINAR · 6 MAY 2016

To introduce a new *invariant*  
for classical propositional proofs  
and to show how they can be used.

## Today's Plan

---

Background

Preterms

Derivations

Terms

Eliminating Cuts

Strong Normalisation

Further Work

# BACKGROUND

## When is $\pi_1$ the same proof as $\pi_2$ ?

$$\frac{\frac{p \succ p}{p \succ p \vee q} \vee R}{p \wedge q \succ p \vee q} \wedge L$$

$$\frac{\frac{p \wedge q}{p} \wedge E}{p \vee q} \vee I$$

$$\frac{\frac{p \succ p}{p \wedge q \succ p} \vee R}{p \wedge q \succ p \vee q} \wedge L$$

## When is $\pi_1$ the same proof as $\pi_2$ ?

$$\frac{\frac{p \succ p}{p \succ p \vee q} \vee R}{p \wedge q \succ p \vee q} \wedge L$$

$$\frac{\frac{p \wedge q}{p} \wedge E}{p \vee q} \vee I$$

$$\frac{\frac{p \succ p}{p \wedge q \succ p} \vee R}{p \wedge q \succ p \vee q} \wedge L$$

$$\frac{\frac{q \succ q}{q \succ p \vee q} \vee R}{p \wedge q \succ p \vee q} \wedge L$$

$$\frac{\frac{p \wedge q}{q} \wedge E}{p \vee q} \vee I$$

$$\frac{\frac{q \succ q}{p \wedge q \succ q} \vee R}{p \wedge q \succ p \vee q} \wedge L$$

## When is $\pi_1$ the same proof as $\pi_2$ ?

$$\frac{p \vee q \quad \frac{[p]^1}{q \vee p} \vee I \quad \frac{[q]^1}{q \vee p} \vee I}{q \vee p} \vee E^1$$

$$\frac{p \vee q \quad \frac{[p]^1}{(q \vee p) \vee r} \vee I \quad \frac{[q]^1}{(q \vee p) \vee r} \vee I}{(q \vee p) \vee r} \vee E^1$$

Are these *different proofs*, or *different ways of presenting the same proof*?

## Girard, Lafont and Taylor: *Proofs and Types*, Chapter 2

Natural deduction is a slightly paradoxical system: it is limited to the intuitionistic case (in the classical case it has no particularly good properties) but it is only satisfactory for the  $(\wedge, \Rightarrow, \forall)$  fragment of the language: we shall defer consideration of  $\vee$  and  $\exists$  until chapter 10. Yet disjunction and existence are the two most *typically* intuitionistic connectors!

The basic idea of natural deduction is an asymmetry: a proof is a vaguely tree-like structure (this view is more a graphical illusion than a mathematical reality, but it is a pleasant illusion) with one or more hypotheses (possibly none) but a single conclusion. The deep symmetry of the calculus is shown by the *introduction* and *elimination* rules which match each other exactly. Observe, incidentally, that with a tree-like structure, one can always decide uniquely what was the *last* rule used, which is something we could not say if there were several conclusions.



## Lambda Terms and Proofs

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[x : p \supset (q \supset r)] \quad [z : p]}{xz : q \supset r} \supset E \quad \frac{[y : p \supset q] \quad [z : p]}{yz : q} \supset E}{\frac{(xz)(yz) : r}{\lambda z (xz)(yz) : p \supset r} \supset I} \supset I}{\lambda x \lambda y \lambda z (xz)(yz) : (p \supset (q \supset r)) \supset ((p \supset q) \supset (p \supset r))} \supset I$$

## Contraction and weakening are managed by variables

$$\frac{\frac{[x:p]}{\lambda y x: q \supset p} \supset I}{\lambda x \lambda y x: p \supset (q \supset p)} \supset I$$

## Contraction and weakening are managed by variables

$$\frac{\frac{[x:p]}{\lambda y x: q \supset p} \supset I}{\lambda x \lambda y x: p \supset (q \supset p)} \supset I$$
$$\frac{\frac{x: p \supset (p \supset q) \quad [y: p]}{xy: p \supset q} \supset E}{\frac{(xy)y: q}{\lambda y (xy)y: p \supset q} \supset I} \supset E$$

# Classical Sequent Derivations

$$\begin{array}{c} \frac{p \succ p}{\succ p, \neg p} \neg R \\ \frac{\succ p, \neg p}{\succ p \vee \neg p} \vee R \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{c} \frac{p \succ p}{p, \neg p \succ} \neg L \\ \frac{p, \neg p \succ}{p \wedge \neg p \succ} \wedge L \end{array}$$

# Classical Sequent Derivations

$$\frac{p \succ p}{\succ p, \neg p} \neg R \qquad \frac{p \succ p}{p, \neg p \succ} \neg L$$
$$\frac{\succ p, \neg p}{\succ p \vee \neg p} \vee R \qquad \frac{p, \neg p \succ}{p \wedge \neg p \succ} \wedge L$$

$$\frac{\frac{q \succ q \quad r \succ r}{q \vee r \succ q, r} \vee L}{p \succ p \quad q \vee r \succ q, r} \wedge R$$
$$\frac{p, q \vee r \succ p \wedge q, r}{p \wedge (q \vee r) \succ p \wedge q, r} \wedge L$$
$$\frac{p \wedge (q \vee r) \succ p \wedge q, r}{p \wedge (q \vee r) \succ (p \wedge q) \vee r} \vee R$$

# Sequents and Terms

$$X \succ Y \qquad X \succ A, Y \qquad X, A \succ Y$$

Where do you put the *variables*,  
and where do you put the *terms*?

## Our Choice

$$x_1 : A_1, \dots, x_n : A_n \succ y_1 : B_1, \dots, y_m : B_m$$

## Our Choice

$$\mathbf{x}_1 : A_1, \dots, \mathbf{x}_n : A_n \succ \mathbf{y}_1 : B_1, \dots, \mathbf{y}_m : B_m$$

*Each* premise and conclusion is decorated with variables.



## Our Choice

$$\pi(x_1, \dots, x_n)[y_1, \dots, y_m]$$
$$x_1 : A_1, \dots, x_n : A_n \succ y_1 : B_1, \dots, y_m : B_m$$

Each premise and conclusion is decorated with variables.

The *sequent* gets the term, connecting inputs & outputs.

# Example 1

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x : p \succ x : p} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{y \frown y}{y : q \succ y : q} \quad \frac{z \frown z}{z : r \succ z : r}}{\quad} \vee L}{\frac{x : p \succ x : p \quad w : q \vee r \succ y : q, z : r}{\quad} \wedge R} \wedge L \\
 \frac{\frac{x \frown Fv \quad Lw \frown Sv \quad Rw \frown z}{x : p, w : q \vee r \succ v : p \wedge q, z : r} \wedge L}{\frac{u : p \wedge (q \vee r) \succ v : p \wedge q, z : r}{\quad} \vee R} \vee R \\
 \frac{Fu \frown FLt \quad LSu \frown SLt \quad RSu \frown Rt}{u : p \wedge (q \vee r) \succ t : (p \wedge q) \vee r}
 \end{array}$$

## Example 2

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \begin{array}{ccc}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown \textcolor{red}{x} & & \textcolor{red}{x} \frown \textcolor{red}{x} \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{x} : p & \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{x} : p & \\
 \hline
 & \wedge R & 
 \end{array}
 \quad
 \begin{array}{ccc}
 & & \textcolor{red}{z} \frown \textcolor{red}{z} \\
 & & \textcolor{red}{z} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p \\
 \hline
 & & \wedge L
 \end{array} \\
 \begin{array}{ccc}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown Fy & \textcolor{red}{x} \frown Sy & \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{y} : p \wedge p & & \textcolor{red}{Fw} \frown \textcolor{red}{z} \\
 & & \textcolor{red}{w} : p \wedge p \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p \\
 \hline
 & & Cut
 \end{array} \\
 \begin{array}{ccc}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown F\bullet & \textcolor{red}{x} \frown S\bullet & \textcolor{red}{F\bullet} \frown \textcolor{red}{z} \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p & & 
 \end{array}
 \end{array}$$

PRETERMS

# Variables and Cut Points

- For each formula  $A$ ,  $x_1^A, x_2^A, \dots$  are VARIABLES of type  $A$ .

# Variables and Cut Points

- ▶ For each formula  $A$ ,  $x_1^A, x_2^A, \dots$  are VARIABLES of type  $A$ .
- ▶ For each formula  $A$ ,  $\bullet_1^A, \bullet_2^A, \dots$  are CUT POINTS of type  $A$ .

# Variables and Cut Points

- ▶ For each formula  $A$ ,  $x_1^A, x_2^A, \dots$  are VARIABLES of type  $A$ .
- ▶ For each formula  $A$ ,  $\bullet_1^A, \bullet_2^A, \dots$  are CUT POINTS of type  $A$ .
- We use  $x, y, z, u, v, w, \dots; \bullet, \star, *, \sharp, b$  as schematic letters for variables and cut points, omitting type superscripts where possible.

# Nodes and Subnodes

- ▶ A variable  $x$  of type  $A$  and a cut point  $\bullet$  of type  $A$  are both  $A$  NODES.



# Nodes and Subnodes

- ▶ A variable  $x$  of type  $A$  and a cut point  $\bullet$  of type  $A$  are both  $A$  NODES.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \wedge B$  node, then  $Ln$  is an  $A$  node and  $Rn$  is a  $B$  node.

# Nodes and Subnodes

- ▶ A variable  $x$  of type  $A$  and a cut point  $\bullet$  of type  $A$  are both  $A$  NODES.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \wedge B$  node, then  $Ln$  is an  $A$  node and  $Rn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \vee B$  node, then  $Fn$  is an  $A$  node and  $Sn$  is a  $B$  node.

# Nodes and Subnodes

- ▶ A variable  $x$  of type  $A$  and a cut point  $\bullet$  of type  $A$  are both  $A$  NODES.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \wedge B$  node, then  $Ln$  is an  $A$  node and  $Rn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \vee B$  node, then  $Fn$  is an  $A$  node and  $Sn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \supset B$  node, then  $An$  is an  $A$  node and  $Cn$  is a  $B$  node.

# Nodes and Subnodes

- ▶ A variable  $x$  of type  $A$  and a cut point  $\bullet$  of type  $A$  are both  $A$  NODES.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \wedge B$  node, then  $Ln$  is an  $A$  node and  $Rn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \vee B$  node, then  $Fn$  is an  $A$  node and  $Sn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \supset B$  node, then  $An$  is an  $A$  node and  $Cn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is a  $\neg A$  node, then  $Nn$  is an  $A$  node.

# Nodes and Subnodes

- ▶ A variable  $x$  of type  $A$  and a cut point  $\bullet$  of type  $A$  are both  $A$  NODES.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \wedge B$  node, then  $Ln$  is an  $A$  node and  $Rn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \vee B$  node, then  $Fn$  is an  $A$  node and  $Sn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is an  $A \supset B$  node, then  $An$  is an  $A$  node and  $Cn$  is a  $B$  node.
- ▶ If  $n$  is a  $\neg A$  node, then  $Nn$  is an  $A$  node.
- ▶ For each complex node  $Ln, Rn, Fn, Sn, An, Cn$  and  $Nn$ ,  $n$  is its IMMEDIATE subnode, and the subnodes of  $n$  are also subnodes of the original node.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:



# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *input position*,  $n$  is also in *input position*.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *input position*,  $n$  is also in *input position*.
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *output position*,  $n$  is also in *output position*.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *input position*,  $n$  is also in *input position*.
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *output position*,  $n$  is also in *output position*.
  - $L$ ,  $R$ ,  $F$ ,  $S$  and  $C$  each *preserve position*.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *input position*,  $n$  is also in *input position*.
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *output position*,  $n$  is also in *output position*.
  - $L$ ,  $R$ ,  $F$ ,  $S$  and  $C$  each *preserve position*.
  - ▶ If  $An$  or  $Nn$  is in *input position*,  $n$  is in *output position*.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *input position*,  $n$  is also in *input position*.
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *output position*,  $n$  is also in *output position*.
  - $L$ ,  $R$ ,  $F$ ,  $S$  and  $C$  each *preserve position*.
  - ▶ If  $An$  or  $Nn$  is in *input position*,  $n$  is in *output position*.
  - ▶ If  $An$  or  $Nn$  is in *output position*,  $n$  is in *input position*.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *input position*,  $n$  is also in *input position*.
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *output position*,  $n$  is also in *output position*.
    - $L$ ,  $R$ ,  $F$ ,  $S$  and  $C$  each *preserve position*.
  - ▶ If  $An$  or  $Nn$  is in *input position*,  $n$  is in *output position*.
  - ▶ If  $An$  or  $Nn$  is in *output position*,  $n$  is in *input position*.
    - $A$  and  $N$  *reverse position*.

# Linkings, Inputs and Outputs

- ▶ A LINKING is a pair  $n \frown m$  of nodes of the same type.
- ▶ In  $n \frown m$ ,  $n$  is in INPUT POSITION, and  $m$  is in OUTPUT POSITION.
- ▶ Positions generalise to subnodes as follows:
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *input position*,  $n$  is also in *input position*.
  - ▶ If  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$  or  $Cn$  are in *output position*,  $n$  is also in *output position*.
    - $L$ ,  $R$ ,  $F$ ,  $S$  and  $C$  each *preserve position*.
  - ▶ If  $An$  or  $Nn$  is in *input position*,  $n$  is in *output position*.
  - ▶ If  $An$  or  $Nn$  is in *output position*,  $n$  is in *input position*.
    - $A$  and  $N$  *reverse position*.
- ▶ The INPUTS (OUTPUTS) of a linking are the *variables* in INPUT (OUTPUT) position of that linking.

## Example Linkings

$\lambda$  of type  $((p \supset q) \supset p) \supset p$



## Example Linkings

$x$  of type  $((p \supset q) \supset p) \supset p$

$AAx \curvearrowright Cx$

## Example Linkings

$x$  of type  $((p \supset q) \supset p) \supset p$

$$AAx \frown Cx$$

$$CAx \frown Cx$$

# Preterms

- ▶ A PRETERM is a finite set of linkings.

# Preterms

- ▶ A PRETERM is a finite set of linkings.
- ▶ The INPUTS of a preterm are the inputs of its linkings.

# Preterms

- ▶ A PRETERM is a finite set of linkings.
- ▶ The INPUTS of a preterm are the inputs of its linkings.
- ▶ Its OUTPUTS are the outputs of its linkings.

# DERIVATIONS

# Annotating Derivations: Identity

$$\Sigma, \overset{x \curvearrowright y}{\mathbf{x}: A} \succ \mathbf{y}: A, \Delta$$

# Annotating Derivations: Conjunction

$$\frac{\Sigma, \mathbf{x}: A, \mathbf{y}: B \succ \Delta}{\Sigma, \mathbf{z}: A \wedge B \succ \Delta} \wedge L$$

$\pi(x, y)$   
 $\pi(Fz, Sz)$



# Annotating Derivations: Conjunction

$$\frac{\Sigma, \overset{\pi(x, y)}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \overset{\pi(Fz, Sz)}{\mathbf{y}} : B \succ \Delta}{\Sigma, \overset{\pi(Fz, Sz)}{\mathbf{z}} : A \wedge B \succ \Delta} \wedge L \qquad \frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \Delta \quad \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi'[y]}{\mathbf{y}} : B, \Delta'}{\Sigma, \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi[Fz] \quad \pi'[Sz]}{\mathbf{z}} : A \wedge B, \Delta, \Delta'} \wedge R$$

## Excursus on *Weakening* and *Variables*

$$\frac{\frac{[x : p]}{\lambda y x : q \supset p} \supset I}{\lambda x \lambda y x : p \supset (q \supset p)} \supset I$$

## Excursus on *Weakening* and *Variables*

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[x : p]}{\lambda y x : q \supset p} \supset I}{\lambda x \lambda y x : p \supset (q \supset p)} \supset I$$

$$\frac{\frac{\pi(x, y)}{\Sigma, x : A, y : B \succ \Delta} \wedge L}{\Sigma, z : A \wedge B \succ \Delta} \quad \text{can be} \quad \frac{\frac{\pi(x)}{\Sigma, x : A \succ \Delta} \wedge L}{\Sigma, z : A \wedge B \succ \Delta} \wedge L$$

## Excursus on *Weakening* and *Variables*

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[x : p]}{\lambda y x : q \supset p} \supset I}{\lambda x \lambda y x : p \supset (q \supset p)} \supset I$$

$$\frac{\frac{\pi(x, y)}{\Sigma, x : A, y : B \succ \Delta} \wedge L}{\Sigma, z : A \wedge B \succ \Delta} \wedge L \quad \text{can be} \quad \frac{\frac{\pi(x)}{\Sigma, x : A \succ \Delta} \wedge L}{\Sigma, z : A \wedge B \succ \Delta} \wedge L$$

In a premise  $\pi(x, y)$  the indicated  $x$  and  $y$  display all of the  $x$  and  $y$  inputs to the proof term.

There might be *none*.

# Annotating Derivations: Negation

$$\frac{\pi[x] \quad \Sigma \succ x : A, \Delta}{\Sigma, z : \neg A \succ \Delta} \neg L \qquad \frac{\pi(x) \quad \Sigma, x : A \succ \Delta}{\Sigma \succ z : \neg A, \Delta} \neg R$$

# Annotating Derivations: Disjunction

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \pi(x) \\ \Sigma, \mathbf{x} : A \succ \Delta \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \pi'(y) \\ \Sigma', \mathbf{y} : B \succ \Delta' \end{array}}{\Sigma, \Sigma', \mathbf{z} : A \vee B \succ \Delta, \Delta'} \vee L$$
$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \pi[x, y] \\ \Sigma \succ \mathbf{x} : A, \mathbf{y} : B, \Delta \end{array}}{\Sigma \succ \mathbf{z} : A \vee B, \Delta} \vee R$$
$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \pi(Lz) \quad \pi'(Rz) \\ \Sigma, \Sigma', \mathbf{z} : A \vee B \succ \Delta, \Delta' \end{array}}{\Sigma \succ \mathbf{z} : A \vee B, \Delta} \vee E$$

# Annotating Derivations: Conditional

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \pi[x] \\ \Sigma \succ x : A, \Delta \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \pi'(y) \\ \Sigma', y : B \succ \Delta' \end{array}}{\Sigma, \Sigma', z : A \supset B \succ \Delta, \Delta'} \supset L \qquad \frac{\begin{array}{c} \pi(x)[y] \\ \Sigma, x : A \succ y : B, \Delta \end{array}}{\Sigma \succ z : A \supset B, \Delta} \supset R$$

$\pi[Az] \quad \pi'(Lz)$                        $\pi(Az)[Cz]$

# Example Annotation

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{y \frown y}{y:q \succ y:q} \quad \frac{z \frown z}{z:r \succ z:r}}{\quad} \vee L}{\frac{x:p \succ x:p \quad w:q \vee r \succ y:q, z:r}{\quad} \wedge R} \wedge L \\
 \frac{\frac{x \frown Fv \quad Lw \frown Sv \quad Rw \frown z}{x:p, w:q \vee r \succ v:p \wedge q, z:r} \wedge L}{\frac{u:p \wedge (q \vee r) \succ v:p \wedge q, z:r}{\quad} \vee R} \vee R \\
 \frac{Fu \frown FLt \quad LSu \frown SLt \quad RSu \frown Rt}{u:p \wedge (q \vee r) \succ t:(p \wedge q) \vee r}
 \end{array}$$



# Annotating Derivations: Cut

$$\frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \Delta \quad \Sigma', \overset{\pi'(y)}{\mathbf{y}} : A \succ \Delta'}{\Sigma, \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi[\bullet]}{\Delta}, \overset{\pi'(\bullet)}{\Delta'}} \text{Cut}$$

## Example Annotation, with *Cut*

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown x \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{x} : p
 \end{array}
 \quad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown x \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{x} : p
 \end{array}
 \quad \vee_L
 \quad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown x \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{x} : p
 \end{array}
 \quad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown x \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{x} : p
 \end{array}
 \quad \wedge_R \\
 \hline
 \begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{L}y \frown x \quad \textcolor{red}{R}y \frown x \\
 \textcolor{red}{y} : p \vee p \succ \textcolor{red}{x} : p
 \end{array}
 \quad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{x} \frown Fz \quad \textcolor{red}{x} \frown Sz \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p \wedge p
 \end{array}
 \quad \textit{Cut} \\
 \hline
 \begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{L}y \frown \bullet \quad \textcolor{red}{R}y \frown \bullet \quad \bullet \frown Fz \quad \bullet \frown Sz \\
 \textcolor{red}{y} : p \vee p \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p \wedge p
 \end{array}
 \end{array}$$

# When is $\pi_1$ the same proof as $\pi_2$ (revisited)?

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{z} \curvearrowright \textcolor{red}{z} \\
 \hline
 \textcolor{red}{z} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p \quad \vee R \\
 \textcolor{red}{z} \curvearrowright \textcolor{red}{L}y \\
 \hline
 \textcolor{red}{z} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{y} : p \vee q \quad \wedge L \\
 \hline
 \textcolor{red}{F}x \curvearrowright \textcolor{red}{L}y \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \wedge q \succ \textcolor{red}{y} : p \vee q
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 p \wedge q \\
 \hline
 p \quad \wedge E \\
 \hline
 p \vee q \quad \vee I
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{red}{z} \curvearrowright \textcolor{red}{z} \\
 \hline
 \textcolor{red}{z} : p \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p \quad \vee R \\
 \textcolor{red}{F}x \curvearrowright \textcolor{red}{z} \\
 \hline
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \wedge q \succ \textcolor{red}{z} : p \quad \wedge L \\
 \hline
 \textcolor{red}{F}x \curvearrowright \textcolor{red}{L}y \\
 \textcolor{red}{x} : p \wedge q \succ \textcolor{red}{y} : p \vee q
 \end{array}$$

# When is $\pi_1$ the same proof as $\pi_2$ (revisited)?

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{z \curvearrowright z}{z : p \succ z : p} \vee R \\
 \frac{z \curvearrowright Ly}{z : p \succ y : p \vee q} \wedge L \\
 \hline
 Fx \curvearrowright Ly \\
 x : p \wedge q \succ y : p \vee q
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{p \wedge q}{p} \wedge E \\
 \frac{p}{p \vee q} \vee I
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{z \curvearrowright z}{z : p \succ z : p} \vee R \\
 \frac{Fx \curvearrowright z}{x : p \wedge q \succ z : p} \wedge L \\
 \hline
 Fx \curvearrowright Ly \\
 x : p \wedge q \succ y : p \vee q
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{w \curvearrowright w}{w : q \succ w : q} \vee R \\
 \frac{w \curvearrowright Ry}{w : q \succ y : p \vee q} \wedge L \\
 \hline
 Sx \curvearrowright Ry \\
 x : p \wedge q \succ y : p \vee q
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{p \wedge q}{q} \wedge E \\
 \frac{q}{p \vee q} \vee I
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{w \curvearrowright w}{w : q \succ w : q} \vee R \\
 \frac{Sx \curvearrowright w}{x : p \wedge q \succ w : q} \wedge L \\
 \hline
 Sx \curvearrowright Ry \\
 x : p \wedge q \succ y : p \vee q
 \end{array}$$

# When is $\pi_1$ the same proof as $\pi_2$ (revisited)?

$$\frac{\frac{p \vee q}{q \vee p} \vee I \quad \frac{\frac{[p]^1}{q \vee p} \vee I \quad \frac{[q]^1}{q \vee p} \vee I}{q \vee p} \vee E^1}{(q \vee p) \vee r} \vee I$$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x : p \succ x : p} \vee R \quad \frac{\frac{y \frown y}{y : q \succ y : q} \vee R}{\frac{x \frown Rz}{x : p \succ z : q \vee p} \quad \frac{y \frown Lz}{y : q \succ z : q \vee p}} \vee L}{\frac{Lw \frown Rz \quad Rw \frown Lz}{w : p \vee q \succ z : q \vee p} \vee R} \vee R$$

$$\frac{Lw \frown RLu \quad Rw \frown LLu}{w : p \vee q \succ u : (q \vee p) \vee r}$$

# When is $\pi_1$ the same proof as $\pi_2$ (revisited)?

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[p]^1}{q \vee p} \vee I}{p \vee q} \quad \frac{\frac{[q]^1}{q \vee p} \vee I}{(q \vee p) \vee r} \vee I}{(q \vee p) \vee r} \vee E^1$$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x : p \succ x : p} \vee R}{x : p \succ z : q \vee p} \vee R \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{y \frown y}{y : q \succ y : q} \vee R}{y : q \succ z : q \vee p} \vee R}{\frac{x \frown RLu}{x : p \succ u : (q \vee p) \vee r} \quad \frac{y \frown LLu}{y : q \succ u : (q \vee p) \vee r}} \vee L$$

$$\frac{Lw \frown RLu \quad Rw \frown LLu}{w : p \vee q \succ u : (q \vee p) \vee r}$$

A preterm is SEQUENTIALISABLE  
iff it is the conclusion of some derivation.

TERMS



## Nonsequentialisable Preterms

$$\textcolor{red}{x} : p \vee q \succ \textcolor{red}{y} : p \wedge q$$

$Lx \frown Fy \quad Rx \frown Sy$

This is connected, but it is not connected *enough*.

## Switching Example

$$\begin{array}{c} Lx \frown Fy \quad Rx \frown Sy \\ x : p \vee q \succ y : p \wedge q \end{array}$$

---

## Switching Example

$$\begin{array}{c} Lx \frown Fy \quad Rx \frown Sy \\ x : p \vee q \succ y : p \wedge q \end{array}$$

---

$$\begin{array}{c} Lx \frown Fy \quad \cancel{Rx \frown Sy} \\ x : p \vee - \succ y : p \wedge - \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} Lx \frown \cancel{Fy} \quad \cancel{Rx \frown Sy} \\ x : p \vee - \succ y : - \wedge q \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} \cancel{Lx \frown Fy} \quad Rx \frown \cancel{Sy} \\ x : - \vee q \succ y : p \wedge - \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} \cancel{Lx \frown \cancel{Fy}} \quad Rx \frown Sy \\ x : - \vee q \succ y : - \wedge q \end{array}$$

# Switchings

- The SWITCHINGS of a preterm  $\pi$  are found by selecting for each pair of subterms  $L_n$  and  $R_n$  in *input position*;  $F_n$  and  $S_n$  in *output position*,  $A_n$  in *output position* and  $C_n$  in *input position*; or the cut point  $\bullet$  (in both *input* and *output position*), one item of the pair to keep, and the other to DELETE.

# Switchings

- ▶ The SWITCHINGS of a preterm  $\pi$  are found by selecting for each pair of subterms  $L_n$  and  $R_n$  in *input* position;  $F_n$  and  $S_n$  in *output position*,  $A_n$  in *output position* and  $C_n$  in *input position*; or the cut point  $\bullet$  (in both *input* and *output position*), one item of the pair to keep, and the other to DELETE.
- ▶ A LINKING in a switching of a preterm  $\pi$  SURVIVES if and only if neither side of the link involves a deletion.

# Switchings

- ▶ The SWITCHINGS of a preterm  $\pi$  are found by selecting for each pair of subterms  $L_n$  and  $R_n$  in *input* position;  $F_n$  and  $S_n$  in *output position*,  $A_n$  in *output position* and  $C_n$  in *input position*; or the cut point  $\bullet$  (in both *input* and *output position*), one item of the pair to keep, and the other to DELETE.
- ▶ A LINKING in a switching of a preterm  $\pi$  SURVIVES if and only if neither side of the link involves a deletion.
- ▶ A preterm is SPANNED if every switching has at least one surviving linking.

## Example

$$Fu \frown FLt \quad LSu \frown SLt \quad RSu \frown Rt$$

This has two pairs for switching:

$LSu/RSu$  in *input position*.      $FLt/SLt$  in *output position*.

## Example

$$Fu \frown FLt \quad LSu \frown SLt \quad RSu \frown Rt$$

This has two pairs for switching:

**LSu/RSu** in *input position*.     **FLt/SLt** in *output position*.

$$Fu \frown \cancel{FLt} \quad \cancel{LSu} \frown SLt \quad RSu \frown Rt$$

$$Fu \frown FLt \quad \cancel{LSu} \frown \cancel{SLt} \quad RSu \frown Rt$$

$$Fu \frown \cancel{FLt} \quad LSu \frown SLt \quad \cancel{RSu} \frown Rt$$

$$Fu \frown FLt \quad LSu \frown \cancel{SLt} \quad \cancel{RSu} \frown Rt$$



A preterm  $\pi$  is a TERM when it is SPANNED.

## Sequentialisable Preterms are Terms

By induction on the derivation sequentialising  $\pi$ .

# Sequentialisable Preterms are Terms: Identity

$$\Sigma, \overset{x \curvearrowright y}{\textcolor{red}{x}} : A \succ \textcolor{red}{y} : A, \Delta$$

# Sequentialisable Preterms are Terms: Conjunction

$$\frac{\Sigma, \overset{\pi(x, y)}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \overset{\pi(Fz, Sz)}{\mathbf{y}} : B \succ \Delta}{\Sigma, \overset{\pi(Fz, Sz)}{\mathbf{z}} : A \wedge B \succ \Delta} \wedge_L \qquad \frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \Delta \quad \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi'[y]}{\mathbf{y}} : B, \Delta'}{\Sigma, \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi[Fz] \quad \pi'[Sz]}{\mathbf{z}} : A \wedge B, \Delta, \Delta'} \wedge_R$$

# Sequentialisable Preterms are Terms: Negation

$$\frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \Delta}{\Sigma, \overset{\pi[Nz]}{\mathbf{z}} : \neg A \succ \Delta} \neg_L \qquad \frac{\Sigma, \overset{\pi(x)}{\mathbf{x}} : A \succ \Delta}{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi(Nz)}{\mathbf{z}} : \neg A, \Delta} \neg_R$$

# Sequentialisable Preterms are Terms: Disjunction

$$\frac{\frac{\pi(x)}{\Sigma, x:A \succ \Delta} \quad \frac{\pi'(y)}{\Sigma', y:B \succ \Delta'}}{\Sigma, \Sigma', z:A \vee B \succ \Delta, \Delta'} \vee_L \qquad \frac{\frac{\pi[x, y]}{\Sigma \succ x:A, y:B, \Delta}}{\Sigma \succ z:A \vee B, \Delta} \vee_R$$

$\frac{\pi(Lz) \quad \pi'(Rz)}{\Sigma, \Sigma', z:A \vee B \succ \Delta, \Delta'}$

# Sequentialisable Preterms are Terms: Conditional

$$\frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \Delta \quad \Sigma', \overset{\pi'(y)}{\mathbf{y}} : B \succ \Delta'}{\Sigma, \Sigma', \overset{\pi[Az]}{\mathbf{z}} : A \supset B \succ \overset{\pi'(Cz)}{\Delta}, \Delta'} \supset_L$$
$$\frac{\Sigma, \overset{\pi(x)[y]}{\mathbf{x}} : A \succ \overset{\pi(x)[y]}{\mathbf{y}} : B, \Delta}{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi(Az)[Cz]}{\mathbf{z}} : A \supset B, \Delta} \supset_R$$

## Sequentialisable Preterms are Terms: Cut

$$\frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{\mathbf{x}} : A, \Delta \quad \Sigma', \overset{\pi'(y)}{\mathbf{y}} : A \succ \Delta'}{\Sigma, \overset{\pi[\bullet]}{\Sigma'} \succ \overset{\pi'(\bullet)}{\Delta}, \Delta'} \text{Cut}$$



## Terms are Sequentialisable

By induction on the number of pairs for switching in  $\pi$ .

*Except ...*

$x \frown y \quad u \frown v$

# ELIMINATING CUTS

# Conjunction Cut Reduction

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\pi[x] \quad \Sigma \succ x : A, \Delta \quad \pi'[y] \quad \Sigma' \succ y : B, \Delta}{\wedge R} \quad \frac{\pi''(u, v) \quad \Sigma'', u : A, v : B \succ \Delta''}{\wedge L}}{\frac{\pi[Fz] \quad \pi'[Sz] \quad \Sigma, \Sigma' \succ z : A \wedge B, \Delta, \Delta \quad \pi''(Fw, Sw) \quad \Sigma'', w : A \wedge B \succ \Delta''}{Cut}} \\
 \frac{\pi[F\bullet] \quad \pi'[S\bullet] \quad \pi''(F\bullet, S\bullet)}{\Sigma, \Sigma', \Sigma'' \succ \Delta, \Delta', \Delta''}
 \end{array}$$

# Conjunction Cut Reduction

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\pi[x] \quad \Sigma \succ x : A, \Delta \quad \pi'[y] \quad \Sigma' \succ y : B, \Delta}{\Sigma, \Sigma' \succ z : A \wedge B, \Delta, \Delta} \wedge_R \quad \frac{\pi''(u, v) \quad \Sigma'', u : A, v : B \succ \Delta''}{\Sigma'', w : A \wedge B \succ \Delta''} \wedge_L \\
 \hline
 \frac{\pi[Fz] \quad \pi'[Sz] \quad \Sigma, \Sigma' \succ z : A \wedge B, \Delta, \Delta \quad \pi''(Fw, Sw) \quad \Sigma'', w : A \wedge B \succ \Delta''}{\Sigma, \Sigma', \Sigma'' \succ \Delta, \Delta', \Delta''} \text{Cut}
 \end{array}$$

reduces to

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\pi'[y] \quad \Sigma' \succ y : B, \Delta \quad \pi''(u, v) \quad \Sigma'', u : A, v : B \succ \Delta''}{\Sigma', \Sigma'', u : A \succ \Delta', \Delta''} \text{Cut} \\
 \hline
 \frac{\pi[x] \quad \Sigma \succ x : A, \Delta \quad \pi'[*] \quad \pi''(u, *) \quad \Sigma', \Sigma'', u : A \succ \Delta', \Delta''}{\Sigma, \Sigma', \Sigma'' \succ \Delta, \Delta', \Delta''} \text{Cut}
 \end{array}$$

# Identity Cut Reduction

$$\frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{x} : A, \Delta \quad \Sigma', \overset{y \curvearrowright z}{y} : A \succ \overset{\bullet \curvearrowright z}{z} : A, \Delta'}{\Sigma, \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi[\bullet] \quad \bullet \curvearrowright z}{z} : A, \Delta, \Delta'} \text{Cut}$$

# Identity Cut Reduction

$$\frac{\Sigma \succ \overset{\pi[x]}{x} : A, \Delta \quad \Sigma', \overset{y \curvearrowright z}{y} : A \succ \overset{z}{z} : A, \Delta'}{\Sigma, \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi[\bullet] \bullet \curvearrowright z}{z} : A, \Delta, \Delta'} \text{Cut}$$

reduces to

$$\Sigma, \Sigma' \succ \overset{\pi[z]}{z} : A, \Delta, \Delta'$$

# Difficult Cases: Contraction

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \vee L \quad \frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \wedge R \\
 \frac{\frac{Ly \frown x \quad Ry \frown x}{y:p \vee p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown Fz \quad x \frown Sz}{x:p \succ z:p \wedge p}}{\quad} Cut \\
 \frac{Ly \frown \bullet \quad Ry \frown \bullet \quad \bullet \frown Fz \quad \bullet \frown Sz}{y:p \vee p \succ z:p \wedge p}
 \end{array}$$

## Difficult Cases: Contraction

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \vee L \quad \frac{\frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \wedge R \\
 \frac{\frac{Ly \curvearrowright x \quad Ry \curvearrowright x}{y:p \vee p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \curvearrowright Fz \quad x \curvearrowright Sz}{x:p \succ z:p \wedge p}}{\quad} Cut \\
 \frac{Ly \curvearrowright \bullet \quad Ry \curvearrowright \bullet \quad \bullet \curvearrowright Fz \quad \bullet \curvearrowright Sz}{y:p \vee p \succ z:p \wedge p}
 \end{array}$$
  

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \vee L \quad \frac{\frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \curvearrowright x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \vee L \\
 \frac{\frac{Ly \curvearrowright x \quad Ry \curvearrowright x}{y:p \vee p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{Ly \curvearrowright x \quad Ry \curvearrowright x}{y:p \vee p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \wedge R \\
 \frac{Ly \curvearrowright Fz \quad Ry \curvearrowright Fz \quad Ly \curvearrowright Sz \quad Ry \curvearrowright Sz}{y:p \vee p \succ z:p \wedge p}
 \end{array}$$



## Difficult Cases: Contraction

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \vee L \quad \frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \wedge R \\
 \frac{\frac{Ly \frown x \quad Ry \frown x}{y:p \vee p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown Fz \quad x \frown Sz}{x:p \succ z:p \wedge p}}{\quad} Cut \\
 \frac{Ly \frown \bullet \quad Ry \frown \bullet \quad \bullet \frown Fz \quad \bullet \frown Sz}{y:p \vee p \succ z:p \wedge p} \\
 \\
 \frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \wedge R \quad \frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \quad \frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p}}{\quad} \wedge R \\
 \frac{\frac{x \frown Fz \quad x \frown Sz}{x:p \succ z:p \wedge p} \quad \frac{x \frown Fz \quad x \frown Sz}{x:p \succ z:p \wedge p}}{\quad} \vee L \\
 \frac{Ly \frown Fz \quad Ry \frown Fz \quad Ly \frown Sz \quad Ry \frown Sz}{y:p \vee p \succ z:p \wedge p}
 \end{array}$$

## Difficult Cases: Weakening

$$\frac{\frac{\pi}{\Sigma \succ \Delta} \quad \frac{\pi'}{\Sigma \succ \Delta}}{\frac{\Sigma \succ \textcolor{red}{x}: A, \Delta \quad \Sigma, \textcolor{red}{y}: A \succ \Delta}{\Sigma \succ \Delta} \textit{Cut}}$$

## Difficult Cases: Weakening

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\pi}{\Sigma \succ \Delta} \quad \frac{\pi'}{\Sigma \succ \Delta} \\
 \hline
 \frac{\pi \quad \pi'}{\Sigma \succ \Delta} \text{Cut}
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\pi \quad \pi'}{\Sigma \succ \Delta} \text{Mix} \\
 \hline
 \Sigma \succ \Delta
 \end{array}$$

# Back to Sequentialisation

$x \frown y \quad u \frown v$

## Back to Sequentialisation

$$x \curvearrowright y \quad u \curvearrowright v$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{cc} x \curvearrowright y & u \curvearrowright v \\ x : A \succ y : A & u : B \succ v : B \end{array}}{x : A, u : B \succ y : B, v : A} \text{Mix}$$

## Sequentialisation: Terms with *No* Switchings

The term contains no  $L_n$ ,  $R_n$ ,  $C_n$  and  $\bullet$  in input position  
or  $F_n$ ,  $S_n$ ,  $A_n$  and  $\bullet$  in output position.

## Sequentialisation: Terms with No Switchings

The term contains no  $\text{Ln}$ ,  $\text{Rn}$ ,  $\text{Cn}$  and  $\bullet$  in input position  
or  $\text{Fn}$ ,  $\text{Sn}$ ,  $\text{An}$  and  $\bullet$  in output position.

It has a derivation using the linear rules  
 $\wedge L$ ,  $\neg L$ ,  $\neg R$ ,  $\vee R$  and  $\supset R$  and *mixes*.

## Sequentialisation: Terms with No Switchings

The term contains no  $Ln$ ,  $Rn$ ,  $Cn$  and  $\bullet$  in input position  
or  $Fn$ ,  $Sn$ ,  $An$  and  $\bullet$  in output position.

It has a derivation using the linear rules  
 $\wedge L$ ,  $\neg L$ ,  $\neg R$ ,  $\vee R$  and  $\supset R$  and *mixes*.

$$Fy \frown Lz \quad NRz \frown Lz \quad Sy \frown Rz$$

$$y : p \wedge \neg p \succ z : p \vee \neg p$$



# Terms with No Switchings: Example

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{x \frown x}{x:p \succ x:p} \vee R}{x:p \succ z:p \vee \neg p} \wedge L \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{u \frown u}{u:p \succ u:p} \neg R \quad \frac{v \frown v}{v:\neg p \succ v:\neg p} \vee R}{\frac{Nv \frown u}{\succ u:p, v:\neg p} \vee R} \wedge L}{\frac{NRz \frown Lz}{\succ z:p \vee \neg p} \wedge L} \text{Mix} \\
 \frac{\frac{y \frown Lz}{y:p \wedge \neg p \succ z:p \vee \neg p} \wedge L \quad \frac{\frac{v \frown Rz}{v:\neg p \succ z:p \vee \neg p} \wedge L}{\frac{Sy \frown Rz}{y:p \wedge \neg p \succ z:p \vee \neg p} \text{Mix}} \text{Mix} \\
 \frac{Fy \frown Lz \quad NRz \frown Lz \quad Sy \frown Rz}{y:p \wedge \neg p \succ z:p \vee \neg p} \text{Mix}
 \end{array}$$

## Terms *with* Switchings

By induction on the number of switched pairs.

Take a switched pair at the *adjacent to variables* or *cut points*  
(peel away unswitched steps if there aren't any).

$$\frac{\begin{array}{cc} \pi[x](-) & \pi[-](y) \\ \Sigma \succ \mathbf{x} : A, \Delta & \Sigma', \mathbf{y} : B \succ \Delta' \end{array}}{\Sigma, \Sigma', \mathbf{z} : A \supset B \succ \Delta, \Delta'} \supset_L$$

# Back to Eliminating Cuts: Cuts can be Complicated

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\pi[x, u] \quad \pi'[x, v]}{\succ x : A \wedge B, u : A \quad \succ x : A \wedge B, v : B} \wedge R \quad \frac{\pi''(y, z, x)}{y : A, z : B, x : A \wedge B \succ} \wedge L}{\frac{\frac{\pi[x, Fx] \quad \pi'[x, Sx]}{\succ x : A \wedge B} \quad \frac{\pi''(Fx, Sx, x)}{x : A \wedge B \succ}}{Cut} \\
 \frac{\pi[\bullet, F\bullet] \quad \pi'[\bullet, S\bullet] \quad \pi''(F\bullet, S\bullet, \bullet)}{\Sigma \succ \Delta}
 \end{array}$$

## Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .

# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

$$Sz \frown F\bullet \quad Fz \frown S\bullet \quad F\bullet \frown Sx \quad S\bullet \frown Fx \quad Ny \frown \bullet \quad \bullet \frown v$$

# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

$Sz \frown F\bullet \quad Fz \frown S\bullet \quad F\bullet \frown Sx \quad S\bullet \frown Fx \quad Ny \frown \bullet \quad \bullet \frown v$

$Sz \frown \star \quad Fz \frown * \quad \star \frown Sx \quad * \frown Fx$

# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

$$Sz \frown F\bullet \quad Fz \frown S\bullet \quad F\bullet \frown Sx \quad S\bullet \frown Fx \quad Ny \frown \bullet \quad \bullet \frown v$$

$$Sz \frown \star \quad Fz \frown * \quad \star \frown Sx \quad * \frown Fx \quad FNy \frown Sx \quad SNy \frown Fx \quad Ny \frown v$$



# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

$$Sz \frown F\bullet \quad Fz \frown S\bullet \quad F\bullet \frown Sx \quad S\bullet \frown Fx \quad Ny \frown \bullet \quad \bullet \frown v$$

$$Sz \frown \star \quad Fz \frown * \quad \star \frown Sx \quad * \frown Fx \quad FNy \frown Sx \quad SNy \frown Fx \quad Ny \frown v \quad Sz \frown Fv \quad Fz \frown Sv$$

# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.
- ▶ *negation*: for each  $N\bullet$ , add a new cut point  $\star$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.
- ▶ *negation*: for each  $N\bullet$ , add a new cut point  $\star$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.
- ▶ *disjunction*: for each  $L\bullet/R\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

# Cut Reductions

Given a term  $\pi(\bullet)[\bullet]$  and a cut-point  $\bullet$ , the  $\bullet$ -REDUCTION of  $\pi$  is found by:

- ▶ *atomic*: replace each pair  $n \frown \bullet$  and  $\bullet \frown m$  by  $n \frown m$ .
- ▶ *conjunction*: for each  $F\bullet/S\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.
- ▶ *negation*: for each  $N\bullet$ , add a new cut point  $\star$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.
- ▶ *disjunction*: for each  $L\bullet/R\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.
- ▶ *conditional*: for each  $A\bullet/C\bullet$ , add new cut points  $\star$  and  $*$ . For any  $\bullet \frown n$  add  $l(n)$  for each link  $l(\bullet)$  with  $n$  as input. For any  $n \frown \bullet$  add  $l[n]$  for each link  $l[\bullet]$  with  $n$  as output.

# STRONG NORMALISATION

Any reduction for  $\pi$  terminates in a unique\* term  $\pi^*$

Any reduction for  $\pi$  terminates in a unique\* term  $\pi^*$

- There is *some* terminating reduction process.

## Any reduction for $\pi$ terminates in a unique\* term $\pi^*$

- ▶ There is *some* terminating reduction process.
- ▶ Proof reduction is confluent.
- If  $\pi \rightsquigarrow_{\bullet} \pi'$  and  $\pi \rightsquigarrow_{\star} \pi''$  then there is a  $\pi'''$  where  $\pi' \rightsquigarrow_{\star} \pi'''$  and  $\pi'' \rightsquigarrow_{\bullet} \pi'''$ .



FURTHER WORK

# To Do List

- ▶ Are these genuine *invariants*? (Can we show that if two derivations have the same term, some set of permutations permute one to the other?)

## To Do List

- ▶ Are these genuine *invariants*? (Can we show that if two derivations have the same term, some set of permutations permute one to the other?)
- ▶ *Categories* (The class of *single input, single output* terms with composition by defined by *Cut + reduction* is a category. What are its properties?)

# To Do List

- ▶ Are these genuine *invariants*? (Can we show that if two derivations have the same term, some set of permutations permute one to the other?)
- ▶ *Categories* (The class of *single input, single output* terms with composition by defined by *Cut + reduction* is a category. What are its properties?)
- ▶ Apply terms to theories of warrants.

# To Do List

- ▶ Are these genuine *invariants*? (Can we show that if two derivations have the same term, some set of permutations permute one to the other?)
- ▶ *Categories* (The class of *single input, single output* terms with composition by defined by *Cut + reduction* is a category. What are its properties?)
- ▶ Apply terms to theories of warrants.
- ▶ Extend beyond propositional logic.

# THANK YOU!

<https://consequently.org/presentation/2016/terms-for-classical-sequents-logicmelb/>

@consequently on Twitter