BDK05 Exercise 01 KEY

Review the paper “Oral tolerance and OVA-induced tolerogenic dendritic cells reduce the severity of collagen/ovalbumin-induced arthritis in mice” available at: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0008874912002201> and the [Nature Checklist for Life Sciences Articles](http://www.nature.com/authors/policies/checklist.pdf) (http://www.nature.com/authors/policies/checklist.pdf).

1. What areas of the checklist don’t apply to the paper? What areas are met by the paper? Be sure to include where you found the information for each part of the checklist. Are there any areas missing?

Don’t apply:

* Inclusion/exclusion criteria, randomization.
* Human Subject information

Missing: The figure legends do not meet all the requirements, such as exact sample size for each experiment, and they do not mention how many times each experiment was replicated.

1. Look at the [supplementary information](http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v489/n7415/extref/nature11421-s1.pdf) for the paper. Does this fulfill the requirements of the checklist?

Fulfills: Figure legends; how sample size chosen; method of randomization; blinding; justification of statistical tests; assumptions of tests, variation; variance between groups; approving committee; code.

1. What areas are still unfulfilled in the checklist (other than those that don’t apply)? Does this impact the reproducibility of the study? Why or why not?

Unfulfilled: Informed consent; consent to publish photos; and accession codes

In this case, the reproducibility is probably not impacted because these categories aren’t directly related to the methods.