

8.1

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z ((P_x \wedge P_y) \wedge P_z) \rightarrow ((x=y \vee y=z) \vee x=z))$$

8.2

i)  $D_A = \{1, 2\}$

$$|Q^2|_A = \{\langle 1, 2 \rangle, \langle 2, 1 \rangle\}$$

$$|a|_A = 1$$

$$|b|_A = 2$$

ii)  $D_B = \{1\}$

$$|P|_B = \emptyset$$

8.3

No, from (i), you can do to  
(ii):

~~Pa~~

Very good. For logical equivalence you should also show the other direction:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{[b=a \wedge Pb]}{Pb} \quad \frac{[b=a \wedge Pb]}{b=a}}{\exists x(x=a \wedge Px)} \quad Pa}{Pa} \text{=Elim} \quad \exists\text{Elim}$$

$$\frac{[a=a] \quad Pa}{a=a \wedge Pa} \wedge\text{I} \quad \exists\text{I}$$

$$\exists x(x=a \wedge Px)$$

In case it's of interest to you, Halbach further remarks: "I prefer (i) because it is much simpler. In fact, one could propose to formalise 'x is a philosopher' using an additional existential quantifier."

8.4  $\Rightarrow$   $\frac{[a=a]}{\exists y \neg y} \rightarrow \exists I$  ✓

$\pm$ )

$$\frac{[Pa] \wedge [a=b]}{P_b} = E$$

$$\frac{[ \neg P_b ]}{\neg E}$$

$$\frac{\neg a=b}{\neg E}$$

$$\frac{\exists y \neg a=y}{\exists I}$$

$$\frac{\exists x \neg Px \quad \exists x \exists y \neg x=y}{\exists E}$$

$$\frac{\neg \exists x Px \quad \exists x \exists y \neg x=y}{\exists E}$$

8.5  $\pm$ )



I)

$$\frac{[\forall y (P_y \rightarrow a=y) \wedge P_a]}{P_a} \wedge E$$

$$\frac{P_a}{P_b} [a=b]$$

$$\frac{[\forall y (P_y \rightarrow a=y) \wedge P_a]}{\forall y (P_y \rightarrow a=y)} \wedge E$$

$$\frac{\forall y (P_y \rightarrow a=y)}{P_b \rightarrow a=b} \forall E$$

$$\frac{P_b \rightarrow a=b}{a=b} [P_b] \rightarrow E$$

$$a=b \leftrightarrow b$$

$$\frac{P_b \leftrightarrow a=b}{\forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow a=y)} \forall I$$

$$\frac{\forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow a=y)}{\exists x \forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow x=y)} \exists I$$

$$\frac{\exists x \forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow x=y) \wedge \forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow a=y)}{\exists x \forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow x=y)} \exists E$$

$$\frac{\exists x \forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow x=y)}{\exists x \forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow x=y)}$$

II)

$$\frac{[\forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow a=y)]}{\forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow a=y)} \forall E$$

$$\frac{P_b \leftrightarrow a=b}{a=b} [P_b] \leftrightarrow E$$

$$P_b \rightarrow a=b$$

$$\frac{P_b \rightarrow a=b}{P_b \rightarrow a=b} \rightarrow I$$

$$\forall y (P_y \rightarrow a=y)$$

$$[\forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow a=y)]$$

$$\frac{P_a \leftrightarrow a=a}{P_a} \forall E$$

$$P_a$$

$$\frac{\forall y (P_y \rightarrow a=y) \wedge P_a}{\exists x (\forall y (P_y \rightarrow x=y) \wedge P_x)} \exists I$$

$$\frac{\exists x (\forall y (P_y \rightarrow x=y) \wedge P_x)}{\exists x (\forall y (P_y \leftrightarrow x=y))} \exists E$$



8.8

I)  $\forall x \exists y (Q_1 x \wedge Q_2 y \wedge \neg y = x \wedge \forall z (Q_3 z \rightarrow (x = z \vee y = z)))$

$\exists x \exists y (Q_1 x \wedge Q_2 y \wedge \neg x = y \wedge \forall z (Q_3 z \rightarrow (x = z \vee y = z)))$

Good. Halbach splits his existential and universal quantifiers:

$\exists x \exists y (Q_1 x \wedge Q_1 y \wedge \neg x = y) \wedge \forall x \forall y \forall z ((Q_1 x \wedge Q_1 y \wedge Q_1 z) \rightarrow (x = y \vee y = z \vee x = z))$

II)

$\exists x (Q_x \wedge P_x \wedge \forall y ((Q_y \wedge P_y) \rightarrow x = y) \wedge \forall z (Q_3 z \rightarrow R_{xz}))$

III)

Again, good. Halbach uses an  $\leftrightarrow$  instead of  $\rightarrow$  for the clever tutor expression:  $\exists x (\forall y (P_y \wedge Q_y \leftrightarrow x = y) \wedge \forall z (Q_3 z \rightarrow R_{xz}))$

$\exists x (Q_x \wedge \forall y (Q_y \rightarrow R_{xy}) \wedge \forall z ((Q_3 z \wedge \forall y (Q_y \rightarrow R_{zy})) \rightarrow x = z) \wedge P_x)$

Careful using universal quantifiers and  $\wedge$ . Here is Halbach:

$\exists x \wedge x (((\forall z (Q_z \rightarrow R_{xz}) \wedge Q_1 x) \leftrightarrow x = y) \wedge P_y)$

The TA is wrong here, my answer is also correct (note the double open brackets).

IV  $\forall x \forall y \forall z ((Q_x \wedge Q_y \wedge Q_z) \rightarrow (x = y \vee x = z \vee y = z))$

