



# A Larger Equational Proof on Lists

Principles of Functional Programming

## A Law of Reverse

For a more difficult example, let's consider the reverse function.

We pick its inefficient definition, because its more amenable to equational proofs:

```
Nil.reverse = Nil           // 1st clause  
(x :: xs).reverse = xs.reverse ++ List(x) // 2nd clause
```

We'd like to prove the following proposition

```
xs.reverse.reverse = xs
```

# Proof

By induction on `xs`. The base case is easy:

```
Nil.reverse.reverse  
=  Nil.reverse      // by 1st clause of reverse  
=  Nil              // by 1st clause of reverse
```

## Proof

By induction on `xs`. The base case is easy:

```
Nil.reverse.reverse
=  Nil.reverse           // by 1st clause of reverse
=  Nil                   // by 1st clause of reverse
```

For the induction step, let's try:

```
(x :: xs).reverse.reverse
=  (xs.reverse ++ List(x)).reverse // by 2nd clause of reverse
```

## Proof

By induction on `xs`. The base case is easy:

```
Nil.reverse.reverse
=   Nil.reverse           // by 1st clause of reverse
=   Nil                   // by 1st clause of reverse
```

For the induction step, let's try:

```
(x :: xs).reverse.reverse
=   (xs.reverse ++ List(x)).reverse // by 2nd clause of reverse
```

We can't do anything more with this expression, therefore we turn to the right-hand side:

```
x :: xs
=   x :: xs.reverse.reverse           // by induction hypothesis
```

Both sides are simplified in different expressions.

## To Do

We still need to show:

$$(xs.reverse ++ List(x)).reverse = x :: xs.reverse.reverse$$

Trying to prove it directly by induction doesn't work.

We must instead try to *generalize* the equation. For *any* list  $ys$ ,

$$(ys ++ List(x)).reverse = x :: ys.reverse$$

This equation can be proved by a second induction argument on  $ys$ .

## Auxiliary Equation, Base Case

```
(Nil ++ List(x)).reverse      // to show: = x :: Nil.reverse
```

## Auxiliary Equation, Base Case

`(Nil ++ List(x)).reverse`      `// to show: = x :: Nil.reverse`

`= List(x).reverse`      `// by 1st clause of ++`



## Auxiliary Equation, Base Case

```
(Nil ++ List(x)).reverse    // to show: = x :: Nil.reverse  
  
= List(x).reverse          // by 1st clause of ++  
  
= (x :: Nil).reverse       // by definition of List
```

## Auxiliary Equation, Base Case

```
(Nil ++ List(x)).reverse      // to show: = x :: Nil.reverse  
  
= List(x).reverse            // by 1st clause of ++  
  
= (x :: Nil).reverse         // by definition of List  
  
= Nil ++ (x :: Nil)          // by 2nd clause of reverse
```

## Auxiliary Equation, Base Case

```
(Nil ++ List(x)).reverse      // to show: = x :: Nil.reverse  
  
= List(x).reverse            // by 1st clause of ++  
  
= (x :: Nil).reverse         // by definition of List  
  
= Nil ++ (x :: Nil)          // by 2nd clause of reverse  
  
= x :: Nil                   // by 1st clause of ++
```

## Auxiliary Equation, Base Case

```
(Nil ++ List(x)).reverse      // to show: = x :: Nil.reverse  
  
= List(x).reverse            // by 1st clause of ++  
  
= (x :: Nil).reverse         // by definition of List  
  
= Nil ++ (x :: Nil)          // by 2nd clause of reverse  
  
= x :: Nil                   // by 1st clause of ++  
  
= x :: Nil.reverse           // by 1st clause of reverse
```

## Auxiliary Equation, Inductive Step

```
((y :: ys) ++ List(x)).reverse
```

```
// to show: = x :: (y :: ys).reverse
```

## Auxiliary Equation, Inductive Step

`((y :: ys) ++ List(x)).reverse`

`// to show: = x :: (y :: ys).reverse`

`= (y :: (ys ++ List(x))).reverse`

`// by 2nd clause of ++`

## Auxiliary Equation, Inductive Step

```
((y :: ys) ++ List(x)).reverse           // to show: = x :: (y :: ys).reverse  
  
= (y :: (ys ++ List(x))).reverse         // by 2nd clause of ++  
  
= (ys ++ List(x)).reverse ++ List(y)     // by 2nd clause of reverse
```

## Auxiliary Equation, Inductive Step

```
((y :: ys) ++ List(x)).reverse           // to show: = x :: (y :: ys).reverse  
  
= (y :: (ys ++ List(x))).reverse         // by 2nd clause of ++  
  
= (ys ++ List(x)).reverse ++ List(y)    // by 2nd clause of reverse  
  
= (x :: ys.reverse) ++ List(y)         // by the induction hypothesis
```



## Auxiliary Equation, Inductive Step

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <code>((y :: ys) ++ List(x)).reverse</code>       | <code>// to show: = x :: (y :: ys).reverse</code> |
| <code>= (y :: (ys ++ List(x))).reverse</code>     | <code>// by 2nd clause of ++</code>               |
| <code>= (ys ++ List(x)).reverse ++ List(y)</code> | <code>// by 2nd clause of reverse</code>          |
| <code>= (x :: ys.reverse) ++ List(y)</code>       | <code>// by the induction hypothesis</code>       |
| <code>= x :: (ys.reverse ++ List(y))</code>       | <code>// by 1st clause of ++</code>               |

## Auxiliary Equation, Inductive Step

```
((y :: ys) ++ List(x)).reverse           // to show: = x :: (y :: ys).reverse

= (y :: (ys ++ List(x))).reverse         // by 2nd clause of ++

= (ys ++ List(x)).reverse ++ List(y)     // by 2nd clause of reverse

= (x :: ys.reverse) ++ List(y)           // by the induction hypothesis

= x :: (ys.reverse ++ List(y))           // by 1st clause of ++

= x :: (y :: ys).reverse                 // by 2nd clause of reverse
```

This establishes the auxiliary equation, and with it the main proposition.

## Exercise

Prove the following distribution law for map over concatenation.

For any lists  $xs$ ,  $ys$ , function  $f$ :

$$(xs ++ ys).map(f) = xs.map(f) ++ ys.map(f)$$

You will need the clauses of  $++$  as well as the following clauses for `map`:

$$Nil.map(f) = Nil$$

$$(x :: xs).map(f) = f(x) :: xs.map(f)$$