January 15, 2004
OGSA-WG teleconference minutes

1   Early discussion

(1) Note taker assignment: Fred Maciel

(2) Roll call
- Fred Maciel (Hitachi)
- Hiro Kishimoto (Fujitsu)
- Jem Treadwell (HP)
- Andreas Savva (Fujitsu)
- Michael Frankel (IBM)
- Dave Berry (UK National Science Centre)
- Tom Maguire (IBM)
- Bill Horn (IBM)
- Frank Siebenlist (ANL)

(3) Other businesses:
- Approve Jan. 12 minutes: no comments, approved.
- Face-to-face meeting update
  - Andrew asked participants to send their names to him.
  - Agenda of the face-to-face will start being planned soon. Please send proposals for discussion subjects to Hiro.
- Since many people will be at GlobusWorld, we will not have teleconferences in the next week. The next teleconference will be on January 26.
  - One hour for CMM, one hour for logging.

"ec" below are embedded comment numbers, "ti" below are tracker item numbers

2   Embedded comments review

- Line numbers between parenthesis below refer to the line (row) numbers in the embedded comments spreadsheet in https://forge.gridforum.org/projects/ogsa-wg/ document/embedded_comments_check_list/en/2
- Side comment on who has the pen of the OGSA spec. There should be a way to get the pen when needed. The way it was done with logging (update separate document and merge in later) allowed writing to go in parallel. Does not work well for minor revisions.
  - Action: Hiro to talk with Ian about getting the pen back.

- Security interfaces (ec 10)
  - Corrected by Andreas: comment refers to the paragraph on page 17, "OGSA's security model must address authentication, ... evolving standards will be adopted or recognized in the Grid security model.
  - Action item: Andreas to mail Frank about this correction.
- What is a discovery service (ec 20)
  - Skipped last week because Andreas was not sure of the exact location. Used Jeff's commented draft that is now available on GridForge.
  - Service groups is not a service, it's portTypes
  - Hiro: we will need grouping functionality at OGSA level that is more sophisticated than service groups at OGSI level.
  - Section 6.3 seems accurate. But how does it relate to section 6.19? It's the same, should be collapsed.
  - AI: Tom to talk to Jeff about clarifying his comments. Also talk with Ian on how to re-write the section, and the relationship between section 6.3 and 6.19.
- Check text on subscription (ec 27)
  - Action item: Andrew to check if this text is OK or not.
- WS-Agreement as underlying service of policy and agreements (ec 28)
  - Hiro: I think that we should have WS-Agreement here, as a related standard not a service. There are no related services at the moment.
  - Hiro assigned temporarily this item.
- Update section based on discussion from OGSA-DAI face-to-face (ec 29)
  - No one on the call was up to speed with developments.
  - Action item: Ian (or Jay) to update this section.
- Service cloning (ec 30)
  - Dave Berry: Text needs clarification. It is not really cloning. (Query example.)
  - Ian (or Jay) to clarify in the next revision.
- Levels in data services (ec 31)
  - Dave: the higher-level data services are concerned with things like replication and the management services are concerned with lower level things. E.g.: DML of database versus file operations of the file system.
    - ♦ Agreement among participants that this is the case and that there is not sufficient explanation in the text.
  - Ian (or Jay) to clarify in the next revision.
- "looking" (ec 32)
  - Jem: two possibilities. One is locking. One is a misinterpretation of "viewing". Not quite sure what it is.
  - Jay to clarify in the next revision.

- Data access agreement service (ec 33)
  - Andreas: not sure if decided to drop this service altogether. It comes from the original Platform submission.
  - Hiro: agree that we have to merge them with data services.
  - Tom: There are two parts to Jeff's question. The second part is more interesting: "Are all forms of agreement specialized into typed agreement services?" I.e., there are two cases: one is when the service is also the agreement provider, and the other where the agreement provider is a third party. Andreas: WS-agreement does not require one or the other? Tom: It doesn't but maybe the OGSA specification should give some direction on what pattern is 'recommended.'
  - Some possibilities:
    - Pattern should be addressed in each section.
    - In the OGSA document we might point to the need for a pattern. Comment that it's already pointed.
    - If we come to a consensus on a pattern, put in 4.1.1 section (Service Interaction)
  - Hiro: WS-Agreement at the moment is in the platform services.
    - Service interaction might be a good place, but that might be a specialization.
    - Hiro: logical place to explain it is page 30 (agreement that it's the case).
  - Agreement is also described in Program Execution.
  - Action item: return to the discussion on how to tackle the second point later, perhaps in the Feb F2F. Section 5.4 is left as a possible point for contention.
  - Action item: Andrew and Ravi should take the above comments in consideration when re-writing the section on PE
  - Action item: Hiro to decide how to introduce agreement in the document
- "Laundry list of services" not OK (ec 34)
  - There seem to be two points made here. One a general comment for section 6, the second a specific comment for the way this service (queuing) is described.
  - Hiro: if we re-write this for something more job-specific, would it be enough? Bill: only for that section, since it won't address other sections.
  - Conclusion: Andrew/Ravi to re-write this section so that it is job-specific. Hiro to have Ian call in on the next face-to-face (if not earlier) and discuss the structure of section 6.
- Queuing service (ec 35)
  - Has to do with Jeff's comment on page 54 (ec 33).
  - Hiro: this is not a queuing service, this is an explanation of WS-Agreement itself.
  - Conclusion: handle 33 and 35 at the same time. Address in section 5.4
- OGSI description should come earlier (ec 36)

– Hiro: order in chapter 6 reflects order in chapters 4 and 5; because of that OGSI is at the end of chapter 6. Does not have a particular preference on other.
– Bill: or, it does not belong there. Hiro: might want to move it out of here (say, section 6.1).
– Conclusion: Hiro to check with Ian.
- CMM-related text (ec 37 and 38)
– Fred will have to revise the section anyway to change to WSDM, and will incorporate these comments.

3 Tracker item review

3.1 Platform document

- Numbers in parenthesis below are the tracker item "Artifact ID".
- Andreas: The trackers have not been updated since the Dec F2F. Apologies. Recommended way to view the trackers is to switch to the advanced filter and then in the status scroll box choose everything except 'Closed' and 'Resolved' and sort by Priority. This operation only has to be done once per tracker. GridForge remembers the last setting.
- (ti 537)
– Hiro: Change assignment to Frank since Frank is in charge of security.
– Frank: should change title into "identification of missing standards"?
– Andreas: We have actually agreed on the approach we are taking so maybe this one should be closed.
– Action: Mark Resolved.
- (ti 125): mark as done
- (ti 130): leave it as it is. Revisit in the F2F.
- (ti 351): leave it as it is
- (ti 407, 409, 411): 409 and 411 are probably done. Andreas will re-check and close.
- (ti 413): leave it as it is
- (ti 436): done in the last 2 calls.
- (ti 446): change state to assigned. Owner is still Dave Snelling.
- (ti 518): change state to assigned. Owner is still Dave Snelling.
- (ti 525): change status to assigned. Owner is still Takashi Kojo.
- (ti 533): obsolete. Close.
- (ti 541): Done for the last two calls. Close.
- (ti 421): Long term goal. Leave as is.
- (ti 492): almost done. Change status to assigned. Owner is still Bill Horn.
- (ti 126): Obsolete. We decided not to do profiles. Close.

- (ti 128): leave it as it is

3.2   Agenda and Topic request

- (ti 542): Change status to assigned. Owner is still Hiro.
- (ti 132): work in progress
- (ti 314): obsolete. Close.
- (ti 419): obsolete. Close.
- (ti 501): obsolete. Close.
- (ti 535): arranged, close.
- (ti 540)
  - will have to do something similar for GGF10
  - close this one and create a new one for GGF10
- (ti 404): waiting for answer from Jay
- (ti 500): Change status to assigned. Owner is still Ravi.
- (ti 502, 503): obsolete. Close.
- (ti 519): Jon MacLaren raised this issue in the GRAAP-WG. They are discussing it in their next F2F. Close.
- (ti 534) : Done in the last F2F. Close.
- (ti 536): obsolete, close.
- (ti 538): done. Close.
- (ti 584)
  - Andreas: update title and change status to assigned. Owner is still Frank
- (ti 585)
  - Andreas: not sure if the group has completely finished going through Takuya's summary. Frank: got most of what he wanted to communicate.
  - Close.
- (ti 410): Nothing yet. Leave it as it is.
- (ti 422) No change. Hiro: We still need policy examples.
- (ti 447)
  - Hiro: Agreed to do roadmap (schedule agreed at Dec. F2F: first draft for GGF11, final call for GGF12). Andreas: long-term action item.
  - Andreas: related to (ti 520)
  - Hiro: will talk to Jeff about this
- (ti 453): obsolete. Close.
- (ti 454): Confirmed that a Logging group BoF is still on for GGF10. Questions on how to request a BOF. Suggestions to contact GGF people (Charlie, Stacey). Andreas updated tracker with a url on how to register a BoF. Will also send link to mailing list.
- (ti 581): Put in the agenda for the next face-to-face. Change status to assigned.

- Bill asked about the recommended way to post new issues for the OGSA document. Andreas said that new issues should be posted to the trackers. Jeff's comments were handled differently because they were embedded in the document and it was too much work to move them to the trackers.

4   Action items (from above)

- Hiro Kishimoto:
  – Talk with Ian about getting the pen back.
  – (ec 28) assigned temporarily this item
  – (ec 33) decide how to introduce agreement in the document
  – (ec 34) have Ian call in on the next face-to-face (if not earlier) and discuss the structure of section 6
  – (ec 36) check with Ian
  – (ti 542) assigned this tracker item
  – (ti 422) ask Jay
  – (ti 447) talk to Jeff about this
- Bill Horn:
- Fred Maciel:
  – (ec 37 and 38) revise the section to change to WSDM, incorporating comments.
- Tom Maguire:
  – (ec 20) talk to Jeff about clarifying his comments. Also talk with Ian on how to re-write the section, and the relationship between section 6.3 and 6.19.
- Jem Treadwell:
- Andreas Savva:
  – (ec 10) mail Frank about this correction.
  – (ti 407, 409): check if done
  – (ti 540): close and create a new one for GGF10
  – (ti 519): look into it and possibly close it
  – (ti 581): update to next face-to-face
- Bill Horn:
- Frank Siebenlist:
  – (ti 537) find out what OGSA needs
- Andrew Grimshaw
  – (ec 27) check if text is OK or not.
  – (ec 33 and 35, with Ravi) take the above comments in consideration when re-writing the section.
  – (ec 34) re-write this section so that it is job-specific

- Ravi Subramaniam
  - (ec 33 and 35, with Andrew) take the above comments in consideration when re-writing the section.
  - (ec 34) re-write this section so that it is job-specific
- Jay Unger
  - (ec 29) Ian (or Jay) to update this section.
  - (ec 30) Ian (or Jay) to clarify in the next revision.
  - (ec 31) Ian (or Jay) to clarify in the next revision.
  - (ec 32) clarify in the next revision.
- Ian Foster
  - (ec 29) Ian (or Jay) to update this section.
  - (ec 30) Ian (or Jay) to clarify in the next revision.
  - (ec 31) Ian (or Jay) to clarify in the next revision.
- General:
  - (ec 33) return to the discussion on how to tackle the second point later, perhaps in the Feb F2F