

CITY OF PALO ALTO CITY COUNCIL TRANSCRIPT

Regular Meeting January 4, 2016

The City Council of the City of Palo Alto met on this date in the Council Chambers at 6:11 P.M.

Present: Berman, Burt, DuBois, Filseth, Holman, Kniss, Scharff, Schmid,

Wolbach

Absent:

Special Orders of the Day

1. Election of Mayor for 2016.

Mayor Holman: As you all know, the order of the business this evening is the election of the Mayor and Vice Mayor. First I'll call for nominations for the Mayor. Anyone can nominate a nominee for the Mayor. It does not require a second. A person can also nominate themselves. After that, the person who's making the nomination can speak to the nomination. The person being nominated can also speak. Any other Council Members can also comment. Members of the public will also be heard. If a member of the public wants to speak to a nomination of a Mayor or Vice Mayor, please fill out a card and send it to the Clerk over here to my left. With that, I have a light from Council Member Filseth.

Council Member Filseth: Thank you very much and happy new year. I'd like to nominate Greg Schmid for Mayor. Going into his eighth year on Council, Greg has amassed a huge amount of experience, which will serve the community well.

Mayor Holman: Council Member Filseth, I think, let's hear all the nominations, and then we'll come back to you, if we could. I appreciate the enthusiasm though.

NOMINATION: Council Member Filseth nominated Council Member Schmid for Mayor for 2016.

Mayor Holman: Council Member Kniss.

Council Member Kniss: You're looking simply for a name at this point?

Mayor Holman: At this moment, yes please.

Council Member Kniss: I would nominate Pat Burt.

NOMINATION: Council Member Kniss nominated Council Member Burt for Mayor for 2016.

Mayor Holman: We have two nominations. I see no more lights. Council Member Filseth, would you care to speak to your nomination?

Council Member Filseth: Sure. As I said, I think in addition to serving as Vice Mayor this year, Greg also chaired the Finance Committee which is a critical function for the City. Greg has pushed very hard for us to really understand the structural nature of the City's finances, which I believe is a long-term, critical issue. After six years of economic boom, we know that there's going to be another recession sometime. The time to lay the foundation is during the good times, not once the crisis arise. Greg thinks One of his strengths is his focus on data and numbers and decision making which will be an excellent orientation as we head into 2016. In his seven years on Council, Greg has served the City with dedication and integrity. As Vice Mayor, I believe Greg and the current Mayor made a strong leadership team this year. I thought Greg's quantitative bent together with Karen's expertise and passion on social service made a potent and balanced combination. There's a lot of talent and passion on this Council. The job of the Mayor is really to set an environment to get the best contributions from the entire Council membership, not necessarily come up with all the ideas. I think Greg would be very good at this. He'll strike the right balance. He's collaborative, respectful and has demonstrated his ability to work constructively with everybody. He's ready to take the chair. Finally, 2015 was a bit of a transition year as the Council adjusted direction slightly in response to some of the City's shifting economic and social challenges. I think it would be good for the City to get back to the orderly transition of Vice Mayor to Mayor. This allows the Vice Mayor to work directly with the Mayor for a year before taking on that role, and that in turn helps us better serve all of our bosses, the voters of Palo Alto. For all those reasons, I nominate Greg Schmid for Mayor.

Mayor Holman: Thank you. Vice Mayor Schmid, would you care to speak?

Vice Mayor Schmid: I'd love to share my view of the role of the Mayor. The Mayor represents the Council and the City on public occasions. It would be an honor for me to do so. The key role for Mayor is as chair of Council. There are four things that are important there. Number one, identify and

get on the agenda critical policy issues. Number two, support Staff in getting appropriate data out to the public on those critical policy issues. Three, welcome public and Council member comments on that discussion. Four, bring to a vote before midnight when Council Members, Staff members and the public are available on the critical issues. It's also important in the agenda that it reflect Council's role of oversight. On the agenda should be important items on finance, budget, contracts, decisions that are being made, so Council can provide their oversight. The Council is the meeting point of citizens and governance. Let's all work together to make sure we make it continue that way. Thank you.

Mayor Holman: Thank you. Council Member Kniss.

Council Member Kniss: Tom and I are sharing a mike tonight, so bear with First of all, I want to thank—this will come later—Karen and Greg; thank you so much for your service this year. It's been so appreciated. You've offered a great deal of guidance. Also, thanks to everyone who's out here in the audience, especially lots of my former colleagues and a Supervisor or two and the rest of you. It's wonderful to see this great Starting with last year, I think a couple have already audience tonight. mentioned it. We're heading into 2016. We have a City Council that has gone from having marked differences, I think, in early 2015. Now we are a far more collaborative and consensus-oriented governing body. However, I think 2016 is still going to be a challenge as we carry our priorities from last year. Our priorities from last year, you won't be surprised to learn, include actually finishing the Comprehensive Plan. We have great hopes for the Comprehensive Plan. Also, maintaining our infrastructure. We've done a good job on that, but we have a long way to go. Perhaps finally getting fiber to the home; that would be such an accomplishment. We will need a strong, balanced and focused Mayor to create these results. I'm nominating Pat Burt tonight, who has a history of effective leadership in the private sector, the Planning and Transportation Commission, Mayor and having chaired multiple City Council Committees as well as regional bodies. He recognizes that these leadership roles, rather than having a strong position of what one would do, this is a chance to lead and hopefully get a good outcome within our region, a big challenge. Mann said a leader must be a consensus builder, a thinker and communicate effectively in real time and accept the responsibility to exercise fairness and balance to everyone. Pat has strong knowledge and insights in the range of issues that the City Council must Planning, he spent eight years on the Planning Commission. Transportation, as I said spent eight years on Planning and Transportation. Finance, utilities, sustainability, community services and finances. He has served now almost 17 years, if I'm adding it correctly. He has served us well as a City. This Council is coalescing around measures that maintain the

quality of life that our residents value. Pat is someone who can help build that common purpose within the Council. Thank you.

Mayor Holman: Council Member Burt, do you care to speak to your nomination?

Council Member Burt: Thank you to Council Member Kniss for those words. I would say that just briefly my thoughts on the role of the Mayor and the needs of the Council are that the Mayorship role is one of leadership and not one of authority. The responsibility of the Mayor is to not only be the voice of the Council when asked to be so, but also to lead the Council forward throughout its meetings and its agenda throughout the year, to really have a focused approach and a productive approach to what it's attempting to do, and to attempt to build consensus within the governing body. The intent of what we want to do requires that there be at least the majority of the Council and hopefully a broad consensus around issues. I very much respect those responsibilities and limitations and would look forward to providing those services to the Council this year.

Mayor Holman: I see no other lights. Before we hear from one member of the public who has submitted a card and before we vote, I already have my first role of advice for the new Mayor. That is—you see I'm not used to going from a script. I overlooked recognizing our dignitaries. Next year, when the Mayor does this, after the roll call is recognition of dignitaries. We're honored to have several people with us here. Supervisor Simitian, I don't see him because no one chose to sit in the front seats. Everyone's hiding out. We also have a representative here from Jerry Hill's office. I believe we were to have somebody here from Rich Gordon's office too. I'm not sure—there we go. Right beside each other. Thank you. From Anna Eshoo's office we have Anne. Thank you very much for coming. Ream, she has a last name. Former Mayors Larry Klein, Yoriko Kishimoto, Former Vice Mayor Enid Pearson, Former Mayor Vic Ojakian, Former Mayor Judy Kleinberg, Former Council Member Emily Renzel. I don't think we've overlooked anybody. If we have, please make yourself known. You're coming, you're coming. We have representing the School Board Camille Townsend from PAUSD. We have several people who devote much time, many hours, a lot of dedication working on Boards, Commissions and our Community Advisory Committee for the Comp Plan. We have representatives from the Comp Plan CAC. We have fiber to the home representatives and Library Advisory Commission. When you hear your group, if you'd just stand, that would be really great so we can acknowledge you. Stand and stay standing. If you're on the CAC, fiber, Comp Plan CAC, Parks and Rec Commission. I know we have a couple of people here from the Parks and Rec Commission. I don't see anybody from the Planning and

Transportation Commission. Thank you all so much for your attendance and your service. We do have a member of the Historic Resources Board here too. Thank you very much, Marty. We do have one member of the public who would care to speak to the nomination of the Mayor. That is Sea Reddy. You will have three minutes.

Sea Reddy: Thank you, citizens of Palo Alto and the Mayor. If we had a way, I think we would have Karen for Mayor for ten years. I think she's outstanding. Considering the things we needed to change, the tone, the direction, the leadership, the calmness, the integrity, altogether Karen did a great job for the 11 1/2, 12 months that she's been on the job. Outstanding work, thank you. I think Palo Alto is lucky to have someone like her. I think with her is Greg Schmid. I don't know if you recall two years ago, a year ago when we did this. I came here and also recommended Greg Schmid to be the Vice Mayor. I think that he's done an outstanding job. He's an outstanding individual. He thinks through a lot. Palo Alto, we go through a lot of engineering in everything we do. I think he's the perfect candidate for the economy we have. I think we are privileged to have him serve us. I like his gray hair like mine. I think that's another one good reason. I would also recommend—I'm taking a step ahead—that Pat Burt is an outstanding thought processor and has a very good understanding of what City issues are, very detailed. I would recommend him to be the Vice Mayor. I'm sure that comes up the next time. With that team, I think we'll be ready for 2020 and beyond. The elections are coming, so we know it's going to be a busy year. Thank you. Thanks for the time you've given me.

Mayor Holman: Thank you, Sea. I see Council Member DuBois, you've turned your light on. Is that correct? Liz, did you turn his light on?

Council Member Kniss: Would you like me to speak for you, Tom?

Council Member DuBois: (inaudible)

Mayor Holman: With that, Council Members you'll see in front of you, you have a paper ballot. At this time, if you would fill out those paper ballots. David will come along and collect them. Sorry we don't have any theme music to fill the time. You can make up in your own minds what that theme music should be.

Beth Minor, City Clerk: Mayor Holman, I have the tally. We have Council Member Berman voting for Council Member Burt. We'll get this right by the end. Council Member Burt voting for Council Member Burt. Council Member DuBois voting for Vice Mayor Schmid. Council Member Filseth voting for Vice Mayor Schmid. Mayor Holman voting for Vice Mayor Schmid. Council Member Kniss voting for Council Member Burt. Council Member Scharff

voting for Council Member Burt. Vice Mayor Schmid voting for Vice Mayor Schmid. Council Member Wolbach voting for Council Member Burt. Council Member Burt has gotten five votes.

NOMINATION FOR COUNCIL MEMBER SCHMID FAILED: 4-5 DuBois, Filseth, Holman, Schmid yes

NOMINATION FOR COUNCIL MEMBER BURT PASSED: 5-4 Berman, Burt, Kniss, Scharff, Wolbach yes

Mayor Holman: Thank you. We will now switch places. I'll leave the script here for you for the rest of the meeting.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. I'll just offer a few comments before we go on to election of the Vice Mayor. First, thank you to my colleagues for your support, and to the community for entrusting me with these responsibilities. As we look at our challenges ahead, we will need to continue the important initiatives that the City Council worked on this past year under Mayor Holman's leadership, including taking the reins in managing commercial growth, protecting our local retail, addressing parking problems, updating our Comprehensive Plan, and a range of other initiatives. This year we also need to develop a plan and funding to improve our local transportation We must also work to protect our local affordable housing, its current supply and our plan to address new housing obligations in ways with the least impacts on our community. We'll also be adopting an updated Sustainability and Climate Action Plan. This Plan needs to provide for protecting our natural environment, creating long-term sustainable water and transportation systems, preparing for emergencies, and continuing our progress towards sustainable and affordable energy. It's important to remember that all that we provide as a City government is founded on our finances. We must build on the major progress we've made in recent years through increased investment in streets, bikeways and infrastructure. This has been done while making our finances more sound and sustainable. Through new efficiencies in how we deliver services along with pension and benefit reforms, we have gone from long-term deficits and a questionable financial future just a few years ago to strong finances and current budget surpluses. Our final leg of achieving financial sustainability must be to begin a program to pay down our unfunded pension liability. The Council last year made a commitment to address this. Lastly, we will need to recognize that our ambitious agenda cannot be accomplished at once or in a single year. Our strong and talented Staff is willing to take on multiple challenges. We as a Council and as a community need to set priorities and recognize realistic limits to what can be done each year. Thank you again. I look

forward to the coming year hoping that we can adjourn early this evening as a positive sign of the year ahead. Now I'm looking at our script.

2. Election of Vice Mayor for 2016.

Mayor Burt: The floor is now open for nominations for Vice Mayor. Council Members may nominate themselves or another Council Member, and no second is required. Is this Council Member Wolbach?

Council Member Wolbach: I'd like to nominate Council Member Greg Scharff for Vice Mayor

NOMINATION: Council Member Wolbach nominated Council Member Scharff for Vice Mayor for 2016.

Mayor Burt: Council Member DuBois.

Council Member DuBois: I'd like to nominate somebody who has never been Vice Mayor, Karen Holman.

NOMINATION: Council Member DuBois nominated Council Member Holman for Vice Mayor for 2016.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Any other nominees? Council Member Wolbach, would you like to speak to your nomination?

Council Member Wolbach: Briefly. First, let me say I think that there are actually eight people who would be very qualified to serve as Vice Mayor for the coming year. I've been thinking about the accomplishments, many of which have been mentioned, over the past year by this Council, by the community, by the Staff; the challenges facing us in the coming year; and what the opportunities are in the coming year. I think really the question is how can we have a team that works well, that works collegially, that presents balance, that will work together to address the complex issues and to respect and represent the diversity of views on the Council and in the community. Just to recap a little bit. Over the last year, in 2015 we've really refocused on and focused on systemic thinking about long-term issues. We've focused on resident concerns both immediate and long-term. We've focused on building a collegial atmosphere among the Council. As Council Member Kniss mentioned earlier, we started 2015 with a sense of I think we've started 2016 with a sense of unity, a sense of collective purpose. Going into 2016, we'll face a number of significant challenges, both internal and external. Internal, the financial issues that have been mentioned, Staff overload in no small part thanks to an ambitious Council. It'll be important to clearly set priorities as Mayor Burt mentioned

and to focus on recruitment and retention among the City Staff. This will all require a strong leadership team, not just the Mayor, but the Mayor working in collaboration with the Vice Mayor and the City Staff. External issues facing the community, the cost of housing, transportation and parking remain ongoing issues along with other things that have been focused on during the year such as airplane noise and the future of water security and other sustainability issues in Palo Alto. I think that the Vice Mayor and the Mayor working together need to present an opportunity for unity, for trust building, collaboration, compromise and team work. I think that Council Member Scharff brings a breadth of experience to that position. His experience with utilities in particular, his work representing Palo Alto on regional bodies will be an important asset in supplementing the work that the Mayor does as a number of regional issues are faced by the City in the coming year. I think that together they'll provide clear, efficient and experienced leadership for the City.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Council Member DuBois, would you like to speak to your nomination?

Council Member DuBois: Yes, sure. We have been divided on some issues this last year. I think it's critical that the Vice Mayor is someone that's not divisive, that's demonstrated clear leadership and the ability to work with everyone in a collegial manner. I'd also like to see some continuity, so that we continue the projects we've started, and we continue to make some real impacts on the quality of life for our citizens. Karen, she's served the City for a long time on both the Council and the Planning Commission. It's kind of funny, but she has yet to be Vice Mayor. She's demonstrated her ability to work well with Staff and the Council. I think she'd be a strong partner with the Mayor. Pat and Karen would make a great team. Together they have a huge amount of experience. I think Karen really complements Pat nicely. There's kind of a left brain/right brain thing going on there. Karen tends to focus on important issues that there'd be less to do with the hard numbers, things like homelessness, in particular homelessness with veterans. I think she struck the right balance on Buena Vista this year. She really brings that ability for everybody to work together. I think as evidenced by her landslide win in the last election, I think she really has tapped into the desires of the community. For those reasons, I think her tirelessness, ability to work for the community, ability to step in when the Mayor's not available and keep us focused on important priorities, I would support Karen for Vice Mayor.

Mayor Burt: The nominees are also welcome to speak. Council Member Scharff.

Council Member Scharff: Thank you. Thank you, Council Member Wolbach, for those kind words. I'm honored to be nominated for Vice Mayor. As a former Vice Mayor, I understand the importance of working closely with the Mayor, Council and Staff to implement the Council's and community's shared vision. I mean shared vision. Today begins my seventh year on Council. What has struck me the most is not the differences among Council Members, but the unanimity of Council. The vision is shared. The differences that we have are usually about how to achieve a shared goal. Mayor Burt has spoken eloquently about his vision and priorities for the coming year. support that vision and believe that 2016 is a critical year in which we can bring to fruition much of that vision. We also need to continue to lay the groundwork for achieving the priorities and vision that Council's been pursuing over the past couple of years. As Mayor Burt said, this is not a one-year process. It's accomplishing, bringing home what we can and laying the groundwork so the following year we can achieve more. That's what I believe we need to do. We all want a City that's environmentally sustainable, fiscally sustainable and who's quality of life is sustainable and doesn't degrade over time. We have accomplished some great things on the environmental sustainability front from carbon neutral to banning plastic bags and composting. Of course, there's more we can do. We will be doing it and discussing it at our upcoming Sustainability Summit. We have also made a lot of progress towards a sustainable fiscal future over my seven years on the Council. That is something we need to be diligent about moving forward, as seemingly small decisions can have long-term financial implications. Additionally, as residents of Palo Alto we want a sustainable quality of life. That means that we as a Council need to work together and listen to our community as we tackle the issues of traffic congestion, housing and development. I believe that Mayor Burt and I would work together in leading the Council towards actionable steps to ensure we maintain our quality of life here in Palo Alto while taking into account the diverse interests of our community. This will take not only the Council working together, but also the Council setting clear priorities, as Mayor Burt said, for Staff and clearly establishing what we want to accomplish this year. As Vice Mayor, I intend to work closely with the Mayor, Council Members and the community to achieve our shared vision of a sustainable Palo Alto and would ask for your support for me as Vice Mayor.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Council Member Holman.

Council Member Holman: Thank you, and thank you to Council Member DuBois for your kind words. I really, very much appreciate them. Council Member DuBois used a word that I think is really applicable in this case. That's the word continuity. I think, especially with the election of the Mayor, continuity is an issue here. I worked with Council Member Burt not only as a

part of neighborhood association, but on the Planning and Transportation Commission, on the South of Forest Avenue working group, on the Planning and Transportation Commission and now on the City Council. I've had a long history of working with Council Member Burt and would be, I think, a good partner in that regard. I'll be fairly brief here. We have a lot of things that we have accomplished this year, a very long list of things that we've accomplished, and a lot of things that we need to continue. Hopefully, now that we've gotten some things in place, we can continue in even a more focused manner. Some of those, just to list two or three here, that are kind of on the forefront for me are a continued commitment to the environment, housing and homelessness. Those are certainly high on my list. It's most especially the homelessness. Traffic and transportation congestion relief. I was part of a nine member Mayor and City Manager group that worked together to send a communication to VTA to talk about congestion relief and work for a study there. It's that kind of experience that you get as being a Mayor. Since I have skipped being Vice Mayor all these years, I think it's one that I can work in a very good support role. The Vice Mayor does step in for the Mayor also when the Mayor is out of town or unable or has multiple conflicts, which can happen on the same day. I'm ready, willing and able to fill that role. Going back to the continuity thing, I guess the last thing I would say about this is my engine is already warmed up. appreciate your support and your vote. Thank you.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. We have one member of the public to speak, Richard Brand. I also want to note that Former Mayor Gail Woolley has joined us. Welcome Richard.

Richard Brand: Good evening. Happy new year to all. I just wanted to add a few comments here. I think we have a chance being the City that's become the wonder City in Palo Alto with a wonder team here. I'm speaking—Mayor Burt, congratulations. I think you're great at this. I really recommend that people vote for Karen Holman as Vice Mayor. I think the two working together are going to continue the good work that's happened, Pat, under your regime several years ago and Mayor Holman this past year as you heard. I think we have the opportunity to work with Staff. I've actually seen, because I'm on several committees, the Staff working well with Karen Holman. I think that's important. Pat, that'll support the work that you're going to be needing to do, working with Jim's team which is doing a great job. I didn't expect to have to do this, but I think this is a real opportunity for the City to move forward. I encourage all of you to vote for Karen Holman for Vice Mayor. Thank you.

Mayor Burt: Council Member Berman, were you wanting to speak? Okay. We will shortly be hearing from the City Clerk on the results.

Beth Minor, City Clerk: Mayor Burt, I have the tally. We have Council Member Berman voting for Council Member Scharff. Mayor Burt voting for Council Member Scharff. Council Member DuBois voting for Council Member Holman. Council Member Filseth voting for Council Member Holman. Council Member Holman voting for Council Member Holman. Council Member Kniss voting for Council Member Scharff. Council Member Scharff voting for Council Member Scharff. Council Member Scharff. Council Member Holman. Council Member Wolbach voting for Council Member Scharff. Council Member Scharff has received five votes.

NOMINATION FOR COUNCIL MEMBER SCHARFF PASSED: 5-4 Berman, Burt, Kniss, Scharff, Wolbach

NOMINATION FOR COUNCIL MEMBER HOLMAN FAILED: 4-5 DuBois, Filseth, Holman, Schmid

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Vice Mayor Scharff, did you wish to make any additional comments?

Vice Mayor Scharff: Just that I really look forward to the upcoming year. Thank you all for coming tonight.

Mayor Burt: Thank you.

3. Resolution 9570 Entitled, "Resolution of the Council of the City of Palo Alto Expressing Appreciation for Outstanding Public Service to Karen Holman as Mayor."

Mayor Burt: Our next order of business is a Resolution recognizing the work of Former Mayor Holman this last year. What we need is, first, the Resolution to be read, to be followed by a motion to approve the Resolution. Council Member Schmid, I think you've agreed to read this on behalf of the Council. Thank you.

Council Member Schmid read the Resolution into the record. I move approval of the Resolution.

Vice Mayor Scharff: Second.

MOTION: Council Member Schmid moved, seconded by Vice Mayor Scharff to adopt the Resolution expressing appreciation for outstanding public service to Karen Holman as Mayor.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Before voting on it, we'd like to give members of the Council and members of the public an opportunity to speak to the Resolution. I see we do have some speakers. First, why don't we allow the

members of the public to speak. Our first speaker is Lisa Chung, to be followed by Catherine Martineau.

Lisa Chung, Senator Hill's Office: I will be brief since I know there's a long line of people who'd wish to wish outgoing Mayor Holman very well. I represent the office of Senator Jerry Hill. Senator Hill is in Sacramento, regrets he cannot be here today. He wishes me to convey his warmest congratulations for this very successful year. Your leadership has been felt throughout Palo Alto. Thank you.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Catherine Martineau to be followed by Faith Bell.

Catherine Martineau: Good evening, and thank you, Mayor Burt. I'm here to say a little more about the environmental leadership of Karen Holman. She mentioned that it's still a priority for this Council. The Resolution mentioned it too. I want to nominate Karen to be the chief tree advocate for Palo Alto. All of you actually are tree advocates and have been. I didn't know we could do this; I didn't know until today. I would have been here to bestow this distinction to many of you. Karen, she started her term last year with her Mayor tree planting. It will be your turn, Pat, very soon too. She took a real liking for her tree; it's a gingko at Rinconada Library. In a way she protected it; she watered it during the drought. Karen has always been an advocate for the trees. This year, because of all of the challenges, especially with the drought and the water conservation measures that compounded the effect of the lack of rain, Karen took an active role. She went herself to water her tree in front of Rinconada Library. I don't know exactly how she brought the water. She called me to water the tree, and then she talked to the Staff. She also, of course, led the adoption of the Urban Forest Master Plan, and she gave to the Staff and the Urban Forest Master Plan team some very good directions in terms of including more about the overall ecosystem of the City and the green infrastructure in the Plan and coming up with solutions to bring the south of Palo Alto canopy closer to the canopy cover of north Palo Alto. I believe that the Council will be very pleased when Staff presents preliminary results very soon. In a word, we could not be happier with Karen's advocacy for the trees. She used the dais and she's used her monthly letters to educate the whole population and the residents of Palo Alto. We're very grateful for that. Thank you for your amazing partnership, Karen.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Faith Bell to be followed by Former Mayor Yoriko Kishimoto.

Faith Bell: Greetings to our honored Council Members, community members at large. Congratulations to the newly elected Mayor and Vice Mayor. I

won't say that I wasn't disappointed. I am disappointed not to see Karen as our Vice Mayor, but I'm sure you'll all do beautifully. As a local small business owner, Bell's Book Store, Emerson Street, it's been wonderful to have Mayor Holman as our Mayor. She's extended herself in an exemplary manner to reach the business community. I hope that we'll see some consistent follow through on that, because it's been a huge change for us in the business community, to see that. It's been very welcome. She's worked to preserve the ground-floor retail environment. She's addressed difficult parking issues. She instigated the first Meet the Street event in which the smaller side streets got a chance to highlight their offerings in a way we never have before. We were able to coordinate our 80th anniversary party with that event, and we got over 700 people coming. I call that a success. As an environmentalist, I appreciate that Mayor Holman has sought creative ways in which to encourage recycling, composting and reuse and has established the preservation and creative reuse of historic buildings as a priority. Thank you for that. On other fronts, she's tirelessly forged strong connections between departments and with neighboring cities, reestablished transparency in City government, very important. All with an even hand and a remarkable ability to chair meetings in a professional and civilized fashion. Thank you, Mayor Holman, for your dedication and for guiding our City so well.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Our final speaker is Former Mayor Yoriko Kishimoto. We have one more speaker after that, Stephanie Munoz.

Yoriko Kishimoto: Thank you. Congratulations to the new Mayor and Vice Mayor. Thank you to Greg Schmid for your good Vice Mayorship. It's been a pure pleasure to watch our outgoing Mayor, Karen Holman, this last year. She's been an outstanding and very effective Mayor. You just spoke about all the criteria which makes a great Mayor, bringing out the best in Council Members. Actually I would add from the members of the public as well. Prioritizing and bringing focus to the most important issues, and bringing them to a productive vote, that calls for a real mastery of process and strong leadership that we all took advantage of. We saw the grace that you lead the meetings with and hard work. I'm not used to these beeps either. I just want to say thank you so much for representing the community so well. I think you've made a huge difference. Thank you.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Our next speaker is Stephanie Munoz. We have two more cards. To be followed by Shani Kleinhaus.

Stephanie Munoz: Happy new year all of you. Thank you, Karen. You say to yourself sometimes, "If Karen couldn't do it, then nobody can." Actually everybody has a different kind of a chance, a different kind of set of

circumstances, a different understanding from the rest of the community for the support that you're going to get. I bitterly regret that I didn't fight harder for that gym, the Birge Clark gym, for the women's shelter, bitterly. I know there's another year. There's another cause. I think Greg Scharff will be a great Vice Mayor, especially with respect to the small business. That's his forte, being nice to people. I think that'll work very well. I admire all of you. I respect all of you. I'm very, very grateful for the time you put in. There's something I want to say. The problems that you're facing are not of your making. Some are; to some extent they are. They're storms brewed in other men's waters. For instance, here are the veterans, the homeless. Scandalous. This is not our fault. I mean not our fault as Palo Altans. It's our fault as the entire United States. We allowed people to be conscripted, to be removed from their own control of their own lives. That's a whole lot worse than a wealth tax on 100 percent of your wealth, to tell you you have to go stand in front of a cannon and be shot at. It's the United States Government that should be responsible for those homeless veterans, making a home for them. I believe the City of Palo Alto should go in with the other cities in California. The reason the veterans are here is because the climate's better. You cannot stay out in the cold in-I don't know-Kansas and the Great Plains. We ought to make sure that those properties that are surplus property go to help the veterans, go to help education, go to help other things. I think I can tell you more, but that's enough for now. Thank you. Thank you very much for everything you've done, every one of you. Thanks.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Shani Kleinhaus to be followed by Mora Oommen.

Shani Kleinhaus: Good evening. Congratulations Mayor Burt and Vice Mayor Schmid. I'm here on behalf of Santa Clara Valley Audubon Society, the Sierra Club as well as a resident of Palo Alto to thank Karen Holman for her service. Karen, you have provided outstanding attention to the aesthetic of the City, its ecology and its people. We thank you for that. Thank you very much.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Mora Oommen to be followed by Arthur Keller.

Mora Oommen: Good evening everyone. My name's Mora Oommen. I'm the Executive Director of Blossom Birth Services. On behalf of Blossom, a nonprofit that serves expectant and new families in the area, I want to thank Karen Holman for all of her hard work this year. We're on California Avenue. She's done a really amazing job of trying to support small business on California Avenue. Unfortunately, Blossom will be losing its lease. We've been in Palo Alto for over 16 years. We're going to be looking for a new home. I hope it'll be here in Palo Alto, but it might be further up or down

the Peninsula. Karen Holman has been extremely instrumental in helping us as we transition. I want to thank her and wish her all the best. Hopefully she'll have some time, because I know she's been emailing me at sometimes even 2:00 a.m. I know she's been working hard day in and day out. Hopefully she'll get a good night's rest. Looks like she might be getting over something right now. I hope you feel better soon. Thanks so much, Karen.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Our final speaker is Arthur Keller.

Arthur Keller: Congratulations Mayor Burt, and congratulations Vice Mayor Greg Scharff. I'm sure you'll do ably in your posts. I would like to thank outgoing Mayor Karen Holman for her job in healing the City, in bringing us back together. After all, the last election was a very divisive election. In the past, we have had some divisiveness on the City Council. We didn't see any of that this year. That is a testament to the work of Karen in bringing us all together and bringing a spirit of collegiality. I hope that the future leadership of the City continues that spirit of collegiality, because I think that bringing us together is very important. When we all work together, we can accomplish a lot more than when we operate more divisively. I'd like to thank Karen for her work in healing the City, bringing us all together after a divisive campaign.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. On that note, we are ready to vote on the Resolution. Lights are not working at the moment. There we go. Everybody. That passes unanimously.

MOTION PASSED: 9-0

Mayor Burt: Before asking Former Mayor Holman to speak to the Resolution, I think we have some plaques that we can present out in front. Would you care to join me? Would you like to speak to your Resolution?

Council Member Holman: (inaudible)

Mayor Burt: Yes, you're welcome to do so. Council Member DuBois.

Council Member DuBois: Before it's all over, I would just like to thank Karen for her hard work this year. I think she was at every event. It was kind of incredible how much. Not only were you at the ceremony events, but you were also present on important policy issues. I think we made some important progress. People have mentioned retail protection, limiting office growth maybe to provide more space for housing, our Parking Permit Program. I think you really were the glue that held together what could have been a very fractious Council. I also want to thank you for the new events. I think the Veterans Day ceremony was terrific, and Meet the

Street, those were great additions that I hope continue. Just on a personal level, I wanted to thank you for your advice and assistance as a first-year Council Member. I really appreciated it. Thank you for caring and just working so hard.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Council Member Kniss.

Council Member Kniss: I've got to cozy back up to Tom. I particularly want to call out something that Karen did this year and that I was supportive of her in doing that, which was our new Healthy Communities and Healthy Cities aim and our Resolution that is now in place. I know Karen has been pushing this for a number of years. I came back on the Council and, as you all know, health is one of my particular issues. We were able this year, with Karen chairing it and me co-chairing, I think to bring it to fruition. We intend to continue it. Karen, thank you for that. That was an important initiative and, I think, one that is going to now be present in most cities and also will be a part of the Comprehensive Plan, and an important part as we think of our infrastructure and go forward, that we need this kind of thrust toward health as well as we need a thrust toward all the other amenities that we add to our Comprehensive Plan. Thanks Karen.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Council Member Wolbach.

Council Member Wolbach: First, I'd like to echo the comments by Council Member DuBois. As a first-year Council Member, I've appreciated your counsel. You never steered me wrong. My thanks for that. Also, the comments by former Planning Commissioner Arthur Keller, I think, were completely on point. What you've done to manage a contentious, complex year with diverse community and Council viewpoints and keep us together has been quite remarkable and deserves repeated commendation. Also, the example I think that you've set for each of us on Council, whether we're new or veterans on the Council, and for everyone in the community by demonstrating the importance of moral leadership should not be discounted. Your focus on the homeless and others who are most at risk in our community is something I personally appreciate. Thank you.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. I'd just like to share my comments. As Mayor, Council Member Holman brought just great energy and ideas and initiatives that I believe were fully embraced by the community. She also, as others have mentioned, really provided leadership for the Council over the course of the year to move toward a more shared vision that, I think, we've heard a number of people speak about. This Council has come together around a set of shared community values. I also want to emphasize Council Member Holman's real dedication to fairness to not only all the members of the

Council, but all the members of the community. This is a deeply held value for her. We could all see this throughout the course of the year. We really value it and respect it. Finally, I'd like to say that the strong leadership that she showed this year, I think, is something that is valued by the Council and portends to future leadership roles on the Council. I look forward to that as well. On that note, Former Mayor Holman, would you like to speak to your Resolution?

Council Member Holman: Thank you all very much. Thank you to the members of the community who came and additionally who spoke. First, congratulations to the new Mayor and Vice Mayor. Congratulations. I hope one of the things that has happened this year is we've created a collegial environment. That collegiality, I think, extends to Staff too. It's been an amazing year this year working with Staff. I thought about listing off some people on Staff who are not frontline people, but who just pitch in. I mean, you could hardly say more. It's just they pitch in. They generate product, and the effort to good end. I thought about doing that, but in spite of myself I would forget somebody. Somebody would feel left out, and that certainly was not my intention. There are some of you I can see now and look at; just know that I thank you from the bottom of my heart. You've been just great support this year and great inspiration. I really appreciate that. To Catherine Martineau, I want to know if a hat comes with the job. It'd be my honor to wear a badge of Canopy. It's been a really busy year. I told Jim earlier today that when I did the State of the City-Claudia Keith knows this as well—I was trying to find out if we would have any problem in using the roadrunner cartoon, because it's kind of what this year I knew was going to be like. It's kind of what it has been like. Those of you over a certain age certainly will know what I'm talking about. It's the roadrunner just zipping across the screen. That kind of a lot what this year has been about. I'm hoping that we have a number of things in place at this point in time that will help us to focus more even on the Comprehensive Plan and accomplishing the completion of that. We've gotten some things in place like putting an office cap in place. We've got retail protections in place Citywide. We have a PC moratorium. We've taken some things off the table that could cause distractions for this next year. Not to say other things won't come up. We have a number of other things that we want to accomplish. Those things, I think, will help us have a stable place to start from, so we're not chasing a moving target. I think having those in place and accomplished, I appreciate Staff and colleagues working with the whole Council and community on that. That said, we have accomplished a lot and the environment is one of the primary things that we almost always focus Yet, even with our focus on the environment and our continued initiatives there, we can't create blue skies for everyone. We've not been able to do that. We still have a homeless population that needs to be

served. I could mention the veterans homelessness among that population, but it's really the whole homeless population. I hope we can create blue skies. We had a really, I think, successful veterans appreciation event this year. It was the first one we've ever done. At the same time, we couldn't end war. We aim high. We aim high here. We need to continue to aim high. We know what we can't accomplish everything, but that doesn't mean we should lower our sights. This year we with Staff took it to the streets literally in a couple of different ways. We did the Meet the Street event which was an initiative that helped, as Faith Bell spoke, that introduced a lot of people who had not visited before some of the side street businesses. It was in many ways a successful event. At least some aspects of that will be continuing next year. It's a way to get people to introduce themselves or get introduced to the new stores and the stores that have been there for a long time that people haven't discovered because they're on a side street, because they're on not the main drag. We also took it to the streets by visiting neighborhoods. Along with some colleagues who also signed onto a Colleagues Memo, we had our first two neighborhood Town Hall meetings. Those stretched from San Antonio Road to San Francisquito Creek. We had neighborhoods that extended that far that came together for a couple of Town Hall meetings. By all accounts, they seemed to be very successful and well received. The most important thing that we do here up on this dais and out in the public is represent you, the public. I thought what I would do— I'm sorry. I meant to have these up on the screen. I got called, and it just didn't happen. I thought I'd read a couple of letters; they're brief. They're from kids in the community. We start them young in this community. I think you'll see that these are representative of the public at large. This one was dated December 16 of this year. "Dear Mayor Holman, I have a Can you please help me? Most of the people just drop stuff instead of throwing them in the trash can. Can you please put signs that say please do not litter. P.S. I'm still a first grader." The other one is—I think you'll see how it's representative of the public at large too. Again, we start them young. This one was actually sent more than a year ago. "Dear Mayor, I need you to have a talk with everybody that litters, because I saw 16 cigarettes, two thumb tacks and a pen all on the ground and many other things too. I've had enough." We do start them early here. I think that the comments from these kids do mirror, quite frankly, the community's comments. Most importantly, I want to thank all of you. It's the public-It's you, the public, that make this all worthwhile. It's you, the public, that make this place what it is. I'm so sorry. It's your commitment, your intelligence, your intellect, your experience, your expertise, your time and your care, that you care so much about this community. It has been my pleasure and honor to serve you this year. I look forward to another productive year of this Council working together as colleagues. I thank you all very much.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Before our final item, which is to hear from members of the public on items not otherwise on the agenda, known as our Oral Communications, I just would like to take this opportunity to remind members of the audience that we have some really important and valuable events coming up that are really supported by community engagement. We have a series of our Comprehensive Plan events. Most immediately, we have our Sustainability and Climate Action Summit on the afternoon of Sunday, the 24th of January, at Mitchell Park. This is an event that will inform the Council and the community about a plan that is really our vision for the next 30 years or more in the sustainability of this community. We would very much value your participation. You can find information on it on the City website.

Oral Communications

Mayor Burt: We have six speakers under Oral Communication. I'm sure the audience will welcome brevity. You have up to three minutes to speak. The first speaker is Jennifer Landesmann, to be followed by Stephanie Munoz.

Jennifer Landesmann: Thank you, Mayor Holman, for your support this year. Congratulations Mayor Burt, Vice Mayor Scharff. I'm here to let you know that this is a time of crisis for Palo Alto residents experiencing the mean and brutal onslaught of low-flying airplanes bound to SFO. Crisis not in the sense that the world is about to go under, but in the sense that the data that has been provided to us directly by the Federal Aviation Administration shows that a massive amount of airplane noise and pollution has been shifted to us, to Palo Alto. At least some would like to make the concentration of routes over Palo Alto, which SFO itself calls the perfect storm, the new status quo. We're at an inflection point in the history of this issue, perhaps in the history of the town, in terms of livability. The time to stop this is now. There are countless studies that show that noise and emissions emitted by the great number of airplanes overflying our community does great harm to the growth and development of children, their learning. Every day that we let this situation persist without doing everything in our power to stop it is a day too many. Mayor, Vice Mayor, please help lead in the regional negotiations with the FAA to fix this. Please help to make this work a priority this year. Congratulations and thank you.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Before too many people leave, I've been corrected that the location of the Sustainability Summit will be Jordan Middle School on the 24th. Stephanie Munoz to be followed by Keith Bennett.

Stephanie Munoz: Good evening again, Council Members and Mayor Burt. Joan of Arc is a hard act to follow. Every person brings his own personality

and his own qualities to the job of Mayor. Pat Burt, to me, is the person who makes the word politician a compliment rather than an insult. He's the one who says, "God, give me the grace to prevail and to fight for what I believe in and to accept what I cannot change and the wisdom to know the difference." I'm hoping that during this coming year I'll be able to change your mind about some things that might not be possible. Housing, health care, things that would be advantageous, that people aren't looking at in exactly the right way. IF people got the health insurance on their Social Security they way they were supposed to back in 1885 and they do every place else, think of how much that would save the County and the City. Thank you. Bye-bye.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Keith Bennett to be followed by Esther Nigenda.

Keith Bennett: Good evening, and congratulations on new positions. I'm here on behalf of Save Palo Alto's Groundwater. I know that this issue will be coming up before the full Council sometime this month. I wanted to give comments now also in time for Staff to hear them, so that they can consider our input as they formulate plans. Next slide. The first point, people have said we should only be concerned about significant amounts of water. This graph here gives the per capita allocation of the State water project for the Santa Clara Valley Water District in 2017. It's 715 gallons. The amount of water that was removed for basement construction dewatering of residential basements in Palo Alto on a per capita basis last year was 1.27 times that. I think it's a significant amount of water. Next slide. The other thing is people have brought up that the water that we take out is not potable. However, non-potable water can substitute and does substitute for potable water in many applications. This is a flyer which we received recently; it just indicates that Palo Alto does value non-potable water and gives rebates for various containers to collect rainwater. The next thing I want to point out is that the amount of water taken from beneath a house, based on 9 million gallons and a 10,000 square foot lot, is equivalent to a column of water on that property of 120 feet deep. The point of this slide is that the vast majority of that water is removed from under surrounding properties. Next slide. The final point is Staff had suggested that a sheet pilling might be a good method. It was brought up that sheet piling might be noisy. We did some looking. There is at least one method known as the silent piler method. It's a static hydraulic press-in method. The next thing is I'll show you a short promotional video for this method, but it should be usable in residential neighborhoods. That's it.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Our next speaker is Esther Nigenda.

Esther Nigenda: Good evening and congratulations to the new Mayor and Vice Mayor. We'll just show the short video for the silent piler which should, we hope, be an alternative method. Instead of dewatering, we could use this. [Video shown] I'm glad I didn't have to explain that personally. It looks like this could be useful instead of dewatering to build basements. Thank you.

Mayor Burt: I should say that we won't be accepting any more speaker cards after this time. Our next speaker is Rita Vrhel, to be followed by Rene Wood.

Rita Vrhel: Good evening and congratulations to the new Mayor and Vice Mayor. It was wonderful working with you, Mayor Holman. I would like to clarify that savepaloaltosgroundwater.org is not against building residential Our focus remains on dewatering and the treatment of community groundwater as a vital resource, not as construction waste. The Policy and Services Committee voted unanimously—we thank you—to send this issue of dewatering to the full City Council for a discussion. Department of Public Works will present a three-tiered approach including formulation of a site-specific plan for any property issued a dewatering We ask the City Council to direct Staff to include in their recommendations the following. I will be giving you each a little information Number one, all community groundwater removed during construction shall be directed and/or reused. Number two, all extracted groundwater shall be metered. This will provide, for the first time, an accurate measurement of the amount of pumped groundwater. three, during dewatering the amount of permitted groundwater extraction shall not exceed a volume equivalent to water covering the lot to a depth of 5 feet. Mr. Bennett will be sending you additional information regarding the calculation of this amount. Previously, as you know, pumping could continue for six months, and the amount of groundwater extraction was unlimited. Number four, the dewatering process shall be limited to one month, not six. Best construction practices specifically having all contractors subcontractors sequentially scheduled should reduce excessive dewatering. Members of the public came forward during the Policy and Services Committee meeting and indicated this was possible. Number five, a basement design which does not impede the flow of water through the surrounding soils especially during normal or exceptional rainfall shall be part of all site-specific plans. In addition, we request the City Council apply the same planning and review requirements to all basement construction requiring dewatering that apply to a two-story home. Application of the FAR and limiting basement depth as previously discussed could be helpful. Members of savepaloaltosgroundwater.org look forward to continuing our

work with the Council and Staff to address the issues we discussed this evening. Thank you.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Our next speaker is Rene Wood, and our final speaker Ruth Lowy.

Rene Wood: Good evening. I extend my congratulations to the new Mayor and Vice Mayor also. My name is Rene Wood, and I'm from Sheffield, Massachusetts. I'm hoping that you'll let me speak tonight. My background is similar to many of yours in that I am a member or have been a member of our town's Select Board and Planning Commission. I have followed Savepaloaltosgroundwater.org's work and believe that their and your efforts are cutting edge. I've been impressed with the rigor of their work, their commitment to fact-based data from respected organizations and the modest implementable nature of their requests to the Council. impressed with the Council's openness to their work and your collaborative approach. This discussion is not anti-basement. Rather, it is about smarter, more thoughtful basement construction when dewatering is required, construction which becomes mindful of its impact on groundwater resources. Their requests are reasonable, measureable, data driven and can be implemented prior to the issuance of dewatering permits in April. Just as important, their requests provide a balance, one based on equity between the owner building a basement requiring dewatering and neighboring property owners. I have been a very frequent visitor to Palo Alto for 30 years and have watched this City grow, property become astronomically valuable and services and lifestyle become second to none, in part because of your focus on sustainability which Mayor Burt spoke of in his acceptance remarks. Sustainability for water usage has included in the past, but it's not been limited to, providing compensation to residents who switch to low water landscaping, mandatory gray water systems and the rebates that are currently in place that were mentioned earlier. It is only reasonable and common sense to augment these actions with the dewatering policies requested here tonight. I respectfully ask the Council to grant the requests and thank you for receiving my comments.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. Our final speak is Ruth Lowy.

Ruth Lowy: Good evening. I'm Ruth Lowy. I wanted to thank Karen Holman and Greg Schmid for their wonderful leadership this year and for making, as many have said, a very thoughtful and collaborative year. Congratulations to our new Mayor, Pat Burt, and to Vice Mayor Greg Scharff. I hope that your leadership will continue this very wonderful year that we've had. The quality of life is somewhat improving. We will hope that you can continue on with that. I'd like to also follow up on the comment of the, I

think, first speaker about the airplane noise. I've been very vocal, written, phone calls, etc. I thank Joe Simitian and Anna Eshoo for their efforts trying to do something about the continued airplane noise. Between 6:00 in the morning and 1:00 a.m. the next morning, airplanes are flying low over our homes in the Barron Park neighborhood, where I live, and I know in many other neighborhoods, frankly, at midnight when I'm nice and warm and don't want to jump out of bed and make phone calls to complain to the noise abatement or at 6:00 in the morning when I'd like to spend another half an hour sleeping. Some of those times, the planes seem to be at their loudest. Mostly during the day, there are almost no times when it's quiet overhead. Anything that the City Council can do to help mitigate that would be most appreciated by all of us. Thank you and congratulations. Thank you for your efforts and your time.

Mayor Burt: Thank you. On that note, our meeting is adjourned. We'd like to invite everyone to the lobby to join us for refreshments.

Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at 7:36 P.M.