# Instructions

We are testing different systems for automated processing of user feedback. We created 4 different automated processing systems to analyze the user feedback from a recent development build of a new software tool. We gave the set of user feedback below to each system and asked it to perform a thematic analysis to determine the best themes for characterizing the user feedback we gave it. We would like you to review the themes the 4 systems generated and rate them based on their quality, completeness, accuracy, and usefulness. First please read the user feedback below and then review the themes provided by each system and rate the systems according to the questions we provide. Thank you for your participation in the study!

# User Feedback

[data has been removed for anonymity and its proprietary nature, but an anonymized version may be available upon request]

# Themes

## Set A

1. Scrolling and Navigation: Users found it irritating to have two scrollbars, one for the document view and another for the browser page. Some users had to open a new window to feel comfortable scrolling.
2. Insights and Filtering: The "New Insights" dropdown tab kept popping up during tasks, causing frustration. Users found the filtering system complex and confusing, with multiple options (Genre, Situation, Records) that were not clear in their meanings. Some users felt that the ATHENA insights were sometimes unclear or misleading.
3. Search Functionality: Users wanted a more refined search process, similar to Chat-GPT style, where they can clarify their searches and receive tailored results. The system should learn from the user's searches and provide more accurate suggestions over time. Some users felt that the system was too generic in its search results and couldn't pinpoint specific documents.
4. User Experience: Users wanted a "Find on This Page" feature to quickly locate specific keywords or phrases in long documents. The system should allow users to open separate browser tabs for the answer sheet and search results, rather than forcing them to navigate back and forth between the two. Some users found the UI/UX not very encouraging, with pop-up boxes that got in the way of other filters.
5. Overall Feedback: Users generally found the system helpful and appreciated the capabilities it offered for enhancing knowledge management. However, some users felt that the system was overly complex or confusing, and suggested improvements to make it more user-friendly.'

### Questions

For each of the below questions fill in one bubble to indicate how strongly you agree or disagree with each question.

1. The identified themes are clear and easy to understand.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes are presented concisely without losing important information.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The thematic analysis is comparable to what I would expect from a human researcher.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes completely describe all pieces of user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes accurately reflect the main ideas in the user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes provide actionable insights for improving the system.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. I would feel confident using the themes for further analysis or decision-making.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

## Set B

1. Ease of use and helpfulness
2. Potential for enhancement
3. Challenges during testing
4. Value of insights gained

### Questions

For each of the below questions fill in one bubble to indicate how strongly you agree or disagree with each question.

1. The identified themes are clear and easy to understand.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes are presented concisely without losing important information.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The thematic analysis is comparable to what I would expect from a human researcher.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes completely describe all pieces of user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes accurately reflect the main ideas in the user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes provide actionable insights for improving the system.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. I would feel confident using the themes for further analysis or decision-making.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

## Set C

1. AI and Search: Many users commented on both positive and negative interactions with the AI and search functions. These are crucial aspects of our system that need improvement. We should focus on enhancing the accuracy and efficiency of the AI to provide more relevant results, as well as improving the user experience of the search function by making it faster and more intuitive.
2. Database Navigation and Complexity: Users mentioned having difficulty finding information in the large database, which is a significant challenge for our system. We should focus on making the navigation more efficient and effective, possibly through better organization of the do documentation or additional filtering options. We also need to address the complexity of the system by simplifying the user interface and improving the discoverability of features.
3. Performance and User Experience: Users mentioned issues with performance, such as slow loading times and document accessibility, which negatively impacted their overall user experience. We should focus on improving the performance of the system to provide a smoother experience for users, as well as enhancing the user interface appeal to make it more intuitive and visually appealing.
4. Terminology and Filters: Users mentioned the need for clearer labels and improved filtering options to navigate the database more effectively. We should focus on improving the terminology used in the system to make it more accessible to users, as well as providing more granular filtering options to help users quickly find the information they need.
5. Search Function and Documentation: Users mentioned issues with the search function and the accessibility of older documentation. We should focus on improving the accuracy and effectiveness of the search function by enhancing its algorithms and providing more detailed results. We should also make older documentation more accessible to users, possibly through enhanced organization or improved preservation techniques.
6. System Design and Customization: Users mentioned a need for better customization options, such as the ability to modify layouts or add filters. We should focus on enhancing the system design by providing more customization options to allow users to tailor the experience to their specific needs. This will help improve the overall user experience and make the system more engaging and effective.
7. Feedback and Recommendations: Users mentioned occasional inaccuracies in document recommendations and suggested adding more filters for search results. We should focus on improving the recommendation engine by providing more accurate and relevant suggestions to users, as well as enhancing the filtering options to help users quickly find the information they need.'

### Questions

For each of the below questions fill in one bubble to indicate how strongly you agree or disagree with each question.

1. The identified themes are clear and easy to understand.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes are presented concisely without losing important information.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The thematic analysis is comparable to what I would expect from a human researcher.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes completely describe all pieces of user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes accurately reflect the main ideas in the user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes provide actionable insights for improving the system.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. I would feel confident using the themes for further analysis or decision-making.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

## Set D

1. "AI is excellent" - 40 pieces of feedback. Users appreciate the AI system's performance and relevance (39 times), with this new piece highlighting issues with video content not working as intended, navigation between answer sheets and search results, and a desire for highlighted keywords in search results. Sub-theme: System's ability to host a large volume of data is valuable for users (4 times) - no change
2. "Search functionality needs improvement" - 46 pieces of feedback. Sub-theme: Sequential layering of filters can restrict results and lead to frustration (2 times), with this new piece highlighting issues with query term handling, document ranking, lack of negation options for filters, result loss when toggling between search results and answer pages, and a desire for refined suggestions or recommendations. Sub-theme: Users need suggestions or recommendations to improve search experience (1 time) - no change. Sub-theme: Developing good search prompts requires skills in posing questions (no change), as users struggle to get accurate results and navigate the system's limitations.
3. "Frustration with search results" - 44 pieces of feedback. Users' experiences are consistently plagued by poor search result sorting, lack of chronological order, and irrelevant hits, leading to wasted time and effort in searching for information.
4. "Insight button can be improved" - 3 pieces of feedback (no change). Users suggest that the insight button might not always be relevant or necessary when searching for information, leading to potential annoyance or distraction.
5. "Document viewer improvements needed" - 23 pieces of feedback. Users are unsure about the insight s feature's purpose and would prefer a more convenient document reading experience in the browser (2 times) - no new insights.
6. "Technical issues with recording results" - 32 pieces of feedback. This new piece highlights an issue with recording results, specifically when users run out o f time or experience technical difficulties while submitting their work.
7. "Search result limitations hinder exploration" - 15 pieces of feedback (no change). Users feel that the system's limitations in providing accurate and relevant search results hinder their ability to explore and find the information they need.
8. "Navigation and usability issues" - 15 pieces of feedback. This new piece highlights users' frustration with navigating between answer sheets and search results, which can be improved by suggesting users open separate browser tabs for each.
9. "Suggestions for improvement needed" - 8 pieces of feedback (new theme). Users want more refined suggestions or recommendations based on their query, rather than just offering random options.

### Questions

For each of the below questions fill in one bubble to indicate how strongly you agree or disagree with each question.

1. The identified themes are clear and easy to understand.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes are presented concisely without losing important information.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The thematic analysis is comparable to what I would expect from a human researcher.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes completely describe all pieces of user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes accurately reflect the main ideas in the user feedback.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. The identified themes provide actionable insights for improving the system.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

1. I would feel confident using the themes for further analysis or decision-making.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|  |  |  |  |  |

# Final Ranking

* **Ranking**: Please rank the four sets of themes from best to worst in terms of overall quality of thematic analysis from 1 (best) to 4 (worst)

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Set A | Set B | Set C | Set D |
|  |  |  |  |