

## Results for the relaxation techniques

This brief report presents the results for a single running of Matlab<sup>®</sup> implementation of algorithms presented on "Structured robust control against mixed uncertainty"<sup>1</sup> for inner, hybrid and outer relaxations methods for the problem of synthesize a structured robust controller for an uncertain system subjected to both parametric and dynamic uncertainties. Evaluation was based on the best worst-case  $H_\infty$ -performance, or gain, achieved by each method.

Table 1 recalls the structure of each test case<sup>2</sup>. The column labeled ' $\Delta$ -structure' shows the structure of the uncertainty  $\Delta$ . Positive numbers give the size of the square complex blocks  $\Delta_d$  of dynamic uncertainties, negative numbers represent a real parametric uncertainty and its repetition. For instance, case 9 has  $N_d = 0$ ,  $N_p = 2$  with  $r_1 = 18$  and  $r_2 = 2$ . Column  $n_P$  is the order of the generalized plant  $P$ , column  $z$ - $w$  shows the number of exogenous outputs and inputs and column  $y$ - $u$  shows the number of control outputs and inputs.

In all plants the performance channel  $w \rightarrow z$  was scaled so that the worst case performance of the closed-loop system computed by the inner approach was close to the value one, in order to render comparison between the different techniques more straightforward. All performance values were certified by the WCGAIN Matlab<sup>®</sup> routine, with the exception of case 17, where WCGAIN failed, indicated by '-' in column 4 of table 2.

Table 2 shows the results for the inner relaxation technique, while tables 3 and 4 present the results for the hybrid and outer relaxation techniques, respectively. For each table, column  $n_K$  gives the order of the synthesized controller, which is the same for the 3 approaches, column named 'gain' corresponds to the worst-case  $H_\infty$ -performance found by the routine implemented and  $T_{syn}$  the time spent in doing so. Global certification uses WCGAIN, and the result is given in column labeled 'certified' while the time needed is given in column  $T_{cft}$ .

For the methods *inner* and *hybrid*, in tables 2 and 3, respectively, also is indicated the number  $|\Delta_a|$  of scenarios needed for the synthesis, which also corresponds to the number of times the local loop was executed. For instance, in case study no. 1, the inner method - table 2, found the gain 1.003

---

<sup>1</sup>Aguiar, R.S.S., Apkarian, P. and Noll, D. - "Structured robust control against mixed uncertainty". Submitted to IEEE TCST.

<sup>2</sup>Test case set available in <http://> .

Table 1: Test cases

| No. | $\Delta$ -structure |                                    | $n_P$ | $z-w$ | $y-u$ |
|-----|---------------------|------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|
| 1   | complex             | 1                                  | 9     | 3 3   | 2 1   |
| 2   | complex             | 3                                  | 7     | 1 2   | 1 1   |
| 3   | complex             | 3                                  | 8     | 4 4   | 3 1   |
| 4   | complex             | 8                                  | 12    | 6 2   | 2 2   |
| 5   | complex             | 1,1                                | 22    | 2 2   | 2 2   |
| 6   | complex             | 1                                  | 3     | 1 1   | 1 1   |
| 7   | complex             | 2                                  | 26    | 6 5   | 5 2   |
| 8   | real                | -1                                 | 3     | 2 3   | 1 1   |
| 9   | real                | -18,-2                             | 23    | 3 2   | 3 1   |
| 10  | real                | -20                                | 10    | 2 1   | 1 1   |
| 11  | real                | -21                                | 5     | 2 2   | 1 1   |
| 12  | mixed               | 1,-1,-1                            | 9     | 1 1   | 1 1   |
| 13  | mixed               | 1,-2,-2                            | 7     | 4 2   | 1 1   |
| 14  | mixed               | 1,-1,-3                            | 8     | 3 4   | 2 1   |
| 15  | mixed               | 1,-1                               | 8     | 2 4   | 2 2   |
| 16  | mixed               | 2,-1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-1                | 14    | 6 2   | 2 2   |
| 17  | mixed               | 1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-3                   | 9     | 2 1   | 1 1   |
| 18  | mixed               | 1,-1,-2,-2                         | 6     | 2 1   | 1 1   |
| 19  | mixed               | 1,-1,-1,-3,-3,-3                   | 6     | 2 2   | 1 1   |
| 20  | mixed               | 1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-3,-3,-3,-3,-3    | 11    | 2 1   | 1 1   |
| 21  | mixed               | 4,-1,-1,-1,-1                      | 8     | 6 2   | 2 2   |
| 22  | mixed               | 1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-1,-2,-2,-2,-2 | 19    | 2 3   | 1 1   |
| 23  | mixed               | 3,-1,-1,-6                         | 8     | 4 4   | 3 1   |
| 24  | mixed               | 3,-1                               | 7     | 1 2   | 1 1   |
| 25  | mixed               | 1,-1,-1,-1,-6,-6,-6                | 24    | 3 2   | 3 1   |
| 26  | mixed               | 1,1,1,1,-1,-1,-1,-1                | 8     | 6 2   | 2 2   |
| 27  | mixed               | 1,-1                               | 7     | 2 2   | 1 1   |
| 28  | mixed               | 1,-1,-5                            | 7     | 2 3   | 2 1   |
| 29  | mixed               | 1,-1                               | 4     | 2 3   | 1 1   |
| 30  | mixed               | 1,-1                               | 8     | 2 2   | 1 1   |

with a controller of order  $n_K = 2$  in 133.6s, and with a total of  $|\Delta_a| = 10$  scenarios. Certification with **WCGAIN** confirmed this value as correct in 5.7s.

Table 2: Results for the inner relaxation techniques

| No. | $n_K$ | gain  | certified | $ \Delta_a $ | $T_{syn}$ | $T_{cft}$ |
|-----|-------|-------|-----------|--------------|-----------|-----------|
| 1   | 2     | 1.003 | 1.003     | 10           | 133.6     | 5.7       |
| 2   | 1     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 6            | 27.7      | 2.8       |
| 3   | 4     | 0.977 | 0.978     | 28           | 988.4     | 3.5       |
| 4   | 3     | 0.999 | 1.000     | 2            | 18.2      | 6.7       |
| 5   | 5     | 0.989 | 0.991     | 23           | 1706.3    | 5.0       |
| 6   | 1     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 3            | 4.2       | 1.9       |
| 7   | 4     | 1.027 | 1.026     | 26           | 5667.0    | 3.1       |
| 8   | 2     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 3            | 4.9       | 1.7       |
| 9   | 2     | 0.999 | 0.998     | 5            | 72.9      | 1947.8    |
| 10  | 2     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 2            | 10.4      | 1450.6    |
| 11  | 1     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 1            | 1.0       | 3260.4    |
| 12  | 3     | 1.000 | 0.998     | 10           | 133.2     | 6.0       |
| 13  | 1     | 1.000 | 0.993     | 2            | 4.2       | 14.8      |
| 14  | 2     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 3            | 9.2       | 23.5      |
| 15  | 3     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 8            | 68.9      | 26.4      |
| 16  | 4     | 1.178 | 1.230     | 16           | 2408.2    | 20.3      |
| 17  | 4     | 0.906 | —         | 13           | 396.2     | 75.0      |
| 18  | 3     | 0.992 | 0.992     | 6            | 43.0      | 21.1      |
| 19  | 1     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 1            | 1.8       | 127.9     |
| 20  | 2     | 1.210 | 1.210     | 5            | 69.3      | 104.6     |
| 21  | 1     | 1.000 | 1.005     | 2            | 27.8      | 29.5      |
| 22  | 3     | 0.976 | 0.976     | 10           | 305.7     | 233.0     |
| 23  | 4     | 1.070 | 1.079     | 37           | 556.3     | 73.9      |
| 24  | 4     | 0.997 | 0.997     | 8            | 48.7      | 11.8      |
| 25  | 3     | 1.000 | 0.999     | 8            | 517.4     | 269.6     |
| 26  | 1     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 2            | 6.7       | 21.0      |
| 27  | 3     | 0.998 | 0.997     | 7            | 88.2      | 12.2      |
| 28  | 4     | 1.001 | 1.001     | 5            | 27.9      | 48.9      |
| 29  | 2     | 1.020 | 1.020     | 5            | 14.7      | 6.1       |
| 30  | 5     | 1.088 | 1.085     | 14           | 346.9     | 6.7       |

Table 3: Results for the hybrid relaxation techniques

| No. | $n_K$ | gain  | certified | $ \Delta_a $ | $T_{syn}$ | $T_{cft}$ |
|-----|-------|-------|-----------|--------------|-----------|-----------|
| 1   | 2     | 1.008 | 0.999     | 2            | 68.5      | 3.0       |
| 2   | 1     | 1.001 | 0.999     | 2            | 22.2      | 2.1       |
| 3   | 4     | 1.444 | 1.521     | 2            | 98.8      | 3.7       |
| 4   | 3     | 1.006 | 0.999     | 2            | 34.1      | 4.2       |
| 5   | 5     | 1.182 | 1.209     | 2            | 138.3     | 4.4       |
| 6   | 1     | 1.008 | 1.003     | 2            | 20.4      | 1.7       |
| 7   | 4     | 1.045 | 1.043     | 2            | 137.2     | 3.5       |
| 8   | 2     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 3            | 22.7      | 1.2       |
| 9   | 2     | 1.001 | 1.001     | 5            | 157.2     | 1511.3    |
| 10  | 2     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 2            | 28.5      | 1469.9    |
| 11  | 1     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 2            | 20.0      | 3211.3    |
| 12  | 3     | 1.052 | 1.052     | 3            | 50.8      | 5.3       |
| 13  | 1     | 1.002 | 0.994     | 2            | 21.0      | 13.9      |
| 14  | 2     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 3            | 43.8      | 22.9      |
| 15  | 3     | 1.001 | 1.000     | 3            | 64.8      | 24.9      |
| 16  | 4     | 1.238 | 1.225     | 14           | 5001.9    | 20.5      |
| 17  | 4     | 1.155 | 1.143     | 3            | 124.3     | 34.8      |
| 18  | 3     | 1.093 | 1.090     | 5            | 109.3     | 17.8      |
| 19  | 1     | 1.000 | 1.000     | 2            | 15.3      | 106.9     |
| 20  | 2     | 1.223 | 1.222     | 3            | 84.7      | 68.7      |
| 21  | 1     | 1.005 | 1.000     | 2            | 18.9      | 42.3      |
| 22  | 3     | 1.042 | 1.041     | 4            | 137.4     | 199.7     |
| 23  | 4     | 4.238 | 4.168     | 2            | 73.0      | 84.7      |
| 24  | 4     | 0.997 | 0.994     | 3            | 60.5      | 11.8      |
| 25  | 3     | 1.103 | 1.103     | 4            | 157.1     | 455.3     |
| 26  | 1     | 1.007 | 0.999     | 2            | 22.6      | 41.3      |
| 27  | 3     | 1.000 | 0.999     | 5            | 123.7     | 11.6      |
| 28  | 4     | 1.000 | 0.999     | 6            | 60.8      | 50.9      |
| 29  | 2     | 1.011 | 1.019     | 3            | 15745.8   | 6.2       |
| 30  | 5     | 1.071 | 1.057     | 3            | 144.7     | 4.9       |

Table 4: Results for the outer relaxation techniques

| No. | $n_K$ | gain   | certified | $T_{syn}$ | $T_{cft}$ |
|-----|-------|--------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| 1   | 2     | 0.989  | 0.996     | 21.6      | 6.0       |
| 2   | 1     | 0.991  | 0.999     | 21.4      | 2.8       |
| 3   | 4     | 1.488  | 1.493     | 78.5      | 3.9       |
| 4   | 3     | 0.991  | 0.999     | 30.1      | 5.5       |
| 5   | 5     | 1.601  | 1.555     | 81.2      | 4.8       |
| 6   | 1     | 0.991  | 1.000     | 20.5      | 2.1       |
| 7   | 4     | 1.035  | 1.043     | 117.6     | 3.4       |
| 8   | 2     | 1.116  | 1.126     | 39.9      | 1.9       |
| 9   | 2     | —      | 86.26     | 71.9      | 0.02      |
| 10  | 2     | —      | 4.687     | 779.2     | 0.02      |
| 11  | 1     | —      | 1.000     | 835.9     | 769.1     |
| 12  | 3     | 1.217  | 1.227     | 118.9     | 8.2       |
| 13  | 1     | 18.83  | 1.135     | 84.1      | 14.5      |
| 14  | 2     | 1.005  | 1.000     | 111.3     | 21.5      |
| 15  | 3     | 9.999  | 6.373     | 30.3      | 18.2      |
| 16  | 4     | 2.227  | 1.732     | 687.3     | 20.5      |
| 17  | 4     | 6.449  | 2.475     | 310.7     | 34.3      |
| 18  | 3     | 1817   | 1785      | 138.2     | 16.6      |
| 19  | 1     | 10.190 | 1.692     | 389.0     | 155.6     |
| 20  | 2     | 20.00  | 18.52     | 1211.2    | 81.0      |
| 21  | 1     | 0.990  | 1.000     | 144.3     | 27.4      |
| 22  | 3     | —      | 36339     | 2339.1    | 258.9     |
| 23  | 4     | 10.180 | 7.881     | 130.0     | 0.02      |
| 24  | 4     | 1.813  | 1.762     | 59.0      | 12.0      |
| 25  | 3     | —      | 60.338    | 725.1     | 0.02      |
| 26  | 1     | 0.990  | 0.999     | 122.7     | 29.0      |
| 27  | 3     | 1.598  | 1.589     | 56.2      | 10.4      |
| 28  | 4     | 10.02  | 3.027     | 49.0      | 46.1      |
| 29  | 2     | 1.228  | 1.188     | 113.9     | 6.3       |
| 30  | 5     | 6.935  | 6.721     | 83.9      | 6.1       |