

Targeted Mass Killing Dataset Codebook

Charles Butcher
Norwegian University of Science and Technology,
Benjamin E. Goldsmith
Australian National University,
Sascha Nanlohy
University of Sydney

November 30, 2019

Abstract

This codebook outlines the variables included in the replication materials for the article: Introducing the Targeted Mass Killing Dataset for the Study and Forecasting of Mass Atrocities.

1 Coding Guidelines

1.1 Sources to identify cases

UCDP One-sided violence / non-state violence (1989-) <http://www.pcr.uu.se/data/>
MEPV (1946-): CIVTOT <http://www.systemicpeace.org/inscrdata.html>
PITF (1955-): genocides and politicides <http://www.systemicpeace.org/inscrdata.html> SSMK State Sponsored Mass Killing
Mass Atrocity Endings - Documenting declines in civilian fatalities (1945-2017) <https://sites.tufts.edu/atrocityendings/>

1.2 Definition

Targeted mass killing is the direct killing of noncombatant members of a group by an organized armed force or collective with the intent of destroying the group, or intimidating the group by creating a perception of imminent threat to its survival. A targeted group is defined in terms of political and/or ethnic and/or religious identity.

1.3 Operationalization

Operationalizing TMK: There are three core aspects to our operationalization: (1) intent to destroy or intimidate a pre-existing group, (2) a (low) minimum death threshold, and (3) an ordinal ladder of the severity of targeted mass killing episodes. These can lead to categorical and ordinal variables. The goal of this project is to provide clear and reliable indicators to allow coding of various types and aspects of TMK, including genocide and politicide.

Intent is challenging to code. We decided to disaggregate intent into 5 items. When coding, each item must refer to the same collective actor (i.e., either to the government side or the rebel-group side). The first two items identify the targeting of lethal violence towards a group, the third identifies the motivation to destroy or intimidate, the fourth and fifth identify whether targeted mass killing was either a stated or institutionalized policy of the perpetrators, or both. This measure of intent should be combined with a measure of severity to create categorical and ordinal indicators.

- (1) Were civilians deliberately targeted?
- (2) Was one group disproportionately targeted?
- (3) Was there evidence that this group was targeted in order to substantially reduce its numbers, terrorise, expel, or affect the political activity of that specific group?
- (4)
 - a. Was there evidence of logistical or organizational plans for large-scale killing of the targeted group?
 - b. Was there evidence of government or rebel-group leaders stating the intention for large-scale killing of the targeted group?
- (5) Is the answer to both (4a) and (4b) yes?

In most cases, but depending on the desired variable, this coding ladder of intent should be treated as cumulative, in that the yes coding of a higher rung only counts if the lower rungs are also coded yes. For example, leaders statements of intent should not be coded as

the highest level unless there is also evidence of killing in order to destroy or intimidate a group.

1.4 TMK Threshold

At least 25 deaths during each year of the event, and intent categories 1, 2, and 3 satisfied for each year of the event would qualify a case as targeted mass killing. Many events in the dataset may only last 1 year (or less).

2 Coding template and annotated variable descriptions

The main TMK dataset at the level of TMK episode-years is found in the `tmk_events_release.csv` file.

2.1 Episode Actors and Details

2.1.1 `country`

Name of the country that was the primary location of the event.

2.1.2 `actor.name`

Name of the perpetrator actor.

2.1.3 `year`

Year of observation for the episode.

2.1.4 `event.name.description`

Short descriptive label of the event.

2.1.5 `tmk`

Was this event classified as a TMK episode [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.1.6 `tmk_id`

A unique ID for the TMK Episode.

2.1.7 `duration`

Duration counter for the TMK episode, years since the episode started.

2.1.8 `part.civ.war`

Was this episode part of a civil war [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.1.9 `civ.war.name`

If yes, what was the name of the civil war?

2.1.10 `part.int.war`

Was this episode part of an inter-state war [YES = 1 / NO = 0] ?

2.1.11 `int.war.name`

If yes, what was the name of the inter-state war?

2.1.12 is.government.actor

Was this perpetrator a government actor (1/0)?

2.1.13 is.non.gov.actor.connected.to.gov

Was this perpetrator a non-government actor that was connected to the state (i.e state militias) (1/0)?

2.1.14 primary.location

The primary location of the TMK episode.

2.1.15 pl.ccode

Correlates of War country code for the primary location.

2.1.16 pl.gwno

Gleditsch and Ward country code for the primary location.

2.1.17 secondary.location

Name of the secondary location of the episode.

2.1.18 tmk.st

Start date of the TMK episode

2.1.19 tmk.end

End date of the TMK episode

2.2 Intent and severity

2.2.1 intent.4.a.actor.org.pln

INTENT 4(a): Was there evidence of logistical or organizational plans for large-scale killing of the targeted group [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.2.2 intent.4.b.actor.stat.int

Was there evidence of government or rebel-group leaders stating the intention for large-scale killing of the targeted group [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.2.3 deaths.est

Best estimate of annual deaths in the episode-year.

2.2.4 deaths.est.crit

Reason that estimate is considered the best, including source

2.2.5 total.deaths

Best estimate of total deaths across the whole TMK episode.

2.2.6 tmk.ordinal

Ordinal scale of the TMK episode in that year. Based on the scale below.

Score	Intent	Total Deaths
1	NO Stated OR Organizational Intent	≥ 25 AND ≤ 999
2	NO Stated OR Organizational Intent	$\geq 1,000$
3	Stated OR Organizational Intent	≥ 25 AND ≤ 999
TMK GENOCIDE/POLITICIDE THRESHOLD		
4	Stated OR Organizational Intent	$\geq 1,000$
5	Stated AND Organizational Intent	≥ 25 AND ≤ 999
6	Stated AND Organizational Intent	$\geq 1,000$
7	Stated AND Organizational Intent	$\geq 10,000$
8	Stated AND Organizational Intent	$\geq 100,000$

Table 1: A TMK Ordinal Scale

2.2.7 genpol.ongoing

Was a TMK genocide/politicide episode ongoing in this year [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.2.8 genpol.onset

Was this year an onset year for a TMK genocide/politicide episode [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.3 Targeted groups

2.3.1 group1.name

The name of the primary targeted group

2.3.2 group1.best.fatalities.estimate

Best estimate for the number of fatalities suffered by this group

2.3.3 group1.tmk.eth

Was this group an ethnic group [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.3.4 group1.tmk.eth.nm

If yes, what was the name of this group?

2.3.5 group1.tmk.eth.id

If yes, what EPR group ID for this group?

2.3.6 group1.tmk.rel

Was this group a religious group [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.3.7 group1.tmk.rel.nm

If yes, what was the name of this group?

2.3.8 group1.tmk.rel.id

If yes, what EPR group ID for this religious group?

2.3.9 group1.tmk.pol

Was this group a political group (i.e a political party or dissident group) [YES = 1 / NO = 0]?

2.3.10 group1.tmk.pol.nm

If yes, what was the name of this group?

2.3.11 tmk.group1.size

Approximate size of the targeted group.

The preceding group level variables are repeated for up to five (5) targeted groups, from Group1 to Group5

2.4 TMK Episode End Details

2.4.1 tmk.end.type

Open text string describing the circumstances of the episode end.

2.4.2 tmk.end.type.military

The perpetrator (state or non-state) was defeated militarily 3 months before the episode end (or less than 3 months) by domestic or international forces. Perpetrator defeat should also be coded if the perpetrator is forcibly expelled from the territory of the target group or forced to stop targeting civilians by domestic or international military forces [YES = 1 / NO = 0].

2.4.3 `tmk.end.type.leader`

The leader of the perpetrator group loses power 3 months before the episode end. (or less than 3 months). Leadership changes on the government side can include coups, election losses, or popular uprisings (short of military defeat). Leadership removal for non-state actors can include, but is not limited to, assassinations or internal coups. We are only interested in the top leader for this variable (i.e the president or prime minister depending on the regime, or the official rebel group leader) [YES = 1 / NO = 0].

2.4.4 `tmk.end.type.peace`

A new peace agreement is signed within 3 months of the episode end (either 3 months before or 3 months after). The peace agreement must be signed between the perpetrator and representatives of the target group within three months of the signing (e.g the Dayton accords in Bosnia). Peace agreements should include measures to resolve the incompatibility in the conflict between the target and perpetrator group [YES = 1 / NO = 0].

2.4.5 `tmk.end.type.ceasefire`

A new cease fire is agreed to within 3 months of the episode end (either 3 months before or 3 months after). The cease fire must be agreed to by perpetrator and representatives of the target group in the last year of activity or within three months of the signing OR must specifically refer to the area where civilians are targeted in a TMK event. Cease fires usually aim to stop belligerents from using violence but do not include provisions for resolving the political incompatibilities associated with the conflict. If an episode ends with a cease fire and a peace agreement the peace agreement should take precedence in coding [YES = 1 / NO = 0].

2.4.6 `tmk.end.type.submission`

The targeted group ceases military activity in the case of a civil war or protest activities in the case of a popular uprising 3 months before the episode end (or less). In the case of rebel groups that represent the targeted population they cease activity in the UCDP database or in the case of major protest movements there is evidence that protest activities significantly declined. In the case rebel perpetrators they are able to overthrow the regime or expel the regime from the claimed/targeted area [YES = 1 / NO = 0].

2.4.7 `tmk.end.type.other.uncertain`

The end type was ambiguous or did not fit into the above categories.

2.5 Outside intervention

2.5.1 `mil.int`

Was there foreign military intervention related to the TMK episode in this episode-year?

Note: We define military intervention broadly to describe any foreign military involvement or intervention inclusive of foreign backed proxy or rebel forces e.g. Ugandan support of Rwandan Patriotic Front; Peacekeeping and Peace Enforcement missions e.g. AU/UNAMID

in Darfur or INTERFET in East Timor; Humanitarian Interventions e.g. NATO missions in Kosovo and Libya; or Military Interventions e.g. India into East Pakistan, Vietnam into Cambodia.]

2.5.2 mil.int.id

If yes, what was the name of the intervening entity?

2.5.3 mil.int.ccid

COW country code for the intervening entity.

2.5.4 Triggers for TMK starts

These variables contain summaries of qualitative information on triggering events for TMK episodes identified in the secondary literature. Note: Our definition of triggers is an event or chain of events that initiate a sharp escalation in atrocity violence. (Straus, 2015). Significant changes in the strategic environment include: military advances by insurgent organisations; coup or assassination attempts on heads of state or leading officials; assassinations of heads of state or leading officials. (Straus 2015) Takeovers of areas with hostile populations. Crackdown on protests are generally either: in response to a contested election result; in response to a social movement looking to unseat a government (Straus 2015). Symbolically significant violations include: killing or massacre of a group that is symbolically significant e.g. religious pilgrims or the destruction of places of significance e.g. burning of churches, temples, mosques (Straus 2015).

2.5.5 trig

Was there a triggering event? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.6 trig.strat.env

Was the triggering event a significant change in the strategic environment? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.7 trig.strat.env.nm

Trigger significant change in the strategic environment event name/description

2.5.8 trig.to.host.pop

Was the triggering event a takeover of areas with hostile populations? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.9 trig.to.host.pop.nm

Trigger takeover of areas with hostile populations event name/description

2.5.10 trig.crac.prot

Was the triggering event a crackdown on protests? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.11 trig.crac.prot.nm

Trigger crackdown on protests event name/description

2.5.12 trig.sym.sig.vio

Was the triggering event a symbolically significant violation? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.13 trig.sym.sig.vio.nm

Trigger symbolically significant violation event name/description

2.5.14 trig.other

Was the triggering event of an other type? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.15 trig.other.nm

Trigger other name/description

2.5.16 trig.inst.perp

Was the instigator of the trigger the perpetrator group? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.17 trig.inst.perp.nm

Trigger instigator perpetrator name

2.5.18 trig.inst.targ.grp

Was the instigator of the trigger the targeted group? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.19 trig.inst.targ.grp.nm

Trigger instigator targeted group name

2.5.20 trig.inst.oth

Was the instigator of the trigger an other actor? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.21 trig.inst.oth.nm

Trigger instigator other actor name

2.5.22 trig.inst.oth.con.gov

Was other actor connected to state/leader? [YES=1 NO=0]

2.5.23 trig.inst.oth.con.targ

Was other actor connected to targeted group?

3 TMK Annual Data

This section describes the variable in `tmk_annual_release.csv` used to create Figure 1 in the text.

3.0.1 `pl.ccode`

COW code for the primary location

3.0.2 `year`

Year of observation

3.0.3 `tmk.ongoing`

Number of ongoing TMK episodes in the country-year

3.0.4 `genpol.ongoing`

Number of ongoing TMK genocide/politicide episodes in the country-year

3.0.5 `tmk.onset`

Number of TMK onsets in the country-year

4 Dataframe with correlates of TMK onset

This section describes the variables in the `tmk_country_year.RData` file and in the main regression analyses.

4.0.1 `country_name`

Name of the primary location

4.0.2 `year`

Observation year

4.0.3 `sftgcode`

State Failure Task Force Country Code.

4.0.4 `ccode`

COW Country Code.

4.0.5 `mkl.start`

Onset of a state-led mass killing episode from (Ulfelder, 2013)

4.0.6 `tmk.onset.dum`

Dummy variable indicating the onset of a TMK episode.

4.0.7 `genpol.onset.dum`

Dummy variable indicating the onset of a TMK genocide/politicide episode.

4.0.8 `pitf.onset.dum`

Dummy variable indicating the onset of a Political Instability Task Force genocide/politicide episode, (Marshall, Gurr and Harff, 2017).

4.0.9 `tmk.onset.dum.gov`

Dummy variable indicating the onset of a TMK episode where a government actor was the perpetrator.

4.0.10 `tmk.onset.dum.ngov`

Dummy variable indicating the onset of a TMK episode where a non-government actor was the perpetrator.

4.0.11 `v2x_regime`

Regime type variable, sourced from the VDEM project (Coppedge et al., 2019).

4.0.12 e_migppc

GDP per capita, sourced from Bolt et al. (N.d.) and provided by the VDEM project (Coppedge et al., 2019).

4.0.13 intra

Number of ongoing intra-state conflicts (internal and internationalised intra-state conflicts) occurring on the territory of the state in the Uppsala Conflict Data Program (Pettersson and Eck, 2018).

4.0.14 inter

Number of ongoing inter-state conflicts occurring on the territory of the state in the Uppsala Conflict Data Program (Pettersson and Eck, 2018).

4.0.15 scoup1

Number of attempted and successful coups in the country-year from Marshall and Marshall (2017)

4.0.16 e_mipopula

Total population, sourced from the VDEM project (Coppedge et al., 2019).

4.0.17 x.spell.p

Cubic polynomials where x is the relevant onset variable (i.e tmk, mk, pitf) and p is the polynomial (i.e 2 = squared).

4.0.18 tmk.ongoing

Number of ongoing TMK episodes in the country-year

4.0.19 genpol.ongoing

Number of ongoing TMK genocide/politicide episodes in the country-year

4.0.20 tmk.onset

Number of TMK onsets in the country-year

4.0.21 mepv

Number of ongoing Major Episodes of Political Violence in the country-year (Marshall, 2017).

4.0.22 mk.ongoing

Number of ongoing State Sponsored Mass Killing episodes in the country-year (Ulfelder, 2013).

4.0.23 pitf.gp.ongoing.sum

Number of ongoing PITF Genocide and Politicide episodes in the country-year (Marshall, Gurr and Harff, 2017).

4.0.24 BGregion

Variable indicating the region that the episode occurred in.

4.0.25 pitf.match

Variable indicating whether the country year had ‘No Onset’, an onset that was only identified in the TMK (‘TMK Only’), only identified in the PITF (‘PITF Only’) or identified in both (‘TMK and PITF’).

References

- Bolt, Jutta, Robert Inklaar, Herman de Jong and Jan Luiten van Zanden. N.d. “Rebasing ‘Maddison’: New Income Comparisons and the Shape of Long-Run Economic Development.” . Forthcoming.
- Coppedge, Michael, John Gerring, Carl Henrik Knutsen, Staffan I. Lindberg, Svend-Erik Skaaning, Jan Teorell, David Altman, Michael Bernhard, M. Steven Fish, Agnes Cornell, Sirianne Dahlum, Haakon Gjerløw, Adam Glynn, Allen Hicken, Joshua Krusell, Anna Lührmann, Kyle L. Marquardt, Kelly McMann, Valeriya Mechkova, Juraj Medzihorsky, Moa Olin, Pamela Paxton, Daniel Pemstein, Josefine Pernes, Johannes Von Römer, Brigitte Seim, Rachel Sigman, Jeffrey Staton, Natalia Stepanova, Aksel Sundström, Eitan Tzelgov, Yi-Ting Wang, Tore Wig, Steven Wilson and Daniel Ziblatt. 2019. “V-Dem Country-Year Dataset 2019.”.
- Marshall, Monty G. 2017. “MAJOR EPISODES OF POLITICAL VIOLENCE (MEPV) AND CONFLICT REGIONS, 1946-2006.” *Center for Systemic Peace* p. 17.
URL: www.systemicpeace.org
- Marshall, Monty G and Donna Ramsey Marshall. 2017. “Coups d’Etat Events, 1946-2017.” *INSCR Codebook* p. 20.
- Marshall, Monty G., Ted Robert Gurr and Barbara Harff. 2017. *PITF - State Failure Problem Set: Internal Wars and Failures of Governance, 1955-2016*. Vienna, VA: Societal-Systems Research Inc.
- Pettersson, Therése and Kristine Eck. 2018. “Organized Violence, 1989–2017.” *Journal of Peace Research* 55(4):535–547.
- Straus, Scott. 2015. “Triggers of Mass Atrocities.” *Politics and Governance* 3(3):5–15.
- Ulfelder, Jay. 2013. A Multimodel Ensemble for Forecasting Onsets of State-Sponsored Mass Killing. SSRN Scholarly Paper ID 2303048 Social Science Research Network Rochester, NY: .
URL: <https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=2303048>