

# Comparison of Attack Chains: APT1 vs. APT29 Using MITRE ATT&CK Navigator By Pranith Jain

## Overview

This report examines the attack chains of two prominent Advanced Persistent Threat (APT) groups, APT1 and APT29, using the MITRE ATT&CK framework as a basis for comparison. APT1, attributed to a Chinese state-sponsored actor, is known for its widespread cyber-espionage activities across various industries. In contrast, APT29, linked to Russian intelligence, is renowned for its sophisticated and stealthy operations, particularly targeting governmental and diplomatic sectors.

By leveraging the MITRE ATT&CK Navigator, this report provides a detailed comparison of the tactics, techniques, and procedures (TTPs) utilized by these groups. The analysis highlights commonalities in their methodologies while underscoring the unique approaches each group employs to achieve their objectives. This comparison not only enhances our understanding of these specific threat actors but also offers insights into improving cybersecurity defenses against similar threats.

## 1. Introduction

Advanced Persistent Threats (APTs) are sophisticated, long-term cyber-espionage campaigns carried out by well-funded and highly skilled threat actors. Two of the most notable APT groups are APT1 and APT29. APT1, attributed to a Chinese state-sponsored group, is known for its extensive cyber espionage operations targeting a broad range of industries. On the other hand, APT29, believed to be associated with Russian intelligence, is recognized for its stealthy operations and focus on government and diplomatic entities.

## 2. Methodology

The comparison was conducted using the MITRE ATT&CK Navigator, a tool that allows users to create and visualize layers of TTPs used by various threat groups. The following steps were taken:

- 1. Layer Creation:** Created separate layers for APT1 and APT29, enabling a side-by-side comparison.
- 2. Data Collection:** Loaded the TTPs associated with APT1 and APT29 from the MITRE ATT&CK database into the Navigator.
- 3. Analysis:** Compared the layers to identify common and unique TTPs across different stages of the attack lifecycle.
- 4. Documentation:** Captured insights and visual evidence from the Navigator to include in this report.

## 3. Analysis

### **3.1 Initial Access**

- APT1: Frequently uses phishing attacks with malicious attachments or links to gain initial access. They also exploit vulnerabilities in web-facing applications.

- APT29: Also relies heavily on spear-phishing but is known for using more sophisticated social engineering techniques. Additionally, APT29 exploits supply chain compromises as part of their initial access.

Comparison: Both APT1 and APT29 use phishing as a primary method for initial access, though APT29 tends to employ more advanced techniques and also targets supply chains.

### **3.2 Execution**

- APT1: Commonly uses malware to execute code after gaining initial access, with tactics such as scheduled tasks and command-line interface (CLI) tools.

- APT29: Leverages various execution techniques, including the use of legitimate credentials to blend in with normal network traffic. They are also known for using customized malware.

Comparison: While both groups use malware and legitimate tools, APT29's approach is more nuanced, often attempting to remain under the radar by mimicking legitimate activities.

### **3.3 Persistence**

- APT1: Maintains persistence through the use of web shells, creating new user accounts, and utilizing backdoors.

- APT29: Uses stealthier methods such as maintaining legitimate remote access tools and embedding backdoors within legitimate software updates.

Comparison: APT1 often relies on creating artifacts that are easier to detect, whereas APT29 prioritizes stealth and evasion, making them harder to detect over long periods.

### **3.4 Privilege Escalation**

- APT1: Exploits known vulnerabilities in operating systems and software to escalate privileges.

- APT29: Similar in approach but often utilizes zero-day vulnerabilities to gain higher privileges without detection.

Comparison: APT29 has a more advanced arsenal for privilege escalation, often using sophisticated zero-day exploits.

### **3.5 Defense Evasion**

- APT1: Uses techniques such as file obfuscation and disabling security tools.
- APT29: Employs advanced evasion techniques, including process hollowing, fileless malware, and exploitation of trust relationships to avoid detection.

Comparison: APT29's defense evasion techniques are significantly more advanced and are designed to avoid detection for extended periods.

### **3.6 Command and Control (C2)**

- APT1: Uses compromised infrastructure for C2, often relying on HTTP/S, DNS, and custom protocols.
- APT29: Operates through encrypted channels and often uses multi-layered C2 infrastructures to obscure communications.

Comparison: APT29's C2 operations are more sophisticated, using encryption and multi-layered approaches to protect their command and control mechanisms from being intercepted.

### **3.7 Exfiltration**

- APT1: Typically exfiltrates data via compressed archives sent over HTTP/S or FTP.
- APT29: Employs more covert methods, including embedding exfiltrated data in legitimate network traffic or using encrypted communications.

Comparison: APT29's methods of exfiltration are more covert and harder to detect compared to APT1's more straightforward approach.


## **4. Conclusion**

The comparison between APT1 and APT29 reveals both commonalities and differences in their attack chains. While both groups employ similar tactics, such as phishing for initial access and using malware for execution, APT29 demonstrates a higher level of sophistication and stealth across the entire attack lifecycle. Their techniques for defense evasion, persistence, and C2 are particularly advanced, indicating a significant investment in avoiding detection and maintaining long-term access to compromised environments.

For organizations, understanding these differences is crucial for developing effective threat detection and response strategies. By focusing on the advanced techniques used by groups like APT29, security teams can better prepare for and mitigate the risks posed by these and similar threat actors.

## **5. Visual Representation**

**APT1:**

APT1				filters	platforms	score gradient					
					Windows, Linux, macOS	1  100					
Initial Access	Execution	Persistence	Privilege Escalation	Defense Evasion	Credential Access	Discovery	Lateral Movement	Collection	Command And Control	Exfiltration	Impact
11 items	34 items	62 items	32 items	69 items	23 items	23 items	18 items	13 items	22 items	9 items	16 items
Drive-by Compromise	AppletScript	bash profile and bashrc	Access Token Manipulation	Access Token Manipulation	Account Manipulation	Account Discovery	AppleScript	Audio Capture	Commonly Used Port	Automated Exfiltration	Account Access Removal
External Traffic Feeding	CMS/TP	Accessibility Features	Accessibility Features	Accessibility Features	Auth History	Application Windows	Application Windows	Application Windows	Connection Through	Data Destruction	
External Remote Services	Customized Line Interface	Account Manipulation	AppCert DLLs	BITS Jobs	Bruite Force	Browser Bookmarks	Browser Bookmarks	Clipboard Data	Connection Proxy	Data Encrypted	Data Encrypted for Impact
Hardware Additions	Compiled HTML File	Applet DLLs	Application Shimming	Browser User Account	Credential Dumping	Domain Trust Discovery	Domain Trust Discovery	Clipboard Information	Content Management	Data Transfer Size Limits	Defacement
Malicious Mailbox	Control Panel Items	Applet DLLs	Application Shimming	Credential from Win	Credentialed from Win	Log and Directory	Log and Directory	Data from Local System	Data from Local System	Endpoint Over Alternative	Disk Content Wipe
Searchphishing Attachment	Control Panel Items	Authentication Package	Applet DLLs	Credential in Files	Credentialed in Files	Network Service Scanning	Network Service Scanning	Data from Network Shared	Data from Network Shared	Endpoint Over Command	Disk Structure Wipe
Searchphishing Link	Dynamic Data Exchange	BITS Jobs	Dylib Hijacking	Credential in Registry	Credentialed in Registry	Network Service Discovery	Network Service Discovery	Data from Removable	Data from Removable	Endpoint Over Physical	Endpoint Denial of Service
Searchphishing via Service	Execution through API	BITS Jobs	Dylib Hijacking	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Firmware Corruption
Supply Chain Compromises	Execution through Module	Browser Extensions	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
Trusted Relationship	Execution through Module	Browser Extensions	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
Valid Accounts	Graphical User Interface	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Initial Mail	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Launch Mail	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Local Job Scheduling	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	LSASS Driver	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Main	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	PowerShell	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Regsvr32/Regasm	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Regsvr32	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Run/32	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Scheduled Task	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Scripting	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Service Execution	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Service Binary Proxy	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Service Script Proxy	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Source	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Space after Filename	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Third-party Software	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Trap	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Trusted Developer Utilities	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	User Execution	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Windows Management	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Windows Management	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	Windows Management	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery
	XSL Script Processing	Change Default File	Endpoint Hijacking with	Complete After Delivery	Complete After Delivery	Network Sniffing	Network Sniffing	Data Staged	Data Staged	Endpoint Over Physical	Initiate System Recovery

## APT29:



**APT1 + APT29**

**filters**

platforms: Windows, Linux, macOS

score gradient

[illegible]