

Abhilash

Day 2

UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को इस हाशिए में नहीं लिखना चाहिए।
Candidates must not write on this margin

Q.1 Discuss the process of creation and reorganization in India, highlighting the constitutional provisions and legislative steps involved. Compare India's approach with that of united states, focusing on linguistic and ethnic factors in shaping federalism. Analyse whether India's emphasis on these factors has strengthened national unity or promoted regionalism.
12+10+16

✓ Indian parliament has been authorised for creation and reorganization of states in India. ✓ Article 1-4 deals with creation or reorganization of states and union territories

Constitutional provisions

~~Article 1~~ - Union of States & Union territories

✓ ~~Article 2~~ - Change the area of a state
alter the boundary of a state
Change the name of state

~~Article 3~~ - Such incidental, consequential, supplementary



entire changes required to give effect.

Two conditions:-

"Recommendation"

(a) prior consent of President is required
as it is his duty to preserve, protect and
defend the constitution.

(b) State assembly is informed and its views
sought. However views are not binding.

Process

No constitutional amendment required. (Art 4)

- done by simple majority.

Example Union of States of Jharkhand,
Chhattisgarh and Bihar,
Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh.

India vs United States on State Reorganization

India

(a) State sovereignty is
not guaranteed
eg Union of Jharkhand
Bihar.

USA

State sovereignty is
guaranteed.
N10, States Union.

(b) State consent is not binding

State consent need to be taken and is binding.

(c) Irrevocable Union of distinctive States.

Irrevocable Union of distinctive States.

(d) No constitution and amendment required.

Constitution Amendment is required.

(e) Example of federation with centralising tendency.

Example of (6) federalism at its best.

(f) linguistic basis as criterion of new states.

no particular criteria mentioned / Geographic

Concept of Reorganisation of States on linguistic basis

Fazal Ali Commission (1953) allowed for linguistic basis. However, rejected one language one state formula. Key considerations:-

- unity and integrity of state
- promotes homogeneity and pluralism.
- Administrative efficiency.
- welfare of state and people.

Key arguments in support

(a) Pre - Independence

- Creation of Committees by Mahatma Gandhi on linguistic basis
- Nehru Report (1928) supportive

(b) Shows LIVING CHARACTER of INDIAN CONSTITUTION

(c) promotes FEDERALISM

(d) Creation of REGIONAL PARTIES & ASPIRATION

Key challenges:

Jarkaria Commission (1953) recognised key challenges.

(a) Sub-national ~~national~~ sentiment & secessionism

(b) economic backwardness.

(c) Regional disparity.

7.5

Suggested Reforms

Need for 2nd Administrative Reform Committee.

(a) LPG reforms have altered the POLITICO- ECONOMY Central

(b) Population explosion:



UPSC

Answer Questions in NOT MORE THAN the Word Limit specified for each in the Parenthesis.
(Specimen Answer Booklet - For Practice Purpose Only)

उम्मीदवारों को
इस हाशिए में
नहीं लिखना
चाहिए
Candidates
must not
write on this
margin

a) Uninhabited areas

cd) new reasons like economic backwardness
and cultural domination.

Politically and economically viable states
coupled with administrative efficiency is key to
reorganisation of states. However, ~~creation of~~
new and smaller states is no panacea for
GOOD and INCLUSIVE GOVERNANCE.

this part is
missing substance.

you need to show that how
in 75 years it has worked

Part in live discussion

19.5/38

