

CS60-454/554
Design and Analysis of Algorithms
Winter 2017

Assignment 1

Due Date: February 7 (before lecture)

1. The following algorithm takes $x, a_i, 0 \leq i \leq n$, as input and returns $\sum_{j=0}^n a_j x^j$ as output.

Algorithm Summation

Input: $x, a_i, 0 \leq i \leq n$;

Output: y ;

begin

$y := 0$;

for $i := n$ **step** -1 **downto** 0 **do**

$y := a_i + x * y$;

end.

- (i) Prove the correctness of the algorithm.

Lemma 1: At the end of the k th iteration of the **for** loop, $y = \sum_{j=1}^k x^{j-1} a_{n-(k-j)}$.

Proof: (By induction on k)

Induction basis:

Consider the first iteration (i.e. when $k = 1$).

Since y was initialized to 0 before execution entering the **for** loop and $i = n$,

$$\begin{aligned} y &= a_n + x * 0 = a_n = x^0 a_{n-0} = x^{1-1} a_{n-(1-1)} \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^1 x^{j-1} a_{n-(1-j)} \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^k x^{j-1} a_{n-(k-j)} \quad (\because k = 1) \end{aligned}$$

Induction hypothesis:

Suppose at the end of the $(k - 1)$ th iteration, $y = \sum_{j=1}^{k-1} x^{j-1} a_{n-((k-1)-j)}$

Induction step:

During the k th iteration, $i = n - (k - 1)$.

Therefore, $y := a_i + x * y$

$$\begin{aligned} \Rightarrow y &= a_{n-(k-1)} + x \left(\sum_{j=1}^{k-1} x^{j-1} a_{n-((k-1)-j)} \right) \quad (\text{by the induction hypothesis}) \\ &= a_{n-(k-1)} + \sum_{j=1}^{k-1} x^j a_{n-((k-1)-j)} \\ &= a_{n-(k-1)} + \sum_{1 \leq j \leq k-1} x^j a_{n-((k-1)-j)} \quad (\text{equivalent notation}) \\ &= a_{n-(k-1)} + \sum_{1+1 \leq j+1 \leq (k-1)+1} x^{(j+1)-1} a_{n-((k-1)-((j+1)-1))} \\ &= a_{n-(k-1)} + \sum_{2 \leq j \leq k} x^{j-1} a_{n-(k-j)} \quad (\text{Replace } j+1 \text{ with } j) \\ &= x^{1-1} a_{n-(k-1)} + \sum_{2 \leq j \leq k} x^{j-1} a_{n-(k-j)} \\ &= \sum_{1 \leq j \leq k} x^{j-1} a_{n-(k-j)} \end{aligned}$$

$$= \sum_{j=1}^k x^{j-1} a_{n-(k-j)} \quad \square$$

The **for** loop terminates its execution at the end of the $(n+1)$ th iteration.

$$\begin{aligned} \text{By Lemma 1, } y &= \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} x^{j-1} a_{n-((n+1)-j)} \\ &= \sum_{1 \leq j \leq n+1} x^{j-1} a_{j-1} \quad (\text{equivalent notation}) \\ &= \sum_{0 \leq j-1 \leq n} x^{j-1} a_{j-1} \\ &= \sum_{0 \leq j \leq n} x^j a_j \quad (\text{Replace } j-1 \text{ with } j) \\ &= \sum_{j=0}^n a_j x^j. \quad (\text{equivalent notation}) \end{aligned}$$

Hence, **Algorithm Summation** correctly returns $\sum_{j=0}^n a_j x^j$ as its output. \blacksquare

(ii) Analyze its time complexity.

The first assignment statement takes $O(1)$ time.

The **for** statement take $O(1)$ time.

Since $+$, $*$ and $:=$ each takes $O(1)$ time, the body of the **for** loop takes $O(1)$ time.

Since the **for** loop iterates $n+1$ times, therefore the **for** loop takes $(O(1)+O(1))*(n+1) = O(1) * (n+1) = O(n)$ time.

Algorithm Summation thus takes $O(1) + O(n) = O(n)$ time. \blacksquare

2. Prove that: $\lg n \in \Theta(\lg \lg(n!))$.

Solution:

$$\begin{aligned} \forall n \geq 4, \quad & 2^n \leq n! \leq n^n \\ \Rightarrow & \lg(2^n) \leq \lg(n!) \leq \lg(n^n) \\ \Rightarrow & \lg \lg(2^n) \leq \lg \lg(n!) \leq \lg \lg(n^n) \\ \Rightarrow & \lg n \leq \lg \lg(n!) \leq \lg(n \lg n) \quad (\because \lg(2^n) = n; \lg(n^n) = n \lg n) \\ \Rightarrow & \lg n \leq \lg \lg(n!) \leq \lg n + \lg \lg n \\ \Rightarrow & \lg n \leq \lg \lg(n!) \leq \lg n + \lg n \quad (n \geq 4) \\ \Rightarrow & \lg n \leq \lg \lg(n!) \leq 2 \lg n \end{aligned}$$

By letter $c_1 = 1, c_2 = 2, n_0 = 4$, we have:

$$\begin{aligned} & \exists c_1, c_2 > 0, n_0 \in \mathbf{N}, c_1 \lg n \leq \lg(\lg(n!)) \leq c_2 \lg n, \forall n \geq n_0 \\ \Rightarrow & \lg \lg(n!) \in \Theta(\lg n) \\ \Rightarrow & \lg n \in \Theta(\lg \lg(n!)). \quad (\text{Theorem 0.5(b)}) \quad \blacksquare \end{aligned}$$

3. Prove or disprove: Let $f, g : \mathbf{N} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^+ \cup \{0\}$ and $h : \mathbf{R}^+ \cup \{0\} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^+ \cup \{0\}$.

If $f(n) \in O(g(n))$, then $h(f(n)) \in O(h(g(n)))$.

Solution: false!

Disprove with a counterexample: let $f(n) = 2n, g(n) = n, h(n) = 2^n$.

Then $2n \leq 3n, \forall n \geq 1$

$$\begin{aligned} \Rightarrow & f(n) \leq 3g(n), \forall n \geq 1 \\ \Rightarrow & \exists c \in \mathbf{R}^+, \exists n_0 \in \mathbf{N}, f(n) \leq cg(n), \forall n \geq n_0 \quad (\text{note: } c = 3, n_0 = 1) \end{aligned}$$

$$\Rightarrow f(n) \in O(g(n)).$$

Moreover $h(f(n)) = 2^{2^n} = (2^2)^n = 4^n$ and $h(g(n)) = 2^n$.

Since $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2^n}{4^n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)^n = 0$,

by Theorem 0.2(d), $2^n \in o(4^n)$

$$\Rightarrow 2^n \in O(4^n) \wedge 2^n \notin \Theta(4^n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.1(c)})$$

$$\Rightarrow 2^n \in O(4^n) \wedge 2^n \notin O(4^n) \cap \Omega(4^n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.1(b)})$$

$$\Rightarrow 2^n \in O(4^n) \text{ and } \sim (2^n \in O(4^n) \wedge 2^n \in \Omega(4^n)) \quad (\text{Definition of } \cap)$$

$$\Rightarrow 2^n \in O(4^n) \text{ and } 2^n \notin O(4^n) \vee 2^n \notin \Omega(4^n) \quad (\text{E16, 60-231 Courseware})$$

$$\Rightarrow 2^n \in O(4^n) \text{ and } 2^n \in O(4^n) \Rightarrow 2^n \notin \Omega(4^n) \quad (\text{E18, 60-231 Courseware})$$

$$\Rightarrow 2^n \notin \Omega(4^n) \quad (\text{I3, 60-231 Courseware})$$

$$\Rightarrow 4^n \notin O(2^n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.1(a)})$$

$$\Rightarrow h(f(n)) \notin O(h(g(n))). \quad \blacksquare$$

4. Rank the following functions by order of growth; that is, find an ordering g_1, g_2, \dots, g_8 of the functions satisfying $g_1 = o(g_2), g_2 = o(g_3), \dots, g_7 = o(g_8)$. Partition your lists into equivalences classes such that functions $f(n)$ and $g(n)$ are in the same class if and only if $f(n) = \Theta(g(n))$.

$$10^{100}, \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2 + 2}{3k^3 + 2k^2 + 1}, \lg n, 10^{\lg \lg n}, 2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}, 4^{\lg n}, n^{\lg n}, 2^n$$

Solution:

The functions in ascending order of rate of growth is as follows:

$$10^{100}, \lg n, \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2 + 2}{3k^3 + 2k^2 + 1}, 10^{\lg \lg n}, 2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}, 4^{\lg n}, n^{\lg n}, 2^n$$

(i) $10^{100} \in o(\lg n)$:

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{10^{100}}{\lg n} = 10^{100} \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\lg n} = 10^{100} \cdot 0 = 0.$$

By Theorem 0.2(d), $10^{100} \in o(\lg n)$. \square

(ii) $\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2 + 2}{3k^3 + 2k^2 + 1} \in \Theta(\lg n)$:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2 + 2}{3k^3 + 2k^2 + 1} &\geq \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2}{3k^3 + 2k^2 + k^3} = \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2}{6k^3} = \frac{1}{6} \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{k} \\ \Rightarrow \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2}{3k^3 + 2k^2 + k^3} &\geq \frac{1}{6} (\ln n + \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} + o(\frac{1}{n})) \quad (\because \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{k} = \ln n + \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} + o(\frac{1}{n})) \\ &\geq \frac{1}{6} \ln n \\ &= \frac{1}{6} \frac{\lg n}{\lg e} \\ &= \frac{1}{6 \lg e} \lg n, \forall n \geq 1. \dots \quad (\text{A}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2 + 2}{3k^3 + 2k^2 + 1} \leq \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2 + 2k^2}{3k^3} = \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{3k^2}{3k^3} = \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{k}$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2+2}{3k^3+2k^2+1} \leq \ln n + \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} + o\left(\frac{1}{n}\right). \dots \text{ (I)}$$

$$\text{Since } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\gamma + \frac{1}{2n}}{\ln n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\gamma}{\ln n} + \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2n \ln n} = 0 + 0 = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} \in O(\ln n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.2(a)})$$

$$\Rightarrow \exists c' > 0, \exists n' \in \mathbf{N}, \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} \leq c' \ln n, \forall n \geq n' \quad (\text{Definition of } O) \quad \dots \text{ (II)}$$

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\frac{1}{n}}{\ln n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n \ln n} = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{1}{n} \in O(\ln n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.2(a)}) \quad \dots \text{ (III)}$$

$$\forall g(n), g(n) \in o\left(\frac{1}{n}\right)$$

$$\Rightarrow g(n) \in O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \wedge g(n) \notin \Theta\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.1(c)})$$

$$\Rightarrow g(n) \in O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \quad (\text{I2; 60-231 Courseware}) \quad \dots \text{ (IV)}$$

$$\Rightarrow g(n) \in O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \wedge \frac{1}{n} \in O(\ln n) \quad ((\text{IV}), (\text{III}), \text{I6; 60-231 Courseware})$$

$$\Rightarrow g(n) \in O(\ln n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.3(c)})$$

$$\Rightarrow \exists c'' > 0, \exists n'' \in \mathbf{N}, g(n) \leq c'' \ln n, \forall n \geq n'' \quad (\text{Definition of } O) \quad \dots \text{ (V)}$$

Therefore, $\forall g(n) \in o\left(\frac{1}{n}\right)$,

$$\ln n + \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} + g(n)$$

$$\leq \ln n + c' \ln n + c'' \ln n, \forall n \geq \max\{n', n''\} \quad (\text{by (II), (V)})$$

$$= (1 + c' + c'') \ln n, \forall n \geq \max\{n', n''\}$$

$$\Rightarrow \ln n + \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} + o\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \leq (1 + c' + c'') \ln n, \forall n \geq \max\{n', n''\} \quad \dots \text{ (VI)}$$

$$\text{Hence, } \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2+2}{3k^3+2k^2+1} \leq \ln n + \gamma + \frac{1}{2n} + o\left(\frac{1}{n}\right)$$

$$\leq (1 + c' + c'') \ln n, \forall n \geq \max\{n', n''\} \quad (\text{by (VI)})$$

$$= \frac{(1+c'+c'')}{\lg e} \lg n, \forall n \geq \max\{n', n''\} \quad \dots \text{ (B)}$$

From (A) and (B), we have:

$$\frac{1}{6 \lg e} \lg n \leq \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2}{3k^3+2k^2+k^3} \leq \frac{(1+c'+c'')}{\lg e} \lg n, \forall n \geq \max\{1, n', n''\}$$

$$\Rightarrow \exists c_1, c_2 > 0, \exists n_0 \in \mathbf{N}, c_1 \lg n \leq \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2}{3k^3+2k^2+k^3} \leq c_2 \lg n, \forall n \geq n_0$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{k^2}{3k^3+2k^2+k^3} \in \Theta(\lg n) \quad (\text{Definition of } \Theta). \quad \square$$

(iii) $\lg n \in o(10^{\lg \lg n})$:

$$10^{\lg \lg n} = (\lg n)^{\lg 10} \quad (a^{\log_b c} = c^{\log_b a})$$

$$= \lg^{3+\varepsilon} n \quad (\lg 10 = 3 + \varepsilon, \text{ for some } \varepsilon, 0 < \varepsilon < 1).$$

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\lg n}{10^{\lg \lg n}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\lg n}{\lg^{3+\varepsilon} n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\lg^{2+\varepsilon} n} = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \lg n \in o(10^{\lg \lg n}). \quad (\text{Theorem 0.4(d)}) \quad \square$$

(iv) $10^{\lg \lg n} \in o(2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}})$:

$$10^{\lg \lg n} = 2^{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)} = 2^{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}$$

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{10^{\lg \lg n}}{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2^{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}}{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}}$$

$$= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n} - (\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}}$$

$$= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n} (1 - \frac{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}})}}.$$

$$\text{Since } \frac{d}{dn} (\lg 10 \lg \lg n) = (\lg 10) \lg e \frac{1}{\lg n} \lg e \frac{1}{n} = (\lg 10) \lg^2 e \frac{1}{n \lg n}$$

$$\frac{d}{dn} (\sqrt{2 \lg n}) = \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}} 2 \lg e \frac{1}{n} = \frac{\lg e}{n \sqrt{2 \lg n}}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{(\lg 10) \lg^2 e \frac{1}{n \lg n}}{\frac{\lg e}{n \sqrt{2 \lg n}}} \quad (\text{L'Hôpital's rule}) \\
&= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\sqrt{2}(\lg 10) \lg e}{\sqrt{\lg n}} \\
&= \sqrt{2}(\lg 10) \lg e \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\sqrt{\lg n}} \\
&= 0. \dots (\text{I})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Therefore } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sqrt{2 \lg n} \left(1 - \frac{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right) &= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sqrt{2 \lg n}) \left(1 - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right) \quad (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} AB = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} A \cdot \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} B) \\
&= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sqrt{2 \lg n})(1 - 0) \quad (\text{by (I)}) \\
&= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sqrt{2 \lg n} \\
&= \infty \dots (\text{II}) \\
\Rightarrow \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n} \left(1 - \frac{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right)} &= 2^{\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sqrt{2 \lg n} \left(1 - \frac{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right)} \quad (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2^{f(n)} = 2^{\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(n)}) \\
&= \infty. \quad (\text{by (II)})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Hence, } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{10^{\lg \lg n}}{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n} \left(1 - \frac{(\lg 10)(\lg \lg n)}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right)}} = \frac{1}{\infty} = 0.$$

By Theorem 0.4(d), $10^{\lg \lg n} \in o(2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}})$. \square

(v) $\underline{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}} \in o(4^{\lg n})}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Since } 4^{\lg n} &= (2^2)^{\lg n} = 2^{2 \lg n}, \\
\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}}{4^{\lg n}} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}}{2^{2 \lg n}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{2 \lg n - \sqrt{2 \lg n}}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{2 \lg n \left(1 - \frac{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}{2 \lg n}\right)}} \\
&= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{2 \lg n \left(1 - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right)}} \\
\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2 \lg n \left(1 - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right) &= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2 \lg n) \left(\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \left(1 - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right)\right) \\
&= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2 \lg n) \left(1 - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right) \\
&= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2 \lg n) (1 - 0) \\
&= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2 \lg n) \\
&= \infty.
\end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Hence, } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}}{4^{\lg n}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{2 \lg n \left(1 - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2 \lg n}}\right)}} = \frac{1}{\infty} = 0.$$

By Theorem 0.4(d), $2^{\sqrt{2 \lg n}} \in o(4^{\lg n})$. \square

(vi) $\underline{4^{\lg n} \in o(n^{\lg n})}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{4^{\lg n}}{n^{\lg n}} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^{\lg 4}}{n^{\lg n}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^2}{n^{\lg n}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n^{\lg n - 2}} = 0. \\
\text{By Theorem 0.4(d), } 4^{\lg n} &\in o(n^{\lg n}). \quad \square
\end{aligned}$$

(vii) $\underline{n^{\lg n} \in o(2^n)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
n^{\lg n} &= 2^{\lg n^{\lg n}} = 2^{\lg n \lg n} = 2^{\lg^2 n}. \dots (\text{I}) \\
\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^{\lg n}}{2^n} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2^{\lg^2 n}}{2^n} \quad (\text{by (I)}) \\
&= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{n - \lg^2 n}} \\
&= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{n \left(1 - \frac{\lg^2 n}{n}\right)}} \dots (\text{II})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Since } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} n \left(1 - \frac{\lg^2 n}{n}\right) &= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} n) \left(\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 1 - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\lg^2 n}{n}\right) \\
&= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} n) \left(1 - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2 \lg e \lg n}{n}\right) \quad (\text{L'Hôpital's rule})
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} n)(1 - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2 \lg^2 e}{n}) \quad (\text{L'Hôpital's rule}) \\
&= (\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} n)(1 - 0) \\
&= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} n \\
&= \infty
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Hence, } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^{\lg n}}{2^n} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2^{n(1 - \frac{\lg^2 n}{n})}} \quad (\text{by (II)}) \\
&= \frac{1}{\infty} \\
&= 0
\end{aligned}$$

$$\Rightarrow n^{\lg n} \in o(2^n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.4(d)}) \quad \blacksquare$$

5. Solve the following recurrences:

$$(a) \quad T(n) = 9T\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) + n^2 \lg n + 2n$$

$$(b) \quad T(n) = 3T\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) + \sqrt{n}$$

$$(c) \quad T(n) = 8T\left(\frac{n}{4}\right) + n^2 \lg^2 n$$

Solution:

$$(a) \quad T(n) = 9T\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) + n^2 \lg n + 2n$$

$$a = 9, b = 3 \Rightarrow \log_b a = \log_3 9 = 2.$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Since } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^2 \lg n + 2n}{n^2 \lg n} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^2 \lg n}{n^2 \lg n} + \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2n}{n^2 \lg n} \\
&= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 1 + 2 \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n \lg n} \\
&= 1 + 2 \cdot 0 \\
&= 1,
\end{aligned}$$

$$n^2 \lg n + 2n \in \Theta(n^2 \lg n) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.2(c)})$$

$$\Rightarrow f(n) = \Theta(n^2 \lg n) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a} \lg^k n), \text{ where } k = 1.$$

$$\text{By Case 2, } T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a} \lg^{k+1} n) = \Theta(n^2 \lg^2 n). \quad \square$$

$$(b) \quad T(n) = 3T\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) + \sqrt{n}$$

$$a = 3, b = 3 \Rightarrow \log_b a = \log_3 3 = 1.$$

$$\sqrt{n} = n^{\frac{1}{2}} = O(n^{\frac{1}{2}}) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.3(a)})$$

$$= O(n^{1-\frac{1}{2}})$$

$$= O(n^{\log_b a - \varepsilon}), \text{ where } \varepsilon = \frac{1}{2} > 0.$$

$$\text{By Case 1, } T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a}) = \Theta(n^1) = \Theta(n). \quad \square$$

$$(c) \quad T(n) = 8T\left(\frac{n}{4}\right) + n^2 \lg^2 n$$

$$a = 8, b = 4 \Rightarrow \log_b a = \log_4 8.$$

$$\text{since } 1 < \log_4 8 < 2, \log_4 8 + \varepsilon = 2, \text{ for some } \varepsilon > 0.$$

$$\text{It follows that } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^2 \lg^2 n}{n^{\log_4 8}} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} n^\varepsilon \lg^2 n = \infty$$

$$\Rightarrow n^2 \lg^2 n = \Omega(n^{\log_4 8}). \quad (\text{Theorem 0.2(b)})$$

$$\text{Moreover, } af\left(\frac{n}{b}\right) = 8\left(\frac{n}{4}\right)^2 \lg^2\left(\frac{n}{4}\right) = \frac{1}{2}n^2(\lg n - 2)^2$$

$$= \frac{1}{2}n^2(\lg^2 n - (4 \lg n - 4)).$$

$$\leq \frac{1}{2}n^2 \lg^2 n, \text{ for } \underline{n \geq 2}$$

$$\Rightarrow af\left(\frac{n}{b}\right) \leq cf(n), \text{ for some } c, 0 < c < 1 \text{ and } n \geq 2.$$

$$\text{By Case 3, } T(n) = \Theta(f(n)) = \Theta(n^2 \lg^2 n). \quad \blacksquare$$

6. Solve the recurrence: $T(n) = T(\frac{n}{2} + 7) + n^2$.

Solution: The given recurrence is similar to $T(n) = T(\frac{n}{2}) + n^2$.

Since $a = 1, b = 2$, and $\log_b a = \log_2 1 = 0$.

Then,

$$\begin{aligned} f(n) = n^2 &= \Omega(n^2) \quad (\text{Theorem 0.3(d)}) \\ &= \Omega(n^{0+2}) \\ &= \Omega(n^{\log_b a + \varepsilon}) \quad (\because \log_b a = 0 \text{ and } \varepsilon = 2(> 0)) \end{aligned}$$

Moreover, $af(\frac{n}{b}) = (\frac{n}{2})^2 = \frac{1}{4}n^2 \leq cn^2 = cf(n)$, for some $0 < c < 1$ and $\forall n \geq 1$.

By Case 3, $T(n) = \Theta(f(n)) = \Theta(n^2)$.

To verify that $T(n) = O(n^2)$, we apply induction on n .

Induction hypothesis: Suppose $T(k) \leq ck^2, \forall k < n$, for some $c > 0$.

Induction Step: When $\underline{n > 14}$, $\frac{n}{2} > 7 \Rightarrow \frac{n}{2} + 7 < \frac{n}{2} + \frac{n}{2} = n$.

It follows that

$$\begin{aligned} T(n) &= T(\frac{n}{2} + 7) + n^2 \\ &\leq c(\frac{n}{2} + 7)^2 + n^2 && (\text{Induction hypothesis}) \\ &= c(\frac{n^2}{4} + 7n + 49) + n^2 \\ &= \frac{c}{4}n^2 + (7cn + 49c + n^2) \\ &= cn^2 - \frac{3c}{4}n^2 + (7cn + 49c + n^2) \\ &= cn^2 - (\frac{c}{4}n^2 + \frac{c}{2}n^2) + (7cn + 49c + n^2) \\ &= cn^2 - (\frac{c}{4}n^2 - n^2) - \frac{c}{2}n^2 + (7cn + 49c) && ((\frac{c}{4}n^2 - n^2) \geq 0, \text{ for } \underline{c \geq 4}) \\ &\leq cn^2 - \frac{c}{2}n^2 + (7cn + 49c) && (49c \leq 7cn, \text{ when } \underline{n \geq 7}) \\ &\leq cn^2 - \frac{c}{2}n^2 + 14cn \\ &\leq cn^2 - (\frac{c}{2}n^2 - 14cn) \\ &\leq cn^2 && ((\frac{c}{2}n^2 - 14cn) \geq 0, \text{ when } \underline{n \geq 28}) \end{aligned}$$

Hence, for any $c \geq 4$ and $n_0 = \max\{14, 7, 28\} = 28$, $T(n) \leq cn^2, \forall n \geq n_0$.

Induction basis: Let $c' = \max\{\frac{T(n)}{n^2} | 21 \leq n \leq 27\}$.

Then, $T(n) \leq c'n^2, 21 \leq n \leq 27$.

By letting $C = \max\{c', c\}$ and $n_0 = 21$, we have: $\exists C > 0, \exists n_0 \in \mathbf{N}, T(n) \leq Cn^2, \forall n \geq n_0$.

Hence, $T(n) = O(n^2)$. ■