



- Articles Review

Tourism and Prostitution

"Tourism and Prostitution," a special issue of *ISIS: International Bulletin*. International Feminist Network (Via della Pelliccia 31, 00153, Rome, Italy) 1979, No. 13, 40 pp. (line drawings, map), n.p. [English].

"Prostitution Tourism," a special issue of *Asian Women's Liberation*. Asian Women's Association (Poste Restante, Shibuya Post Office, Shibuya, Tokyo, Japan 150) June 1980, No. 3, 34 pp. (map, tables, photographs), \$3.50 [English].

Nelson H. H. Graburn

Department of Anthropology
University of California, Berkeley, USA

Both these special issues of two international feminist journals bring attention to a very important and somewhat neglected topic; the relationship between tourism and prostitution, particularly in Third World countries. Both contain original and reprinted materials with a common point of view and both tend to concentrate their case studies on east and southeast Asia. However, *ISIS* has a larger scope by paying attention to the activities of European as well as Asian men in Asia, whereas the other is limited mainly to accounts of Japanese nationals. An outline of the major arguments and data in these two journals will be followed by the reviewer's assessment and criticism.

The basic thesis of these publications is that women are forced into prostitution (1) because of the widespread and the deeply rooted patriarchal

The purpose of this department is to publish reviews or abstracts of recent publications in or related to the study of tourism. The abstracts in "Publication Notes" are of articles, pamphlets or books—full-length studies, edited volumes, proceedings, theses, bibliographies, directories, and the like. The appearance of an abstract here does not preclude full review in a future issue. Individuals interested in submitting reviews should write directly to the Chief Editor for Publications In Review, Arie Reichel (Dept. of Management, New York University, 40 West 4th St., New York, NY 10003, USA. Unsolicited reviews will not be accepted. When price or date of a publication was not listed, np (no price) or nd (no date) is used at the end of a citation.

attitude toward sexuality which casts women in the role of either "madonna/virgin" or "whore." [The data show that both the foreign tourist men and the local men, including fathers and other authority figures, see women in the same way]; (2) women who have violated certain norms are cut off from other employment (or marriage), for instance, after having been seduced, raped, or left by their boyfriends or husbands, they have to join the ranks of the "tainted" un(der)employed; (3) there is a crisis in the agricultural and cottage industries of Third World countries due to capitalist penetration, ecological degradation, and population increase, such that employment is to be sought in the urban sector; and (4) that women are discriminated against in industrial and business employment so that they get the worst paying, most unhealthy jobs, if any. Thus, young, uneducated, poor women of Third World countries are forced, trapped, or willingly enter into various forms of prostitution, particularly in those areas which cater to the apparently wealthy foreigners such as tourists and military "R & R" (rest and recreation) posts.

A second part of the analysis concerns the larger context. The Japanese journal specifically sets out to demonstrate the thesis espoused by Nash (1977:33-48) that tourism is a form of imperialism. A full page map shows the past and present extent of the "Great Asian Co-Prosperity Sphere" by comparing the previous and short-lived military expansion of Japan with the present and more secure economic and tourist expansion into many of the same areas. Though prostitution tourism—defined as tourism whose main or major motivation is to consummate commercial sexual liaisons—is the primary target of these papers, tourism itself, and the associated capitalist (imperialist) system are not left unscathed:

Mass tourism is no longer considered a blessing for Third World countries. It brings in less income than expected and the population is not better off for it. The tourists lay siege to scarce resources . . . but little of the money ends up in the country . . . making the rich richer and the poor poorer. Moreover, tourism brings economic growth without development (ISIS p. 11).

It is asserted that it is not the women themselves who benefit financially from prostitution tourism, but the tourist agencies, hotels, tour operators, pimps, police and government officials, as well as the airlines and foreign travel agencies.

ISIS is more cautious than optimistic about the campaign against prostitution tourism, warning that "prostitution will not end until the social structures [patriarchy/capitalism] that surround it end" (p. 5). ISIS also warns other women not to despise prostitutes, asserting that all women are forced by the patriarchal systems in which they live to "sell themselves to men" in various ways, by taking menial or secretarial jobs ("doing their typing and other shit-work") and by marriage ("a contract to sell her sexual and other services to an individual man, in exchange for security and/or protection from other men") (ISIS p. 5).

The national case studies are not a random sample of all tourist-receiving nations nor of all Third World countries. They concentrate on Asia, particularly on Korea, Thailand, the Philippines, Taiwan, and Japan itself. Most articles are based both on official and semi-official data about tourism, economic relationships, and prostitution, and on personal visits by male and female investigators, including case studies, interviews with women and with male officials. These data are convincing enough to reveal major problems of exploitation and to indicate the urgent need for further research towards the amelioration of these situations.

Korea has become famous for its *Kisaeng* tourism which draws hundreds of thousands of Japanese men every year. *Kisaeng* used to be equivalent to the Japanese *geisha*, accomplished female entertainers and companions, but by now it has become a synonym for prostitute. These women are introduced to men in hotels as a part of package tours, as "enterprise rewards" to functionaries of small and middle sized companies, and by travel agencies, taxi drivers, and bell boys, and cost about one-quarter of the price for similar services in Japan. They are licensed by the Korean government which sees the need to perpetuate South Korea's image as a "Male Paradise" in its drive for foreign exchange. As one official said "Without *Kisaeng*, the number of Japanese tourists would drop drastically." Yet the situation is particularly bitter in light of the long rivalry between Korea and Japan, Japan's feeling of superiority stemming from forty years of colonialism and Japan's treatment of Koreans (including the mass importation of prostitutes) before and during World War II. Protests have been raised by women on both sides: in Korea, women have demonstrated against such tourism in which "Our young women are sacrificed in the process [for the sake of Yen]." In Japan, Christian and feminist women have demonstrated over the years at airports and at the large travel agencies. Some Japanese men tell their wives that they are going on a golfing vacation, then leave their clubs in lockers at Narita, Haneda, or Osaka airports. Recent pressure from Japanese labor unions and feminists and from neighboring countries has brought stricter government supervision of the travel agencies advertising these trips, with a reported reduction in their volume (Giaralli 1981).

Thailand is subject to visits by hundreds of thousands of Japanese and European men, in search of both sex and wives. Since 1960 prostitution has not been legal, but there are said to be over 100,000 prostitutes in Bangkok, 70% of whom have V.D. The government is alleged to give tacit support to prostitution as part of its tourist image. ISIS recounts indepth reports, particularly of German and Dutch men and their travel agents, such as ERO-tours. Thai women classify white men as "Amelikans" and "Neckelmans" (the latter brought in by the huge German travel agency). Some Europeans pay over \$5,000 for a trip to buy a "wife" (who dreams of the "soft" life of Europe, as opposed to her poverty-stricken rural Thai background). The good looking ones may get a husband, but suffer back in Germany from loneliness and lack of communication, or they may be forced into prostitution in Europe. One scheme even pays German homosexuals to marry Thai women and bring them back in return for a large fee from a

pimp. Many wierd and horrible schemes are described for Bangkok as well as other Asian locations.

The Philippines too has its licensed "hospitality girls" who are drawn or forced to the American R & R bases at Subic Bay and Olongapo, as well as to Manila. With a general unemployment rate of 25%, Philippine women have little choice unless they get married in the countryside; many end up as domestics or prostitutes in Europe. Japanese in increasing numbers frequent parts of the Philippines where they were formerly conquerors 40 years ago. Taiwan also has licensed prostitution such as in Peitou, as part of its tourism/foreign exchange drive (Taiwan was also a former colony of Japan), yet, since Japan's recognition of Communist China, the flow of men has diminished. In spite of this, conditions are horrible enough for one (brave) Taiwanese travel agent to protest by publishing a "public opinion advertisement" in Japanese travel trade journals. "Dear Travel Agents of Japan: Do you know the word 'Shame'? . . . Your money . . . is squeezed out of women who sell their bodies to Japanese tourists." The advertisement was soon discontinued, owing to pressure from other advertisers. Minor but illuminating accounts from Indonesia, Hong Kong, Singapore, and other countries demonstrate some of these same patterns of tourism prostitution.

Asia Women's Liberation has additional provocative articles about the history of sexuality and male dominance in Japan and Okinawa. Both journals recount that prior to and during World War II, the Japanese used to export their own prostitutes *karayuki san* to their colonies (as portrayed in the brilliant movie *Sadankan 8*), whereas, particularly since the prohibition of legal prostitution in Japan in 1958, poor women from these same countries are now imported to Japan as prostitutes. ISIS tells a somewhat similar story of the importation of poor Third World women to Germany as prostitutes. ISIS also contains a section entitled "Resources," an annotated bibliography of important sources on tourism and prostitution.

One may criticize these journals for some minor inconsistencies of fact and, perhaps, for their neglect of other countries where tourism and prostitution seem to go hand in hand, such as parts of Latin America, East and West Africa, Europe, the Mediterranean, the Middle East and Ceylon. One may also add that, expectedly they fail to report on male prostitution for male tourists (in San Francisco, parts of Southeast Asia, and other places) or for female tourists (such as in the Caribbean, as illustrated in the film *Welcome to Paradise*, and parts of Africa and the Mediterranean). Yet one must also admit that most of these cases would respond to the same analysis of power and poverty as responsible for forcing young people of both sexes into prostitution.

A major question is the assessment of the vailidity of the case studies presented in these journals, quite apart from their ideological arguments. Fortunately, Cohen's (1982) recent article "Thai Girls and Farang Men: The Edge of Ambiguity" provides one such in-depth study carried out by a highly respected social scientist who is presumably free of the bitter, radical propaganda that some readers see in the two journals under review. Cohen's detailed account of the various types of prostitution available to tourists and

foreigners in Bangkok and this reviewer's inquiries of middle- and upper-class Thai informants agree almost entirely with the facts and point of view presented in the feminist journals, facts which counteract some of the arguments about the economically beneficial nature of tourism and the supposed lack of moral stigma about prostitution in Third World countries. Cohen's data demonstrate that although prostitution is a lucrative occupation for poor Thai women, it does not bring longterm economic security for them and their families, and the women's careers are frequently punctuated with severe psychological depression, involvement in drugs and crime, or worse. Middle- and upper-class Thai informants, men and women alike, even including those who have been involved in social service agencies catering to the poor in Bangkok, express attitudes consonant with the accusations in the two journals under review: that the upper classes perceive that lower-class women are naturally promiscuous and enjoy prostitution, and that they and their families benefit from it economically. This confirming evidence lends credibility to the other reported cases which should spur one to conduct further indepth research concerning these problems.

Some critics have claimed that "Tourism is prostitution," in the metaphorical sense that poor countries are forced to "sell themselves" to the rich in order to make a living. One may pursue the analogy, in the light of the "patriarchy/imperialism" analysis, and note the resemblances for Third World countries.:

1. Poor countries have few alternatives to tourist industries in order to earn foreign exchange from the political and economic powers to whom they are increasingly beholden.
2. As host nations, they may have little to sell but their "beauty" which is often desecrated by (sacrificed to) mass tourism. The men of such countries are forced into the role of pimps.
3. At a psychological level these nations are forced into the "female" role of servitude, of being "penetrated" for money, often against their will; whereas the outgoing, pleasure seeking, "penetrating" tourists of powerful nations are cast in the "male" role.
4. This analysis parallels that of imperialist expansion and warfare, by which nations express or sustain their "maleness." The case studies in these journals and elsewhere (cf. Cohen 1982:425-28) demonstrate the close connection between war, prostitution, and tourism, in such places as Korea, Taiwan, Indonesia, the Philippines, Viet Nam and Japan.

Such an analysis is supported by the cogent work of Haring (1956) concerning the expression and later loss of "maleness" by Japan during and after World War II and may explain the cases of Germany and Japan, both of which were defeated in World War II, resurrected their economies, and banned internal prostitution in the 1950 s. Although domestic prostitution still exists *sub-rosa*, they openly visit their "maleness" on the (women of) poorer "female" countries. The analysis could be extended to include the United States' loss of the Viet Nam War and to other European nations

which have lost their colonial empires but seek to retain and demonstrate their dominance in other ways.

It could be argued that the authors of these journals are particularly biased by neglecting male prostitution and by not reporting and analyzing the presence of prostitution in all tourist resorts, including those such as Atlantic City, Las Vegas, Brighton, or Nice within the metropolitan first world. The loosening of moral rules and the excessive behavior characteristic of most tourism are aspects of tourism as a ritual of reversal (Graburn 1977, 1983; Gottlieb 1982; Cohen 1979), many of which have been investigated elsewhere. Prostitution in tourist resorts is the subject of a few studies but the phenomenon of prostitution tourism in the Third World is particularly crucial because of the economic power differential between the buyer and the seller. Furthermore there is a direct analogy between prostitution in the Third World and that in the metropolitan resort centers where the prostitutes are disproportionately drawn from disadvantaged sections of the population who may have similar economic problems illuminating forms of "internal colonialism" commonly found in stratified, industrial societies.

The connection between certain kinds of tourism and sexual "freedom" needs further examination. Clement (1980) claims that such institutions as the Club Méditerranée provide "Un jardin d'enfants pour adultes consentants," allowing a regression to infantile polymorphous and irresponsible gratifications from those least able to arouse their guilt.

Although these journals are not written by professional researchers and may not be available in most university libraries, and must be read in the context of the rhetoric of the growing feminist movements, they should lead one into carrying out further serious intensive research on these urgent problems, as exemplified in the recent work of Cohen (1982). □ □

REFERENCES

- Clement, Catherine
1980 Un jardin d'enfants pour adultes consentants. [*In La sexualite en vacances: le temps de tous les desirs*] Dossier. *Le Matin* (16 aout):18.
- Cohen, Erik
1979 A Phenomenology of Tourist Experiences. *Sociology* 13:179-201.
1982 Thai Girls and Farang Men. *Annals of Tourism Research* 9(3):403-428.
- Giarelli, Andrew
1981 End of 'Scx Tours.' *World Press Review* (October):21.
- Goffman, Erving
1961 *Asylums*. Garden City, NY: Anchor Doubleday.
- Graburn, Nelson H. H.
1977 Tourism: The Sacred Journey. *In Hosts and Guests: The Anthropology of Tourism*, Valene Smith, ed., pp. 17-31. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
1983 The Anthropology of Tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research* 10(1):9-33.
- Gottlieb, Alma
1982 Americans' Vacations. *Annals of Tourism Research* 9(2):165-187.
- Haring, Douglas G.
1956 *Personal Character and Cultural Milieu*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.

Nash, Dennison

1977 *Tourism as a Form of Imperialism. In Hosts and Guests: The Anthropology of Tourism*, Valene Smith, ed., pp. 33-38. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Submitted 21 July 1982

Revised version submitted 17 November 1982

Accepted 15 February 1983

• Book Reviews

Financing, Managing and Marketing Recreation and Park Resources

By Dennis Howard and John Crompton. Wm. C. Brown Company, Publishers (2460 Kerper Blvd., Dubuque, IA 52001, USA) ISBN 0-697-07091-3, 1980, xviii + 490 (tables, photographs, appendix), \$18.95 (cloth).

Edward M. Mahoney

Park and Recreation Resources
Michigan State University, USA

This reviewer's initial reaction, when asked to review this book, was: "Oh, no! Another recreation administration/management text!" Not only are most of these texts as dry as dust, but most cover the same out-of-date topics, often in the same sequence. After struggling through several of these books, one begins to think that one really reads the same text only with a different cover on it. Happily, Howard and Crompton's book is a welcomed, needed, and long overdue change.

The book is divided into three sections dealing with finance, management, and marketing. The finance section focuses primarily on alternative methods of acquiring resources—land, labor, equipment—with which to operate parks and recreation agencies. Five of the seven chapters review in detail methods currently being used to secure resources. These include financial assistance from foundations and trusts, donations and volunteerism, and cooperative arrangements with the private sector. The last two chapters in the section deal with land acquisition, both fee simple and less than fee simple techniques.

Chapter Three is one of the most important in the book. It includes an assessment of the status of traditional funding sources and a discussion of four strategies for rectifying, or adapting to, budget reductions. The strategies are: seeking alternative sources of funds from the private and commercial sectors, target zero, self-sufficiency with no reliance on public funds using economic analysis to estimate the economic benefits of recrea-