

Topic: Civil Military Relations in Pakistan

Past and Contemporary times

Introduction

- ▶ Concept of Civil Military Relations
- ▶ Pakistan as a Garrison State
- ▶ Colonial era and the role of military
- ▶ Inheritance of British military culture
- ▶ Martial laws

Three branches of state

- ▶ Executive
- ▶ It runs the affairs of the state,
- ▶ Legislature (Parliament)
- ▶ Judiciary (Provision of justice)

Role of Military in Pakistan's Politics

- ▶ Since achieving independence from the British Government Pakistan's politics had been overshadowed by military rule for almost half of the span.
- ▶ Martial law was declared four times during this period.

First Martial Law 1958-1962

- ▶ Major General and the then President Iskander Mirza, realizing he had no chance of being re-elected president, proclaimed the first martial law.
- ▶ Mirza was supported by General Muhammad Ayub Khan, commander-in-chief of the army. Twenty days later, Ayub forced the president to resign and assumed the presidency himself.
- ▶ After one year, General Ayub became the first Field Marshal of Pakistan and took over the authorities.
- ▶ After four years, in 1962, he lifted martial law and provided the presidential form to the government again.

Second Martial Law 1969-1971

- ▶ The second Martial Law was declared by the Army Chief, General Agha Muhammad Yahya Khan.
- ▶ He dissolved the assemblies and assumed the office of the President after Ayub Khan stepped down as President on March 25, 1969, and handed over power to him.

Third Martial Law 1977-1988

- ▶ Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, Chairman of Pakistan's People's Party, took over as president and the first civilian chief Martial Law Administrator on Dec 20, 1971.
- ▶ The army staged the 3rd coup when General Zia-ul-Haq overthrew the Bhutto government and took over as CMLA on July 5, 1977.
- ▶ All the political parties were banned, and all the national and provincial assemblies were dissolved.

Fourth Martial Law 1999-2008

- ▶ Pakistan came under military rule again on October 12, 1999, when General Pervez Musharraf seized power in bloodless coup and dissolved the elected government of Nawaz Sharif.
- ▶ However, no martial law was imposed. As announced by him on July 11, 2002, general elections were held on October 10, 2002.
- ▶ Before the elections, a referendum was held on April 30, 2002, for him to be elected as the president for another five years.
- ▶ On November 3, 2007, he declared state of emergency in the country which is claimed to be equivalent to the state of martial law as the constitution was suspended.
- ▶ Pervez Musharraf, who ruled Pakistan as Chief Executive from 1999-2002 and as president from 2001-2008, resigned on August 18, 2008 in the face of impeachment.

Involvement of Military in Politics

- ▶ Pakistan provides an example of how the military has been able to govern the country as successfully as a civilian government.
- ▶ In order to justify its existence, it presented the Kashmir issue and invasion threat from India; where a strong army was considered a necessity for the existence of the country along with the ideology.

Civil-Military Relations

- ▶ Armed forces' primary job is to protect the national border and ensure the security of the state. Furthermore, assisting the civilian government in times of contingency like floods, pandemics etc.
- ▶ Excessive involvement of the military in terms of time and manpower in non-military matters is not advisable for the armed forces.
- ▶ Military rule increases the probability of subsequent military coups, which not only exposes their lack of acceptance of civilian supremacy but also erodes the faith of citizens in their armed forces.

State versus Government

- ▶ What is state?
- ▶ What is Government?
- ▶ Political body, elected body
- ▶ Federal Parliamentary system
- ▶ No PM completed his tenure in Pakistan
- ▶ Differences of interests between Army and Civil structure
- ▶ Supremacy of both organs
- ▶ Civil leadership issues
- ▶ Critical governance issues
- ▶ Strong role of military in foreign policy
- ▶ Power conflict

History of Military relations

- ▶ 1947-1958 confrontational politics
- ▶ 1958-1971 Martial law
- ▶ 1971-1972 Zulfikar Ali Bhutto
- ▶ 1988-1999 weak Democratic period
- ▶ PPP-1988 to 1990, Benazir Bhutto
- ▶ PML-N 1990 to 1993, Mian Nawaz Sharif
- ▶ PPP- 1993 to 1996, Benazir Bhutto
- ▶ PML-N 1997-1999, Nawaz Sharif
- ▶ 1999-2002, Martial Law General Musharraf
- ▶ PML-Q, 2002-2007
- ▶ PPP- Asif Zardari, 2002-2013
- ▶ PML-N, Nawaz Sharif, 2013-2018
- ▶ PTI-Imran Khan, 2018-2022

Features

- ▶ Civil-Military relations and their nature
- ▶ Civil-Military relations are the back bone for the political, economic, administrative, infrastructural development
- ▶ Civil-Military relations from an essential strand of national security strategy.
- ▶ In developed country, the military is mostly busy in the formulation of national security policy.
- ▶ On the other hand, in the developing countries with colonial past, the military have long maintained a substantive role in domestic politics.
- ▶ Hybrid regime
- ▶ Overthrown of constitutionally formed governments

Features

- ▶ Influence on decision-making power
- ▶ Interference in domestic politics

Background

- ▶ The evolution of the civil-military relations in Pakistan was affected by many factors
- ▶ The political and administrative structure of Pakistan was very fragile unlike democratic India
- ▶ Pakistan army originated from the British Indian Army.
- ▶ Unlike India, the civil-military relations evolved along the entirely different path
- ▶ Frequent military interventions

Background

- ▶ Since its inception, Pakistan has experienced long spell of military rule
- ▶ Almost 30 years Pakistan has coped up direct rule of military
- ▶ The military consolidated political power in the country
- ▶ The military power notably the military intelligence and Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) exerts significant overt and covert control over the civilian authorities
- ▶ Hegemonic influence on both domestic internal and external affairs

The role of military in Pakistani society

- ▶ Multiple roles of Pakistani military
- ▶ Role in combating natural disasters and natural calamities
- ▶ Contribution of military personnel to UN peacekeeping mission
- ▶ Under special circumstances maintaining of law and order and defending the borders of country and conducting security operations, counter-insurgency or counter-terrorism operations. Pakistan's volatile relationship with India has ensured that the military has been well-sourced.
- ▶ Floods in Sindh, Baluchistan etc

Why Civil-Military relations in Pakistan have always been on a bumpy road?

- ▶ Democracy requires health civil-military relationship
- ▶ “ Do not forget that the armed forces are the servants of the people. You do not make national policy; it is we, the civilians, who decide these issues and it is your duty to carry out these tasks with which you are entrusted”
Quaid-i-Azam

Factors of confrontation

- ▶ Leadership void
- ▶ Weak political parties
- ▶ Fragile institutions
- ▶ Subversion of democratic culture
- ▶ Rising power of civil-military bureaucracy
- ▶ Wrangling for power
- ▶ Military's stay over political setup
- ▶ Civil dependence on army

Leadership void

- ▶ Death of Quaid-i-Azam
- ▶ Assassination of Liaquat Ali Khan
- ▶ Misuse of power
- ▶ Military- Bureaucratic oligarchy
- ▶ Constitutional crisis

Weak political parties

- ▶ For the smooth functioning of democracy strong and well-entrenched political parties are essential
- ▶ Paradoxical nature of democracy in Pakistan
- ▶ Parties in Pakistan have failed to develop strong vehicle of political will
- ▶ Political leaders are mostly from feudal and capitalist classes
- ▶ Political turncoats
- ▶ Constant wrangling for power led to ceaseless fighting
- ▶ Imposition of Martial laws

Weak institutions

- ▶ After independence, Pakistan had to start from scratch. There was no established parliament, no secretariat, no supreme court, no central bank and organized armed forces.
- ▶ Paucity of competent parliamentarians
- ▶ The proportion of Indian Civil Service officers who opted for Pakistan was small.
- ▶ The same was true of the higher judiciary
- ▶ Unlike other institutions, the proportion of Muslims in the Indian Army was comparatively substantial.

Rising power of civil military Bureaucracy

- ▶ Due to lack of basic infrastructure, Pakistan had to make new beginning in all spheres. But the low level of literacy made this take very difficult. The country needed competent and a determined leadership to build and nurture democratic institutions. But such a leadership was hard to come by in a rural society in which the social, political, economic, life was dominated by the landed aristocracy. The feudal leadership of political parties was not capable of dealing with the multifarious problems faced by the country. It depended heavily on the civil and military bureaucracy. The result was the bureaucratic elite became disproportionately assertive, steadily increasing the power at the expense of the political elite.
- ▶ Like Ghulam Muhammad dissolved the National Assembly in 1954 and the Federal Court justified and validated his unconstitutional act on the basis of the “Law of necessity”.

Wrangling of Power

- ▶ President Sikander Mirza did create political instability in Pakistan
- ▶ He dissolved the National Assembly, abrogated the Constitution, dismissed the central and provincial governments, banned all political parties and postponed general elections indefinitely.
- ▶ He also declared Martial Law and appointed General Ayub as the Chief Martial Law Administrator who eventually removed Sikander Mirza on Oct 27, 1958 and himself became the President.
- ▶ Thus began the era of military-dominated governance.

Military's sway over Political setup

- ▶ From the beginning Pakistan faced political instability
- ▶ Seven prime ministers rose and fell
- ▶ Again, after the restoration of democratic governance during 1988-99, four governments were dissolved by the President of Pakistan invoking Article 58 (2) b.
- ▶ On 12 October, 1999 the military again ousted the democratic government and Pakistan was again under the despotic rule.
- ▶ Pakistan's turbulent experience of democracy

Civil Dependence on Army

- ▶ Army's interference in civilian administration
- ▶ Its involvement at the time of natural disasters, emergencies, and other civil functions
- ▶ Always assisted in refugee and humanitarian crisis

Current Circumstances

- ▶ Why Pakistan has oscillated between democracy and military?
- ▶ It's a intriguing riddle
- ▶ The Army is more deeply involved now than a decade ago in support of activities for the civilian government.
- ▶ It held sway over law and order, relief and rescue operations.
- ▶ The use of its organization and technological resources for public welfare projects
- ▶ The greater induction of army personnel in civilian administration, anti-terrorist activities, human trafficking cases, and so on.
- ▶ What is the evolution, deviation, reconsolidation of democratic process and institutions in Pakistan?

Current Circumstances

- ▶ Army has already attained its major goals of de facto control of the country's nuclear and missile programs, key foreign relationships, the military budget, and national security decision-making.
- ▶ Accumulation of additional power in the economic and political spheres
- ▶ Role in Non-traditional security threats
- ▶ Multiparty system
- ▶ Dis organized and weak party structure
- ▶ Polarized politics

Recent political turmoil

- ▶ Politics is divided in Pakistan and military pursues its interests
- ▶ Dearth of effective diplomacy
- ▶ Vested interests of military
- ▶ Politicization of the military
- ▶ Role of middle classes

Why Pakistan could not develop into a democratic state?

- ▶ How to figure out it?
- ▶ Divided political forces
- ▶ Dearth of pragmatic politics
- ▶ Hybrid regimes
- ▶ Use of religion card
- ▶ Ethnic and language diversity
- ▶ Religious fundamentalism

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto to Imran Khan

- ▶ 5th July 1977, third Martial Law was proclaimed by Zia-ul-Haq
- ▶ 4 April 1979, Bhutto was sentenced to death
- ▶ He was accused of murdering opposition leader Kasuri
- ▶ Period of Islamization (Zia-ul-Haq)
- ▶ Ramzan Ordinance
- ▶ 28 Feb, 1985 elections were held on non-party base
- ▶ Muhammad Khan Junejo became Prime Minister of Pakistan
- ▶ 11 Nov, 1985, 8th Amendment
- ▶ 17 August 1988, General Zia-ul-Haq passed away

8th Amendment

- ▶ Article 58 (2) b
- ▶ Addition of clause
- ▶ President could dissolve the assembly

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto to Imran Khan

- ▶ 16 November, 1988, the first government of Benazir Bhutto became the first Woman Prime Minister of the Muslim world
- ▶ 6 August 1990, Ghulam Ishaq Khan became the President
- ▶ Ghulam Ishaq Khan dissolved the government of Benazir Bhutto on the massive charges of corruption
- ▶ Article 58 (2) b
- ▶ If there is no 58 (2) b then the Prime Minister would dissolve the assembly on the request of Prime Minister

Nawaz Sharif

- ▶ 24, October 1990, Nawaz Sharif became the PM of Pakistan after Benazir Bhutto
- ▶ Ghulam Ishaq Khan again dissolved the government of Nawaz Sharif on corruption charges
- ▶ 18 July, 1993 Nawaz Sharif and Ghulam Ishaq Khan resigned from the Government.
- ▶ 6 October, 1993 Benazir Bhutto again became the Prime Minister
- ▶ 5 Nov 1996, Farooq Laghari became the next President
- ▶ 3 Feb 1997, Nawaz Sharif again became the Prime Minister of Pakistan

Nawaz Sharif

- ▶ 13th Amendment in the constitution
- ▶ 58 (2) b was ended

Pervez Musharraf

- ▶ 12 October, 1999 Musharraf arrested Nawaz Sharif
- ▶ Musharraf declared emergency
- ▶ Chief Executive Officer
- ▶ 2002, referendum and he became President for five years
- ▶ He was also Chief of Army Staff
- ▶ 2003, 17th Amendment in the Constitution, 58 (2) b
- ▶ He again held the reigns of power

Asif Zardari

- ▶ 2008, Asif Zardari became the President of Pakistan
- ▶ Yusuf Raza Gillani became Prime Minister
- ▶ 2010, 18th Amendment in the Constitution
- ▶ 2012, Yusuf Raza Gillani was removed
- ▶ Raja Pervez Ashraf became Prime Minister of Pakistan
- ▶ 2013, Nawaz Sharif became the Prime Minister of Pakistan
- ▶ 2017, Nawaz Sharif was dismissed due to the decision of Supreme Court
- ▶ 2018, PTI came on the political landscape of Pakistan

Imran Khan

- ▶ Cricketer-cum-Politician
- ▶ Populist leader
- ▶ His narrative against dynastic corruption
- ▶ PTI's dharna politics
- ▶ Vote of no-confidence motion

Imran Khan

- ▶ After Fata merger the seats of the National Assembly will be 336 in next General Elections
- ▶ Article 79 of the Constitution does not allow supreme court to interfere in the affairs of the National Assembly
- ▶ Vote of-no confidence was part of international conspiracy
- ▶ President dissolved the National Assembly

Types of Elites in Pakistan

- ▶ Pakistan as an elitist state
- ▶ Military elite
- ▶ Bureaucratic elite
- ▶ Industrialist elite
- ▶ Religious elite
- ▶ Judicial elite
- ▶ Land lords
- ▶ Elite in Media

Power Elite Theory

C. Wright Mills

- ▶ State policies reflect interests of the power elite
- ▶ Power elite are leaders of the military-industrial complex, military leaders, government leaders, and the heads of large corporations
- ▶ Although they do not necessarily get together and conspire, Mills claimed that these people have similar interests and support similar government policies.

Sources

- ▶ Al Jazeera, Diplomat, Foreign Affairs, The Guardian, The Times
- ▶ Dawn, Asim Sajjad Akhtar, Zahid Hussain, Fahad Hussain, Rafia Zakria, Umair Javed, Maleeha Lodhi etc
- ▶ Express Tribune
- ▶ Reports of Freedom House Democracy
- ▶ Journal of Democracy
- ▶ Journal of Political Economy
- ▶ Taylor and Francis Journal
- ▶ Brookings Institute Journal
- ▶ Book: How Democracies Die?
- ▶ Book: Democratization in Pakistan
- ▶ Book: Pakistan as a Garrison State
- ▶ Book: Pakistan between Mosque and the Military
- ▶ Book: The Army and Democracy: Military Politics in Pakistan

Sources

- ▶ Margalla Papers, National Defense University
- ▶ ISSRA papers, National Defense University
- ▶ Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad
- ▶ Islamabad Policy Research Institute
- ▶ Washington Post
- ▶ Listen Al Jazeera documentaries
- ▶ Read research papers of China Pakistan Study center