

COOPERATIVE GAME THEORY

RICHARD MUŽÍK

RICHARD@IMUZYK.CZ

APRIL 15, 2023

MOTIVATIONS AND INTRODUCTION

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Basic model: game in **normal form** (N, \mathcal{S}, v) :

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Basic model: game in **normal form** (N, \mathcal{S}, v) :

- N ... set of n players

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Basic model: game in **normal form** (N, \mathcal{S}, v) :

- N ... set of n players
- $\mathcal{S} = S_1 \times S_2 \times \cdots \times S_n$... strategy profiles

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Basic model: game in **normal form** (N, \mathcal{S}, v) :

- N ... set of n players
- $\mathcal{S} = S_1 \times S_2 \times \cdots \times S_n$... strategy profiles
 - ▶ S_i ... strategies of player i

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Basic model: game in **normal form** (N, \mathcal{S}, v) :

- N ... set of n players
- $\mathcal{S} = S_1 \times S_2 \times \cdots \times S_n$... strategy profiles
 - ▶ S_i ... strategies of player i
- $v: \mathcal{S} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$... utility function

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Basic model: game in **normal form** (N, \mathcal{S}, v) :

- N ... set of n players
- $\mathcal{S} = S_1 \times S_2 \times \cdots \times S_n$... strategy profiles
 - ▶ S_i ... strategies of player i
- $v: \mathcal{S} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$... utility function
 - ▶ $v(S)_i$... utility of player i under strategy S

Goal: *To analyse and solve conflicting interaction between subjects*

Basic model: game in **normal form** (N, \mathcal{S}, v) :

- N ... set of n players
- $\mathcal{S} = S_1 \times S_2 \times \cdots \times S_n$... strategy profiles
 - ▶ S_i ... strategies of player i
- $v: \mathcal{S} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$... utility function
 - ▶ $v(S)_i$... utility of player i under strategy S

Fundamental question: *What strategy should player i choose?*

SOLUTION OF GAMES IN NORMAL FORM?

NASH EQUILIBRIUM

Idea: Deviation from the **actual** strategy to a **new** strategy does not improve the outcome.

Nash equilibrium

Strategy profile (s_1, \dots, s_n) is **Nash equilibrium**, if it holds for every player i ,

$$v_i(s_1, \dots, s_{i-1}, s_i, s_{i+1}, \dots, s_n) \geq v_i(s_1, \dots, s_{i-1}, t_i, s_{i+1}, \dots, s_n)$$

for every $t_i \in S_i$.

SOLUTION OF GAMES IN NORMAL FORM?

NASH EQUILIBRIUM

Idea: Deviation from the **actual** strategy to a **new** strategy does not improve the outcome.

Nash equilibrium

Strategy profile (s_1, \dots, s_n) is **Nash equilibrium**, if it holds for every player i ,

$$v_i(s_1, \dots, s_{i-1}, s_i, s_{i+1}, \dots, s_n) \geq v_i(s_1, \dots, s_{i-1}, t_i, s_{i+1}, \dots, s_n)$$

for every $t_i \in S_i$.

- Is this model suitable for the analysis of *cooperation*?

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B		Silence	Speak
		Silence	Speak
Silence		-1/-1	-3/0
Speak		0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?
 - ▶ **The prisoners cannot agree on a strategy in advance**

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?
 - ▶ **The prisoners cannot agree on a strategy in advance**
- Solution?

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?
 - ▶ **The prisoners cannot agree on a strategy in advance**
- Solution?
 1. Fix the existing model

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?
 - ▶ **The prisoners cannot agree on a strategy in advance**
- Solution?
 1. Fix the existing model
 - \implies Pareto optimum
 - \implies Nash "cooperative" solution

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?
 - ▶ **The prisoners cannot agree on a strategy in advance**
- Solution?
 1. Fix the existing model
 - \implies Pareto optimum
 - \implies Nash "cooperative" solution

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?
 - ▶ **The prisoners cannot agree on a strategy in advance**
- Solution?
 1. Fix the existing model
 - \implies Pareto optimum
 - \implies Nash "cooperative" solution
 2. Create a new model

PRISONER DILEMMA

Prisoner A \ Prisoner B	Silence	Speak
Silence	-1/-1	-3/0
Speak	0/-3	-2/-2

- Nash equilibrium does not lead to cooperation
- Main problem?
 - ▶ **The prisoners cannot agree on a strategy in advance**
- Solution?
 1. Fix the existing model
 - \implies Pareto optimum
 - \implies Nash "cooperative" solution
 2. Create a new model
 - model of *cooperative games*

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS: *MARKET GAMES*

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players
- \mathbb{R}_+^m ... commodity space

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players
- \mathbb{R}_+^m ... commodity space
- $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$... matrix of initial allocations

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players
- \mathbb{R}_+^m ... commodity space
- $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$... matrix of initial allocations

$$\blacktriangleright A = \begin{pmatrix} \begin{array}{c} | \\ a^1 \\ | \end{array} & \begin{array}{c} | \\ a^2 \\ | \end{array} & \dots & \begin{array}{c} | \\ a^n \\ | \end{array} \end{pmatrix}$$

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players
- \mathbb{R}_+^m ... commodity space
- $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$... matrix of initial allocations
 - ▶ $A = \begin{pmatrix} | & | & & | \\ a^1 & a^2 & \dots & a^n \\ | & | & & | \end{pmatrix}$
 - ▶ $a^i \in \mathbb{R}^m$... commodities owned by player i

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players
- \mathbb{R}_+^m ... commodity space
- $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$... matrix of initial allocations
 - ▶ $A = \begin{pmatrix} | & | & & | \\ a^1 & a^2 & \dots & a^n \\ | & | & & | \end{pmatrix}$
 - ▶ $a^i \in \mathbb{R}^m$... commodities owned by player i
- $w = w_1 \times w_2 \times \dots \times w_n$... utility function

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players
- \mathbb{R}_+^m ... commodity space
- $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$... matrix of initial allocations
 - ▶ $A = \begin{pmatrix} | & | & & | \\ a^1 & a^2 & \dots & a^n \\ | & | & & | \end{pmatrix}$
 - ▶ $a^i \in \mathbb{R}^m$... commodities owned by player i
- $w = w_1 \times w_2 \times \dots \times w_n$... utility function
 - ▶ $w_i: \mathbb{R}_+^m \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$... utility function of player i

Goal of model? *Understanding of the behaviour of markets*

Market

A **market** $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ is given by:

- N ... set of players
- \mathbb{R}_+^m ... commodity space
- $A \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$... matrix of initial allocations
 - ▶ $A = \begin{pmatrix} | & | & & | \\ a^1 & a^2 & \dots & a^n \\ | & | & & | \end{pmatrix}$
 - ▶ $a^i \in \mathbb{R}^m$... commodities owned by player i
- $W = w_1 \times w_2 \times \dots \times w_n$... utility function
 - ▶ $w_i: \mathbb{R}_+^m \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$... utility function of player i
 - ▶ w_i is continuous, concave function

Market games are **transferable utility** games

Market games are **transferable utility** games

- better understanding after we define cooperative games
- meanwhile: *money* used for evaluation of profit

Market games are **transferable utility** games

- better understanding after we define cooperative games
- meanwhile: *money* used for evaluation of profit
- formally: $W_i(x, \zeta) = w_i(x) + \zeta$

Market games are **transferable utility** games

- better understanding after we define cooperative games
- meanwhile: *money* used for evaluation of profit
- formally: $W_i(x, \zeta) = w_i(x) + \zeta$
 - ▶ $x \in \mathbb{R}^m$... vector of commodities
 - ▶ $\zeta \in \mathbb{R}$... money

Market games are **transferable utility** games

- better understanding after we define cooperative games
- meanwhile: *money* used for evaluation of profit
- formally: $W_i(x, \zeta) = w_i(x) + \zeta$
 - ▶ $x \in \mathbb{R}^m$... vector of commodities
 - ▶ $\zeta \in \mathbb{R}$... money
 - ζ may be negative
 - amount we paid to buy the commodities

Goal of market games? Determine *trade* on the market

Trade of coalition S

Trade for market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^n, A, w)$ between players in $\emptyset \neq S \subseteq N$ is a collection $(x^i, \zeta^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying:

Goal of market games? Determine *trade* on the market

Trade of coalition S

Trade for market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^n, A, w)$ between players in $\emptyset \neq S \subseteq N$ is a collection $(x^i, \zeta^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying:

1. $\sum_{i \in S} x^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i$ (preservation of commodities)

Goal of market games? Determine *trade* on the market

Trade of coalition S

Trade for market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^n, A, w)$ between players in $\emptyset \neq S \subseteq N$ is a collection $(x^i, \zeta^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying:

1. $\sum_{i \in S} x^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i$ (preservation of commodities)
2. $\sum_{i \in S} \zeta^i = 0$ (preservation of money).

Goal of market games? Determine *trade* on the market

Trade of coalition S

Trade for market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^n, A, w)$ between players in $\emptyset \neq S \subseteq N$ is a collection $(x^i, \zeta^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying:

1. $\sum_{i \in S} x^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i$ (preservation of commodities)
2. $\sum_{i \in S} \zeta^i = 0$ (preservation of money).

Questions:

Goal of market games? Determine *trade* on the market

Trade of coalition S

Trade for market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^n, A, w)$ between players in $\emptyset \neq S \subseteq N$ is a collection $(x^i, \zeta^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying:

1. $\sum_{i \in S} x^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i$ (preservation of commodities)
2. $\sum_{i \in S} \zeta^i = 0$ (preservation of money).

Questions:

Goal of market games? Determine *trade* on the market

Trade of coalition S

Trade for market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^n, A, w)$ between players in $\emptyset \neq S \subseteq N$ is a collection $(x^i, \zeta^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying:

1. $\sum_{i \in S} x^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i$ (preservation of commodities)
2. $\sum_{i \in S} \zeta^i = 0$ (preservation of money).

Questions:

- Which coalitions agree on trading?

Goal of market games? Determine *trade* on the market

Trade of coalition S

Trade for market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^n, A, w)$ between players in $\emptyset \neq S \subseteq N$ is a collection $(x^i, \zeta^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying:

1. $\sum_{i \in S} x^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i$ (preservation of commodities)
2. $\sum_{i \in S} \zeta^i = 0$ (preservation of money).

Questions:

- Which coalitions agree on trading?
- What trade will occur within a given coalition?
 - What is the profit of player i for a given market?

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS: *VOTING GAMES*

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of player

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of player
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... množina vítězných koalic

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of player
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... množina vítězných koalic
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of player
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... množina vítězných koalic
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of player
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... množina vítězných koalic
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of player
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... množina vítězných koalic
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$

Goal: *Understanding of voting systems a coalition formation*

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of player
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... množina vítězných koalic
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS: *VOTING GAMES*

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R} \dots$ power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i \dots$ power of coalition $S \subseteq N$

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Application: Voting system UN Security Council

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Application: Voting system UN Security Council

- 15 members (5 permanent)

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Application: Voting system UN Security Council

- 15 members (5 permanent)
 - ▶ permanent members: right of veto

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Application: Voting system UN Security Council

- 15 members (5 permanent)
 - ▶ permanent members: right of veto
- to adopt resolution: 9 votes needed

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Application: Voting system UN Security Council

- 15 members (5 permanent)
 - ▶ permanent members: right of veto
- to adopt resolution: 9 votes needed
- $N = \{1, \dots, 15\}$

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Application: Voting system UN Security Council

- 15 members (5 permanent)
 - ▶ permanent members: right of veto
- to adopt resolution: 9 votes needed
- $N = \{1, \dots, 15\}$
- $k = 39$

Special case: **(Weighted) majority games**

- $v_i \in \mathbb{R}$... power of player i
- $v(S) = \sum_{i \in S} v_i$... power of coalition $S \subseteq N$
- $S \in \mathcal{W} \iff v(S) \geq k$
 - ▶ $k \in \mathbb{R}$... voting quota

Application: Voting system UN Security Council

- 15 members (5 permanent)
 - ▶ permanent members: right of veto
- to adopt resolution: 9 votes needed
- $N = \{1, \dots, 15\}$
- $k = 39$
- $v_i = \begin{cases} 7 & i = 1, \dots, 5 \\ 1 & i = 6, \dots, 15 \end{cases}$

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS: *COST-SHARING PROBLEM*

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

Examples:

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players

Examples:

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$

Examples:

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$

Examples:

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

Examples:

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

Examples:

- drinking water supply

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

Examples:

- drinking water supply
- municipal waste collection

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

Examples:

- drinking water supply
- municipal waste collection
- subscriptions to scientific journals

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS: *MINIMAL SPANNING-TREE GAMES*

Goal: *Find the best connection of players to a source*

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS: *MINIMAL SPANNING-TREE GAMES*

Goal: *Find the best connection of players to a source*

- $N = N' \cup \{o\}$... set of players + source

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

MINIMAL SPANNING-TREE GAMES

Goal: *Find the best connection of players to a source*

- $N = N' \cup \{o\}$... set of players + source
- c_{ij} ... cost of connecting i, j

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

MINIMAL SPANNING-TREE GAMES

Goal: *Find the best connection of players to a source*

- $N = N' \cup \{o\}$... set of players + source
- c_{ij} ... cost of connecting i, j
- solution: a network, where each $i \in N$ is connected to o with minimal sum of costs

Cooperative game

Cooperative game

A **cooperative game** is an ordered pair (N, v) , where N is a set of players and $v: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is the characteristic function. Further, $v(\emptyset) = 0$.

Cooperative game

A **cooperative game** is an ordered pair (N, v) , where N is a set of players and $v: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is the characteristic function. Further, $v(\emptyset) = 0$.

■ $S \subseteq N$... coalition

Cooperative game

A **cooperative game** is an ordered pair (N, v) , where N is a set of players and $v: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is the characteristic function. Further, $v(\emptyset) = 0$.

- $S \subseteq N$... coalition
- $v(S)$... values of coalition

Cooperative game

A **cooperative game** is an ordered pair (N, v) , where N is a set of players and $v: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is the characteristic function. Further, $v(\emptyset) = 0$.

- Γ^n ... set of n -person cooperative games
- $S \subseteq N$... coalition
- $v(S)$... values of coalition

Cooperative game

A **cooperative game** is an ordered pair (N, v) , where N is a set of players and $v: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is the characteristic function. Further, $v(\emptyset) = 0$.

- Γ^n ... set of n -person cooperative games
- $S \subseteq N$... coalition
- $v(S)$... values of coalition
- usually $N = \{1, \dots, n\}$

Cooperative game

A **cooperative game** is an ordered pair (N, v) , where N is a set of players and $v: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is the characteristic function. Further, $v(\emptyset) = 0$.

- Γ^n ... set of n -person cooperative games
- $S \subseteq N$... coalition
- $v(S)$... values of coalition
- usually $N = \{1, \dots, n\}$
 - ▶ (S, v_S) is **subgame** (N, v) :
 - $v_S: 2^S \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$
 - $v_S(T) := v(T)$ pro $T \subseteq S$

- $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$... market

Feasible S-allocation

Feasible S-allocations is $(a_S^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying

$$\sum_{i \in S} a_S^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i.$$

We denote the set of feasible S-allocations by \mathcal{A}_S .

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS: *MARKET GAMES*

■ $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, a, w)$... market

Feasible S-allocation

Feasible S-allocation is $(a_S^i)_{i \in S}$ satisfying $\sum_{i \in S} a_S^i = \sum_{i \in S} a^i$.
We denote the set of feasible S-allocations by \mathcal{A}_S .

Market game

Cooperative game (N, v) is **market game**, if there is market $(N, \mathbb{R}_+^m, A, w)$ satisfying

$$v(S) = \max \left\{ \sum_{i \in S} w^i(a_S^i) \mid (a_S^i)_{i \in S} \in \mathcal{A}_S \right\}.$$

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of players
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... set of winning coalitions
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of players
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... set of winning coalitions
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Simple game

Simple game (N, v) satisfies:

1. $v: 2^N \rightarrow \{0, 1\}$
2. $S \subseteq T \wedge v(S) = 1 \implies v(T) = 1$

Voting game

A **voting game** (N, \mathcal{W}) is given by:

- N ... set of players
- $\mathcal{W} \subseteq 2^N$... set of winning coalitions
 - ▶ $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{W}$
 - ▶ $S \subseteq T \wedge S \in \mathcal{W} \implies T \in \mathcal{W}$

Simple game

Simple game (N, v) satisfies:

1. $v: 2^N \rightarrow \{0, 1\}$
2. $S \subseteq T \wedge v(S) = 1 \implies v(T) = 1$

■ $v(S) = 1 \iff S \in \mathcal{W}$

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

Cooperative game

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

Cooperative game

- $c: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$
- a so called *cost game* (N, c)

COOPERATION - EXAMPLES OF MODELS:

COST-SHARING PROBLEM

Goal: *Does cooperation lead to reduction of costs?*

- N ... set of players
- $c(S)$... value of costs for a service shared by $S \subseteq N$
 - ▶ $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cup T)$
 - ▶ a common solution simulated by union of individual solutions

Cooperative game

- $c: 2^N \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$
- a so called *cost game* (N, c)
 - ▶ $c(S)$... values represent costs
 - ▶ $v(S)$... values represent *profit*

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

■ **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

- ▶ $S \cup T$ can behave as separate S and T

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

- ▶ $S \cup T$ can behave as separate S and T
- ▶ does not hold if there are costs of managing coalitions

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

- ▶ $S \cup T$ can behave as separate S and T
- ▶ does not hold if there are costs of managing coalitions
- ▶ cost-games: $c(S) + c(T) \geq v(S \cup T)$... **subadditive game**

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

- ▶ $S \cup T$ can behave as separate S and T
- ▶ does not hold if there are costs of managing coalitions
- ▶ cost-games: $c(S) + c(T) \geq v(S \cup T)$... **subadditive game**

- **convex game** ($S, T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cap T) + v(S \cup T)$$

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

- **convex game** ($S, T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cap T) + v(S \cup T)$$

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

- **convex game** ($S, T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cap T) + v(S \cup T)$$

- ▶ also **supermodular game**

CLASSES OF GAMES

Example: *Bigger coalitions are better coalitions...*

- **monotonic game** ($S \subseteq T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) \leq v(T)$$

- **superadditive game** ($S, T \subseteq N, S \cap T = \emptyset$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cup T)$$

- **convex game** ($S, T \subseteq N$)

$$v(S) + v(T) \leq v(S \cap T) + v(S \cup T)$$

- ▶ also **supermodular game**
- ▶ cost-game: $c(S) + c(T) \geq c(S \cap T) + c(S \cup T)$
 - **concave (submodular)**

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

- **Payoff vector** $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
 - ▶ x_i represents payoff of player i

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

- **Payoff vector** $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
 - ▶ x_i represents payoff of player i
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **efficient**, if $\sum_{i \in N} x_i = v(N)$

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

- **Payoff vector** $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
 - ▶ x_i represents payoff of player i
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **efficient**, if $\sum_{i \in N} x_i = v(N)$
 - ▶ Usually, we distribute $v(N)$
 1. *value of cooperation* $v(N)$
 2. *shared costs* $c(N)$

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

- **Payoff vector** $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
 - ▶ x_i represents payoff of player i
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **efficient**, if $\sum_{i \in N} x_i = v(N)$
 - ▶ Usually, we distribute $v(N)$
 1. *value of cooperation* $v(N)$
 2. *shared costs* $c(N)$
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **individually rational**, if $x_i \geq v(i)$

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

- **Payoff vector** $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
 - ▶ x_i represents payoff of player i
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **efficient**, if $\sum_{i \in N} x_i = v(N)$
 - ▶ Usually, we distribute $v(N)$
 1. *value of cooperation* $v(N)$
 2. *shared costs* $c(N)$
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **individually rational**, if $x_i \geq v(i)$
 - ▶ players prefer x_i over $v(i)$

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

- **Payoff vector** $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
 - ▶ x_i represents payoff of player i
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **efficient**, if $\sum_{i \in N} x_i = v(N)$
 - ▶ Usually, we distribute $v(N)$
 1. *value of cooperation* $v(N)$
 2. *shared costs* $c(N)$
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **individually rational**, if $x_i \geq v(i)$
 - ▶ players prefer x_i over $v(i)$
- $\mathcal{I}^*(v) = \{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid x(N) = v(N)\}$... **preimputation**
 - ▶ $x(S) := \sum_{i \in S} x_i$

GOAL OF THE MODEL OF COOPERATIVE GAMES

Money first!

- **Payoff vector** $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
 - ▶ x_i represents payoff of player i
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **efficient**, if $\sum_{i \in N} x_i = v(N)$
 - ▶ Usually, we distribute $v(N)$
 1. value of cooperation $v(N)$
 2. shared costs $c(N)$
- Vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ is **individually rational**, if $x_i \geq v(i)$
 - ▶ players prefer x_i over $v(i)$
- $\mathcal{I}^*(v) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid x(N) = v(N)\}$... **preimputation**
 - ▶ $x(S) := \sum_{i \in S} x_i$
- $\mathcal{I}(v) = \{x \in \mathcal{I}^*(v) \mid \forall i \in N : x_i \geq v(i)\}$... **imputation**

- Set of payoff vectors satisfying further properties are **solution concepts**

- Set of payoff vectors satisfying further properties are **solution concepts**
- Can reflect payoff distribution, which is

- Set of payoff vectors satisfying further properties are **solution concepts**
- Can reflect payoff distribution, which is
 - ▶ ...*fair*...
 - ▶ ...*non-discriminatory*...
 - ▶ ...*stable (players will accept it)*...
 - ▶ ...

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE CORE

Idea: *Payoff distribution leads to cooperation...*

The core

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **core** $\mathcal{C}(v)$ is

$$\mathcal{C}(v) = \{x \in \mathcal{I}^*(v) \mid x(S) \geq v(S), \forall S \subseteq N\}.$$

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE CORE

Idea: *Payoff distribution leads to cooperation...*

The core

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **core** $\mathcal{C}(v)$ is

$$\mathcal{C}(v) = \{x \in \mathcal{I}^*(v) \mid x(S) \geq v(S), \forall S \subseteq N\}.$$

■ assumption: *homo economicus*

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE CORE

Idea: *Payoff distribution leads to cooperation...*

The core

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **core** $\mathcal{C}(v)$ is

$$\mathcal{C}(v) = \{x \in \mathcal{I}^*(v) \mid x(S) \geq v(S), \forall S \subseteq N\}.$$

■ assumption: *homo economicus*

- ▶ model of human as a player
- ▶ strictly rational and selfish
- ▶ follows his subjective goals

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE CORE

Idea: *Payoff distribution leads to cooperation...*

The core

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **core** $\mathcal{C}(v)$ is

$$\mathcal{C}(v) = \{x \in \mathcal{I}^*(v) \mid x(S) \geq v(S), \forall S \subseteq N\}.$$

- assumption: *homo economicus*
 - ▶ model of human as a player
 - ▶ strictly rational and selfish
 - ▶ follows his subjective goals
- $v(N)$... value, which is distributed among players

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE CORE

Idea: *Payoff distribution leads to cooperation...*

The core

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **core** $\mathcal{C}(v)$ is

$$\mathcal{C}(v) = \{x \in \mathcal{I}^*(v) \mid x(S) \geq v(S), \forall S \subseteq N\}.$$

- assumption: *homo economicus*
 - ▶ model of human as a player
 - ▶ strictly rational and selfish
 - ▶ follows his subjective goals
- $v(N)$... value, which is distributed among players
- $x(S) > v(S) \implies$ coalition S does not leave N

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE CORE

Idea: *Payoff distribution leads to cooperation...*

The core

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **core** $\mathcal{C}(v)$ is

$$\mathcal{C}(v) = \{x \in \mathcal{I}^*(v) \mid x(S) \geq v(S), \forall S \subseteq N\}.$$

- assumption: *homo economicus*
 - ▶ model of human as a player
 - ▶ strictly rational and selfish
 - ▶ follows his subjective goals
- $v(N)$... value, which is distributed among players
- $x(S) > v(S) \implies$ coalition S does not leave N
 - ▶ would lead to (S, v_S)
 - ▶ $v(S)$... distributed value

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE SHAPLEY VALUE

Idea: *Divide the profit in a fair way...*

The Shapley value

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **Shapley value** $\phi(v)$ of player i is

$$\phi_i(v) = \sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i} \frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!} (v(S \cup i) - v(S))$$

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE SHAPLEY VALUE

Idea: *Divide the profit in a fair way...*

The Shapley value

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **Shapley value** $\phi(v)$ of player i is

$$\phi_i(v) = \sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i} \frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!} (v(S \cup i) - v(S))$$

■ $v(S \cup i) - v(S)$

■ $\frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!}$

■ $\sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i}$

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE SHAPLEY VALUE

Idea: *Divide the profit in a fair way...*

The Shapley value

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **Shapley value** $\phi(v)$ of player i is

$$\phi_i(v) = \sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i} \frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!} (v(S \cup i) - v(S))$$

- $v(S \cup i) - v(S)$
 - ▶ *marginal contribution* (of player i in $S \cup i$)
- $\frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!}$
- $\sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i}$

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE SHAPLEY VALUE

Idea: *Divide the profit in a fair way...*

The Shapley value

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **Shapley value** $\phi(v)$ of player i is

$$\phi_i(v) = \sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i} \frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!} (v(S \cup i) - v(S))$$

- $v(S \cup i) - v(S)$
 - ▶ *marginal contribution* (of player i in $S \cup i$)
- $\frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!}$
 - ▶ weights reflecting different sizes of coalitions
- $\sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i}$

EXAMPLES OF SOLUTION CONCEPTS: THE SHAPLEY VALUE

Idea: *Divide the profit in a fair way...*

The Shapley value

For a cooperative game (N, v) , the **Shapley value** $\phi(v)$ of player i is

$$\phi_i(v) = \sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i} \frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!} (v(S \cup i) - v(S))$$

- $v(S \cup i) - v(S)$
 - ▶ *marginal contribution* (of player i in $S \cup i$)
- $\frac{s!(n-s-1)!}{n!}$
 - ▶ weights reflecting different sizes of coalitions
- $\sum_{S \subseteq N \setminus i}$
 - ▶ sum of all marginal contributions of i

Formally:

Formally:

1. sets of payoff vectors
2. functions on games

Formally:

1. sets of payoff vectors
 - ▶ $\Sigma(v) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \dots\}$
2. functions on games

Formally:

1. sets of payoff vectors

▶ $\Sigma(v) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \dots\}$

2. functions on games

▶ $\Sigma: \Gamma^n \rightarrow 2^{\mathbb{R}^n}$

Formally:

1. sets of payoff vectors

▶ $\Sigma(v) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \dots\}$

2. functions on games

▶ $\Sigma: \Gamma^n \rightarrow 2^{\mathbb{R}^n}$

We distinguish

Formally:

1. sets of payoff vectors
 - ▶ $\Sigma(v) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \dots\}$
2. functions on games
 - ▶ $\Sigma: \Gamma^n \rightarrow 2^{\mathbb{R}^n}$

We distinguish

1. **single-point** solution concepts
2. **multi-point** solution concepts

Formally:

1. sets of payoff vectors
 - ▶ $\Sigma(v) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \dots\}$
2. functions on games
 - ▶ $\Sigma: \Gamma^n \rightarrow 2^{\mathbb{R}^n}$

We distinguish

1. **single-point** solution concepts
 - ▶ as a set: $\Sigma(v) = \{x\}$
 - we prefer: $\Sigma(v) = x$
2. **multi-point** solution concepts

Formally:

1. sets of payoff vectors

▶ $\Sigma(v) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid \dots\}$

2. functions on games

▶ $\Sigma: \Gamma^n \rightarrow 2^{\mathbb{R}^n}$

We distinguish

1. **single-point** solution concepts

▶ as a set: $\Sigma(v) = \{x\}$

■ we prefer: $\Sigma(v) = x$

▶ as a function: $\Sigma: \Gamma^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$

2. **multi-point** solution concepts

ALTERNATIVE WAY TO DEFINE THE SHAPLEY VALUE

It is possible to define it using its properties...

The Shapley value

The **Shapley value** $\phi(v)$ is the only function $f: \Gamma^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ satisfying for all games $(N, v), (N, w)$:

1. (AXIOM OF EFFICIENCE)

$$\blacktriangleright \sum_{i \in N} f_i(v) = v(N)$$

2. (AXIOM OF SYMMETRY)

$$\blacktriangleright \forall i, j \in N (\forall S \subseteq N \setminus \{i, j\} : v(S \cup i) = v(S \cup j)) \implies f_i(v) = f_j(v)$$

3. (AXIOM OF NULL PLAYER)

$$\blacktriangleright \forall i \in N (\forall S \subseteq N : v(S) = v(S \cup i)) \implies f_i(v) = 0$$

4. (AXIOM OF ADDITIVITY)

$$\blacktriangleright v, w \in \Gamma^n : f(v + w) = f(v) + f(w)$$

Cooperative games

A **cooperative game** is given by a set of players and real values representing the profit of each subset of players (*coalition*). These values are encoded by the *characteristic function* of a game. The goal of the cooperative game theory is to find payoffs (in form of **payoff vectors**) for individual players based on values of the game. Payoff vectors satisfying further properties form **solution concepts**. These can be expressed as:

1. sets of payoff vectors
2. functions on games
 - 2.1 defined by formula
 - 2.2 defined by its properties