

```

|----- MODULE ZenWithTerms -----|

EXTENDS Naturals, FiniteSets, Sequences, TLC

|-----|

CONSTANTS Values

CONSTANTS Nodes

CONSTANTS
  Join,
  PublishRequest,
  PublishResponse,
  Commit

|-----|

VARIABLE messages

VARIABLE descendant

VARIABLE initialConfiguration
VARIABLE initialValue
VARIABLE initialAcceptedVersion

VARIABLE currentTerm
VARIABLE lastCommittedConfiguration
VARIABLE lastAcceptedTerm
VARIABLE lastAcceptedVersion
VARIABLE lastAcceptedValue
VARIABLE lastAcceptedConfiguration
VARIABLE joinVotes
VARIABLE startedJoinSinceLastReboot
VARIABLE electionWon
VARIABLE lastPublishedVersion
VARIABLE lastPublishedConfiguration
VARIABLE publishVotes

```

$$Terms \triangleq Nat$$

$$Versions \triangleq Nat$$

$$ValidConfigs \triangleq \text{SUBSET } (Nodes) \setminus \{\{\}\}$$

$$InitialVersions \triangleq Nat$$

$$IsQuorum(votes, config) \triangleq Cardinality(votes \cap config) * 2 > Cardinality(config)$$

$$\begin{aligned} IsElectionQuorum(n, votes) &\triangleq \\ &\wedge IsQuorum(votes, lastCommittedConfiguration[n]) \\ &\wedge IsQuorum(votes, lastAcceptedConfiguration[n]) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} IsPublishQuorum(n, votes) &\triangleq \\ &\wedge IsQuorum(votes, lastCommittedConfiguration[n]) \\ &\wedge IsQuorum(votes, lastPublishedConfiguration[n]) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} Init &\triangleq \wedge messages = \{\} \\ &\wedge descendant = \{\} \\ &\wedge initialConfiguration \in ValidConfigs \\ &\wedge initialValue \in Values \\ &\wedge initialAcceptedVersion \in [Nodes \rightarrow InitialVersions] \\ &\wedge currentTerm = [n \in Nodes \mapsto 0] \\ &\wedge lastCommittedConfiguration = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \{\}] \text{ empty config} \\ &\wedge lastAcceptedTerm = [n \in Nodes \mapsto 0] \\ &\wedge lastAcceptedVersion = initialAcceptedVersion \\ &\wedge lastAcceptedValue \in \{[n \in Nodes \mapsto v] : v \in Values\} \text{ all agree on initial value} \\ &\wedge lastAcceptedConfiguration = [n \in Nodes \mapsto lastCommittedConfiguration[n]] \\ &\wedge joinVotes = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \{\}] \\ &\wedge startedJoinSinceLastReboot = [n \in Nodes \mapsto FALSE] \\ &\wedge electionWon = [n \in Nodes \mapsto FALSE] \\ &\wedge lastPublishedVersion = [n \in Nodes \mapsto 0] \\ &\wedge lastPublishedConfiguration = [n \in Nodes \mapsto lastCommittedConfiguration[n]] \\ &\wedge publishVotes = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \{\}] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} SetInitialState(n) &\triangleq \\ &\wedge lastAcceptedConfiguration[n] = \{\} \text{ not already bootstrapped} \end{aligned}$$

$\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{lastAcceptedTerm}[n] = 0, \text{"lastAcceptedTerm should be 0"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{lastCommittedConfiguration}[n] = \{\}, \text{"lastCommittedConfiguration should be empty"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{lastPublishedVersion}[n] = 0, \text{"lastPublishedVersion should be 0"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{lastPublishedConfiguration}[n] = \{\}, \text{"lastPublishedConfiguration should be empty"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{electionWon}[n] = \text{FALSE}, \text{"electionWon should be FALSE"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{joinVotes}[n] = \{\}, \text{"joinVotes should be empty"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{publishVotes}[n] = \{\}, \text{"publishVotes should be empty"})$
 $\wedge \text{lastAcceptedConfiguration}' = [\text{lastAcceptedConfiguration} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \text{initialConfiguration}]$
 $\wedge \text{lastAcceptedValue}' = [\text{lastAcceptedValue} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \text{initialValue}]$
 $\wedge \text{lastCommittedConfiguration}' = [\text{lastCommittedConfiguration} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \text{initialConfiguration}]$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{lastAcceptedTerm}[n] = 0, \text{"lastAcceptedTerm should be 0"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{lastAcceptedConfiguration}'[n] \neq \{\}, \text{"lastAcceptedConfiguration should be non-empty"})$
 $\wedge \text{Assert}(\text{lastCommittedConfiguration}'[n] \neq \{\}, \text{"lastCommittedConfiguration should be non-empty"})$
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{descendant}, \text{initialConfiguration}, \text{initialValue}, \text{messages}, \text{lastAcceptedTerm}, \text{lastAcceptedVersion},$
 $\text{lastPublishedVersion}, \text{lastPublishedConfiguration}, \text{electionWon}, \text{joinVotes}, \text{publishVotes},$
 $\text{startedJoinSinceLastReboot}, \text{currentTerm}, \text{initialAcceptedVersion} \rangle$

$\text{HandleStartJoin}(n, nm, t) \triangleq$
 $\wedge t > \text{currentTerm}[n]$
 $\wedge \text{LET}$
 $\text{joinRequest} \triangleq [\text{method} \mapsto \text{Join},$
 $\text{source} \mapsto n,$
 $\text{dest} \mapsto nm,$
 $\text{term} \mapsto t,$
 $\text{laTerm} \mapsto \text{lastAcceptedTerm}[n],$
 $\text{laVersion} \mapsto \text{lastAcceptedVersion}[n]]$
 IN
 $\wedge \text{currentTerm}' = [\text{currentTerm} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = t]$
 $\wedge \text{lastPublishedVersion}' = [\text{lastPublishedVersion} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = 0]$
 $\wedge \text{lastPublishedConfiguration}' = [\text{lastPublishedConfiguration} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \text{lastAcceptedConfiguration}[n]]$
 $\wedge \text{startedJoinSinceLastReboot}' = [\text{startedJoinSinceLastReboot} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \text{TRUE}]$
 $\wedge \text{electionWon}' = [\text{electionWon} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \text{FALSE}]$
 $\wedge \text{joinVotes}' = [\text{joinVotes} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \{\}]$
 $\wedge \text{publishVotes}' = [\text{publishVotes} \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \{\}]$
 $\wedge \text{messages}' = \text{messages} \cup \{\text{joinRequest}\}$
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{lastCommittedConfiguration}, \text{lastAcceptedConfiguration}, \text{lastAcceptedVersion},$
 $\text{lastAcceptedValue}, \text{lastAcceptedTerm}, \text{descendant}, \text{initialConfiguration}, \text{initialValue}, \text{initialAcceptedVersion} \rangle$

$\text{HandleJoin}(n, m) \triangleq$
 $\wedge m.\text{method} = \text{Join}$
 $\wedge m.\text{term} = \text{currentTerm}[n]$
 $\wedge \text{startedJoinSinceLastReboot}[n]$

$\wedge \vee m.laTerm < lastAcceptedTerm[n]$
 $\vee \wedge m.laTerm = lastAcceptedTerm[n]$
 $\wedge m.laVersion \leq lastAcceptedVersion[n]$
 $\wedge lastAcceptedConfiguration[n] \neq \{\}$ must be bootstrapped
 $\wedge joinVotes' = [joinVotes \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = @ \cup \{m.source\}]$
 $\wedge electionWon' = [electionWon \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = IsElectionQuorum(n, joinVotes'[n])]$
 $\wedge \text{IF } electionWon[n] = \text{FALSE} \wedge electionWon'[n]$
 THEN

 $\wedge lastPublishedVersion' = [lastPublishedVersion \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = lastAcceptedVersion[n]]$
 ELSE
 UNCHANGED $\langle lastPublishedVersion \rangle$
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle lastCommittedConfiguration, currentTerm, publishVotes, messages, descendant,$
 $lastAcceptedVersion, lastAcceptedValue, lastAcceptedConfiguration,$
 $lastAcceptedTerm, startedJoinSinceLastReboot, lastPublishedConfiguration,$
 $initialConfiguration, initialValue, initialAcceptedVersion \rangle$

$HandleClientValue(n, t, v, val, cfg) \triangleq$
 $\wedge electionWon[n]$
 $\wedge lastPublishedVersion[n] = lastAcceptedVersion[n]$ means we have the last published value / config (useful for CAS op
 $\wedge t = currentTerm[n]$
 $\wedge v > lastPublishedVersion[n]$
 $\wedge cfg \neq lastAcceptedConfiguration[n] \Rightarrow lastCommittedConfiguration[n] = lastAcceptedConfiguration[n]$ only al
 $\wedge IsQuorum(joinVotes[n], cfg)$ only allow reconfiguration if we have a quorum of (join) votes for the new config
 $\wedge \text{LET}$
 $publishRequests \triangleq \{[method \mapsto PublishRequest,$
 $source \mapsto n,$
 $dest \mapsto ns,$
 $term \mapsto t,$
 $version \mapsto v,$
 $value \mapsto val,$
 $config \mapsto cfg,$
 $commConf \mapsto lastCommittedConfiguration[n]] : ns \in Nodes\}$
 $newEntry \triangleq [prevT \mapsto lastAcceptedTerm[n],$
 $prevV \mapsto lastAcceptedVersion[n],$
 $nextT \mapsto t,$
 $nextV \mapsto v]$
 $matchingElems \triangleq \{e \in descendant :$
 $\wedge e.nextT = newEntry.prevT$
 $\wedge e.nextV = newEntry.prevV\}$
 $newTransitiveElems \triangleq \{[prevT \mapsto e.prevT,$
 $prevV \mapsto e.prevV,$
 $nextT \mapsto newEntry.nextT,$
 $nextV \mapsto newEntry.nextV] : e \in matchingElems\}$

IN
 $\wedge descendant' = descendant \cup \{newEntry\} \cup newTransitiveElems$
 $\wedge lastPublishedVersion' = [lastPublishedVersion \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = v]$
 $\wedge lastPublishedConfiguration' = [lastPublishedConfiguration \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = cfg]$
 $\wedge publishVotes' = [publishVotes \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \{\}]$ *publishVotes are only counted per publish version*
 $\wedge messages' = messages \cup publishRequests$
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle startedJoinSinceLastReboot, lastCommittedConfiguration, currentTerm, electionWon,$
 $lastAcceptedVersion, lastAcceptedValue, lastAcceptedTerm, lastAcceptedConfiguration,$
 $joinVotes, initialConfiguration, initialValue, initialAcceptedVersion \rangle$

$HandlePublishRequest(n, m) \triangleq$
 $\wedge m.method = PublishRequest$
 $\wedge m.term = currentTerm[n]$
 $\wedge (m.term = lastAcceptedTerm[n]) \Rightarrow (m.version > lastAcceptedVersion[n])$
 $\wedge lastAcceptedTerm' = [lastAcceptedTerm \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = m.term]$
 $\wedge lastAcceptedVersion' = [lastAcceptedVersion \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = m.version]$
 $\wedge lastAcceptedValue' = [lastAcceptedValue \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = m.value]$
 $\wedge lastAcceptedConfiguration' = [lastAcceptedConfiguration \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = m.config]$
 $\wedge lastCommittedConfiguration' = [lastCommittedConfiguration \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = m.commConf]$
 $\wedge \text{LET}$
 $response \triangleq [method \mapsto PublishResponse,$
 $source \mapsto n,$
 $dest \mapsto m.source,$
 $term \mapsto m.term,$
 $version \mapsto m.version]$
 IN
 $\wedge messages' = messages \cup \{response\}$
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle startedJoinSinceLastReboot, currentTerm, descendant, lastPublishedConfiguration,$
 $electionWon, lastPublishedVersion, joinVotes, publishVotes, initialConfiguration,$
 $initialValue, initialAcceptedVersion \rangle$

$HandlePublishResponse(n, m) \triangleq$
 $\wedge m.method = PublishResponse$
 $\wedge electionWon[n]$
 $\wedge m.term = currentTerm[n]$
 $\wedge m.version = lastPublishedVersion[n]$
 $\wedge publishVotes' = [publishVotes \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = @ \cup \{m.source\}]$
 $\wedge \text{IF}$
 $IsPublishQuorum(n, publishVotes'[n])$
 THEN
 LET
 $commitRequests \triangleq \{[method \mapsto Commit,$
 $source \mapsto n,$

$dest \mapsto ns,$
 $term \mapsto currentTerm[n],$
 $version \mapsto lastPublishedVersion[n] : ns \in Nodes\}$
 IN
 $\wedge messages' = messages \cup commitRequests$
 ELSE
 UNCHANGED $\langle messages \rangle$
 \wedge UNCHANGED $\langle startedJoinSinceLastReboot, lastCommittedConfiguration, currentTerm, electionWon, descendant,$
 $lastAcceptedVersion, lastAcceptedValue, lastAcceptedTerm, lastAcceptedConfiguration,$
 $lastPublishedVersion, lastPublishedConfiguration, joinVotes, initialConfiguration,$
 $initialValue, initialAcceptedVersion \rangle$

$HandleCommit(n, m) \triangleq$
 $\wedge m.method = Commit$
 $\wedge m.term = currentTerm[n]$
 $\wedge m.term = lastAcceptedTerm[n]$
 $\wedge m.version = lastAcceptedVersion[n]$
 $\wedge (electionWon[n] \Rightarrow lastAcceptedVersion[n] = lastPublishedVersion[n])$
 $\wedge lastCommittedConfiguration' = [lastCommittedConfiguration \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = lastAcceptedConfiguration[n]]$
 \wedge UNCHANGED $\langle currentTerm, joinVotes, messages, lastAcceptedTerm, lastAcceptedValue, startedJoinSinceLast,$
 $electionWon, lastAcceptedConfiguration, lastAcceptedVersion, lastPublishedVersion, publishVotes,$
 $lastPublishedConfiguration, initialConfiguration, initialValue, initialAcceptedVersion \rangle$

$RestartNode(n) \triangleq$
 $\wedge joinVotes' = [joinVotes \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \{\}]$
 $\wedge startedJoinSinceLastReboot' = [startedJoinSinceLastReboot \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = FALSE]$
 $\wedge electionWon' = [electionWon \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = FALSE]$
 $\wedge lastPublishedVersion' = [lastPublishedVersion \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = 0]$
 $\wedge lastPublishedConfiguration' = [lastPublishedConfiguration \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = lastAcceptedConfiguration[n]]$
 $\wedge publishVotes' = [publishVotes \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = \{\}]$
 \wedge UNCHANGED $\langle messages, lastAcceptedVersion, currentTerm, lastCommittedConfiguration, descendant,$
 $lastAcceptedTerm, lastAcceptedValue, lastAcceptedConfiguration, initialConfiguration,$
 $initialValue, initialAcceptedVersion \rangle$

$Next \triangleq$
 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : SetInitialState(n)$
 $\vee \exists n, nm \in Nodes : \exists t \in Terms : HandleStartJoin(n, nm, t)$
 $\vee \exists m \in messages : HandleJoin(m.dest, m)$
 $\vee \exists n \in Nodes : \exists t \in Terms : \exists v \in Versions : \exists val \in Values : \exists vs \in ValidConfigs : HandleClientValue(n, t,$
 $\vee \exists m \in messages : HandlePublishRequest(m.dest, m)$
 $\vee \exists m \in messages : HandlePublishResponse(m.dest, m)$
 $\vee \exists m \in messages : HandleCommit(m.dest, m)$

$\forall \exists n \in Nodes : RestartNode(n)$

SingleNodeInvariant \triangleq

$\forall n \in Nodes :$

$\wedge lastAcceptedTerm[n] \leq currentTerm[n]$

$\wedge electionWon[n] = IsElectionQuorum(n, joinVotes[n])$ cached value is consistent

$\wedge \text{IF } electionWon[n] \text{ THEN } lastPublishedVersion[n] \geq lastAcceptedVersion[n] \text{ ELSE } lastPublishedVersion[n] =$

$\wedge electionWon[n] \Rightarrow startedJoinSinceLastReboot[n]$

$\wedge publishVotes[n] \neq \{\} \Rightarrow electionWon[n]$

OneMasterPerTerm \triangleq

$\forall m1, m2 \in messages :$

$\wedge m1.method = PublishRequest$

$\wedge m2.method = PublishRequest$

$\wedge m1.term = m2.term$

$\Rightarrow m1.source = m2.source$

LogMatching \triangleq

$\forall m1, m2 \in messages :$

$\wedge m1.method = PublishRequest$

$\wedge m2.method = PublishRequest$

$\wedge m1.term = m2.term$

$\wedge m1.version = m2.version$

$\Rightarrow m1.value = m2.value$

CommittedPublishRequest(mp) \triangleq

$\wedge mp.method = PublishRequest$

$\wedge \exists mc \in messages :$

$\wedge mc.method = Commit$

$\wedge mp.term = mc.term$

$\wedge mp.version = mc.version$

DescendantRelationIsStrictlyOrdered \triangleq

$\forall d \in descendant :$

$\wedge d.prevT \leq d.nextT$

$\wedge d.prevV < d.nextV$

DescendantRelationIsTransitive \triangleq

$\forall d1, d2 \in descendant :$

$d1.nextT = d2.prevT \wedge d1.nextV = d2.prevV$

$\Rightarrow [prevT \mapsto d1.prevT, prevV \mapsto d1.prevV, nextT \mapsto d2.nextT, nextV \mapsto d2.nextV] \in descendant$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{NewerOpsBasedOnOlderCommittedOps} \triangleq \\
& \forall m1, m2 \in \text{messages} : \\
& \quad \wedge \text{CommittedPublishRequest}(m1) \\
& \quad \wedge m2.\text{method} = \text{PublishRequest} \\
& \quad \wedge m2.\text{term} \geq m1.\text{term} \\
& \quad \wedge m2.\text{version} > m1.\text{version} \\
& \Rightarrow [\text{prevT} \mapsto m1.\text{term}, \text{prevV} \mapsto m1.\text{version}, \text{nextT} \mapsto m2.\text{term}, \text{nextV} \mapsto m2.\text{version}] \in \text{descendant}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{CommittedValuesDescendantsFromCommittedValues} \triangleq \\
& \forall m1, m2 \in \text{messages} : \\
& \quad \wedge \text{CommittedPublishRequest}(m1) \\
& \quad \wedge \text{CommittedPublishRequest}(m2) \\
& \quad \wedge \vee m1.\text{term} \neq m2.\text{term} \\
& \quad \vee m1.\text{version} \neq m2.\text{version} \\
& \Rightarrow \\
& \quad \vee [\text{prevT} \mapsto m1.\text{term}, \text{prevV} \mapsto m1.\text{version}, \text{nextT} \mapsto m2.\text{term}, \text{nextV} \mapsto m2.\text{version}] \in \text{descendant} \\
& \quad \vee [\text{prevT} \mapsto m2.\text{term}, \text{prevV} \mapsto m2.\text{version}, \text{nextT} \mapsto m1.\text{term}, \text{nextV} \mapsto m1.\text{version}] \in \text{descendant}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{CommittedValuesDescendantsFromInitialValue} \triangleq \\
& \exists v \in \text{InitialVersions} : \\
& \quad \wedge \exists n \in \text{Nodes} : v = \text{initialAcceptedVersion}[n] \\
& \quad \wedge \exists \text{votes} \in \text{SUBSET}(\text{initialConfiguration}) : \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{IsQuorum}(\text{votes}, \text{initialConfiguration}) \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \forall n \in \text{votes} : \text{initialAcceptedVersion}[n] \leq v \\
& \quad \wedge \forall m \in \text{messages} : \\
& \quad \quad \text{CommittedPublishRequest}(m) \\
& \quad \Rightarrow \\
& \quad [\text{prevT} \mapsto 0, \text{prevV} \mapsto v, \text{nextT} \mapsto m.\text{term}, \text{nextV} \mapsto m.\text{version}] \in \text{descendant}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{CommitHasQuorumVsPreviousCommittedConfiguration} \triangleq \\
& \forall mc \in \text{messages} : mc.\text{method} = \text{Commit} \\
& \Rightarrow (\forall \text{mprq} \in \text{messages} : (\wedge \text{mprq}.\text{method} = \text{PublishRequest} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{mprq}.\text{term} = mc.\text{term} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{mprq}.\text{version} = mc.\text{version}) \\
& \quad \Rightarrow \text{IsQuorum}(\{\text{mprs}.\text{source} : \text{mprs} \in \{\text{mprs} \in \text{messages} : \wedge \text{mprs}.\text{method} = \text{PublishResponse} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{mprs}.\text{term} = \text{mprq}.\text{term} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{mprs}.\text{version} = \text{mprq}.\text{version} \\
& \quad \}, \text{mprq}.\text{commConf}))
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{P2bInvariant} \triangleq \\
& \forall mc \in \text{messages} : mc.\text{method} = \text{Commit} \\
& \Rightarrow (\forall \text{mprq} \in \text{messages} : \text{mprq}.\text{method} = \text{PublishRequest}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\Rightarrow (mprq.term > mc.term \Rightarrow mprq.version > mc.version))$$

$$\begin{aligned} StateConstraint &\triangleq \\ &\wedge \forall n \in Nodes : \text{IF } currentTerm[n] \leq 1 \text{ THEN } lastPublishedVersion[n] \leq 2 \text{ ELSE } lastPublishedVersion[n] \leq 3 \\ &\wedge Cardinality(messages) \leq 15 \end{aligned}$$
