

# COMP 2804 — Solutions Assignment 4

## Question 1:

- Write your name and student number.

**Solution:** Diego Maradona<sup>1</sup>, 10

**Question 2:** Consider six fair dice  $D_1, \dots, D_6$ , each one having six faces. For each  $i$  with  $1 \leq i \leq 6$ , the die  $D_i$  has one face labeled  $i$ , whereas its other five faces are labeled zero.

You roll each of these dice once. Consider the random variable  $X$ , whose value is the sum of the results of these six rolls.

Determine the expected value  $\mathbb{E}(X)$  of  $X$ .

**Solution:** We introduce random variables  $X_1, \dots, X_6$ , where  $X_i$  is the result of rolling die  $D_i$ . Note that  $X_i$  is either  $i$  or 0. Since  $X_i = i$  with probability  $1/6$ , and  $X_i = 0$  with probability  $5/6$ , we have

$$\mathbb{E}(X_i) = i \cdot \Pr(X_i = i) + 0 \cdot \Pr(X_i = 0) = i/6.$$

Since  $X = \sum_{i=1}^6 X_i$ , we have, using the Linearity of Expectation,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}(X) &= \mathbb{E}\left(\sum_{i=1}^6 X_i\right) \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^6 \mathbb{E}(X_i) \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^6 i/6 \\ &= \frac{1 + 2 + 3 + 4 + 5 + 6}{6} \\ &= 7/2. \end{aligned}$$

**Question 3:** Consider a standard red die and a standard blue die; both of them are fair. You roll each die once. Consider the random variables

$X$  = the result of the red die plus the result of the blue die,  
 $Y$  = the result of the red die minus the result of the blue die.

1. Prove that  $\mathbb{E}(X \cdot Y) = \mathbb{E}(X) \cdot \mathbb{E}(Y)$ .

---

<sup>1</sup>El Pibe de Oro

2. Are  $X$  and  $Y$  independent random variables? As always, justify your answer.

**Solution:** Let  $R$  be the result of the red die and let  $B$  be the result of the blue die. Then  $X = R + B$  and  $Y = R - B$ .

By symmetry,  $\mathbb{E}(R) = \mathbb{E}(B)$ . Thus,

$$\mathbb{E}(Y) = \mathbb{E}(R - B) = \mathbb{E}(R) - \mathbb{E}(B) = 0$$

and, thus,

$$\mathbb{E}(X) \cdot \mathbb{E}(Y) = 0.$$

We next note that

$$X \cdot Y = (R + B)(R - B) = R^2 - B^2.$$

Thus,

$$\mathbb{E}(X \cdot Y) = \mathbb{E}(R^2 - B^2) = \mathbb{E}(R^2) - \mathbb{E}(B^2).$$

By symmetry,  $\mathbb{E}(R^2) = \mathbb{E}(B^2)$ . Therefore,  $\mathbb{E}(X \cdot Y) = 0$ . This proves that

$$\mathbb{E}(X \cdot Y) = \mathbb{E}(X) \cdot \mathbb{E}(Y).$$

**Note:**  $\mathbb{E}(R^2) \neq (\mathbb{E}(R))^2$ .

Are  $X$  and  $Y$  independent random variables? If  $Y = 0$ , then  $X$  must be even. Based on this,

$$\Pr(X = 11 \wedge Y = 0) \neq \Pr(X = 11) \cdot \Pr(Y = 0),$$

because the left-hand side is zero, whereas the right-hand side is  $2/36$  times  $1/6$ , which is non-zero.

**Question 4:** When FX and his girlfriend XF have a child, this child is a boy with probability  $1/2$  and a girl with probability  $1/2$ , independently of the sex of their other children. FX and XF stop having children as soon as they have a girl or four children.

Consider the random variables

$$\begin{aligned} C &= \text{the number of children that FX and XF have,} \\ B &= \text{the number of boys that FX and XF have.} \end{aligned}$$

Determine the expected values  $\mathbb{E}(C)$  and  $\mathbb{E}(B)$ .

**Solution:** The sample space is

$$S = \{g, bg, bbg, bbbg, bbbb\}$$

and  $\Pr(g) = 1/2$ ,  $\Pr(bg) = 1/4$ ,  $\Pr(bbg) = 1/8$ ,  $\Pr(bbbg) = 1/16$ , and  $\Pr(bbbb) = 1/16$ . (Sanity check: These probabilities add up to one.)

The possible values for  $C$  are 1, 2, 3, 4. Since  $\Pr(C = 1) = 1/2$ ,  $\Pr(C = 2) = 1/4$ ,  $\Pr(C = 3) = 1/8$ , and  $\Pr(C = 4) = 1/16 + 1/16 = 1/8$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbb{E}(C) &= \sum_{k=1}^4 k \cdot \Pr(C = k) \\ &= 1 \cdot 1/2 + 2 \cdot 1/4 + 3 \cdot 1/8 + 4 \cdot 1/8 \\ &= 15/8.\end{aligned}$$

The possible values for  $B$  are 0, 1, 2, 3, 4. Since  $\Pr(B = 0) = 1/2$ ,  $\Pr(B = 1) = 1/4$ ,  $\Pr(B = 2) = 1/8$ ,  $\Pr(B = 3) = 1/16$ , and  $\Pr(B = 4) = 1/16$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbb{E}(B) &= \sum_{k=0}^4 k \cdot \Pr(C = k) \\ &= 0 \cdot 1/2 + 1 \cdot 1/4 + 2 \cdot 1/8 + 3 \cdot 1/16 + 4 \cdot 1/16 \\ &= 15/16.\end{aligned}$$

**Remark:** If  $G$  denotes the number of girls, then

$$\mathbb{E}(G) = \mathbb{E}(C - B) = \mathbb{E}(C) - \mathbb{E}(B) = 15/8 - 15/16 = 15/16 = \mathbb{E}(B).$$

**Question 5:** Consider the following algorithm, which takes as input an integer  $n \geq 1$ :

**Algorithm** MYSTERY( $n$ ):

```
// all random choices made are mutually independent
X = 0;
for  $i = 1$  to  $n$ 
  do  $a$  = random real number between  $-1$  and  $1$ ;
     $b$  = random real number between  $-1$  and  $1$ ;
    if  $a^2 + b^2 \leq 1$ 
      then  $X = X + 1$ 
    endif
  endfor;
 $Y = \frac{4}{n} \cdot X$ ;
return  $Y$ 
```

The output  $Y$  of this algorithm is a random variable. Determine the expected value  $\mathbb{E}(Y)$  of this random variable.

*Hint:* If you implement this algorithm and run it several times for large values of  $n$ , then you may recognize the output. For the derivation of your value of  $\mathbb{E}(Y)$ , use indicator random variables.

**Solution:** We first determine  $\mathbb{E}(X)$ . We introduce indicator random variables  $X_1, \dots, X_n$ , where

$$X_i = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } X \text{ is increased in iteration } i, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

What is  $\mathbb{E}(X_i)$ ? In iteration  $i$ , the algorithm chooses a uniformly random point  $(a, b)$  in a square with sides of length 2. This square has area 4. The value of  $X$  is increased if and only if this point is inside the circle with center at the origin and whose radius is 1. This circle has area  $\pi$ . Thus,

$$\mathbb{E}(X_i) = \Pr(X_i = 1) = \frac{\text{area circle}}{\text{area square}} = \pi/4.$$

Since  $X = \sum_{i=1}^n X_i$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}(X) &= \mathbb{E}\left(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i\right) \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbb{E}(X_i) \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^n \pi/4 \\ &= \pi n/4. \end{aligned}$$

This gives

$$\mathbb{E}(Y) = \mathbb{E}\left(\frac{4}{n} \cdot X\right) = \frac{4}{n} \cdot \mathbb{E}(X) = \frac{4}{n} \cdot \pi n/4 = \pi.$$

**Question 6:** In the Lotto 6/49 lottery, you pick a 6-element subset  $X$  from the set  $N = \{1, \dots, 49\}$  and then a machine picks, uniformly at random, a 6-element subset  $Y$  from  $N$ .

1. The number  $|X \cap Y|$  of numbers you picked correctly is a random variable. What is the expected value of this random variable? Give an exact answer, some Python code is provided below that can help you with the calculation.
2. [Warning: The following is an oversimplification, don't use it to make life choices.] The payout in Lotto 6/49 is relative to the Jackpot, which we will call  $x$ . The payout is defined as follows:
  - 6 correct numbers:  $x$
  - 5 correct numbers  $x/95$
  - 4 correct numbers  $x/4365$
  - 3 correct numbers 10
  - 2 correct numbers 3

If you are given one Lotto 6/49 ticket, what is your expected payout? Give an exact answer (which will include the variable  $x$ ).

3. A Lotto 6/49 ticket costs \$3. What is the minimum jackpot value  $x$  that gives a payout of at least \$3?

#### Useful Python Code

```

morin@lauteschwein:~$ python3
Python 3.8.5 (default, Jul 28 2020, 12:59:40)
[GCC 9.3.0] on linux
Type "help", "copyright", "credits" or "license" for more information.
>>> from fractions import Fraction
>>> from math import factorial
>>> binom=lambda n,k: Fraction(factorial(n),factorial(k)*factorial(n-k))
>>> n = 5
>>> print(binom(n,3)/2**n)
5/16
>>> sum([binom(n,k) for k in range(n+1)])
Fraction(32, 1)
>>> sum([binom(n,k)/2**n for k in range(n+1)])
Fraction(1, 1)

```

#### Solution:

1. In the following,  $X$  is the 6-element subset from  $\{1, \dots, 49\}$  that you have picked before the actual lottery takes place; this subset is not random. During the lottery, the 6-element subset  $Y$  is chosen uniformly at random.

The possible values for  $|X \cap Y|$  are 0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6. For each  $i$  with  $0 \leq i \leq 6$ , it follows from the Product Rule that

$$\Pr(|X \cap Y| = i) = \frac{\binom{6}{i} \binom{43}{6-i}}{\binom{49}{6}}. \quad (1)$$

This gives

$$\mathbb{E}(|X \cap Y|) = \sum_{i=0}^6 i \cdot \Pr(|X \cap Y| = i) = 36/49.$$

```

>>> pr = [ binom(6,i)*binom(43,6-i)/binom(49,6) for i in range(7)]
>>> print(", ".join([str(x) for x in pr]))
435461/998844, 68757/166474, 44075/332948, 8815/499422, 645/665896,
43/2330636, 1/13983816
>>> print(sum([i*pr[i] for i in range(7)]))
36/49

```

2. Let  $p_i = \Pr(|X \cap Y| = i)$ . We have seen an expression for  $p_i$  in (1). The expected payout is

$$x \cdot p_6 + \frac{x}{95} \cdot p_5 + \frac{x}{4365} \cdot p_4 + 10 \cdot p_3 + 3 \cdot p_2,$$

which is

$$\frac{683x}{1400661570} + \frac{572975}{998844}.$$

```
>>> payout_x = pr[6] + pr[5]/95 + pr[4]/4365
>>> print(payout_x)
683/1400661570
>>> payout_flat = pr[3]*10 + pr[2]*3
>>> print(payout_flat)
572975/998844
```

3. Solving

$$\frac{683x}{1400661570} + \frac{572975}{998844} \geq 3$$

gives

$$x \geq \frac{156331544285}{31418} \approx 4975859.19807117.$$

So the Jackpot needs to be nearly \$5,000,000 before you should even consider playing.

```
>>> print((3-payout_flat)/payout_x)
156331544285/31418
```

Note: People typically say that the 6/49 Jackpot needs to be at least \$14,000,000 before it's worth playing but when they do that they're only counting the probability of winning the entire jackpot  $\Pr(|X \cap Y| = 6) = 1/\binom{49}{6} = 1/13983816$  (about one in 14 million).<sup>2</sup>

**Question 7:** Consider the following algorithm, which takes as input an integer  $n \geq 1$ :

---

<sup>2</sup>A complicating factor is that, if two or more people win the jackpot then they must split it evenly, the calculations here don't account for that at all.

**Algorithm EULER( $n$ ):**

```

// all random choices made are mutually independent
total = 0;
i = 0;
while total ≤ n
do i = i + 1;
    xi = uniformly random element in {1, 2, ..., n};
    total = total + xi
endwhile;
return i

```

The output  $i$  of this algorithm is a random variable, which we denote by  $X$ .

1. What are the possible values that  $X$  can take? As always, justify your answer.
2. Let  $k$  be an integer with  $0 \leq k \leq n$ . Prove that

$$\Pr(X \geq k + 1) = \binom{n}{k} \cdot (1/n)^k.$$

*Hint:* What is the number of solutions of the inequality  $x_1 + x_2 + \cdots + x_k \leq n$ , where  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k$  are strictly positive integers?

3. Determine  $\mathbb{E}(X)$ .

*Hint:* You may use the fact that  $\mathbb{E}(X) = \sum_{k=0}^n \Pr(X \geq k + 1)$ .

4. Determine  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}(X)$ .

**Solution:** We start with **part 1**:

- After the first iteration,  $total \leq n$ . Therefore, there are at least two iterations. Thus,  $X \geq 2$ .
- If  $x_1 = n$ , then  $X = 2$ .
- Assume that  $X \geq n + 2$ . Then at the end of iteration  $n + 1$ ,  $total \leq n$ . However, at the end of iteration  $n + 1$ ,  $total \geq n + 1 > n$ , which is a contradiction. Thus,  $X \leq n + 1$ .
- If  $x_1 = x_2 = \cdots = x_n = 1$ , then  $X = n + 1$ .
- We conclude that  $X \in \{2, 3, \dots, n + 1\}$ .

Next we do **part 2**:

**Semi-formal proof:** If  $k = 0$ , then, since  $X$  is always at least 2,

$$\Pr(X \geq k + 1) = \Pr(X \geq 1) = 1 = \binom{n}{0} \cdot (1/n)^0.$$

Assume that  $1 \leq k \leq n$ . Observe that  $X \geq k + 1$  if and only if  $x_1 + \cdots + x_k \leq n$ . Since all  $x_i$  are at least 1, we rewrite this as

$$(x_1 - 1) + (x_2 - 1) + \cdots + (x_k - 1) \leq n - k.$$

Using  $y_i = x_i - 1$ , this becomes

$$y_1 + y_2 + \cdots + y_k \leq n - k,$$

where  $y_1, \dots, y_k \geq 0$  are integers. By Theorem 3.9.2 in the textbook, the number of solutions of this inequality is  $\binom{n}{k}$ . Since each  $y_i$  is a uniformly random element of  $\{0, 1, \dots, n - 1\}$ , the total number of possible sequences  $(y_1, \dots, y_k)$  is equal to  $n^k$ . Therefore,

$$\Pr(X \geq k + 1) = \frac{\binom{n}{k}}{n^k} = \binom{n}{k} \cdot (1/n)^k.$$

**A bit more formal:** In case you don't like this argument, let's do this a bit more carefully. Let  $t_1, \dots, t_k$  be strictly positive integers such that  $t_1 + \cdots + t_k \leq n$ . (We know that there are  $\binom{n}{k}$  many such sequences.) Since the random choices for the  $x_i$  are mutually independent,

$$\Pr(x_1 = t_1 \wedge x_2 = t_2 \wedge \cdots \wedge x_k = t_k)$$

is equal to

$$\Pr(x_1 = t_1) \cdot \Pr(x_2 = t_2) \cdots \Pr(x_k = t_k).$$

Since  $x_i$  is chosen uniformly at random from  $\{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ , we have  $\Pr(x_i = t_i) = 1/n$ . It follows that

$$\Pr(x_1 = t_1 \wedge x_2 = t_2 \wedge \cdots \wedge x_k = t_k) = 1/n^k.$$

Since this is true for each of the  $\binom{n}{k}$  solutions  $(t_1, t_2, \dots, t_k)$ , it follows that

$$\Pr(X \geq k + 1) = \frac{\binom{n}{k}}{n^k} = \binom{n}{k} \cdot (1/n)^k.$$

**Rigorous proof:** This is still not rigorous: Whether or not the  $i$ -th iteration<sup>3</sup> takes place depends on the values that are chosen for  $x_1, \dots, x_{i-1}$ .

Here is a rigorous argument. We have already seen that the claim is true for  $k = 0$ . If  $k = 1$ , then, since  $X$  is always at least 2,

$$\Pr(X \geq k + 1) = \Pr(X \geq 2) = 1 = \binom{n}{1} \cdot (1/n)^1.$$

---

<sup>3</sup>the iterations are numbered as 1, 2, 3, ...



Assume that  $2 \leq k \leq n$ . Let  $t_1, \dots, t_k$  be strictly positive integers such that  $t_1 + \dots + t_k \leq n$ .

For each  $i \geq 1$ , let  $I_i$  be the event “iteration  $i$  takes place”. Also, if the event  $I_i$  occurs, let  $x_i$  be the uniformly random element from  $\{1, 2, \dots, n\}$  that is chosen in iteration  $i$ . Finally, let  $A_i$  be the event

$$A_i = (I_i \wedge x_i = t_i).$$

The event “iteration  $k$  takes place and  $x_1 = t_1, \dots, x_k = t_k$ ” is equal to

$$A_1 \wedge A_2 \wedge \dots \wedge A_k,$$

which is the same as

$$A_k \wedge A_{k-1} \wedge \dots \wedge A_1.$$

We observe that

$$\Pr(A_k \wedge A_{k-1} \wedge \dots \wedge A_1) = \left( \prod_{i=2}^k \Pr(A_i \mid A_1 \wedge \dots \wedge A_{i-1}) \right) \cdot \Pr(A_1).$$

Where does this come from? If  $k = 3$ , then this becomes

$$\Pr(A_3 \wedge A_2 \wedge A_1) = \Pr(A_3 \mid A_1 \wedge A_2) \cdot \Pr(A_2 \mid A_1) \cdot \Pr(A_1),$$

which can be verified by applying the definition of conditional probability to the right-hand side and then simplifying the resulting expression.

We know that  $A_1 = (I_1 \wedge x_1 = t_1)$ . Since the first iteration is guaranteed to take place,  $\Pr(A_1)$  is equal to the probability that  $x_1$  is equal to  $t_1$ , which is  $1/n$ .

Let  $i$  be such that  $2 \leq i \leq k$ . We are going to determine

$$\Pr(A_i \mid A_1 \wedge \dots \wedge A_{i-1}).$$

We are given that the event  $A_1 \wedge \dots \wedge A_{i-1}$  occurs. This means that all iterations  $1, 2, \dots, i-1$  take place and  $x_1 = t_1, \dots, x_{i-1} = t_{i-1}$ . Therefore,

$$x_1 + \dots + x_{i-1} = t_1 + \dots + t_{i-1} \leq t_1 + \dots + t_k \leq n$$

and, thus, iteration  $i$  takes place. It follows that  $\Pr(A_i \mid A_1 \wedge \dots \wedge A_{i-1})$  is just the probability that  $x_i$  is equal to  $t_i$ , which is  $1/n$ .

We conclude that

$$\Pr(A_k \wedge A_{k-1} \wedge \dots \wedge A_1) = \left( \prod_{i=2}^k \frac{1}{n} \right) \cdot \frac{1}{n} = 1/n^k,$$

which is the same answer as we got before.

For **part 3**, using the hint and Newton’s Binomial Theorem, we have

$$\mathbb{E}(X) = \sum_{k=0}^n \Pr(X \geq k+1) = \sum_{k=0}^n \binom{n}{k} \cdot (1/n)^k = (1 + 1/n)^n.$$

Finally, for **part 4**, using a limit that you have seen in calculus,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E}(X) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} (1 + 1/n)^n = e,$$

which is Euler's number.

**Question 8:** Let  $G$  be an undirected graph with  $n$  vertices and  $m$  edges. This graph is not necessarily connected. Recall that the degree of a vertex  $u$ , denoted  $\deg(u)$ , is the number of edges that are incident on  $u$ . We assume that every vertex has degree at least one. If  $u$  and  $v$  are two vertices that are connected by an edge, then we say that  $v$  is a neighbor of  $u$ .

Consider the following experiment:

- Let  $x$  be a uniformly random vertex.
- Let  $y$  be a uniformly random neighbor of  $x$ .
- Let  $X = \deg(x)$  and  $Y = \deg(y)$ .

1. Let  $a > 0$  and  $b > 0$  be real numbers. Prove that

$$\frac{a}{b} + \frac{b}{a} \geq 2,$$

with equality if and only if  $a = b$ .

*Hint:* Rewrite this inequality until you get an equivalent inequality which obviously holds.

**Solution:**

$$\frac{a}{b} + \frac{b}{a} \geq 2$$

is equivalent to

$$\frac{a^2 + b^2}{ab} \geq 2,$$

which (since  $ab > 0$ ) is equivalent to

$$a^2 + b^2 \geq 2ab,$$

which is equivalent to

$$(a - b)^2 \geq 0,$$

which obviously holds. Equality holds if and only if  $a - b = 0$ .

2. Prove that the expected value  $\mathbb{E}(X)$  of the random variable  $X$  satisfies

$$\mathbb{E}(X) = \frac{2m}{n}.$$

**Solution:** To analyze  $X$ , we only need to consider the uniformly random vertex  $x$  that is chosen. The sample space  $S$  is the vertex set of  $G$ . The random variable  $X : S \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is given by  $X(u) = \deg(u)$ . Using the expression for  $\mathbb{E}(X)$  that uses the domain of  $X$ , we get

$$\mathbb{E}(X) = \sum_{u \in S} X(u) \cdot \Pr(u) = \sum_{u \in S} \deg(u) \cdot \frac{1}{n} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{u \in S} \deg(u).$$

You have learned in COMP 1805 that in the latter summation, each edge of  $G$  is counted twice. Therefore,

$$\mathbb{E}(X) = \frac{2m}{n}.$$

3. Prove that the expected value  $\mathbb{E}(Y)$  of the random variable  $Y$  satisfies

$$\mathbb{E}(Y) = \frac{1}{n} \cdot \sum_{u: \text{vertex in } G} \left( \sum_{v: \text{neighbor of } u} \frac{\deg(v)}{\deg(u)} \right).$$

**Solution:** Since the value of  $Y$  depends on both  $x$  and  $y$ , we use the sample space

$$S' = \{(u, v) : u \text{ is a vertex and } v \text{ is a neighbor of } u\},$$

which is the same as

$$S' = \{(u, v) : \{u, v\} \text{ is an edge}\}.$$

Note that elements of  $S'$  are ordered pairs, whereas edges of the graph are unordered pairs. Each edge  $\{u, v\}$  of  $G$  gives two elements of  $S'$ , namely  $(u, v)$  and  $(v, u)$ .

The random variable  $Y : S' \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is given by  $Y(u, v) = \deg(v)$ . We will use the expression for  $\mathbb{E}(Y)$  that uses the domain of  $Y$ :

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}(Y) &= \sum_{(u,v) \in S'} Y(u, v) \cdot \Pr(u, v) \\ &= \sum_{u: \text{vertex in } G} \left( \sum_{v: \text{neighbor of } u} Y(u, v) \cdot \Pr(u, v) \right) \\ &= \sum_{u: \text{vertex in } G} \left( \sum_{v: \text{neighbor of } u} \deg(v) \cdot \Pr(x = u \wedge y = v) \right). \end{aligned}$$

If  $v$  is a neighbor of  $u$ , then

$$\Pr(x = u \wedge y = v) = \Pr(y = v \mid x = u) \cdot \Pr(x = u) = \frac{1}{\deg(u)} \cdot \frac{1}{n}.$$

Plugging this in gives the expression that we are asked to prove.

4. Prove that

$$\sum_{u: \text{ vertex in } G} \left( \sum_{v: \text{ neighbor of } u} \frac{\deg(v)}{\deg(u)} \right) = \sum_{\{u, v\}: \text{ edge in } G} \left( \frac{\deg(v)}{\deg(u)} + \frac{\deg(u)}{\deg(v)} \right).$$

**Solution:** Consider an arbitrary edge  $\{p, q\}$  in the graph. This edge contributes  $\deg(q)/\deg(p) + \deg(p)/\deg(q)$  to the right-hand side. What does it contribute to the left-hand side:

- If  $u = p$  and  $v = q$ , then we get the term  $\deg(q)/\deg(p)$ .
- If  $u = q$  and  $v = p$ , then we get the term  $\deg(p)/\deg(q)$ .
- Thus, the total contribution of the edge  $\{p, q\}$  to the left-hand side is  $\deg(q)/\deg(p) + \deg(p)/\deg(q)$ .

This shows that the left-hand side is equal to the right-hand side.

5. Prove that

$$\mathbb{E}(Y) \geq \mathbb{E}(X),$$

with equality if and only if each connected component of  $G$  is regular (i.e., all vertices in the same connected component have the same degree).

**Solution:** Using parts 3 and 4, we get

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}(Y) &= \frac{1}{n} \cdot \sum_{u: \text{ vertex in } G} \left( \sum_{v: \text{ neighbor of } u} \frac{\deg(v)}{\deg(u)} \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{n} \cdot \sum_{\{u, v\}: \text{ edge in } G} \left( \frac{\deg(v)}{\deg(u)} + \frac{\deg(u)}{\deg(v)} \right). \end{aligned}$$

From part 1,  $\deg(v)/\deg(u) + \deg(u)/\deg(v) \geq 2$ , with equality if and only if  $\deg(u) = \deg(v)$ . This gives

$$\mathbb{E}(Y) \geq \frac{1}{n} \cdot \sum_{\{u, v\}: \text{ edge in } G} 2 = \frac{1}{n} \cdot 2m = \mathbb{E}(X),$$

with equality if and only if for every edge  $\{u, v\}$ ,  $\deg(u) = \deg(v)$ , which is the same as saying that each connected component is regular.

**Remark:** Imagine that  $G$  represents a “friendship graph”: Each vertex is a person, and an edge  $\{u, v\}$  indicates that  $u$  and  $v$  are friends. Informally,

- the value of  $\mathbb{E}(X)$  is equal to the number of friends that Average Joe has,
- the value of  $\mathbb{E}(Y)$  is equal to the number of friends that an average friend of Average Joe has.

- The latter is at least the former.
- This is known as the *friendship paradox*. Wikipedia has an article on this.