

PRIMARY STUDIES CLASSIFICATION

Table 2 - Robotic Platform

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|--------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| no hardware | P2, P4, P5, P8, P10, P11, P12, P16, P17, P18, P23, P28, S02, S04, S06, S07, S08, S10, S13, S14, S15, S17, S19, S21, S22, S24, S27, S30, S31 |
| Turtlebot | P7, P13, P24, P25, P29, P32, S01, S12, S16, S23 |
| Kobuki | P6, P22, S01, S11 |
| Care-O-bot | P20, S09, S28 |
| KUKA | P26, P27 |
| AgRob | S05, S16 |
| PR2 | P29, S28 |
| Telerob | P1 |
| Twist | P3 |
| FPGA | P9 |
| Flightgoggles | P14 |
| Parrot | P14 |
| M4K | P15 |
| EvoRally | P19 |
| Ford Hybrid Escape | P21 |
| Landshark | S18 |
| Raspberry | S20 |
| FASTEN | S25 |
| M3-Neony | P30 |
| NAO | P31 |
| Auto-ID | S03 |

Table 3 - ROS Ecosystem Level

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|-------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| filesystem | P1, P2, P3, P4, P5, P7, P8, P9, P10, P11, P12, P13, P14, P15, P16, P17, P18, P19, P20, P21, P22, P23, P24, P25, P26, P27, P29, P32, S01, S02, S03, S05, S06, S07, S09, S11, S14, S17, S21, S22, S23, S24, S25, S27, S28, S29, S30, S31 |
| computation graph | P1, P2, P3, P4, P6, P7, P8, P9, P11, P13, P14, P17, P18, P19, P20, P21, P22, P24, P25, P30, S05, S08, S09, S10, S11, S14, S15, S16, S18, S20, S26 |
| community | P4, P7, P8, P12, P13, P16, P23, P28, P31, S04, S12, S13, S19 |

Table 4 - Communication Paradigm

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|---------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| topic | P1, P2, P3, P6, P7, P8, P9, P11, P13, P17, P18, P19, P20, P21, P22, P24, P25, P26, P30, S01, S05, S08, S09, S10, S11, S12, S14, S16, S18, S20, S22, S25, S26, S31 |
| - | P4, P5, P10, P12, P14, P15, P16, P23, P27, P28, P29, P31, P32, S02, S03, S04, S06, S07, S13, S15, S17, S19, S21, S23, S24, S27, S28, S29, S30 |
| service | P3, P8, P11, P20, P22, P26, P30, S08, S09, S12, S16 |
| shared memory | P3, S20 |

Table 5 - Quality Attribute

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| functional suitability | P2, P3, P6, P10, P11, P13, P14, P15, P18, P19, P20, P25, S01, S02, S03, S07, S08, S09, S10, S13, S15, S23, S26, S27, S29 |
| maintainability | P1, P3, P4, P5, P8, P9, P10, P11, P12, P16, P22, P23, P24, P25, P30, S04, S06, S09, S16, S21, S25 |
| portability | P1, P8, P12, P14, P16, P18, P19, P21, P23, P24, P25, P30, S03, S11, S13, S14 |

| | |
|------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| reliability | P1, P4, P6, P7, P8, P19, S07, S17, S18, S22, S26, S27, S29, S31 |
| compatibility | P1, P3, P8, P11, P14, P15, P16, P21, P23, P24, P25, P29, P30, S02, S14 |
| usability | P1, P8, P12, P13, P16, P17, P24, P31, S06, S13, S17, S19, S21 |
| security | P4, P8, P25, P27, P28, S05, S17, S18, S24 |
| performance efficiency | P26, P32, S12, S20, S28, S30, S31 |

Table 6 - Type of Robot

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Mobile | P1, P3, P4, P6, P7, P13, P15, P18, P19, P20, P21, P22, P24, P25, P26, P29, P30, P31, P32, S01, S05, S09, S10, S11, S12, S16, S22, S23, S25, S26, S29, S31 |
| - | P5, P9, P10, P11, P12, P16, P17, P28, S02, S04, S06, S13, S14, S15, S17, S18, S19, S21, S24, S27, S28 |
| Fixed | P2, P27, S03, S08, S20 |
| airborne | P14, P25, S07, S30 |

Table 7 - Cardinality

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Single | P1, P2, P3, P4, P6, P7, P13, P14, P15, P19, P20, P21, P22, P24, P26, P27, P29, P30, P31, P32, S02, S03, S05, S07, S08, S09, S10, S11, S12, S14, S16, S22, S23, S25, S26, S28, S29, S30 |
| - | P5, P8, P9, P10, P11, P12, P16, P17, P23, P28, S04, S06, S13, S17, S18, S19, S21, S24, S27 |
| Multiple | P18, P25, S01, S02, S15, S20, S31 |

Table 8 - Application Field

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|-------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| - | P5, P10, P11, P12, P16, P17, P21, P28, S02, S04, S05, S13, S14, S15, S16, S17, S18, S19, S21, S24, S25, S27, S28 |
| Navigation task | P6, P7, P13, P14, P15, P19, P24, P29, P32, S11, S12, S22, S23, S26, S28, S29, S31 |
| Toy example | P2, P9, P22, P26, P27, P30, S01, S03, S06, S10 |
| Multiple | P8, P23, P27, S08, S20 |
| Unmanned | P25, S28, S30 |
| Self-driving | P21, S25, S28 |
| Home | P20, P31, S28 |
| Medical | P3, S09 |
| Search and rescue | P1 |
| Military | P4 |
| Leader/Follower | P18 |

Table 9 - ROS Version

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|----------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ROS1 | P26, P27, P28, P29, P30, P31, P32, S01, S02, S03, S04, S05, S06, S08, S09, S10, S11, S12, S13, S14, S15, S16, S17, S18, S19, S21, S22, S23, S24, S25, S26, S27, S28, S29, S30, S31 |
| ROS2 | P28, S04, S06, S07, S10, S12, S13, S20 |
| Not Restricted | P1, P3, P6, P9, P10, P13, P14, P16, P17, P18, P19, P20, P21, P22, P24, P25 |

Table 10 - Knowledge Area

| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
|--------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| design | P1, P7, P8, P9, P15, P21, P24, P26, P27, S01, S02, S03, S07, S08, S12, S13, S16, S17, S26, S27, S28, S31 |
| quality | P4, P20, P28, P32, S01, S05, S06, S12, S15, S18, S19, S20, S21, S22, S24, S25, S28, S29 |
| maintenance | P12, P16, P23, P28, P30, S08, S11, S14, S16, S25, S28 |
| SE models | P1, P2, P3, P6, P7, P11, P18, P19, P20, P24, P25 |
| testing | P5, P10, P14, P17, P18, P22, P23, S06, S10, S22, S29 |
| construction | P13, P23, P31, S03, S30 |
| management | P5, P7, P11, P24 |
| requirement | S07, S18, S19, S23 |
| practice | S03, S13 |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| computing | P14, P29 |
| | |
| | Table 11 - Research Strategy |
| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
| proposal | P1, P2, P3, P4, P5, P6, P7, P9, P11, P14, P15, P17, P18, P19, P20, P21, P22, P24, P25, P26, P27, P29, S01, S02, S03, S05, S06, S07, S08, S09, S10, S11, S14, S15, S16, S18, S21, S22, S23, S26, S27, S29, S31 |
| evaluation | P5, P8, P12, P13, P16, P23, P28, P30, P31, P32, S03, S05, S12, S13, S15, S16, S19, S20, S24, S25, S28, S30 |
| validation | P1, P3, P6, P7, P14, P15, P18, P19, P21, P24, P25, P26, S12 |
| philosophical | P10, S04, S17 |
| | |
| | Table 12 - Research Method |
| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
| lab | P13, P15, P25, P26, P27, P29, P32, S01, S02, S06, S09, S11, S12, S19, S20, S23, S24, S26, S27 |
| simulation | P1, P7, P14, P18, P19, P21, P24, P25, P31, P32, S03, S08, S10, S18, S22, S30, S31 |
| concept | P2, P4, P6, P9, P10, P11, P17, P20, P22, P30, S07 |
| deployment | P3, P14, P28, S05, S14, S15, S16, S25, S28, S29 |
| mining | P5, P8, P12, S04, S12, S13, S17, S21 |
| Survey | P8, P16, P23 |
| Interview | P16, P23 |
| | |
| | Table 13 - Future Challenges and Limitations |
| | <i>Primary Studies</i> |
| Multi-language | P2, P11, P14, P15, P17, P20, P22, P27, P29, P31, S01, S08, S09, S10, S11, S13, S15, S16, S20, S24, S25, S29 |
| Further validation | P1, P4, P10, P11, P13, P21, P24, P25, P26, P29, S03, S07, S11, S17, S20, S21, S26, S28, S30 |
| Lack of generalization | P1, P7, P13, P16, P30, P32, S03, S06, S10, S12, S13, S14, S16, S17, S28 |
| Support for complex specification | P2, P11, P22, P25, S01, S05, S09, S14, S22, S23, S26, S28, S29 |
| Automation | P4, P6, P8, P10, P16, S03, S08, S09, S10, S15, S23 |
| Performance improvements | P9, P14, P15, P21, P22, S03, S15, S18, S20, S29 |
| Support for more reference | P8, P20, P23, P28, S05, S15, S17, S21, S26 |
| Evaluation of quality | P3, P4, P10, S09, S18 |
| Enable self-adaptation | P18, S23 |
| Run-time support | P7, P17 |
| Support for real-time properties | P25 |
| Machine learning integration | P19 |