

Topic: Assertion Description in EAS

[Initial request](#)

[Proposal discussed at Berlin](#)

[Sample Encoding](#)

[Maintenance event](#)

[Source](#)

[Assertion](#)

[Result of Proposal](#)

[Note on Previous Documentation](#)

[Remaining Questions](#)

Initial request

See <https://github.com/SAA-SDT/eac-cpf-schema/issues/43>.

Submitted by Daniel Pitti, on behalf of the Social Networks and Archival Context (SNAC) project:

“For all properties or relations in EAC-CPF describing the entity (that is, not the control elements, nor the higher level description elements), accommodate the following "meta" documentation as a package of information that is repeatable:

1. Agent making the assertion with respect to the property or relation of the CPF entity (for example: nameEntry, existDates, cpfRelation, ...).
2. Date of the assertion or revision of the assertion.
3. Citation of the source that constitutes or provides the evidence for the assertion. Citation should accommodate both traditional citation of "offline" source/evidence, or Web accessible (a URL).
4. Evidence found in the source. Text.
5. Rules used in formulating the assertion.
6. Note for anything deemed important but not otherwise provided.

Such documentation of each assertion is being accommodated in SNAC, and at this time, it cannot be communicated via EAC-CPF.

The same meta-documentation will also be a feature of ICA EGAD RiC.”

Proposal discussed at Berlin

- Add **@sourceref** as an optional attribute that is expected to provide a direct link to a source element provided in eac-cpf/control/sources.
 - to accommodate requests 3, 4, and 6.
- Consider adding **@maintenanceeventref** as an optional attribute that is expected to provide a direct link to a maintenance event in eac-cpf/control/maintenancehistory.
 - to accommodate requests 1 and 2
- Add **citedrange** as an optional child element of source.
 - to provide additional options for requests 2 and 6;
 - This element would be available to provide a location from within a source to indicate precisely where supporting evidence for the corresponding assertion was found (e.g. pages 88-92).
 - Though not requested by SNAC, the ability to provide citation ranges within sources was one of the reasons that the Syraica.org project opted to use TEI only and not also EAC-CPF.
- Add **@unit**, already available in EAD3, as an optional attribute of citedrange.
 - same rationale as citedrange.

Recording over Berlin overview:

<https://drive.google.com/open?id=1h8HR2coaHiHz3LkwTiQi2Uws8bcSFGoS>

Sample Encoding

Maintenance event

```
<maintenanceEvent id="maintenanceevent1">
  <eventType>created</eventType>
  <eventDateTime standardDateTime="2020-03-09"/>
  <agentType>human</agentType>
  <agent>me</agent>
</maintenanceEvent>
```

Source

```
<source id="source1"
href="https://www.theguardian.com/books/2018/aug/10/langston-hughes-born-a-year-be
fore-accepted-date-poet">
  <citation>Flood, Alison <span
    localType="http://id.loc.gov/ontologies/bibframe/title">"Langston Hughes
    'born a year before accepted date', researcher finds,"</span> The
    Guardian. Published 10 August 2018.</citation>
  <citedRange unit="page">1</citedRange>
  <!-- descriptiveNote becomes the de facto place to put information about
    found data, rather than being a place that's hijacked to slightly encode a citation -->
  <descriptiveNote>
    <p>A poet researching archives of local African American newspapers
    found numerous references to 'little Langston' and his mother, published in 1901, a year
    before his accepted birth date of 1902.</p>
  </descriptiveNote>
</source>
```

Assertion

```
<existDates maintenanceEventRef="#maintenanceevent1">
  <dateRange>
    <fromDate sourceRef="#source1" standardDate="1901-02-01"
    localType="http://www.loc.gov/mads/rdf/v1#birthDate"/>
    <toDate standardDate="1967-05-22"
    localType="http://www.loc.gov/mads/rdf/v1#deathDate"/>
  </dateRange>
</existDates>
```

Result of Proposal

Proposal accepted, pending discussions about the overall data model of source and the availability of the new *ref attributes. There was also a question about the need for a @conventionDeclarationRef attribute.

Note on Previous Documentation

For additional background information, including links to the previous proposals and encoding examples, see

https://github.com/SAA-SDT/TS-EAS-subteam-notes/blob/master/eaccpf-subteam/working-documents/topics/assertion/Topic_assertion_20200309.pdf

Remaining Questions

- Request 5 (rules used in formulating the assertion) is NOT addressed by this proposal. However, there are other discussions about adding @rules to the nameentry elements, and this update alone would satisfy the primary use case for that particular request (see <https://github.com/SAA-SDT/eac-cpf-schema/issues/67> and <https://github.com/SAA-SDT/eac-cpf-schema/issues/68>). Does that seem sufficient?
- Is the element sourceEntry necessary? That element is only used once in EAC-CPF (and EAD3). I propose reusing “citation” in this context (and possibly revisiting the model of “citation”, as well). I see no reason for adding a source and not providing a citation to that source.
- Is it desirable to link a source to a bibliographic description (e.g. <https://catalog.hathitrust.org/Record/006248762>) AND the actual resource or a representation of that resource (e.g. <https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=uc1.31210018793081>)? You cannot do this right now (you have to choose one option or the other) but it seems like it would be useful? Perhaps having “citation” would be useful here, since that could be used to link to a bibliographic description, and “source” could link to an actual resource. This might also be addressed by the Relations topic group.
- Where should the @*ref elements (e.g. sourceref) be available? I don’t know if it makes sense for @sourceref to be available everywhere (outside of control), but that would be easiest (and follow TEI’s model). I attempted to create a subset of “assertion-based” elements, and came up with the following list (made quite long due to plural/singular elements):
 - address
 - addressLine

- biogHist (not sure if narrative elements should be included if we go with a subset... if so, others that i've excluded in this list would need to be added.)
- chronItem
- chronList
- cpfRelation (relation)
- date
- dateRange
- dateSet
- event
- existDates
- fromDate
- function
- functionRelation (relation)
- functions
- Item
- language
- languagesUsed
- languageUsed
- legalStatus
- legalStatuses
- list
- mandate
- mandates
- nameEntry
- occupation
- occupations
- outline (maybe we don't want to link to a source from lists and outline? I thought I'd suggest it since I can see a use for it for lists, and the outline element is a hierarchical list.)
- part
- place
- placeEntry
- placeRole
- places
- relations (in the event they're all from the same source... but i don't like adding to the plural elements in general)
- resourceRelation (relation)
- script (whatever it's renamed)
- structureOrGenealogy
- toDate
- useDates

As for something like @maintenanceEventRef, that's more difficult. I could even see a use case for adding source/@maintenanceEventRef, which would mean allowing it to be part of "control" (e.g. this agent added this source to this EAC file at this time). But I also don't know if including @maintenanceEventRef would really be that useful in the context of XML documents.

If we add both (or either), maybe better to follow TEI's model and just include it basically everywhere. See https://www.tei-c.org/release/doc/tei-p5-doc/en/html/ref-att_global_source.html In the case of EAC, though, then we could exclude it from control elements if we wanted.

But in the case of EAD, I really don't know why it would need to be available on elements like c, did, etc. So....

- If pressed to come up with a subset of EAD3 elements where @sourceref might be beneficial, how about?:
 - bioghist (maybe an EAC source :))
 - blockquote
 - chronitem
 - chronitemset
 - chronlist
 - daterange
 - dateset
 - datesingle
 - defitem
 - entry
 - footnote
 - foreign
 - fromdate
 - geographiccoordinates
 - item
 - langmaterial
 - language
 - languageset
 - list
 - quote
 - relation
 - relations
 - row
 - script
 - table
 - todate