Mixed Effects Models Module

Alessandra Ragni

May 11, 2025

For patient i (i = 1, ..., 234) at time t (t = 1 (4 wks), 2 (12 wks), 3 (24 wks), 4 (52 wks))

• Notation 1: model equation at the level of statistical units it

VISUAL_{it} =
$$\beta_{0t} + \beta_1 \cdot \text{VISUAL}_{0i} + \beta_{2t} \cdot \text{TREAT}_{i} + \epsilon_{it}$$
 with $\epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2)$

• Notation 2: model equation at the patient level i

$$\underline{\text{VISUAL}_i} = \mathbb{X}_i \beta + \underline{\epsilon_i}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} \text{VISUAL}_{i1} \\ \text{VISUAL}_{i2} \\ \text{VISUAL}_{i3} \\ \text{VISUAL}_{i4} \end{bmatrix} \equiv \underline{\text{VISUAL}_i} \quad \text{and} \quad \begin{bmatrix} \epsilon_{i1} \\ \epsilon_{i2} \\ \epsilon_{i3} \\ \epsilon_{i4} \end{bmatrix} \equiv \boxed{\underline{\epsilon_i} \sim \mathcal{N}(\underline{0}, \mathbf{R}_i)} \text{ where } \mathbf{R}_i = \sigma^2 \mathbf{R}_i = \sigma^2 \mathbf{\Lambda}_i \mathbf{C}_i \mathbf{\Lambda}_i$$

$$oldsymbol{\Lambda}_i = egin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad ext{and} \quad oldsymbol{\mathcal{C}}_i = egin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\mathbb{X}_{i}\underline{\beta} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & \text{TREAT}_{i} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & 0 & \text{TREAT}_{i} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & 0 & 0 & \text{TREAT}_{i} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & 0 & 0 & 0 & \text{TREAT}_{i} \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} \beta_{0 \text{ 4wks}} \\ \beta_{0 \text{ 12wks}} \\ \beta_{0 \text{ 24wks}} \\ \beta_{0 \text{ 52wks}} \\ \beta_{1 \text{ 524wks}} \\ \beta_{2 \text{ 12wks}} \\ \beta_{2 \text{ 12wks}} \\ \beta_{2 \text{ 12wks}} \\ \beta_{2 \text{ 52wks}} \end{bmatrix}$$

```
# formula
lm1.form <- visual ~ -1 + time.f + visual0 + treat.f:time.f</pre>
```

1 Standard Model: $\epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2)$

```
# Model 6.1
fm6.1 <- lm(lm1.form, data = armd)
```

In Sections 2 and 3 we relax the variance homogeneity assumption: we want to model Λ_i , (while C_i is still diagonal). We mainly employ **Notation 1**.

2 Known Variance Weights: $\epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma_{it}^2)$

where, for instance, we assume $\sigma_{it} = \sigma_t = \sigma \cdot \sqrt{\text{TIME}_t}$, i.e.,

$$\sigma_{t} = \begin{cases} \sigma_{1} \\ \sigma_{2} \\ \sigma_{3} \\ \sigma_{4} \end{cases} = \begin{cases} \sigma \cdot \sqrt{4} & \text{if } t = 1 \text{ (4 weeks);} \\ \sigma \cdot \sqrt{12} & \text{if } t = 2 \text{ (12 weeks);} \\ \sigma \cdot \sqrt{24} & \text{if } t = 3 \text{ (24 weeks);} \\ \sigma \cdot \sqrt{52} & \text{if } t = 4 \text{ (52 weeks).} \end{cases}$$

```
# Model 9.0
weights = varFixed(value = ~time)
# the variance covariate needs to be continuous: time.f doesn't work!
fm9.0 <- gls(lm1.form, weights = weights, data = armd)</pre>
```

3 Variance Functions: $\epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma_{it}^2)$

3.1 varIdent(·) - $<\delta>$ -group

$$\epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma_t^2), \quad \text{s.t.} \quad \sigma_t = \begin{cases} \sigma_1 \\ \sigma_2 \\ \sigma_3 \end{cases} = \begin{cases} \sigma \cdot 1 & \text{if } t = 1 \text{ (4 weeks);} \\ \sigma \cdot \delta_2 & \text{if } t = 2 \text{ (12 weeks);} \\ \sigma \cdot \delta_3 & \text{if } t = 3 \text{ (24 weeks);} \\ \sigma \cdot \delta_4 & \text{if } t = 4 \text{ (52 weeks).} \end{cases}$$

we get: $\delta_2 = \frac{\sigma_2}{\sigma_1}$; $\delta_3 = \frac{\sigma_3}{\sigma_1}$; $\delta_4 = \frac{\sigma_4}{\sigma_1}$

```
# Model 9.1
weights = varIdent(form = ~1|time.f)
fm9.1 <- gls(lm1.form, weights = weights, data = armd)</pre>
```

3.2 varPower(·) - $<\delta>$ -group

• We do not include any stratification in the model

$$\begin{array}{lll} \epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma_{it}^2) & \text{s.t.} & \sigma_{it} & = & \sigma \cdot \lambda_{it} \\ & = & \sigma \cdot \lambda(\ \delta, \ \text{TIME}_{it}\) \\ & = & \sigma \cdot | \text{TIME}_{it}|^{\delta} & \text{since } \lambda \ \text{is } \text{varPower}(\cdot) \end{array}$$

Following Notation 2, this could be written as $\underline{\epsilon_i} \sim \mathcal{N}(\underline{0}, \sigma^2(\Lambda_i C_i \Lambda_i))$ s.t.

$$\mathbf{\Lambda}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} |\text{TIME}_{i1}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i2}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i3}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i4}|^{\delta} \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{C}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

```
# Model 9.2
weights = varPower(form = ~time)
fm9.2 <- gls(lm1.form, weights = weights, data = armd)</pre>
```

• We include stratification in the model

$$\epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma_{it}^{2}) \quad \text{s.t.} \quad \sigma_{it} = \sigma \cdot \lambda_{it}$$

$$= \sigma \cdot \lambda \left(\underline{\delta}, \text{TIME}_{it} \right)$$

$$= \sigma \cdot \lambda \left([\delta_{1}, \delta_{2}]', \text{TIME}_{it} \right)$$

$$= \begin{cases} \sigma \cdot |\text{TIME}_{it}|^{\delta_{1}} & \text{if active} \\ \sigma \cdot |\text{TIME}_{it}|^{\delta_{2}} & \text{if placebo} \end{cases}$$

```
# Model 9.3
weights = varPower(form = ~time|treat.f)
fm9.3 <- gls(lm1.form, weights = weights, data = armd)</pre>
```

In Section 4 we also relax the independence assumption; we mainly employ **Notation 2**. Specifically, we want to modify C_i , allowing the visual acuity measurements for the same individual to be correlated.

4 Correlation Structure: $\boxed{\underline{\epsilon_i} \sim \mathcal{N}(\underline{0}, \sigma^2 \mathbf{\Lambda}_i \boldsymbol{\mathcal{C}}_i \mathbf{\Lambda}_i)}$

4.1 $\operatorname{corCompSymm}(\cdot)$ (& $\operatorname{varPower}(\cdot)$)

Compound Symmetry Correlation Structure

$$\mathbf{C}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho & \rho & \rho \\ \rho & 1 & \rho & \rho \\ \rho & \rho & 1 & \rho \\ \rho & \rho & \rho & 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{\Lambda}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} |\text{TIME}_{i1}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i2}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i3}|^{\delta} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i4}|^{\delta} \end{bmatrix}$$

4.2 $\operatorname{corAR1}(\cdot)$ (& $\operatorname{varPower}(\cdot)$)

Heteroscedastic Autoregressive Residual Errors

$$\mathbf{C}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho & \rho^{2} & \rho^{3} \\ \rho & 1 & \rho & \rho^{2} \\ \rho^{2} & \rho & 1 & \rho \\ \rho^{3} & \rho^{2} & \rho & 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{\Lambda}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} |\text{TIME}_{i1}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i2}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i3}|^{\delta} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i4}|^{\delta} \end{bmatrix}$$

4.3 $\operatorname{corSymm}(\cdot)$ (& $\operatorname{varPower}(\cdot)$)

$$\boldsymbol{\mathcal{C}}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho_{12} & \rho_{13} & \rho_{14} \\ \rho_{12} & 1 & \rho_{23} & \rho_{24} \\ \rho_{13} & \rho_{23} & 1 & \rho_{34} \\ \rho_{14} & \rho_{24} & \rho_{34} & 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \boldsymbol{\Lambda}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} |\text{TIME}_{i1}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i2}|^{\delta} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i3}|^{\delta} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i4}|^{\delta} \end{bmatrix}$$

4.4 $\operatorname{corSymm}(\cdot)$ (& $\operatorname{varIdent}(\cdot)$)

$$\mathbf{C}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \rho_{12} & \rho_{13} & \rho_{14} \\ \rho_{12} & 1 & \rho_{23} & \rho_{24} \\ \rho_{13} & \rho_{23} & 1 & \rho_{34} \\ \rho_{14} & \rho_{24} & \rho_{34} & 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{\Lambda}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & \delta_{2} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \delta_{3} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & \delta_{4} \end{bmatrix}$$

5 Linear Mixed Models

For patient i (i = 1, ..., 234) at time t (t = 1 (4 wks), 2 (12 wks), 3 (24 wks), 4 (52 wks))

- Notation 1: We define our new model and add a random intercept b_{0i} VISUAL $_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \cdot \text{VISUAL}_{0i} + \beta_2 \cdot \text{TIME}_{it} + \beta_3 \cdot \text{TREAT}_{i} + \beta_4 \cdot \text{TREAT}_{i} \cdot \text{TIME}_{it} + b_{0i} + \epsilon_{it}$ with $\epsilon_{it} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma_{it}^2)$ and $b_{0i} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 d_{11})$
- Notation 2: Model equation at the patient level i

$$VISUAL_i = X_i\beta + \underline{1}_i \underline{b_{0i}} + \epsilon_i$$

with $\epsilon_i \sim \mathcal{N}(\underline{0}, \mathcal{R}_i)$ where $\mathcal{R}_i = \sigma^2 R_i = \Lambda_i \mathcal{C}_i \Lambda_i$ and $b_{0i} \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 d_{11})$

$$\begin{bmatrix} \text{VISUAL}_{i1} \\ \text{VISUAL}_{i2} \\ \text{VISUAL}_{i3} \\ \text{VISUAL}_{i4} \end{bmatrix} \equiv \underline{\text{VISUAL}}_i \quad \text{and} \quad \begin{bmatrix} \epsilon_{i1} \\ \epsilon_{i2} \\ \epsilon_{i3} \\ \epsilon_{i4} \end{bmatrix} \equiv \underline{\epsilon_i} \quad \text{and} \quad \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \equiv \underline{1}_i$$

$$\mathbb{X}_{i}\underline{\beta} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & 4 & \text{TREAT}_{i} & 4 \cdot \text{TREAT}_{i} \\ 1 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & 12 & \text{TREAT}_{i} & 12 \cdot \text{TREAT}_{i} \\ 1 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & 24 & \text{TREAT}_{i} & 24 \cdot \text{TREAT}_{i} \\ 1 & \text{VISUAL0}_{i} & 52 & \text{TREAT}_{i} & 52 \cdot \text{TREAT}_{i} \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} \beta_{0} \\ \beta_{1} \\ \beta_{2} \\ \beta_{3} \\ \beta_{4} \end{bmatrix}$$

More in general: with both a random intercept and slopes $b_i = [b_{0i} \quad b_{1i} \quad ...]'$

$$\underline{\text{VISUAL}_i} = \mathbb{X}_i \beta + \mathbb{Z}_i \underline{b_i} + \underline{\epsilon_i}$$

with $\underline{\epsilon_i} \sim \mathcal{N}(\underline{0}, \mathcal{R}_i)$ where $\mathcal{R}_i = \sigma^2 \mathbf{R}_i$ and $\underline{b_i} \sim \mathcal{N}(\underline{0}, \mathcal{D})$ where $\mathcal{D} = \sigma^2 \mathbf{D}$ for instance, we can choose TIME to be our slope:

$$\mathbb{Z}_i = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 4 \\ 1 & 12 \\ 1 & 24 \\ 1 & 52 \end{bmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \underline{b_i} = \begin{bmatrix} b_{0i} \\ b_{1i} \end{bmatrix}$$

formula
lm2.form <- visual ~ visual0 + time + treat.f + treat.f:time</pre>

we know that $\mathbf{V}_i = \sigma^2 \mathbf{V}_i = \sigma^2 [\mathbb{Z}_i \mathbf{D} \mathbb{Z}'_i + \mathbf{R}_i]$

- with 'getVarCov(model, type = 'conditional')' we extract $\sigma^2 \mathbf{R}_i$;
- with 'getVarCov(model, type = 'marginal')' we extract $\sigma^2 V_i$;
- with VarCorr (model) we extract $\sigma^2 D$ (also from the summary).

5.1 Homoscedastic residuals

5.1.1 Random intercept only

$$\boldsymbol{D} = \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\boldsymbol{R}_i = \boldsymbol{\Lambda}_i \boldsymbol{C}_i \boldsymbol{\Lambda}_i = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\mathcal{V}}_i = \mathbb{Z}_i \boldsymbol{D} \, \mathbb{Z}'_i + \boldsymbol{R}_i = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\Rightarrow \boldsymbol{V}_i = \begin{bmatrix} 1 + d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} \\ d_{11} & 1 + d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} \\ d_{11} & d_{11} & 1 + d_{11} & d_{11} \end{bmatrix}$$

Note that the **implied marginal variance-covariance structure** is that of compound symmetry with a common correlation equal to $\rho = d_{11}/(1+d_{11}) > 0$ since $d_{11} > 0$.

$$Var(VISUAL_{it}) = \sigma^2(\mathbf{d_{11}} + 1)$$

5.1.2 Random intercept & slope

 \bullet General D

$$\boldsymbol{D} = \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} & d_{12} \\ d_{21} & d_{22} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$m{R}_i = m{\Lambda}_i m{\mathcal{C}}_i m{\Lambda}_i = egin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\boldsymbol{V}_i = \mathbb{Z}_i \, \boldsymbol{D} \, \mathbb{Z}_i' + \boldsymbol{R}_i = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 4 \\ 1 & 12 \\ 1 & 24 \\ 1 & 52 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} & d_{12} \\ d_{21} & d_{22} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 4 & 12 & 24 & 52 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$Var(VISUAL_{it}) = \sigma^2(d_{11} + 2d_{12}TIME_{it} + d_{22}TIME_{it}^2 + 1)$$

ullet Diagonal D

$$\boldsymbol{D} = \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} & 0 \\ 0 & d_{22} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$oldsymbol{R}_i = oldsymbol{\Lambda}_i oldsymbol{\mathcal{C}}_i oldsymbol{\Lambda}_i = egin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$oldsymbol{V}_i = \mathbb{Z}_i \, oldsymbol{D} \, \mathbb{Z}_i' + oldsymbol{R}_i = egin{bmatrix} 1 & 4 \ 1 & 12 \ 1 & 24 \ 1 & 52 \end{bmatrix} egin{bmatrix} d_{11} & 0 \ 0 & d_{22} \end{bmatrix} egin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \ 4 & 12 & 24 & 52 \end{bmatrix} + egin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$Var(VISUAL_{it}) = \sigma^2(d_{11} + d_{22}TIME_{it}^2 + 1)$$

5.2 Heteroscedastic residuals: varPower(·)

5.2.1 Random intercept only

$$\boldsymbol{D} = \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\boldsymbol{R}_{i} = \boldsymbol{\Lambda}_{i} \boldsymbol{\mathcal{C}}_{i} \boldsymbol{\Lambda}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} |\text{TIME}_{i1}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i2}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i3}|^{2\delta} & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i4}|^{2\delta} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\boldsymbol{V}_i = \mathbb{Z}_i \, \boldsymbol{D} \, \mathbb{Z}_i' + \boldsymbol{R}_i = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} |\mathrm{TIME}_{i1}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & |\mathrm{TIME}_{i2}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & |\mathrm{TIME}_{i3}|^{2\delta} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & |\mathrm{TIME}_{i4}|^{2\delta} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\Rightarrow \boldsymbol{V}_i = \begin{bmatrix} |\mathrm{TIME}_{i1}|^{2\delta} + d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} \\ d_{11} & |\mathrm{TIME}_{i2}|^{2\delta} + d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} \\ d_{11} & d_{11} & |\mathrm{TIME}_{i3}|^{2\delta} + d_{11} & d_{11} \\ d_{11} & d_{11} & d_{11} & |\mathrm{TIME}_{i4}|^{2\delta} + d_{11} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$Var(VISUAL_{it}) = \sigma^2(\frac{d_{11}}{d_{11}} + |TIME_{it}|^{2\delta})$$

5.2.2 Random intercept & slope

ullet General D

$$\boldsymbol{D} = \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} & d_{12} \\ d_{21} & d_{22} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$m{R}_i = m{\Lambda}_i m{\mathcal{C}}_i m{\Lambda}_i = egin{bmatrix} |{
m TIME}_{i1}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0 \ 0 & |{
m TIME}_{i2}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0 \ 0 & 0 & |{
m TIME}_{i3}|^{2\delta} & 0 \ 0 & 0 & 0 & |{
m TIME}_{i4}|^{2\delta} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$oldsymbol{V}_i = \mathbb{Z}_i \, oldsymbol{D} \, \mathbb{Z}_i' + oldsymbol{R}_i = egin{bmatrix} 1 & 4 \\ 1 & 12 \\ 1 & 24 \\ 1 & 52 \end{bmatrix} egin{bmatrix} d_{11} & d_{12} \\ d_{21} & d_{22} \end{bmatrix} egin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 4 & 12 & 24 & 52 \end{bmatrix} + oldsymbol{R}_i$$

$$Var(VISUAL_{it}) = \sigma^2(d_{11} + 2d_{12}TIME_{it} + d_{22}TIME_{it}^2 + |TIME_{it}|^{2\delta})$$

ullet Diagonal D

$$\boldsymbol{D} = \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} & 0 \\ 0 & d_{22} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\boldsymbol{R}_{i} = \boldsymbol{\Lambda}_{i} \boldsymbol{\mathcal{C}}_{i} \boldsymbol{\Lambda}_{i} = \begin{bmatrix} |\text{TIME}_{i1}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i2}|^{2\delta} & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i3}|^{2\delta} & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 0 & |\text{TIME}_{i4}|^{2\delta} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\boldsymbol{V}_i = \mathbb{Z}_i \, \boldsymbol{D} \, \mathbb{Z}_i' + \boldsymbol{R}_i = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 4 \\ 1 & 12 \\ 1 & 24 \\ 1 & 52 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} d_{11} & 0 \\ 0 & d_{22} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 4 & 12 & 24 & 52 \end{bmatrix} + \boldsymbol{R}_i$$

$$Var(VISUAL_{it}) = \sigma^2(\frac{d_{11} + d_{22}TIME_{it}^2}{1 + |TIME_{it}|^{2\delta}})$$