,

Appendix to Muteract: Interactive Prompt Mutation Interface for LLM Developers and Evaluators

ACM Reference Format:

Appendix

A Interactions from Evaluation

Table 1. This table illustrates the interactions we performed using the samples from the developer set of AdvGLUE's RTE dataset during our evaluation. The original prompt is the same as the one in AdvGLUE, while the mutated prompt is the one that acquired the lowest BLEU/ROUGE-L score.

Sample	Original/Mutated	Prompt	Response
R-E1	Original	Following the successful bid to bring the 2010	Entailment
K-E1		Ryedr Cup to Wales , the Wales Tourist Board	
		has wasted little time in commissioning work	The second line "Wales to host 2010 Ry-
		to ensure that the benefits accruing from the	der Cup" is a direct consequence of the
		event are felt throughout the country.	first line, which states that there was a
		Wales to host 2010 Ryder Cup.	successful bid to bring the Ryder Cup to
			Wales. Therefore, it entails that Wales will
			host the event.
	Mutated	Following the successful bid to bring the 2010	Entailment
		Ry Cprude to Wales , the Wales , the Wales	
		Uourist Board has wasted little time in com-	The second line, "Wales to host 2010
		missioning work to ensure that the benefits	Ryder Cup," directly supports the first line,
		accruing from the event are felt throughout	which discusses the successful bid to bring
		the country.	the 2010 Ryder Cup to Wales. The first line
		Wales to host 2010 Ryder Cup.	implies that Wales will host the event, and the
			second line confirms this.

Author's Contact Information:

Permission to make digital or hard copies of all or part of this work for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or commercial advantage and that copies bear this notice and the full citation on the first page. Copyrights for components of this work owned by others than the author(s) must be honored. Abstracting with credit is permitted. To copy otherwise, or republish, to post on servers or to redistribute to lists, requires prior specific permission and/or a fee. Request permissions from permissions@acm.org.

© 2018 Copyright held by the owner/author(s). Publication rights licensed to ACM.

Manuscript submitted to ACM

Manuscript submitted to ACM

	Original	Huckaby voluntarily submitted herself to ques-	Not entailment.
R-E2	Original	tioning Friday night at the Tracy police station,	1vot Chtamillent.
		and was arrested less than six hours later. She	The second line states that Huckaby is
		now resides in the San Joaquin County Jail	accused of killing Sandra Cantu, while the
		without bond, awaiting an arraignment hear-	first line provides details about Huckaby's
		ing on Tuesday. On April 6, the body of Sandra	arrest and the discovery of Cantu's body.
		Cantu was discovered stuffed inside the 28-	However, it does not confirm or deny the
		year-old's suitcase at the bottom of a pond a	accusation itself; it merely presents the
		few miles away from her home. The two were	context surrounding the situation. Therefore,
		neighbors in the Orchard Estates Mobile Home	the assertion that "false is not true" does
		Park and Huckaby's own 5-year-old daughter	not logically follow from the information
		often played with Cantu. Autopsy results are	provided.
		still pending.	
		Huckaby is accused of killing Sandra Cantu	
		and false is not true .	
	Mutated	Huckaby voluntarily submitted herself to ques-	Not entailment.
		tioning Friday night at the Tsacy police station,	
		and was arrested less than six hours later. She	The second line states that Huckaby is
		now resides in the San Joaquin County Jail	accused of killing Sandra Cantu and that
		without bond, awaiting an arraignment hear-	the claim is false. However, the first line
		ing on Tuesday. On April 6, the body of San-	provides information about Huckaby's arrest
		dra Cantu was discovered stuffed inside the	and the context surrounding it, which implies
		28-year-old daughter often played with Cantu.	that there is an accusation against her. The
		Autopsy results are still pending.	assertion in the second line contradicts the
		Huckaby is accused of killing Sandra Cantu	implication of the first line but does not
		and false isonot true .	logically follow from it, hence it does not entail the first line.
	Original	The international humanitarian aid organiza-	Entailment
R-E3	Original	tion , Dtcoors Witbout Broders / Medecins	Entaiment
		Sans Frontieres (MSF), continues to treat vic-	The second line states that "Doctors Without
		tims of violence in all locations where it is	Borders is an international aid organization,"
		present in Darfur.	which is consistent with the first line that de-
		Doctors Without Borders is an international	scribes "Dtcoors Witbout Broders / Medecins
		aid organization.	Sans Frontieres (MSF)" as an international
			humanitarian aid organization. Since MSF is
			another name for Doctors Without Borders,
			the second line logically follows from the first.
	Mutated	The international humanitarian aid organiza-	Entailment
		tion , Dtcoors Witbout Broders / Meviolence	
		in all locations where it is present in Dars of	The second line states that "Doctors Without
		violence in all locations where it is present in	Borders is an international aid organization,"
		Darfur.	which directly supports the claim made in
		Doctors Without Borders is an international	the first line about the organization being an
		aid ogranization.	international humanitarian aid organization.
	0::1	mi o p: p i vi p	Therefore, the second line entails the first.
R-E4	Original	The San Diego Padres ace , Jake Peavy , was	Not entailment.
		harming in an 8 - 5 loss to the St . Louis Cardinals	The first line states that the Con Diagram
		nals.	The first line states that the San Diego
		The San Diego Padres won the game against the St . Louis Cardinals .	Padres lost the game to the St. Louis Cardinals, while the second line claims that the
		the St. Louis Cardinais.	· ·
			Padres won the game. These two statements
			contradict each other, so the second line does not entail the first.

105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
133
134
135
136
137
138
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151

	Mutated	The San Diego Padres ace , Jake Peavy , was harming in an 8 - 5 loss to the St . Louis Cardi-	Not entailment.
		nals.	The first line states that the San Diego
		The San Diego Padres won the game against	Padres lost the game to the St. Louis Cardinals
		the St . Louis Cardinals .	with a score of 8-5, while the second line
		The San Diego Padres won the game against	claims that the Padres won the game. Since a
		the St . Louis Cardinals .	team cannot both win and lose the same game
			the second line does not logically follow from
			the first.
R-E5	Original	Dana Reeve , the veuve of the actors Christo-	Not entailment.
10 20		pher Reeve , possessed died of pneumothorax	
		malignancy at age 44, coherent to the Christo-	The second line states that Christopher
		pher Reeve Foundation .	Reeve had an accident, but it does not provide
		Christopher Reeve had an accident .	any information that would lead to the conclu-
			sion that Dana Reeve died of pneumothorax
			malignancy. The two statements are related
			to the individuals but do not logically connect
			in a way that one entails the other.
	Mutated	Dana Reeve , the veuve of the actors Christo-	Not entailment.
		pher Reeve , posó U+0081U+0093sessed died	
		of pneumothorax maliZnancy at age 44, co-	The second line does not logically sup-
		herent to the Christopher Reeve Foun accident	port or confirm the first line. The first line
			states that Dana Reeve died of a specific cause
			(pneumothorax malignancy) at a certain age
			while the second line mentions the Christo-
			pher Reeve Foundation and an accident
			which does not provide any information
			that confirms or relates to the cause of Dana
			Reeve's death.
R-E6	Original	In Nigeria , by far the most populous country	Not entailment.
		in sub - Saharan Africa , over 2 . 7 million	
		people exist infected with HIV .	The first line states that over 2.7 mil-
		2 . 7 percent of the people infected with HIV	lion people in Nigeria are infected with
		live in Africa .	HIV, while the second line claims that 2.7
			percent of the people infected with HIV live
			in Africa. The first line provides a specific
			number for Nigeria only, and does not
			provide information about the percentage of
			HIV-infected individuals in Africa as a whole
			Therefore, the second line does not logically
			follow from the first.
	Mutated	In Nigeria , by far the most popu infected with	Not entailment.
		HIV live in Africa .	
			The second line states that the most
			populous infected with HIV live in Africa
			but it does not specifically confirm that this
			population is in Nigeria. Therefore, while
			Nigeria is in Africa, the statement does not
			entail that the most populous infected with

Table 2. This table illustrates the interactions we performed using the samples from the developer set of AdvGLUE's QQP dataset during our evaluation. The original prompt is the same as the one in AdvGLUE, while the mutated prompt is the one that acquired the lowest BLEU/ROUGE-L score.

Sample	Original/Mutated	Prompt	Response
0.54	Original	What's the easiest way to make money online	not duplicate
Q-E1		from India?	_
		What is the beqt way to make money in ind	The two lines of text ask about making
		ia?	money online but use different phrasing
			and contain spelling errors. The first line
			specifically mentions "online" and is focused
			on India, while the second line has a type
			("beqt" instead of "best") and does not specif
			"online." Therefore, they are not duplicates.
	Mutated	What's the easiest way to make money online	duplicate
		from India?	
		What is the beqt way to make money in ind	Both lines of text are identical, as the
		ia?What's the easiest way to make money on-	contain the same content and structure
		line from India?	despite minor typographical errors in th
		What is the beqt way to make money in ind	second line.
		ia?	
O Ea	Original	How can I create the most popular question	not duplicate
Q-E2		on Quora ?	
		Which are the most famous questions on	The first line asks about how to creat
		Quora presently that ie create the most dis-	a popular question on Quora, while th
		cussions ?	second line inquires about existing famou
			questions that generate discussions. Althoug
			both lines relate to questions on Quor
			they focus on different aspects: one is about
			creation and the other about identification.
	Mostatad	Harry and I amont the mont manufactions	
	Mutated	How can I create the most populartions	not duplicate
		on Quora presently thmost populartions on	
		Quora presently that ie create the most discus-	The first line contains a typographica
		sions ?	error ("populartions" instead of "populations
			and is somewhat unclear, while the secon
			line appears to be a repetition of the first bu
			with additional errors and a lack of coherence
			The two lines are similar in theme but diffe
			in clarity and structure, making them no
			exact duplicates.
0.75	Original	Can eating precisely advance for dinner lead	not duplicate
Q-E3	-	to weight loss ?	
		Does eating dinner earlier in the evening help	The first line discusses the concept of
		with weight loss?	eating "precisely" for dinner and its potentia
			impact on weight loss, while the secon
			line focuses on the timing of dinner (eatin
			it earlier) and its effects on weight los
			Although both lines relate to dinner an
			weight loss, they address different aspects of
			eating behavior.

209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
233
230
237
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257

	Mutated	Can eating precisely advance for dinner lead to weight loss?	not duplicate
		Does eating dinner eating dinner earlier in the evening help with weight loss?	The first line discusses whether eating precisely for dinner can lead to weight loss, while the second line asks if eating dinner earlier in the evening aids in weight loss. Although both lines relate to dinner and weight loss, they focus on different aspects: precision in eating versus timing of the meal.
Q-E4	Original	What is lperational research? What is operations research?	not duplicate
			The first line contains a typographical error ("lperational" instead of "operational"), while the second line correctly states "operations research." Despite the similarity in content, the presence of the typo makes them distinct.
	Mutated	What is lperational research?	duplicate
		What is operations research? What is lperational research? What is operations research?	The two lines of text are identical in content, with the only difference being the formatting (line breaks). Both lines ask the same question about "lperational research" and "operations research," making them duplicates.
Q-E5	Original	What was the deadliest batle in history?	not duplicate
		What was the bloodiest battle in history?	The two lines of text refer to similar concepts but use different adjectives: "deadliest" and "bloodiest." While both terms can imply a high number of casualties, "deadliest" may refer to the overall impact or consequences of the battle, while "bloodiest" specifically emphasizes the amount of bloodshed or casualties. Therefore, they are not identical in meaning.
	Mutated	What was the deadliest batle in history? What was the deadliest batle in history? What was the bloodiest battle into?i hrsyWhat was the deadliest batle in history? What was the deadliest batle in history? What was the bloodiest byer ?thot asitiln	not duplicate The first two lines are identical, while the third and fourth lines contain variations and misspellings that make them different from the first two. The phrases "the bloodiest battle into?i hrsy" and "the bloodiest byer ?thot asitiln" do not match the original question.
Q-E6	Original	Are ailens real or are they fake? Do aliens exists?	not duplicate
			The first line asks whether aliens are real or fake, while the second line inquires about the existence of aliens. Although both lines pertain to the topic of aliens, they are phrased differently and ask slightly different questions.

261 N	Mutated	Are ailens real oe fetkDay h ?aerr\noaliens	not duplicate
262		exists?	
263			The first line contains several misspellings
264			and appears to be a jumbled question about
265			aliens, while the second line is a clearer
266			question asking if aliens exist. The content
267			and clarity of the two lines differ significantly.

 $Table \ 3. \ This \ table \ illustrates \ the \ interactions \ we \ performed \ using \ the \ samples \ from \ the \ developer \ set \ of \ AdvGLUE's \ SST-2 \ dataset$ during our evaluation. The original prompt is the same as the one in AdvGLUE, while the mutated prompt is the one that acquired the lowest BLEU/ROUGE-L score.

Sample	Original/Mutated	Prompt	Response
S-E1	Original	the title not only describes its main characters	Negative. The phrase "lazy people behind the
		, but the lazy people behind the camera as ok .	camera" conveys a critical sentiment towards
			the creators, suggesting a lack of effort or qual-
			ity in their work, which detracts from the over-
			all positivity of the title's description.
	Mutated	the title not only describes its main characters	Negative
		, but the l.	
			The sentence is incomplete and lacks
			context, making it difficult to derive a clear
			sentiment. The phrase "not only describes"
			suggests a potentially positive aspect, but
			without further information, it leans towards
			a negative sentiment due to its unfinished
			nature.
6 Fe	Original	holden caulfield did it better and true is true .	Negative.
S-E2			
			The phrase "holden caulfield did it bet-
			ter" suggests a comparison that implies
			disappointment or dissatisfaction with some-
			thing else, indicating a negative sentiment.
			The phrase "true is true" could imply a sense
			of resignation or acceptance of a less favorable
			reality, further contributing to the overall
			negative tone.
	Mutated	holden caulfield did it bettea&sn t pbrn;drue	Negative
		is true .holden caulfield did it better and true	
		is true .	The sentence appears to be poorly con-
			structed and contains typographical errors,
			which detracts from its clarity and coherence.
			The sentiment expressed is not clearly positive
			or negative, but the overall confusion and
			lack of clear meaning suggest a negative
			sentiment.
	Original	I wouldn't say, given all that I've seen over the	Negative. The speaker expresses a lack of admi-
S-E3	0	years, that the is a wonderful actor.	ration for the actor, indicating disappointment
		jears, that the is a wonderful detol.	or disapproval based on their experiences.
		<u> </u>	or alsapprovar based on their experiences.

	Mutated	I is a wonderful ac.rto	Negative
			The sentence contains a typographical error ("ac.rto"), which makes it unclear and difficult to interpret. The overall sentiment is undermined by this confusion, leading to a negative impression.
S-E4	Original	the iditarod lasts for days - this just felt like it	Negative. The phrase "this just felt like it did"
		did and true is true .	suggests a sense of frustration or dissatisfac- tion, indicating that the experience was longer or more tedious than expected. The overall tone does not convey positivity.
	Mutated	ts for days - this just felt like it did n dt arue is	Negative. The sentence appears to express con-
		true .	fusion or frustration, suggesting that some- thing is not as it seems or is not true, which
			conveys a negative sentiment.
S-E5	Original	the primitive effect of this video occurs to bub-	Negative.
3-E3		ble up from the vast collective remembered of	
		the combatants .	The phrase "primitive effect" suggests a
			lack of sophistication or depth, and "bubble
			up" implies something that is not fully formed
			or developed. Additionally, "vast collective
			remembered of the combatants" may indicate a focus on past conflicts, which can carry a
			negative connotation. Overall, the language
			used conveys a sense of something raw and
			potentially unsettling.
	Mutated	the primitive effect of this video occurs to	Negative. The sentence is unclear and con-
		bered of the combered of the combatants .	tains awkward phrasing, which suggests con-
			fusion or dissatisfaction with the video's im-
			pact. The use of "primitive effect" and "bered
			of the combered" indicates a lack of coherence,
			leading to a negative sentiment.
S-E6	Original	good old-fashioned slash-and-hack is back- ward!	Negative. The phrase "backward" suggests
		ward :	a disapproval or criticism of the "good old- fashioned slash-and-hack," indicating that the
			speaker views it as outdated or regressive.
	Mutated	goodeofi-dhanos sdl lash-and-hack is back-	negative
		ward!	
			The sentence expresses a negative senti-
			ment by describing something as "backward,"
			which typically implies that it is outdated or
			not progressing in a desirable way.
S-E7	Original	if you 're hard up for raunchy college humor,	Negative. The sentence expresses a sense of
		this degrade your complainant right granted .	disappointment or disapproval regarding the
			quality of humor, suggesting that it is degrad- ing and not fulfilling expectations.
1			ing and not running expectations.

365		Mutated	if you 're hard up for raunchy college humor ,	Negative
366			this degrade yourot amrl ngiaichpnt granted .	
367				The sentence expresses a sense of dis-
368				appointment or dissatisfaction, particularly
369				with the phrase "hard up for raunchy college
370				humor," suggesting that the humor is lacking
371				or not meeting expectations. The use of "de-
372				grade" further implies a negative connotation
373				regarding the quality of the content being
				referred to.
374	S-E8	Original	I wouldn't say, given that I am from Brazil,	Negative. The use of "wouldn't say" suggests a
375	3-E0		that the story is lame.	disagreement or a dismissal of the idea that the
376				story is lame, indicating a negative sentiment
377				towards that characterization.
378		Mutated	I 't say, given that I am from Brazil, that the	Negative. The use of the word "lame" indicates
379			story is lame.	a negative sentiment towards the story, sug-
380				gesting that the speaker finds it uninteresting
381				or disappointing.

Results

Table 4 shows the minimum values of BLEU and ROUGE-L scores we were able to obtain within three mutation operations on the original prompt using Muteract. The value ~ 0 indicates a number smaller than 10^{-6} . The labels in the Sample column are the labels used to refer to them in the Appendix. More details will be made publicly available upon acceptance as supplementary material to this work, including the original prompts, their responses, and the configuration used to generate those responses. Our observations during the evaluation of the model with the mentioned configuration were: in certain instances, the mutations made by the tool led to a change in the class selected by the model. This is illustrated in Tables 2, 1, 3. A close observation of sample Q-E5 shows that for question-pair detection, repeating certain phrases of text makes the model evaluate it as a duplicate. In S-E3, radamsa removed a major part of the text in the mutated prompt making the text grammatically incorrect, but the model evaluates it as a positive sentence. Notably, the model often responded with a wrong answer to the sentiment analysis tasks we presented (even without mutations), and the responses for the rationale behind the classification were typically worded as if the model considered the words of the prompt individually rather than the meaning as a whole. Through the various mutations we performed during our experiments, we succeeded in diverting attention from some of the words used by the model to generate the rationale presented in the explanation. This is evident from the low BLEU and ROUGE-L scores achieved even when the classification was not affected.

Table 4. BLEU and ROUGE-L Metrics computed from the samples taken from the developer set of AdvGLUE.

AdvGLUE's QQP dataset samples.

ROUGE-L

0.212

0.222

0.564

0.207

0.148

0.239

BLEU

~ 0

0.098

0.418

 ~ 0

~ 0

0.191

Sample

Q-E1

Q-E2

Q-E3

Q-E4

Q-E5*

Q-E6

AdvGLUE's RTE dataset samples.

AdvGLUE's SST-2 dataset samples.

Sample	BLEU	ROUGE-L
R-E1	0.445	0.603
R-E2	0.388	0.545
R-E3	0.394	0.543
R-E4	0.577	0.640
R-E5	0.252	0.427
R-E6*	0.161	0.366

Sample	BLEU	ROUGE-L
S-E1	0.064	0.121
S-E2	0.064	0.152
S-E3*	~ 0	0.088
S-E4	~ 0	0.182
S-E5	0.079	0.200
S-E6	~ 0	0.151
S-E7	0.194	0.413
S-E8	0.231	0.320