

Foundations of Certified Programming Language and Compiler Design

Dr.-Ing. Sebastian Ertel

Composable Operating Systems Group, Barkhausen Institute

Theorem Proving at TUD



- There is an internship ("Komplexpraktikum") about LEAN at TUD!
- Please have a look at https://iccl.inf.tu-dresden.de/web/Theorem_Proving_with_LEAN_(WS2023)

· Meet Stephan and Lukas and join their research!

Formally-verified your dreams!





Outline



Lecture	Logic Cog/Lean	Formalisms	PL Haskell
1	Propositional and first-order logic		
2			Functional programming
3		Syntax and Semantics	
4			The untyped lambda calculus
5		Types	
6			The typed lambda calculus
7			Polymorphism
8		Curry-Howard	
9			Higher-order types
10			Dependent types

Goals



Let's enter a more powerful logic system that allows us to express

- (in-)equalities and
- arithmetics.



• Natural numbers with addition:



• Natural numbers with addition:

$$0+1=1$$



• Natural numbers with addition:

$$0 + 1 = 1$$

Generalization:



• Natural numbers with addition:

$$0 + 1 = 1$$

Generalization:

$$0 + x = x$$



• Natural numbers with addition:

$$0 + 1 = 1$$

Generalization:

$$0 + x = x$$

• And even tougher ones:



Natural numbers with addition:

$$0 + 1 = 1$$

Generalization:

$$0 + x = x$$

• And even tougher ones:

$$x + 0 = x$$
, $x + y = y + x$



Natural numbers with addition:

$$0 + 1 = 1$$

Generalization:

$$0 + x = x$$

And even tougher ones:

$$x + 0 = x$$
, $x + y = y + x$

• Verification of the correctness of a compiler transformation trans for a program p:



Natural numbers with addition:

$$0 + 1 = 1$$

Generalization:

$$0 + x = x$$

• And even tougher ones:

$$x + 0 = x$$
, $x + y = y + x$

• Verification of the correctness of a compiler transformation \mathtt{trans} for a program p:

$$\mathtt{exec}(\mathtt{trans}\; p) = \mathtt{exec}\; p$$

From Propositional to First-Order Logic



Examples: Propositional Logic

$$X_1 \lor X_2 \Rightarrow X_3$$

From Propositional to First-Order Logic



```
Syntax A ::=
                                           formulas/propositions:
                 P(t_1,\ldots,t_n)
                                            predicates on terms
                 A \Rightarrow A
                                           implication
                 A \wedge A
                                           conjunction
                                           truth
                 A \vee A
                                           disjunction
                                           falsity
                                           negation
                  \neg A
                 \forall x.A
                                           universally quantified term variables
                  \exists x.A
                                           existentially quantified term variables
```

Examples: Propositional Logic $X_1 \lor X_2 \Rightarrow X_3$

First-Order Logic $\forall x. \exists y. (x \times y = 1 \land y \times x = 1)$

Predicates



- . . . with $a::\mathcal{P}\to\mathbb{N}$ defining the arity of predicates.
- Let $\mathcal{P}=\mathcal{X}$ where \mathcal{X} is the set of propositional variables such that $\forall X\in\mathcal{X}.a(X)=0$,
- then

Propositional formula
$$X \vee \neg Y$$

$$First-order \ formula \\ X() \vee \neg Y()$$

Terms



- . . . with an associated arity: $a:: \Sigma \to \mathbb{N}$
- and \mathcal{T} as the smallest set of terms.

Terms



- ... with an associated arity: $a:: \Sigma \to \mathbb{N}$
- and \mathcal{T} as the smallest set of terms.

Bound and Free Variables



```
Syntax A ::= \dots formulas/propositions:

| \forall x.A | universally quantified term variables

| \exists x.A | existentially quantified term variables
```

• We say: "Term variable x is bound in formula A.

Bound and Free Variables



- We say: "Term variable x is bound in formula A.
- A variable that is not bound is free.

Bound and Free Variables



- We say: "Term variable x is bound in formula A.
- A variable that is not bound is free.
- A formula A is closed when it does not contain free variables, i.e., $FV(A) = \emptyset$.



• . . . of a formula A:



. . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$



• . . . of a formula *A*:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$



• . . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \vee A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \wedge A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$



• ... of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$



• . . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$

$$FV_A(\neg A_1) = FV_A(A_1)$$



• . . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$

$$FV_A(\neg A_1) = FV_A(A_1)$$

$$FV_A(\forall x.A_1) = FV_A(\exists x.A_1) = FV_A(A_1) \setminus \{x\}$$



• ... of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$

$$FV_A(\neg A_1) = FV_A(A_1)$$

$$FV_A(\forall x.A_1) = FV_A(\exists x.A_1) = FV_A(A_1) \setminus \{x\}$$

• . . . of a term *t*:

$$FV_t :: t \to \{x | x \in X\}$$



• . . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$

$$FV_A(\neg A_1) = FV_A(A_1)$$

$$FV_A(\forall x.A_1) = FV_A(\exists x.A_1) = FV_A(A_1) \setminus \{x\}$$

of a term t:

$$FV_t :: t \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_t(x) = \{x\}$$



• . . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$

$$FV_A(\neg A_1) = FV_A(A_1)$$

$$FV_A(\forall x.A_1) = FV_A(\exists x.A_1) = FV_A(A_1) \setminus \{x\}$$

• . . . of a term t:

$$FV_t :: t \rightarrow \{x|x \in X\}$$

$$FV_t(x) = \{x\}$$

$$FV_t(f(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$



• . . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$

$$FV_A(\neg A_1) = FV_A(A_1)$$

$$FV_A(\forall x.A_1) = FV_A(\exists x.A_1) = FV_A(A_1) \setminus \{x\}$$

of a term t:

$$FV_t :: t \rightarrow \{x|x \in X\}$$

$$FV_t(x) = \{x\}$$

$$FV_t(f(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

• ... of a context Γ :

$$FV_{\Gamma} :: \Gamma \to \{x | x \in X\}$$



• . . . of a formula A:

$$FV_A :: A \to \{x | x \in X\}$$

$$FV_A(P(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

$$FV_A(A_1 \Rightarrow A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \lor A_2) = FV_A(A_1 \land A_2) = FV_A(A_1) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$

$$FV_A(\top) = FV_A(\bot) = \emptyset$$

$$FV_A(\neg A_1) = FV_A(A_1)$$

$$FV_A(\forall x.A_1) = FV_A(\exists x.A_1) = FV_A(A_1) \setminus \{x\}$$

• . . . of a term t:

$$FV_t :: t \to \{x|x \in X\}$$

$$FV_t(x) = \{x\}$$

$$FV_t(f(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = FV_t(t_1) \cup \dots \cup FV_t(t_n)$$

• . . . of a context Γ :

$$\begin{array}{rcl} FV_{\Gamma} & :: & \Gamma \rightarrow \{x | x \in X\} \\ FV_{\Gamma}(x:A_1,\ldots,x:A_n) & = & FV_A(A_1) \cup \ldots \cup FV_A(A_n) \end{array}$$

• Notation: $A(x_1, \ldots, x_n)$ where x_1, \ldots, x_n are free variable of A

Substitution



Substitution



Definition (Substitution)

A substitution is a function $\sigma :: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{T}$ such that the set $\{x \in \mathcal{X} | \sigma(x) \neq x\}$ is finite.

Substitution



Definition (Substitution)

A substitution is a function $\sigma :: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{T}$ such that the set $\{x \in \mathcal{X} | \sigma(x) \neq x\}$ is finite.

• We write $t[\sigma(x)]$ for the term where every occurrence of x in t is replaced by $\sigma(x)$.



Definition (Substitution)

A substitution is a function $\sigma :: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{T}$ such that the set $\{x \in \mathcal{X} | \sigma(x) \neq x\}$ is finite.

- We write $t[\sigma(x)]$ for the term where every occurrence of x in t is replaced by $\sigma(x)$.
- The replacement function is trivial:



Definition (Substitution)

A substitution is a function $\sigma :: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{T}$ such that the set $\{x \in \mathcal{X} | \sigma(x) \neq x\}$ is finite.

- We write $t[\sigma(x)]$ for the term where every occurrence of x in t is replaced by $\sigma(x)$.
- The replacement function is trivial:

$$x[\sigma] = \sigma(x)$$

$$f(t_1, \dots, t_n)[\sigma] = f(t_1[\sigma], \dots, t_n[\sigma])$$



Definition (Substitution)

A substitution is a function $\sigma :: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{T}$ such that the set $\{x \in \mathcal{X} | \sigma(x) \neq x\}$ is finite.

- We write $t[\sigma(x)]$ for the term where every occurrence of x in t is replaced by $\sigma(x)$.
- The replacement function is trivial:

$$x[\sigma] = \sigma(x)$$

$$f(t_1, \dots, t_n)[\sigma] = f(t_1[\sigma], \dots, t_n[\sigma])$$

Notation:



Definition (Substitution)

A substitution is a function $\sigma :: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{T}$ such that the set $\{x \in \mathcal{X} | \sigma(x) \neq x\}$ is finite.

- We write $t[\sigma(x)]$ for the term where every occurrence of x in t is replaced by $\sigma(x)$.
- The replacement function is trivial:

$$x[\sigma] = \sigma(x)$$

$$f(t_1, \dots, t_n)[\sigma] = f(t_1[\sigma], \dots, t_n[\sigma])$$

Notation:

$$A(t_1, \ldots t_n)$$
 instead of $A[t_1/x_1, \ldots, t_n/x_n]$



• We extend the natural deduction rules of propositional logic with the following rules:



• We extend the natural deduction rules of propositional logic with the following rules:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \forall x. A}{\Gamma \vdash A[t/x]} \ (\forall_E)$$



We extend the natural deduction rules of propositional logic with the following rules:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \forall x. A}{\Gamma \vdash A[t/x]} \ (\forall_E)$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash \forall x.A} \ \, (\forall_I) \text{ if } x \not\in FV_\Gamma(\Gamma)$$



We extend the natural deduction rules of propositional logic with the following rules:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \forall x.A}{\Gamma \vdash A[t/x]} \ (\forall_E) \\ \frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash \forall x.A} \ (\forall_I) \text{ if } x \not\in FV_\Gamma(\Gamma) \\ \frac{\Gamma \vdash \exists x.A_1 \quad \Gamma, A_1 \vdash A_2}{\Gamma \vdash A_2} \ (\exists_E) \text{ if } x \not\in FV_\Gamma(\Gamma) \cup FV_A(A_2)$$



We extend the natural deduction rules of propositional logic with the following rules:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \forall x.A}{\Gamma \vdash A[t/x]} \ (\forall_E) \\ \frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash A_2} \ (\exists_E) \text{ if } x \not\in FV_\Gamma(\Gamma) \\ \frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash A_2} \ (\exists_E) \text{ if } x \not\in FV_\Gamma(\Gamma) \cup FV_A(A_2) \\ \frac{\Gamma \vdash A[t/x]}{\Gamma \vdash \exists x.A} \ (\exists_I)$$





Definition (First-order Theory)

A first-order theory $\Theta(\mathcal{P}, \Sigma)$ on a set of predicates \mathcal{P} and a signature of terms Σ is a (possibly infinite) set of closed formulas also called *axioms*.



Definition (First-order Theory)

A first-order theory $\Theta(\mathcal{P}, \Sigma)$ on a set of predicates \mathcal{P} and a signature of terms Σ is a (possibly infinite) set of closed formulas also called *axioms*.



Definition (First-order Theory)

A first-order theory $\Theta(\mathcal{P}, \Sigma)$ on a set of predicates \mathcal{P} and a signature of terms Σ is a (possibly infinite) set of closed formulas also called *axioms*.

Definition (Provability)

A formula A is *provable* if there is $\Gamma \subseteq \Theta$ such that $\Gamma \vdash A$ is provable.



Definition (First-order Theory)

A first-order theory $\Theta(\mathcal{P}, \Sigma)$ on a set of predicates \mathcal{P} and a signature of terms Σ is a (possibly infinite) set of closed formulas also called *axioms*.

Definition (Provability)

A formula A is *provable* if there is $\Gamma \subseteq \Theta$ such that $\Gamma \vdash A$ is provable.

Properties:



Definition (First-order Theory)

A first-order theory $\Theta(\mathcal{P}, \Sigma)$ on a set of predicates \mathcal{P} and a signature of terms Σ is a (possibly infinite) set of closed formulas also called *axioms*.

Definition (Provability)

A formula A is *provable* if there is $\Gamma \subseteq \Theta$ such that $\Gamma \vdash A$ is provable.

Properties:

consistent when \perp is not provable in the theory



Definition (First-order Theory)

A first-order theory $\Theta(\mathcal{P}, \Sigma)$ on a set of predicates \mathcal{P} and a signature of terms Σ is a (possibly infinite) set of closed formulas also called *axioms*.

Definition (Provability)

A formula A is *provable* if there is $\Gamma \subseteq \Theta$ such that $\Gamma \vdash A$ is provable.

Properties:

consistent when \bot is not provable in the theory complete when for every formula A, either A or $\neg A$ is provable in the theory



Definition (First-order Theory)

A first-order theory $\Theta(\mathcal{P}, \Sigma)$ on a set of predicates \mathcal{P} and a signature of terms Σ is a (possibly infinite) set of closed formulas also called *axioms*.

Definition (Provability)

A formula A is *provable* if there is $\Gamma \subseteq \Theta$ such that $\Gamma \vdash A$ is provable.

Properties:

consistent when \bot is not provable in the theory complete when for every formula A, **either** A **or** $\neg A$ is provable in the theory decidable when there is an algorithm that decides whether a given formula is provable or not



$$\Theta:=(\mathcal{P},\Sigma)$$
 where $\mathcal{P}=\{=\colon 2\}$
$$\Sigma \ = \ \{f: \ n\ |\ f\in \mathsf{Strings}, n\in\mathbb{N}\}$$



$$\Theta:=(\mathcal{P},\Sigma)$$
 where $\mathcal{P}=\{=\colon 2\}$
$$\Sigma \ = \ \{f: \ n\ |\ f\in \mathsf{Strings}, n\in\mathbb{N}\}$$

Axioms:



$$\Theta:=(\mathcal{P},\Sigma)$$
 where $\mathcal{P}=\{=\colon 2\}$
$$\Sigma \ = \ \{f: \ n\ |\ f\in \mathsf{Strings}, n\in\mathbb{N}\}$$

Axioms:

$$t=t'$$
 Reflexivity



$$\Theta:=(\mathcal{P},\Sigma)$$
 where $\mathcal{P}=\{=\colon 2\}$
$$\Sigma \ = \ \{f: \ n \ | \ f \in \mathsf{Strings}, n \in \mathbb{N}\}$$

Axioms:

$$t=t'$$
 Reflexivity $\dfrac{t_2=t_1}{t_1=t_2}$ Symmetry



$$\Theta:=(\mathcal{P},\Sigma)$$
 where $\mathcal{P}=\{=\colon 2\}$
$$\Sigma \ = \ \{f: \ n \ | \ f \in \mathsf{Strings}, n \in \mathbb{N}\}$$

Axioms:

$$\boxed{t=t'} \qquad \qquad \overline{t=t} \quad \text{Reflexivity} \qquad \qquad \frac{t_2=t_1}{t_1=t_2} \quad \text{Symmetry} \qquad \qquad \frac{t_1=t_{12}-t_{12}=t_2}{t_1=t_2} \quad \text{Transitivity}$$



$$\Theta:=(\mathcal{P},\Sigma)$$
 where $\mathcal{P}=\{=\colon 2\}$
$$\Sigma \ = \ \{f: \ n \ | \ f \in \mathsf{Strings}, n \in \mathbb{N}\}$$

Axioms:

$$\boxed{t=t'} \qquad \qquad \frac{t_2=t_1}{t=t} \; \text{Symmetry} \qquad \qquad \frac{t_1=t_1}{t_1=t_2} \; \text{Transitivity}$$

$$\frac{f=f' \quad t_1=t_1' \quad \dots \quad t_n=t_n'}{f(t_1,\dots,t_n)=f'(t_1',\dots,t_n')} \; \text{Function Congruence}$$



$$\Theta:=(\mathcal{P},\Sigma)$$
 where $\mathcal{P}=\{=\colon 2\}$
$$\Sigma \ = \ \{f: n \ | \ f\in \mathsf{Strings}, n\in \mathbb{N}\}$$

Axioms:

$$\boxed{t=t'} \qquad \qquad \frac{t_2=t_1}{t_1=t_2} \; \text{Symmetry} \qquad \qquad \frac{t_1=t_{12} \quad t_{12}=t_2}{t_1=t_2} \; \text{Transitivity}$$

$$\frac{f=f' \quad t_1=t_1' \quad \dots \quad t_n=t_n'}{f(t_1,\dots,t_n)=f'(t_1',\dots,t_n')} \; \text{Function Congruence}$$

$$\frac{P(A_1,\dots,A_m) \quad A_1=A_1' \quad \dots \quad A_m=A_m'}{P(A_1',\dots,A_m')} \; \text{Predicate Congruence}$$



Axiomatizes the addition over natural numbers.



- Axiomatizes the addition over natural numbers.
- Theory of equality over the signature $\Sigma = \{0 : 0, S : 1, + : 2\}$



- Axiomatizes the addition over natural numbers.
- Theory of equality over the signature $\Sigma = \{0 : 0, S : 1, + : 2\}$
- with the following axioms:



- Axiomatizes the addition over natural numbers.
- Theory of equality over the signature $\Sigma = \{0 \,:\, 0, S \,:\, 1, + \,:\, 2\}$
- with the following axioms:

$$\frac{0=S(x)}{\perp} \ (\mathrm{ax}_{=\perp})$$



- Axiomatizes the addition over natural numbers.
- Theory of equality over the signature $\Sigma = \{0 : 0, S : 1, + : 2\}$
- with the following axioms:

$$\frac{0 = S(x)}{\perp} \ (\operatorname{ax}_{=_{\perp}}) \qquad \frac{S(x) = S(y)}{x = y} \ (S_{\operatorname{inj}})$$



- Axiomatizes the addition over natural numbers.
- Theory of equality over the signature $\Sigma = \{0 : 0, S : 1, + : 2\}$
- with the following axioms:

$$\frac{0=S(x)}{\perp} \ (\operatorname{ax}_{=\perp}) \qquad \frac{S(x)=S(y)}{x=y} \ (S_{\operatorname{inj}}) \qquad \overline{0+x=x} \ (\operatorname{ax}_{+_1})$$



- Axiomatizes the addition over natural numbers.
- Theory of equality over the signature $\Sigma = \{0 : 0, S : 1, + : 2\}$
- with the following axioms:

$$\frac{0=S(x)}{\perp} \ (\operatorname{ax}_{=\perp}) \qquad \frac{S(x)=S(y)}{x=y} \ (S_{\operatorname{inj}}) \qquad \overline{0+x=x} \ (\operatorname{ax}_{+1}) \qquad \overline{S(x)+y=S(x+y)} \ (\operatorname{ax}_{+2})$$



$$\forall x.x + 0 = x$$



$$\frac{\forall x.x+0=x}{x=0\vdash x+0=x} \frac{x=S(y)\vdash S(y)+0=S(y)}{x+0=x} \text{ (cases)}$$



$$rac{\pi_0}{orall x.x+0=x}$$
 (cases)

$$\frac{x=0 \vdash x+0=x \quad x=S(y) \vdash S(y)+0=S(y)}{x+0=x} \text{ (cases)}$$



```
\pi_S := \pi_0 := \pi_{\mathsf{Left | Identity}} := \frac{\pi_0 - \pi_S}{\forall x. x + 0 = x} \text{ (cases)} fn \ \mathsf{pi\_left\_identity(x:Nat) \{ \} }
```



$$\pi_S$$
 :=
$$\pi_0$$
 := $0+0=0$ =: $(x+0=x)[0/x]$
$$\pi_{\text{Left Identity}}$$
 :=
$$\frac{\pi_0}{\forall x.x+0=x}$$
 (cases)



$$\begin{array}{ll} \pi_S &:= & \\ \\ \pi_0 &:= & \overline{0+0=0} \ (\operatorname{ax}_{+1}) \\ \\ \pi_{\operatorname{Left Identity}} &:= & \overline{\forall x.x+0=x} \ (\operatorname{cases}) \end{array}$$



$$\pi_S := \frac{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}{S(x)+0=S(x)} \ (\forall_E)$$

$$\pi_0 := \overline{0+0=0} \ (\text{ax}_{+1})$$

$$\pi_{\text{Left Identity}} := \frac{\pi_0 \quad \pi_S}{\forall x.x+0=x} \ (\text{cases})$$



$$\frac{\forall x.S(x) + 0 = S(x + 0)}{\forall x.S(x) + 0 = S(x)} \qquad (=_{\text{transitivity}})$$

$$\pi_S := \frac{\forall x.S(x) + 0 = S(x)}{S(x) + 0 = S(x)} (\forall_E)$$

$$\pi_0 := \overline{0 + 0 = 0} \text{ (ax}_{+1})$$

$$\pi_{\text{Left Identity}} := \frac{\pi_0 \quad \pi_S}{\forall x.x + 0 = x} \text{ (cases)}$$



$$\frac{\overline{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x+0)}}{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)} \xrightarrow{(\mathsf{ax}_{+2})} \forall x.S(x+0)=S(x)} (=_{\mathsf{transitivity}})$$

$$\pi_S := \frac{\overline{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}}{S(x)+0=S(x)} (\forall_E)$$

$$\pi_0 := \overline{0+0=0} \overset{(\mathsf{ax}_{+1})}{(\mathsf{ax}_{+1})}$$

$$\pi_{\mathsf{Left Identity}} := \frac{\pi_0 \quad \pi_S}{\forall x.x+0=x} \; (\mathsf{cases})$$



$$\frac{\frac{}{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x+0)}}{\frac{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x+0)}{S(x)+0=S(x)}} \underbrace{\frac{S=S}{\forall x.X+0=x}}_{\forall x.S(x+0)=S(x)} \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\text{currentitivity}}}_{\text{currentitivity}} = \frac{\frac{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}{S(x)+0=S(x)}}{\frac{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}{S(x)+0=S(x)}} \underbrace{(\forall E)}_{\text{currentitivity}}$$



$$\frac{\overline{S=S} \ (\mathsf{ax}_{S-\mathsf{cong}}) \quad \forall x.x+0=x}{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x+0)} \ (\mathsf{ax}_{+2}) \quad \frac{\overline{S=S} \ (\mathsf{ax}_{S-\mathsf{cong}}) \quad \forall x.x+0=x}{\forall x.S(x+0)=S(x)} \ (\mathsf{fun\,cong})}{\forall x.S(x+0)=S(x)}$$

$$(=\mathsf{transitivity})$$

$$\pi_{S} := \frac{\overline{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}}{S(x)+0=S(x)} \ (\forall_{E})$$

$$\pi_{0} := \overline{0+0=0} \ (\mathsf{ax}_{+1})$$

$$\pi_{\mathsf{Left\,Identity}} := \frac{\pi_{0} \quad \pi_{S}}{\forall x.x+0=x} \ (\mathsf{cases})$$





$$\frac{\overline{S=S} \text{ } \left(\text{ax}_{S-\text{cong}}\right)}{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x+0)} \text{ } \left(\text{fun cong}\right)}{\forall x.x+0=x} \text{ } \left(\text{fun cong}\right)}$$

$$\frac{\overline{S=S} \text{ } \left(\text{ax}_{S-\text{cong}}\right)}{\forall x.S(x+0)=S(x)} \text{ } \left(\text{fun cong}\right)}$$

$$\frac{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}{S(x)+0=S(x)} \text{ } \left(\forall E\right)$$

$$\pi_{0} := \overline{0+0=0} \text{ } \left(\text{ax}_{+1}\right)$$

$$f(n) := \begin{cases} \pi_{0} & \text{if } n \text{ is } 0 \end{cases}$$

$$\pi_{\text{Left Identity}} := \frac{\pi_{0} - \pi_{S}}{\forall x.x+0=x} \text{ } \left(\text{cases}\right)$$



$$\frac{\overline{\forall x.S(x) + 0 = S(x + 0)}}{\overline{\forall x.S(x) + 0 = S(x + 0)}} \underbrace{\frac{\overline{S = S}}{\forall x.S(x + 0) = S(x)}}_{\begin{array}{c} \forall x.S(x) + 0 = x \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} \forall x.S(x) + 0 = S(x) \\ \hline S(x) + 0 = S(x) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\forall x.S(x) + 0 = S(x))}_{\begin{array}{c} (\forall E) \\ \hline S(x) + 0 = S(x) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\forall F)}_{\begin{array}{c} (\text{transitivity})} \underbrace{(\text{fun is } 0)}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} (\text{transitivity})} \underbrace{(\text{fun is } 0)}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\text{fun in } S(y))}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y)}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y)}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y) \\ \hline \end{array}} \underbrace{(\text{fun cong})}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{ is } S(y)}_{\begin{array}{c} \pi_S[y/x] \text{ if } n \text{$$



$$\frac{\overline{S=S}}{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x+0)} \text{ (ax$_{+2}$)} \qquad \frac{\overline{S=S}}{\forall x.S(x+0)} \frac{\forall x.f(x)}{\forall x.x+0=x} \text{ (fun cong)}$$

$$\frac{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)} \text{ (=transitivity)}$$

$$\pi_S := \qquad \frac{\forall x.S(x)+0=S(x)}{S(x)+0=S(x)} \text{ ($\forall E$)}$$

$$\pi_0 := \overline{0+0=0} \text{ (ax$_{+1}$)} \qquad f(n) := \begin{cases} \pi_0 & \text{if n is 0} \\ \pi_S[y/x] & \text{if n is $S(y)$} \end{cases}$$

$$\pi_{\text{Left Identity}} := \frac{\pi_0 & \pi_S}{\forall x.x+0=x} \text{ (cases)} \text{ (cases)} \text{ (ax$_{+2}$)} \text{ (ax$_{+2}$)$$



$$\frac{\overline{S=S} \text{ } (\mathsf{ax}_{S-\mathsf{cong}}) \quad \frac{\forall x. f(x)}{\forall x. x + 0 = x}}{\forall x. S(x) + 0 = S(x + 0)} \text{ } (\mathsf{fun} \, \mathsf{cong})}$$

$$\frac{\overline{S=S} \text{ } (\mathsf{ax}_{S-\mathsf{cong}}) \quad \frac{\forall x. f(x)}{\forall x. x + 0 = x}}{\forall x. S(x) + 0 = x} \text{ } (\mathsf{fun} \, \mathsf{cong})}$$

$$\frac{\forall x. S(x) + 0 = S(x)}{S(x) + 0 = S(x)} \text{ } (\forall_E)}$$

$$\pi_0 := \overline{0 + 0 = 0} \text{ } (\mathsf{ax}_{+1})$$

$$f(n) := \begin{cases} \pi_0 & \text{if } n \text{ is } 0 \\ \pi_S[y/x] & \text{if } n \text{ is } S(y) \end{cases}$$

$$\pi_{\mathsf{Left}} \, \mathsf{Identity} := \frac{\pi_0 - \pi_S}{\forall x. x + 0 = x} \text{ } (\mathsf{cases})$$

$$\mathsf{axiom} \, \mathsf{scheme} : \boxed{\frac{A(0) - (\forall x. A(x) \to A(S(x)))}{\forall x. A x}} \text{ } (\mathsf{Rec})$$

Induction Principle



$$\frac{\overline{S=S} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{ax}_{S-\operatorname{cong}}\right)}{S(x)+0=S(x+0)} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{ax}_{+2}\right) \frac{\overline{S=S} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{ax}_{S-\operatorname{cong}}\right)}{x+0=x\vdash x+0=x} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{fun\,cong}\right)}{x+0=x\vdash S(x+0)=S(x)} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{etransitivity}\right)$$

$$\pi_{S} := \frac{x+0=x\vdash S(x)+0=S(x)}{x+0=x\Rightarrow S(x)+0=S(x)} \text{ } \left(\Rightarrow_{I}\right)$$

$$\pi_{0} := \overline{0+0=0} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{ax}_{+0}\right)$$

$$\pi_{Left\, Identity} := \frac{\pi_{0}}{\forall x.x+0=x} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{Ind}\right) \qquad \qquad \frac{A(0)}{\forall x.A(x)\Rightarrow A(S(x))} \text{ } \left(\operatorname{Ind}\right)$$

Induction Principle



$$\frac{S(x) + 0 = S(x + 0)}{S(x) + 0 = S(x + 0)} \xrightarrow{\text{(ax}_{S-cong})} \frac{\overline{x + 0} = x \vdash x + 0 = x}{x + 0 = x \vdash S(x + 0) = S(x)} \xrightarrow{\text{(fun cong)}} \frac{x + 0 = x \vdash S(x) + 0 = S(x)}{x + 0 = x \Rightarrow S(x) + 0 = S(x)} \xrightarrow{\text{(=transitivity)}} \pi_S := \frac{x + 0 = x \vdash S(x) + 0 = S(x)}{x + 0 = x \Rightarrow S(x) + 0 = S(x)} \xrightarrow{\text{(\Rightarrowi$)}} \frac{x + 0 = x \vdash S(x) + 0 = S(x)}{x + 0 = x \Rightarrow S(x) + 0 = S(x)} \xrightarrow{\text{(\Rightarrowi$)}} \pi_S := \frac{\pi_0 \quad \pi_S}{\forall x . x + 0 = x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x)))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \pi_S := \frac{\pi_0 \quad \pi_S}{\forall x . x + 0 = x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad (\forall x . A(x) \Rightarrow A(X)}{\forall x . A x} \xrightarrow{\text{(Ind)}} \frac{A(0) \quad$$

Induction Principle

 π_S



Induction Hypothesis

$$\frac{1}{S(x)+0=S(x+0)} \xrightarrow{(\operatorname{ax}_{+2})} \frac{\overline{S=S} \xrightarrow{(\operatorname{ax}_{S-\operatorname{cong}})} \xrightarrow{x+0=x\vdash x+0=x} \xrightarrow{(\operatorname{ax})} \xrightarrow{(\operatorname{fun \, cong})} {(\operatorname{fun \, cong})} \xrightarrow{x+0=x\vdash S(x)+0=S(x)} \xrightarrow{(=\operatorname{transitivity})} \pi_S := \frac{x+0=x\vdash S(x)+0=S(x)}{x+0=x\Rightarrow S(x)+0=S(x)} \xrightarrow{(\Rightarrow_I)} \pi_S := \overline{0+0=0} \xrightarrow{(\operatorname{ax}_{+0})} (\operatorname{ax}_{+0})$$

$$\pi_{\text{Left Identity}} \quad := \quad \frac{\pi_0 \quad \pi_S}{\forall x.x+0=x} \ \ \text{(Ind)}$$

$$\frac{A(0) \qquad (\forall x. A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x. A \; x} \; \; (\operatorname{Ind})$$

Induction vs. Cases



$$\frac{x = 0 \vdash A(x) \qquad (\forall x. A(x) \ \Rightarrow \ A(S(x))}{\forall x. A \ x} \ (\mathrm{Ind}) \qquad \frac{x = 0 \vdash A(x) \quad x = S(y) \vdash A(S(y))}{\forall x. A(x)} \ (\mathrm{cases})$$

- Important point to remember:
 - Cases does not provide a induction hypothesis, i.e.,
 - it does not cover recursion!

Induction vs. Recurrence



$$\frac{A(0) \qquad (\forall x. A(x) \Rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x. A \; x} \; \; (\operatorname{Ind}) \qquad \qquad \frac{A(0) \qquad (\forall x. A(x) \rightarrow A(S(x))}{\forall x. A \; x} \; \; (\operatorname{Rec})$$

- Look what just happened:
 - We used a proof just like a function!
 - There seems to be a deeper connection between implication and a function (type)?
- Let's explore this connection in this lecture!