



**Figure 3 | Halo masses for rare, high-redshift, massive galaxies.** The mass of the dark-matter halo ( $M_{\text{halo}}$ ; defined at a density of 200 times the mean density of matter in the Universe) is inferred for galaxies in the first 2 Gyr after the Big Bang (see Methods). These masses present a range of lower limits, from the most conservative assumption (lower bars) that all baryons in the initial halo have been accounted for in the molecular gas mass to the observationally motivated assumption (upper triangles) that the baryonic mass ( $M_b$ ) in gas is a fixed ratio of the halo mass  $M_b/M_{\text{halo}} = 0.05$ , calibrated through a comparison<sup>3</sup> of simulations and observations spanning  $z = 0-8$ . The most massive haloes that are expected to be observable<sup>58</sup> within the whole sky (dotted line), within the 2,500-deg<sup>2</sup> area of the South Pole Telescope (SPT) survey (dashed line) and within the subset of that area that is magnified by a factor of two or more (solid line) are also plotted as a function of redshift. As SPT0311–58 E and SPT0311–58 W reside within the same halo, they are combined for this analysis. As in Fig. 2, halo masses are derived for HFLS3 (large red triangles) and SPT0311–58 (large yellow triangles) using only the carbon monoxide luminosity (open symbols) and the more sophisticated dust and carbon monoxide analysis (filled symbols); the pairs of points are slightly offset in redshift for clarity.

a system at this high redshift and in a survey that covered less than 10% of the sky is unprecedented, its existence is not precluded by the current cosmological paradigm.

**Online Content** Methods, along with any additional Extended Data display items and Source Data, are available in the online version of the paper; references unique to these sections appear only in the online paper.

**Received 11 August; accepted 6 October 2017.**

**Published online 6 December 2017.**

1. Springel, V. *et al.* Simulations of the formation, evolution and clustering of galaxies and quasars. *Nature* **435**, 629–636 (2005).
2. Cole, S., Helly, J., Frenk, C. S. & Parkinson, H. The statistical properties of  $\Lambda$  cold dark matter halo formation. *Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc.* **383**, 546–556 (2008).
3. Behroozi, P. S., Wechsler, R. H. & Conroy, C. The average star formation histories of galaxies in dark matter halos from  $z = 0-8$ . *Astrophys. J.* **770**, 57 (2013).
4. Riechers, D. A. *et al.* A dust-obscured massive maximum-starburst galaxy at a redshift of 6.34. *Nature* **496**, 329–333 (2013).
5. Vieira, J. D. *et al.* Dusty starburst galaxies in the early Universe as revealed by gravitational lensing. *Nature* **495**, 344–347 (2013).
6. Strandet, M. L. *et al.* ISM properties of a massive dusty star-forming galaxy discovered at  $z \sim 7$ . *Astrophys. J.* **842**, L15 (2017).
7. Cormier, D. *et al.* The Herschel dwarf galaxy survey. I. Properties of the low-metallicity ISM from PACS spectroscopy. *Astron. Astrophys.* **578**, A53 (2015).
8. Carlstrom, J. E. *et al.* The 10 meter South Pole telescope. *Publ. Astron. Soc. Pacif.* **123**, 568–581 (2011).
9. Mocanu, L. M. *et al.* Extragalactic millimeter-wave point-source catalog, number counts and statistics from 771 deg<sup>2</sup> of the SPT-SZ survey. *Astrophys. J.* **779**, 61 (2013).
10. Planck Collaboration. Planck 2015 results. XIII. Cosmological parameters. *Astron. Astrophys.* **594**, A13 (2016).
11. Casey, C. M., Narayanan, D. & Cooray, A. Dusty star-forming galaxies at high redshift. *Phys. Rep.* **541**, 45–161 (2014).

12. Hezaveh, Y. D. *et al.* Detection of lensing substructure using ALMA observations of the dusty galaxy SDP81. *Astrophys. J.* **823**, 37 (2016).
13. Mihos, J. C. & Hernquist, L. Gasdynamics and starbursts in major mergers. *Astrophys. J.* **464**, 641–663 (1996).
14. Cooray, A. *et al.* HerMES: the rest-frame UV emission and a lensing model for the  $z = 6.34$  luminous dusty starburst galaxy HFLS3. *Astrophys. J.* **790**, 40 (2014).
15. Decarli, R. *et al.* Rapidly star-forming galaxies adjacent to quasars at redshifts exceeding 6. *Nature* **545**, 457–461 (2017).
16. Casey, C. M. *et al.* Near-infrared MOSFIRE spectra of dusty star-forming galaxies at  $0.2 < z < 4$ . *Astrophys. J.* **840**, 101 (2017).
17. Bouwens, R. J. *et al.* UV luminosity functions at redshifts  $z \sim 4$  to  $z \sim 10$ : 10,000 galaxies from HST legacy fields. *Astrophys. J.* **803**, 34 (2015).
18. Ferkinhoff, C. *et al.* First detection of the [O III] 88  $\mu\text{m}$  line at high redshifts: characterizing the starburst and narrow-line regions in extreme luminosity systems. *Astrophys. J.* **714**, L147–L151 (2010).
19. Brauer, J. R., Dale, D. A. & Helou, G. A compendium of far-infrared line and continuum emission for 227 galaxies observed by the Infrared Space Observatory. *Astrophys. J. Suppl. Ser.* **178**, 280–301 (2008).
20. Inoue, A. K. *et al.* Detection of an oxygen emission line from a high-redshift galaxy in the reionization epoch. *Science* **352**, 1559–1562 (2016).
21. Lebouteiller, V. *et al.* Physical conditions in the gas phases of the giant H II region LMC-N 11 unveiled by Herschel. I. Diffuse [C II] and [O III] emission in LMC-N 11B. *Astron. Astrophys.* **548**, A91 (2012).
22. Díaz-Santos, T. *et al.* Explaining the [C II] 157.7  $\mu\text{m}$  deficit in luminous infrared galaxies—first results from a Herschel/PACS study of the GOALS sample. *Astrophys. J.* **774**, 68 (2013).
23. Oteo, I. *et al.* Witnessing the birth of the red sequence: ALMA high-resolution imaging of [C II] and dust in two interacting ultra-red starbursts at  $z = 4.425$ . *Astrophys. J.* **827**, 34 (2016).
24. Spilker, J. S. *et al.* ALMA imaging and gravitational lens models of South Pole telescope—selected dusty, star-forming galaxies at high redshifts. *Astrophys. J.* **826**, 112 (2016).
25. Bolatto, A. D., Wolfire, M. & Leroy, A. K. The CO-to-H<sub>2</sub> conversion factor. *Annu. Rev. Astron. Astrophys.* **51**, 207–268 (2013).
26. Bothwell, M. S. *et al.* A survey of molecular gas in luminous sub-millimetre galaxies. *Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc.* **429**, 3047–3067 (2013).
27. Aravena, M. *et al.* A survey of the cold molecular gas in gravitationally lensed star-forming galaxies at  $z > 2$ . *Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc.* **457**, 4406–4420 (2016).
28. Harrison, I. & Hotchkiss, S. A consistent approach to falsifying  $\Lambda\text{CDM}$  with rare galaxy clusters. *J. Cosmology Astropart. Phys.* **7**, 022 (2013).
29. Weiß, A. *et al.* Highly-excited CO emission in APM 08279+5255 at  $z = 3.9$ . *Astron. Astrophys.* **467**, 955–969 (2007).

**Acknowledgements** ALMA is a partnership of ESO (representing its member states), NSF (USA) and NINS (Japan), together with NRC (Canada) and NSC and ASIAA (Taiwan), in cooperation with the Republic of Chile. The Joint ALMA Observatory is operated by ESO, AUI/NRAO and NAOJ. This work incorporates observations with the NASA/ESA Hubble Space Telescope, obtained at the Space Telescope Science Institute (STScI) operated by AURA. This work is based in part on observations made with the Spitzer Space Telescope, which is operated by the Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology under a contract with NASA. The SPT is supported by the NSF through grant PLR-1248097, with partial support through PHY-1125897, the Kavli Foundation and the Gordon and Betty Moore Foundation grant GBMF 947. Supporting observations were obtained at the Gemini Observatory, which is operated by the Association of Universities for Research in Astronomy, under a cooperative agreement with the NSF on behalf of the Gemini partnership of NSF (USA), NRC (Canada), CONICYT (Chile), Ministerio de Ciencia, Tecnología e Innovación Productiva (Argentina) and Ministério da Ciência, Tecnologia e Inovação (Brazil). D.P.M., J.S.S., J.D.V., K.C.L. and J.S. acknowledge support from the US NSF under grant AST-1312950. D.P.M. was partially supported by NASA through grant HST-GO-14740 from the Space Telescope Science Institute. K.C.L. was partially supported by SOSP44-007 from the National Radio Astronomy Observatory. The Flatiron Institute is supported by the Simons Foundation. J.D.V. acknowledges support from an A. P. Sloan Foundation Fellowship. Y.D.H. is a Hubble fellow.

**Author Contributions** D.P.M. proposed the ALMA [C II] and [O III] line observations and analysed all ALMA data. J.S.S. performed the lens modelling. C.C.H. led the rareness analysis. M.L.N.A., M.B.B., S.C.C., A.H.G., J.M., K.M.R. and B.S. provided optical and infrared data reduction and de-convolution. K.A.P. and J.D.V. performed SED modelling of the sources and lens. A.W. performed joint dust and line modelling of high-redshift targets. D.P.M. wrote the manuscript. J.S.S., C.C.H., D.P.M., S.L., K.A.P. and J.D.V. prepared the figures. All authors discussed the results and provided comments on the paper. Authors are ordered alphabetically after J.D.V.

**Author Information** Reprints and permissions information is available at [www.nature.com/reprints](http://www.nature.com/reprints). The authors declare no competing financial interests. Readers are welcome to comment on the online version of the paper. Publisher's note: Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to D.P.M. ([dmarrone@email.arizona.edu](mailto:dmarrone@email.arizona.edu)).

**Reviewer Information** Nature thanks R. Davé and the other anonymous reviewer(s) for their contribution to the peer review of this work.