**1NC**

**Westborough negates the resolution Resolved: In the US, the benefits of the use of generative AI in education outweigh the harms.**

**Misuse OV**

**You should be skeptical of AI’s effectiveness – almost no research supports it.**

[**Williamson** **‘24**](http://nepc.colorado.edu/publication/ai) **confirms that:**

There is little evidence on AI’s ability to “transform” schools. Claims that AI can solve educational problems rely on rhetoric rather than actual evidence, and the serious methodological flaws in AI studies lead us to question the validity of hundreds of AI studies. Researchers rely on AI companies for money, making research reliant on corporate funding, giving AI firms considerable influence. This renders research unverifiable and unusable.

**Thus, we negate.**

**Our First Contention is Cost.**

#### **AI systems take money from poor districts.**

[**Williamson et. al 24**](http://nepc.colorado.edu/publication/ai) **warns:** Learning systems are already used in many schools. AI’s integration clouds the judgement of administrators on critical issues since they give up decision making to tech firms. The promise that AI can save schools money by reducing staffing costs is illusory, as schools will be required to pay fees for accessing AI facilities. Tech firms extract value from school budgets to defray the high computing costs associated with AI. The goal of business is to shift costs while getting the highest ROI. Struggling districts especially, will be willing to gamble on AI despite the costs.

**Rich schools can afford the top of the line products, but even cheap AI technology is out of reach for underfunded schools.**

**In fact,** [**Bromley 25**](https://ryanbromley.substack.com/p/ai-revolution-at-school-gates?utm_campaign=post&amp;utm_medium=web) **states:** AI services are too expensive to use at school. It’s blockaded behind paywalls that are too expensive for schools to provide for students and staff. Schools already operate on thin margins, and the whole budget is already taken up. AI packages that protect user data start at $30 per month per student.

At a small school with just 1,000 students, this leads to a cost of 300 thousand dollars per year, which eventually ends up in cuts to strict school budgets.

[**Roy 24**](https://cbsaustin.com/news/local/texas-schools-face-layoffs-and-cuts-without-state-funding-boost) **finds:** school districts cut programs when facing budget cuts. This takes away from other programs and extracurriculars, further limiting student opportunities.

**Educational inequality leads to inequality throughout the student’s life**

[**Sinkevich 24**](https://partners.pennfoster.edu/blog/2024/february/how-education-inequality-impacts-student-success) **continues:** inequality in education is devastating. Students in lower-income schools have limited access to a quality education. Furthermore, only 51% of lower-income

students enroll in college compared to 89% from well-off families.

**Inequality is one of the leading causes of death in the U.S.**

[**Bezruchka 14**](https://depts.washington.edu/eqhlth/pages/BezruchkaInequalityKillsBkPubInfo14.pdf) **correlates:** the factor most responsible for different mortality rates is rising inequality in wealth and income. A study from Harvard University found that about 1 in 3 deaths in the U.S. stems from high income inequality.

**Our Second Contention is Critical Thinking.**

**Generative AI disrupts the processes that build critical thinking**

[**Horvath 24**](https://hbr.org/2024/07/the-limits-of-genai-educators) **finds:** critical thinking relies on internalized knowledge. Using AI bypasses the tedious process of memorizing facts, which ensures that higher-order thinking skills never emerge. AI also structures information differently and learners who use it sacrifice future mastery.

**Studies prove the devastating effects**

[**Knapp 25**](https://www.forbes.com/sites/alexknapp/2025/01/10/the-prototype-study-suggests-ai-tools-decrease-critical-thinking-skills/) **reports:** a study of 666 individuals from a diverse population found that those who used AI tools had worse critical thinking skills. Using AI reduces the ability to think and solve problems. This is consistent with many other studies.

**The impact is economic devastation.**

**A society without critical thinking leads to economic collapse.**

[**Facione 23**](https://insightassessment.com/iaresource/critical-thinking-what-it-is-and-why-it-counts) **assesses:** a workforce without critical thinking skills would lead to whole sectors of the economy becoming unpredictable and large-scale economic disaster becoming inevitable.

[**Radcliffe ‘24**](https://www.investopedia.com/articles/economics/09/education-training-advantages.asp) **furthers**: As the number of educated workers increases, the economy prospers. The education and training of a country’s workforce is a major factor in determining how well the country’s economy will perform.

**The con helps to protect against poverty.**

**According to** [**Wu 24**](https://blogs.worldbank.org/en/africacan/economic)**:**  A one percent growth in GDP per capita leads to a 2.5 percent reduction in the poverty rate.

**The aff has terrible implications.**

[**Muller 23**](https://www.jwatch.org/na56040/2023/04/20/poverty-leading-cause-death-us) **concludes:** current poverty is associated with 42% excess risk for death. Poverty was the seventh leading cause of deaths in the US, ahead of accidents, chronic lung disease, stroke, suicide, and homicide.

**Thus, we are proud to negate.**