

# Noise-Induced Randomization in Regression Discontinuity Designs

Dean Eckles, Nikolaos Ignatiadis, Stefan Wager, Han Wu

Presented by: Sai Zhang

November 18, 2022

# Outline

## 1 Estimation

# Estimation

# Estimation of Weighted Treatment Effects

## Proposition 1

Let  $\gamma_+(\cdot), \gamma_-(\cdot)$  be measurable functions of  $Z$ , then under A1-A3:

$$\mathbb{E} [\gamma_+ (Z) Y] = \mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(1)} (U) h (U, \gamma_+)] , \quad \mathbb{E} [\gamma_- (Z) Y] = \mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(0)} (U) h (U, \gamma_-)]$$

where  $h(u, \gamma) := \int \gamma(z) p(z | u) d\lambda(z)$ ,  $\alpha_{(w)}(u) = \mathbb{E}[Y_i(w) | U_i = u]$

ratio-form estimators:

$$\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \underbrace{\gamma_+(Z_i)}}$$

$$\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \underbrace{\gamma_-(Z_i)}}$$

# Estimation of Weighted Treatment Effects

## Proposition 1

Let  $\gamma_+(\cdot), \gamma_-(\cdot)$  be measurable functions of  $Z$ , then under A1-A3:

$$\mathbb{E}[\gamma_+(Z)Y] = \mathbb{E}[\alpha_{(1)}(U)h(U, \gamma_+)], \quad \mathbb{E}[\gamma_-(Z)Y] = \mathbb{E}[\alpha_{(0)}(U)h(U, \gamma_-)]$$

where  $h(u, \gamma) := \int \gamma(z)p(z|u)d\lambda(z)$ ,  $\alpha_{(w)}(u) = \mathbb{E}[Y_i(w) | U_i = u]$

ratio-form estimators:

$$\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \underbrace{\gamma_+(Z_i)}_{\gamma_+(z)=0, z < c}}$$

$$\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \underbrace{\gamma_-(Z_i)}_{\gamma_-(z)=0, z \geq c}}$$

# Estimation of Weighted Treatment Effects

Ratio-form estimators:

$$\frac{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_+(Z)Y]}{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_+(Z)]} \Rightarrow \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)}$$

$$\frac{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_-(Z)Y]}{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_-(Z)]} \Rightarrow \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)}$$

# Estimation of Weighted Treatment Effects

Ratio-form estimators:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_+(Z)Y]}{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_+(Z)]} &\Rightarrow \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)} \\ \frac{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_-(Z)Y]}{\mathbb{E}[\gamma_-(Z)]} &\Rightarrow \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)} \end{aligned} \quad \Rightarrow \hat{\tau}_\gamma = \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-}$$

# Estimation of Weighted Treatment Effects

Ratio-form estimators:

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} = \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)} - \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)}$$

What's the weighted treatment effects to be estimated?



# Estimation of Weighted Treatment Effects

Ratio-form estimators:

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} = \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)} - \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)}$$

What's the weighted treatment effects to be estimated?

$$\tau_w = \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u), w(\cdot) \geq 0$$

# Estimation of Weighted Treatment Effects

Ratio-form estimators:

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} = \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)} - \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)}$$

What's the weighted treatment effects to be estimated?

$$\tau_w = \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u), w(\cdot) \geq 0$$

where  $\tau(u)$  (**Conditional Average Treatment Effects**) is

$$\tau(u) = \mathbb{E}[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0) \mid U_i = u] = \alpha_{(1)}(u) - \alpha_{(0)}(u)$$

# Asymptotic Bias

## Theorem 2: Asymptotic Limit of $\hat{\tau}_\gamma$

$$\hat{\tau}_\gamma = \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)} - \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)}$$

# Asymptotic Bias

## Theorem 2: Asymptotic Limit of $\hat{\tau}_\gamma$

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\tau}_\gamma = \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} &= \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)} - \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)} \\ &\xrightarrow{p} \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(1)}(U) h(U, \gamma_+)]}{\mathbb{E} [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(0)}(U) h(U, \gamma_-)]}{\mathbb{E} [h(U, \gamma_-)]} = \mu_{\gamma,+} - \mu_{\gamma,-} \equiv \theta_\gamma \end{aligned}$$

# Asymptotic Bias

## Theorem 2: Asymptotic Limit of $\hat{\tau}_\gamma$

$$\hat{\tau}_\gamma = \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} = \frac{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_+(Z_i)} - \frac{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i) Y_i}{\sum_i \gamma_-(Z_i)} \xrightarrow{p} \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(1)}(U) h(U, \gamma_+)]}{\mathbb{E} [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(0)}(U) h(U, \gamma_-)]}{\mathbb{E} [h(U, \gamma_-)]} = \mu_{\gamma,+} - \mu_{\gamma,-} \equiv \theta_\gamma$$

How biased is this asymptotic limit? Comparing to

$$\tau_w = \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u), w(\cdot) \geq 0$$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$a\text{Bias} \left[ \gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)}(\cdot), \tau(\cdot), G \right] = \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w$$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$a\text{Bias} [\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)} (\cdot), \tau (\cdot), G] = \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w$$

$$= \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(1)} (U) h (U, \gamma_+)]}{\mathbb{E} [h (U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(0)} (U) h (U, \gamma_-)]}{\mathbb{E} [h (U, \gamma_-)]} - \int \frac{w (u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w (U)]} \tau (u) dG (u)$$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\begin{aligned}
 a\text{Bias} [\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)}(\cdot), \tau(\cdot), G] &= \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w \\
 &= \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(1)}(U) h(U, \gamma_+)]}{\mathbb{E} [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(0)}(U) h(U, \gamma_-)]}{\mathbb{E} [h(U, \gamma_-)]} - \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u) \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} \right) \alpha_{(1)}(u) dG(u) - \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) \\
 &\quad - \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u)
 \end{aligned}$$



# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\begin{aligned}
 a\text{Bias} [\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)} (\cdot), \tau (\cdot), G] &= \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w \\
 &= \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(1)} (U) h (U, \gamma_+)]}{\mathbb{E} [h (U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{\mathbb{E} [\alpha_{(0)} (U) h (U, \gamma_-)]}{\mathbb{E} [h (U, \gamma_-)]} - \int \frac{w (u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w (U)]} \tau (u) dG (u) \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h (u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h (U, \gamma_+)]} \right) \alpha_{(1)} (u) dG (u) - \int \left( \frac{h (u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h (U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)} (u) dG (u) \\
 &\quad - \int \frac{w (u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w (U)]} \tau (u) dG (u)
 \end{aligned}$$

Remember?  $\tau(u)$  **(Conditional Average Treatment Effects)** is

$$\tau (u) = \mathbb{E} [Y_i (1) - Y_i (0) \mid U_i = u] = \alpha_{(1)} (u) - \alpha_{(0)} (u) \Rightarrow \boxed{\alpha_{(1)} (u) = \tau (u) + \alpha_{(0)} (u)}$$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\begin{aligned}
 a\text{Bias} [\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)} (\cdot), \tau (\cdot), G] &= \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} \right) \underbrace{\alpha_{(1)}(u)}_{=\tau(u) + \alpha_{(0)}(u)} dG(u) \\
 &\quad - \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) - \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u)
 \end{aligned}$$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\begin{aligned}
 a\text{Bias} [\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)} (\cdot), \tau (\cdot), G] &= \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} \right) \underbrace{\alpha_{(1)}(u)}_{=\tau(u) + \alpha_{(0)}(u)} dG(u) \\
 &\quad - \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) - \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u) \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u)
 \end{aligned}$$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\begin{aligned}
 a\text{Bias} [\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)} (\cdot), \tau (\cdot), G] &= \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} \right) \underbrace{\alpha_{(1)}(u)}_{=\tau(u) + \alpha_{(0)}(u)} dG(u) \\
 &\quad - \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) - \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u) \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) \\
 &\quad + \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u)
 \end{aligned}$$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\begin{aligned}
 a\text{Bias} [\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_{(0)} (\cdot), \tau (\cdot), G] &= \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_w \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} \right) \underbrace{\alpha_{(1)}(u)}_{=\tau(u) + \alpha_{(0)}(u)} dG(u) \\
 &\quad - \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) - \int \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w(U)]} \tau(u) dG(u) \\
 &= \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) \\
 &\quad + \int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G [h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G [w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u)
 \end{aligned}$$

**Confounding bias**

**CATE heterogeneity bias**

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u)$$

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u)$$

**Confounding bias**

**CATE heterogeneity bias**

How to minimize them?

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u)$$

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u)$$

**Confounding bias**

**CATE heterogeneity bias**

How to minimize them?

- **Confounding bias:**  $h(\cdot, \gamma_+) \approx h(\cdot, \gamma_-)$

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) \quad \text{Confounding bias}$$

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u) \quad \text{CATE heterogeneity bias}$$

How to minimize them?

- **Confounding bias:**  $h(\cdot, \gamma_+) \approx h(\cdot, \gamma_-)$  where  $h(u, \gamma) := \int \gamma(z) p(z | u) d\lambda(z)$   
How well the units are **balanced** via the latent variable  $u$



# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u)$$

**Confounding bias**

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u)$$

**CATE heterogeneity bias**

How to minimize them?

- **Confounding bias:**  $h(\cdot, \gamma_+) \approx h(\cdot, \gamma_-)$

How well the units are **balanced** via the latent variable  $u$

- **CATE heterogeneity bias:**

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u)$$

**Confounding bias**

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u)$$

**CATE heterogeneity bias**

How to minimize them?

- **Confounding bias:**  $h(\cdot, \gamma_+) \approx h(\cdot, \gamma_-)$

How well the units are **balanced** via the latent variable  $u$

- **CATE heterogeneity bias:**

, a constant conditional treatment effect

, an absolutely correct weighting function

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u) \quad \text{Confounding bias}$$
$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u) \quad \text{CATE heterogeneity bias}$$

How to minimize them?

- **Confounding bias:**  $h(\cdot, \gamma_+) \approx h(\cdot, \gamma_-)$

How well the units are **balanced** via the latent variable  $u$

- **CATE heterogeneity bias:**

- $\tau(u)$  being constant w.r.t.  $u$ , a constant conditional treatment effect  
    , an absolutely correct weighting function

# Asymptotic Bias: Decomposition

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{h(u, \gamma_-)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_-)]} \right) \alpha_{(0)}(u) dG(u)$$

**Confounding bias**

$$\int \left( \frac{h(u, \gamma_+)}{\mathbb{E}_G[h(U, \gamma_+)]} - \frac{w(u)}{\mathbb{E}_G[w(U)]} \right) \tau(u) dG(u)$$

**CATE heterogeneity bias**

How to minimize them?

- **Confounding bias:**  $h(\cdot, \gamma_+) \approx h(\cdot, \gamma_-)$

How well the units are **balanced** via the latent variable  $u$

- **CATE heterogeneity bias:**

- $\tau(u)$  being constant w.r.t.  $u$ , a constant conditional treatment effect
- $h(u, \gamma_+) = w(u), \forall u$ , an absolutely correct weighting function

# References I

Eckles, D., Ignatiadis, N., Wager, S., & Wu, H. (2020). Noise-induced randomization in regression discontinuity designs. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2004.09458*.

Thank you!