Noise-Induced Randomization in Regression Discontinuity Designs

Dean Eckles, Nikolaos Ignatiadis, Stefan Wager, Han Wu

Presented by: Sai Zhang

November 18, 2022

Outline



Asymptotic Normality

$$\hat{\tau} = \frac{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+} \left(Z_{i}\right) Y_{i}}{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+} \left(Z_{i}\right)} - \frac{\sum_{i} \gamma_{-} \left(Z_{i}\right) Y_{i}}{\sum_{i} \gamma_{-} \left(Z_{i}\right)}$$

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \xrightarrow{p} \theta_{\gamma} = \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(1)} \left(U\right) h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(0)} \left(U\right) h\left(U, \gamma_{-}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{-}\right)\right]}$$

$$a \text{Bias} = \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} = \underbrace{\int \left(\frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{+}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{-}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{-}\right)\right]}\right) \alpha_{(0)} \left(u\right) dG\left(u\right)}_{\text{Confounding bias}}$$

$$+ \underbrace{\int \left(\frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{+}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{w\left(u\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[w\left(U\right)\right]}\right) \tau\left(u\right) dG\left(u\right)}_{\text{CATE heterogeneity bias}}$$

Eckles et al., 2020

Theorem: Asymptotic Normality of $\hat{\tau}$

Suppose the sequence of weighting kernels $\gamma_{+}^{(n)}$ and $\gamma_{-}^{(n)}$ is deterministic, and $\exists \beta \in \left(0, \frac{1}{2}\right), C, C' > 0$ s.t. $\forall n$ large enough:

$$\sup_{z} \left| \gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(z\right) \right| < Cn^{\beta} \mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(Z_{i}\right) \right] \qquad \sup_{u} \left| h\left(u, \gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\right) \right| < C' \mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(Z_{i}\right) \right], \qquad \diamond = \{+, -\}$$

Then

Cls

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \theta_{\gamma}\right)}{\sqrt{V_{\gamma}}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}\left(0, 1\right)$$

where

$$V_{\gamma} = \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}^{2}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]^{2}} + \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}^{2}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,-}\right)^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]^{2}}$$

Asymptotic Normality

Theorem: Asymptotic Normality of $\hat{\tau}$

Suppose the sequence of weighting kernels $\gamma_{+}^{(n)}$ and $\gamma_{-}^{(n)}$ is deterministic, and $\exists \beta \in \left(0, \frac{1}{2}\right), C, C' > 0$ s.t. $\forall n$ large enough: $\sup_{z} \left| \gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)} \left(z\right) \right| < C n^{\beta} \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)} \left(Z_{i}\right) \right], \sup_{u} \left| h \left(u, \gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\right) \right| < C' \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)} \left(Z_{i}\right) \right]$ where $\diamond = \{+, -\}$ Then $\frac{\sqrt{n} \left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \theta_{\gamma} \right)}{\sqrt{V_{\gamma}}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N} \left(0, 1\right)$

where
$$V_{\gamma} = rac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}^{2}(Z_{i})(Y_{i}-\mu_{\gamma,+})^{2}
ight]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}} + rac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}^{2}(Z_{i})(Y_{i}-\mu_{\gamma,-})^{2}
ight]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}}$$

Assumption:

- The repsonse Y_i is bounded: $Y_i \in [0,1]$
- \blacksquare inf_z Var $[Y_i \mid Z_i = z] > 0$

Cls

Asymptotic Normality: A Sketch of the Proof

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left[\left(\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-}\right) - \left(\mu_{\gamma,+} - \mu_{\gamma,-}\right)\right]}{\sqrt{\frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}^{2}(Z_{i})(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}}}} \xrightarrow{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}(Z_{i})(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,-})^{2}\right]}} \frac{d}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}}$$

Cls

Asymptotic Normality: A Sketch of the Proof

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left[\left(\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-}\right) - \left(\mu_{\gamma,+} - \mu_{\gamma,-}\right)\right]}{\sqrt{\frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}^{2}(Z_{i})(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}}} + \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}^{2}(Z_{i})(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,-})^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{\sqrt{n}\left(\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)}{\sqrt{\frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2}(Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}}}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}\left(0,1\right)}$$

Asymptotic Normality: A Sketch of the Proof

$$\frac{\sqrt{n} \left[\left(\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-} \right) - \left(\mu_{\gamma,+} - \mu_{\gamma,-} \right) \right]}{\sqrt{\frac{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,+} \right)^{2} \right]}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]^{2}}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{-}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,-} \right)^{2} \right]}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{-}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]^{2}}}$$

$$\frac{\sqrt{n} \left(\hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+} - \mu_{\gamma,+} \right)}{\sqrt{\frac{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+} \left(Z_{i} \right)^{2} \left(Y_{i} \left(1 \right) - \mu_{\gamma,+} \right)^{2} \right]}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]^{2}}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,+} \right)}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]^{2}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right)^{2} \left(Y_{i} \left(1 \right) - \mu_{\gamma,+} \right)^{2} \right]}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]^{2}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right)^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \left(1 \right) + \mu_{\gamma,+} \right)^{2}}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]^{2}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right)^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right)^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]^{2}}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \left(Z_{i} \right) \right]}} \xrightarrow{\frac{d}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i} \right) \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \right) \left(Z_{i}^{2} \left(Z_{i}^{$$

Cls

Asymptotic Normality: A Sketch of the Proof

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left(\frac{\sum_{i}\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})Y_{i}}{\sum_{i}\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})} - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)}{\sqrt{\frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2}(Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})\right]^{2}}}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}\left(0,1\right)$$

 $\stackrel{d}{\rightarrow} \mathcal{N}(0,1)$

 $=1+o_n(1)$

Asymptotic Normality: A Sketch of the Proof

$$\frac{\sqrt{n} \left(\frac{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) Y_{i}}{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+}(Z_{i})} - \mu_{\gamma,+} \right)}{\sqrt{\frac{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}{\mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) \right]^{2}}}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N} (0,1)$$

$$\frac{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})}{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+}(Z_{i})} = \frac{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\left[\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i} \gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) \right]}$$

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i})^{2} (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}} \cdot \frac{1}{\sqrt{n \mathbb{E} \left[\gamma_{+}(Z_{i}) (Y_{i}(1) - \mu_{\gamma,+})^{2} \right]}}}$$

Sai Zhang Eckles et al., 2020

 $\xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}(0,1)$

Asymptotic Normality: A Sketch of the Proof

$$\frac{\sum_{i} \gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i}\left(1\right) - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)}{\sqrt{n\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)^{2}\left(Y_{i}\left(1\right) - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)^{2}\right]}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}(0,1)$$

$$\boxed{\inf_{z} \operatorname{Var}\left[Y_{i} \mid Z_{i} = z\right] > 0} : \operatorname{Var}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i}\left(1\right) - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)\right] \geq \underline{\sigma}^{2} \mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)^{2}\right]$$

$$\blacksquare \left[\sup_{u} \left| h\left(u, \gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\right) \right| < C' \mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right] \right] \text{ and } \left[Y_{i} \in [0, 1]\right] : \left| \mu_{\gamma, +} \right| = \left| \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(1)}(U)h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]} \right| \leq C' \right]$$

$$\blacksquare \left[\left. \sup_{z} \left| \gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(z\right) \right| < C n^{\beta} \mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(Z_{i}\right) \right] \right] \text{ and Lyapunov CLT condition:}$$

$$\frac{n\mathbb{E}\left[\left|\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i}\left(1\right)-\mu_{\gamma,+}\right)\right|^{2+q}\right]}{\left(n\operatorname{Var}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i}\left(1\right)-\mu_{\gamma,+}\right)\right]\right)^{\frac{2+q}{2}}} \leq \left(\frac{C'+1}{\underline{\sigma}}\right)^{2+q} \left(Cn^{\beta-\frac{1}{2}}\right)^{q} \xrightarrow{0\to\infty} 0$$

Asymptotic Normality: A Sketch of the Proof

$$\frac{\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i}\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]} \xrightarrow{p} 1$$

$$\blacksquare \left[\sup_{z}\left|\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(z\right)\right| < Cn^{\beta}\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{\diamond}^{(n)}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]\right] \text{ and Chebyshev's inequality:}$$

$$\mathbf{P}\left\{\left|\mathbb{E}_{n}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right] - \mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]\right| \geq \epsilon \mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]\right\} \leq \frac{\operatorname{Var}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]}{n\epsilon^{2}\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]^{2}} \\ \leq \left(\frac{C}{\epsilon} \cdot n^{\beta - \frac{1}{2}}\right)^{2} \xrightarrow{n \to \infty} 0$$

Cls

Plug-in Estimator for V_{γ}

$$V_{\gamma} = \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}^{2}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]^{2}} + \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}^{2}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,-}\right)^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]^{2}}$$

Plug-in Estimator for V_{γ}

$$V_{\gamma} = \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}^{2}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,+}\right)^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{+}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]^{2}} + \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}^{2}\left(Z_{i}\right)\left(Y_{i} - \mu_{\gamma,-}\right)^{2}\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[\gamma_{-}\left(Z_{i}\right)\right]^{2}}$$

Proposition: Plug-in Estimator \hat{V}_{γ}

Under the same assumptions, we have $rac{\hat{V}_{\gamma}}{V_{\gamma}}=1+o_{p}(1)$ where

$$\hat{V}_{\gamma} = \frac{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \gamma_{+}^{2} (Z_{i}) (Y_{i} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,+})^{2}}{\left[\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \gamma_{+} (Z_{i})\right]^{2}} + \frac{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \gamma_{-}^{2} (Z_{i}) (Y_{i} - \hat{\mu}_{\gamma,-})^{2}}{\left[\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \gamma_{-} (Z_{i})\right]^{2}}$$

$$a \text{Bias} = \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} = \underbrace{\int \left(\frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{+}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{-}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{-}\right)\right]}\right) \alpha_{(0)}\left(u\right) \, \mathrm{d}G\left(u\right)}_{\text{Confounding bias}} + \underbrace{\int \left(\frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{+}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{w\left(u\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[w\left(U\right)\right]}\right) \tau\left(u\right) \, \mathrm{d}G\left(u\right)}_{\text{CATE heterogeneity bias}}$$

$$a \text{Bias} = \theta_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} = \underbrace{\int \left(\frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{+}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{-}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{-}\right)\right]}\right) \alpha_{(0)}\left(u\right) \, \mathrm{d}G\left(u\right)}_{\text{Confounding bias}} + \underbrace{\int \left(\frac{h\left(u, \gamma_{+}\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[h\left(U, \gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{w\left(u\right)}{\mathbb{E}_{G}\left[w\left(U\right)\right]}\right) \tau\left(u\right) \, \mathrm{d}G\left(u\right)}_{\text{CATE heterogeneity bias}}$$

The distribution of $G(\cdot)$ is unknown

Bound the worst-case bias:

Bound the worst-case bias:

■ Back out the class of latent variable distribution from $\hat{F}_n(t) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbf{1}(Z_i \leq t)$, the empirical distribution of Z_i (Massart, 1990):

$$\mathcal{G}_{n} = \left\{ G(\cdot) : \sup_{t \in \mathbb{R}} \left| F_{G}\left(t\right) - \hat{F}_{n}\left(t\right) \right| \leq \sqrt{\frac{\log\left(2/\alpha_{n}\right)}{2n}} \right\}, \quad \alpha_{n} = \min\left\{0.05, n^{-1/4}\right\}$$

Bound the worst-case bias:

■ Back out the class of latent variable distribution from $\hat{F}_n(t) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbf{1}(Z_i \leq t)$, the empirical distribution of Z_i (Massart, 1990):

$$\mathcal{G}_{n} = \left\{ G(\cdot) : \sup_{t \in \mathbb{R}} \left| F_{G}(t) - \hat{F}_{n}(t) \right| \leq \sqrt{\frac{\log \left(2/\alpha_{n}\right)}{2n}} \right\}, \quad \alpha_{n} = \min \left\{0.05, n^{-1/4}\right\}$$

Take treatment effect heterogeneity into consideration:

$$\mathcal{T}_{M} = \left\{ \tau \left(\cdot \right) \mid \tau \left(u \right) = \bar{\tau} + \Delta \left(u \right), \bar{\tau} \in \mathbb{R}, \left| \Delta \left(u \right) \right| \leq M \right\}, \qquad M \in \left[0, 1 \right]$$

Bound the worst-case bias:

■ Back out the class of latent variable distribution from $\hat{F}_n(t) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbf{1}(Z_i \leq t)$, the empirical distribution of Z_i (Massart, 1990):

$$\mathcal{G}_{n} = \left\{ G(\cdot) : \sup_{t \in \mathbb{R}} \left| F_{G}(t) - \hat{F}_{n}(t) \right| \leq \sqrt{\frac{\log (2/\alpha_{n})}{2n}} \right\}, \quad \alpha_{n} = \min \left\{ 0.05, n^{-1/4} \right\}$$

■ Take treatment effect heterogeneity into consideration:

$$\mathcal{T}_{M} = \left\{ \tau \left(\cdot \right) \mid \tau \left(u \right) = \bar{\tau} + \Delta \left(u \right), \bar{\tau} \in \mathbb{R}, \left| \Delta \left(u \right) \right| \leq M \right\}, \qquad M \in \left[0, 1 \right]$$

- \mathcal{T}_0 (M=0): constant CATE
- \mathcal{T}_1 (M=1): no assumptions
- $\mathcal{T}_{1/2}$ (M=0): a conservative choice for a monotonicity restriction

Eckles et al., 2020

Proposition: Upper Bound for the Potential Bias $\hat{B}_{\gamma,M}$

Under asymptotic normality and all necessary assumptions, for $\tau(\cdot) \in \mathcal{T}_M$, the upper bound of bias is

$$\hat{B}_{\gamma,M} = \sup \left\{ \left| \operatorname{Bias} \left[\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_0 \left(\cdot \right), \tau \left(\cdot \right), G \right] \right| : G \in \mathcal{G}_n, \alpha_{(0)} \left(\cdot \right) \in \left[0, 1 \right], \tau \left(\cdot \right) \in \mathcal{T}_M \right\} \right.$$

then
$$\mathbf{P}\left(|b_{\gamma}| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}\right) \xrightarrow{n \to \infty} 1$$

Proposition: Upper Bound for the Potential Bias $\hat{B}_{\gamma,M}$

Under asymptotic normality and all necessary assumptions, for $\tau(\cdot) \in \mathcal{T}_M$, the upper bound of bias is

$$\hat{B}_{\gamma,M} = \sup \left\{ \left| \text{Bias} \left[\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_0 \left(\cdot \right), \tau \left(\cdot \right), G \right] \right| : G \in \mathcal{G}_n, \alpha_{(0)} \left(\cdot \right) \in \left[0, 1 \right], \tau \left(\cdot \right) \in \mathcal{T}_M \right\} \right.$$

then $\mathbf{P}\left(|b_{\gamma}| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}\right) \xrightarrow{n \to \infty} 1$

$$\{G \in \mathcal{G}_n\} \subset \left\{|b_{\gamma}| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}\right\} \Rightarrow \mathbf{P}\left(|b_{\gamma}| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}\right) \geq \mathbf{P}\left(G \in \mathcal{G}_n\right)$$

Proposition: Upper Bound for the Potential Bias $\hat{B}_{\gamma,M}$

Under asymptotic normality and all necessary assumptions, for $\tau(\cdot) \in \mathcal{T}_M$, the upper bound of bias is

$$\hat{B}_{\gamma,M} = \sup \left\{ \left| \text{Bias} \left[\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_0 \left(\cdot \right), \tau \left(\cdot \right), G \right] \right| : G \in \mathcal{G}_n, \alpha_{(0)} \left(\cdot \right) \in \left[0, 1 \right], \tau \left(\cdot \right) \in \mathcal{T}_M \right\} \right\}$$

then $\mathbf{P}\left(|b_{\gamma}| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}\right) \xrightarrow{n \to \infty} 1$

$$\{G \in \mathcal{G}_n\} \subset \left\{|b_{\gamma}| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}\right\} \Rightarrow \mathbf{P}\left(|b_{\gamma}| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}\right) \geq \mathbf{P}\left(G \in \mathcal{G}_n\right)$$

and for $G \in \mathcal{G}_n$, DKW inequality gives:

$$\mathbf{P}\left(G \in \mathcal{G}_{n}\right) \geq \mathbf{P}\left[\sup_{t \in \mathbb{R}}\left|F_{G}\left(t\right) - \hat{F}_{n}\left(t\right)\right| \leq \sqrt{\frac{\log\left(2/\alpha_{n}\right)}{2n}}\right] \geq 1 - \alpha_{n} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{\frac{\alpha_{n} = \min\left\{0.05, n^{-1/4}\right\}}{n \to \infty}} 1$$

■ Asymptotic limit:

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \stackrel{p}{\rightarrow} \theta_{\gamma} = \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(1)}\left(U\right)h\left(U,\gamma_{+}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U,\gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(0)}\left(U\right)h\left(U,\gamma_{-}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U,\gamma_{-}\right)\right]}$$

■ Asymptotic limit:

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \xrightarrow{p} \theta_{\gamma} = \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(1)}\left(U\right)h\left(U,\gamma_{+}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U,\gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(0)}\left(U\right)h\left(U,\gamma_{-}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U,\gamma_{-}\right)\right]}$$

Asymptotic normality:

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \theta_{\gamma}\right)}{\sqrt{V_{\gamma}}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}\left(0, 1\right)$$

■ Asymptotic limit:

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \xrightarrow{p} \theta_{\gamma} = \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(1)}\left(U\right)h\left(U,\gamma_{+}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U,\gamma_{+}\right)\right]} - \frac{\mathbb{E}\left[\alpha_{(0)}\left(U\right)h\left(U,\gamma_{-}\right)\right]}{\mathbb{E}\left[h\left(U,\gamma_{-}\right)\right]}$$

Asymptotic normality:

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \theta_{\gamma}\right)}{\sqrt{V_{\gamma}}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}\left(0, 1\right)$$

Upper bound of the asymptotic bias:

$$\hat{B}_{\gamma,M} = \sup \left\{ \left| \operatorname{Bias} \left[\gamma_{\pm}, \tau_w; \alpha_0 \left(\cdot \right), \tau \left(\cdot \right), G \right] \right| : G \in \mathcal{G}_n, \alpha_{(0)} \left(\cdot \right) \in \left[0, 1 \right], \tau \left(\cdot \right) \in \mathcal{T}_M \right\} \right.$$

Bias-aware Confidence Intervals

Corollary: Valid Confidence Intervals

Under asymptotic normality and all necessary assumptions, for $\tau(\cdot) \in \mathcal{T}_M$, consider the CIs

$$\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \pm l_{\alpha}, \qquad \qquad l_{\alpha} = \min \left\{ l : \mathbf{P} \left[\left| b + n^{-\frac{1}{2}} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{\frac{1}{2}} \tilde{Z} \right| \leq l \right] \geq 1 - \alpha, \forall |b| \leq \hat{B}_{\gamma, M} \right\}$$

where

- ullet $ilde{Z}$ is a standard Guassian random variable
- $\alpha \in (0,1)$ is the significant level
- lacksquare \hat{V}_{γ} is an estimate of the sampling variance V_{γ}

then

$$\lim\inf_{n\to\infty} \mathbf{P}\left[\tau_w \in \hat{\tau}_\gamma \pm l_\alpha\right] \ge 1 - \alpha$$

Bias-aware Confidence Intervals

CLT (with bias considered) is

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} - b_{\gamma}\right)}{\hat{V}_{\gamma}^{1/2}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}\left(0, 1\right)$$

where $b_{\gamma} = \overline{\theta}_{\gamma} - \tau_w$, then let $\tilde{Z} \sim \mathcal{N}(0,1)$ we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{P} \left[\tau_{w} \in \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \pm l_{\alpha} \right] = & \mathbf{P} \left[-l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \leq \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} - b_{\gamma} \leq l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \right] \\ = & \mathbf{P} \left[-\sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} + b_{\gamma} \right) \leq \sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} - b_{\gamma} \right) \leq \sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \right) \right] \\ = & \mathbb{E} \left(\mathbf{P} \left[-\sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} + b_{\gamma} \right) \leq \tilde{Z} \leq \sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \right) \right] \mid \hat{V}_{\gamma}, \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}, \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \right) + o \left(1 \right) \\ = & \mathbb{E} \left[\mathbf{P} \left(-l_{\alpha} \leq n^{-1/2} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{1/2} \tilde{Z} + b_{\gamma} \leq l_{\alpha} \right) \mid \hat{V}_{\gamma}, \hat{B}_{\gamma,M}, \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \right] + o \left(1 \right) \\ = & 1 - \alpha + o \left(1 \right) \end{aligned}$$

Bias-aware Confidence Intervals

CLT (with bias considered) is

$$\frac{\sqrt{n}\left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} - b_{\gamma}\right)}{\hat{V}_{\gamma}^{1/2}} \xrightarrow{d} \mathcal{N}\left(0, 1\right)$$

where $b_{\gamma} = \overline{\theta}_{\gamma} - \tau_w$, then let $\tilde{Z} \sim \mathcal{N}(0,1)$ we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{P} \left[\tau_{w} \in \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \pm l_{\alpha} \right] = & \mathbf{P} \left[-l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \leq \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} - b_{\gamma} \leq l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \right] \\ = & \mathbf{P} \left[-\sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} + b_{\gamma} \right) \leq \sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(\hat{\tau}_{\gamma} - \tau_{w} - b_{\gamma} \right) \leq \sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \right) \right] \\ = & \mathbb{E} \left(\mathbf{P} \left[-\sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} + b_{\gamma} \right) \leq \tilde{Z} \leq \sqrt{n} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{-1/2} \left(l_{\alpha} - b_{\gamma} \right) \right] \mid \hat{V}_{\gamma}, \hat{B}_{\gamma, M}, \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \right) + o \left(1 \right) \\ = & \mathbb{E} \left[\mathbf{P} \left(-l_{\alpha} \leq n^{-1/2} \hat{V}_{\gamma}^{1/2} \tilde{Z} + b_{\gamma} \leq l_{\alpha} \right) \mid \hat{V}_{\gamma}, \hat{B}_{\gamma, M}, \hat{\tau}_{\gamma} \right] + o \left(1 \right) \\ = & 1 - \alpha + o \left(1 \right) \end{aligned}$$

Robustness to CATE Heterogeneity

References I

Eckles, D., Ignatiadis, N., Wager, S., & Wu, H. (2020). Noise-induced randomization in regression discontinuity designs. arXiv preprint arXiv:2004.09458.

Massart, P. (1990). The tight constant in the dvoretzky-kiefer-wolfowitz inequality. The annals of Probability, 1269–1283

Thank you!