

Matt

Very important question I'm debating right now

Boyle voted for "No" in the poll: Is coffee a soup?

You voted for "No" in the poll: Is coffee a soup?

Robbie voted for "No" in the poll: Is coffee a soup?

Sam

I think soup implies a mixing of ingredients, so black coffee isn't, but maybe a double-double is

Robbie

I still think no. Soup can be a meal usually

Sam

wikipedia says soup has to have meat or vegetables

^but coffee is a fruit

Matt

Tomato soup ?

There's tomato soup that is purely tomato stock and that's it

As a counterexample to the variety of ingredients

Sam

tomato is a culinary vegetable

Matt

Agreed

But if you redefine to allow coffee to qualify then it's essentially the same

Wikipedia also lists juice as a possible liquid ingredient of soup, and coffee is bean juice

Sam

I'm not sure how you would define coffee as a vegetable, but yeah, they're pretty similar

salt is also a possible ingredient of soup, but salt isn't soup

Danielle

tomato soup is pureed tho, whereas like you said coffee is more like an extracted juice

maybe if you pureed coffee beans it'll be more soupy

Robbie

What if you did the same thing to coffee but with peas?

*I still don't think coffee is soup though just trying to help Matt out

Matt

Sam, salt is lacking the liquid ingredient

Danielle

coffee isn't soup fam

Matt

There's definitely an argument that coffee is soup

Robbie

Is beer soup?

Matt

Beer could be a cold soup

Danielle

would tea be soup too then

Matt



Jessie

I'm actually dying rn 😂

Matt

Yes

Jessie

Y'all are great

Robbie

I'm gonna tell my mom I'm having soup next time we drink

Matt

Depending what is used to make it, if it falls into the juice or veggie, meat, fruit category

It would be liquid soup with no bulk

Danielle

so water w lemon is soup?

Robbie

I'll convert if beer is soup

Danielle

Soup is a primarily liquid food, generally served **warm** or **hot** (but may be cool or cold), that is made by combining ingredients of meat or vegetables with stock, juice, water, or another liquid.

[Soup - Wikipedia](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Soup)

<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Soup>

Robbie changed vote to "Yes" in the poll: Is coffee a soup?

Sam

matt being a juice does not make it a soup

Matt

Why?

Sam

it says juice is an ingredient in soup

not soup

Matt

Stock on it's own can be considered soup so why not juice ?

Eg. Tomato soup

Tomato soup is a fully liquid ingredient soup with no bulk

Boyle

I was just going to say, I don't think stock is considered soup on its own

Danielle

the amish say its soup <http://www.amish365.com/amish-cook-classic-coffee-soup/>

Matt

In my debate we concluded stock alone can be considered a soup

Boyle

I would disagree

Matt

Albeit usually a very shitty one

Boyle

If I heat some water up and then add salt, that's not a soup

Danielle

could pickle juice be soup then?

Matt

Correct Boyle because water + salt is not a stock or broth

And yes Danielle I think so

Robbie

don't encourage her

Matt

Also note that in our debate we did not have a conclusion

Danielle

but wiki def of soup says "stock, juice, water or another liquid"

doesnt have to be stock

Matt

We are going to discuss again at a later time

Danielle

lol

Matt

Oh true, I missed the water ^

Sam

Matt you've made me very confused - you're argument for juice being a soup is 1. juice is an ingredient in soup and 2. tomato soup is a soup.

If being an ingredient in soup made something a soup then salt would be a soup too, so that doesnt make sense.

Tomato soup is made with a culinary vegetable, unlike apple juice, coffee juice, tea, lemon water or salt water.

Robbie

"coffee juice"

Matt

Sam, the argument was that a stock or broth alone is a soup , coffee ----> stock if we allow an extension to the definition , therefore coffee is a stock

Is a soup*

Sam

sorry I was still responding to when you said coffee was a soup bc it was a juice

but what makes broth a soup? even the wikipedia article says soup is broth/stock + a meat or veggie

Matt

That's where tomato soup as an example comes into play

Boyle

Yeah, broth is not a soup

Tomato soup is tomato added to a broth

Matt

There are multiple types of tomato soup that are just tomato flavoured stock or broth

Boyle

Not just mashed up tomatoes

Soup is broth plus ingredient

Matt

I've definitely had tomato soup that was broth and no bulk

And others agreed

Robbie

same it's sorta like hot tomato paste

Boyle

If broth was soup, we would call that soup

Yeah, which is a puree

Which requires oil, water, salt and heat too

Those are the three bases of a basic stock

Sam

even if tomato soup is both broth and soup, that doesn't prove that all broths are soup

Boyle

Exactly

Matt

I would argue broth = very boring soup

That's something we concluded

Sam

I would argue broth is soup iff it has a meat or veggie

Boyle

Yeah

I agree with Sam

Danielle

Is pickle juice is soup still

So*

Robbie

no danielle

Boyle

I know you're saying that the people you're with agreed broth is soup, but we are not agreeing to that it sounds like

Matt

Yeah

Robbie

that's sorta a weird line to draw i think. if i heated up broth and ate it what would you call it?

Matt

Soup

Boyle

In the event that we agreed to that, then sure, coffee is soup but so is anything that is a liquid that recieved heat

Matt

You are correct Boyle

Boyle

Like, boiling water is soup then

Danielle

But a jar of pickles w bacon in it is soup

Matt

^ I think we defined soup's liquid component as stock or broth so that wouldn't work:p but we were undecided so yes

Yes Danielle ^

Robbie

omg why Dani?

Boyle

You see why that is silly to say broth is soup

Sam

if you look up a definition of broth or stock those also require a meat or veggie component

so coffee isn't even a broth

Boyle

Because it's like saying that something is only equivalent to it's ingredients before being added together in essence

Matt

We extended the meat or veggie to allow coffee for the sake of argument

There is also a subset of soups known as clear soups which are liquid only

Boyle

Sounds like we're moving the goalposts a bit here man.

Sam

is blood soup?

Matt

Why Boyle ?

Boyle

No, but it is a broth

Matt

Clear soup = liquid only soup = broth

Unless you would argue that clear soup isn't soup

Boyle

Well, were saying that we're extending liquids to be considered broth, despite not following the definition on two different cases so that the basis that is coffee is being considered to be a broth

That's why I'm not agreeing with it being a soup

Matt

The only extension needed is to allow coffee beans to be the flavor added to the liquid

Sam

If you call coffee beans a vegetable then I agree that coffee is a soup. But on the other hand if you call salt a vegetable then I'd agree that saltwater is a soup

Matt

Besides that it fits as a stock and stock = clear soup

I agree Sam

Boyle

That's what I mean, I consider broth to be an ingredient of soup

Doesn't matter if it is the base

Matt

But extended the definition to include fruits it's much more reasonable than to include minerals

Boyle

You don't call a blank easel a painting

Danielle

^ that's subjective

Assuming you means canvas

Not wise

Easel

*

Matt

Note that a tomato is a fruit but a culinary vegetable

Boyle

My b

Yes

Matt

Which is an arbitrary extension as well

Boyle

Arbitrary on account of a culinary body, not out specific argument group

And a blank canvas can be art, but it is not a painting

Robbie

ok how about one argument at a time

Boyle

There is, I'm just using art as a rhetorical device here

Sam

I disagree robbie we need many arguments at the same time

Robbie

ugh this has already lasted too long

Boyle

Same how broth is food for sure, but it's not soup.

Matt

If the definition extends to include tomatoes then coffee beans are equally as reasonable

Boyle

I think my argument is that even if we allowed that, broth on its own is not a soup

Matt

I would argue that it is a clear soup which is a subset of soup

Therefore it is soup

Sam

You make a good point matt. While I don't agree that calling a tomato a vegetable and calling a coffee bean a vegetable are equally reasonable, "vegetable" itself is just an arbitrary definition anyway.

I suppose soup is like that too, like for something to be "soup" it doesn't have to meet some criteria intrinsic to the universe, it has to be considered soup by people. If people call something "soup" then it is soup.

I guess that means that by considering coffee to be soup, you cause coffee to be soup.

And while that only applies to the case of 'coffee considered from your point of view', that is a situation where coffee most truly is soup. So if you want coffee to always be soup, you'll just have to convince everyone that it is.

Sam

And yes danielle, that means that pickle juice can be soup

Robbie

damnit

Sam

lol "beer is soup if you believe"

Matt

You're correct that there isn't an intrinsic criteria but the point of the exercise is to build a definition with axioms such that we can definitively say whether it is or isn't

Danielle

My friend Larissa asked if a hotdog is a sandwich

Matt

Depends on the bun

A sandwich requires 2 or more pieces of bread by definition

Boyle

Not true. Citation: Subs.

Matt

If the bun is in one piece then a sub is not a sandwich

Boyle

What about open-face sandwiches?

Matt

If you have two pieces of bread yes

Boyle

But that's not what an open-face sandwich is

Matt

?

You can have two pieces of bread on the bottom

Actually my bad

An open faced sandwich is an open faced sandwich

But not a sandwich

If it had two pieces of bread it is both

They are separate by definition

My b

Sam

both "soup" and "sandwich" don't have widely agreed upon definitions. If they did, there wouldn't be an argument, we could just look at the definition and see if it fits. Being arbitrary terms, there are no axiomatic truths about either, and are solely based on what the most popular perception is. Therefore no definitive answers can be found. Thus this argument is like a belt made of clocks.

Sam

(a waist of time :D)

Robbie

hahaha sam

Sam

Sorry that last line was just bm

Matt

Soup I can see it not being widely agreed on

Sandwich is pretty straightforward

Sam

Then what is the definition of a sandwich?

Matt

A sandwich is a food typically consisting of vegetables, sliced cheese or meat, placed on or between slices of bread, or more generally any dish wherein two or more pieces of bread serve as a container or wrapper for another food type.[1][2][3]

Specifically the last line

Sam

most people consider a sub to be a sandwich, but it doesn't fit the definition

Matt

A sub is similar

It's an open faced sandwich

Which is a different set

Sam

but most people consider a sub to be a sandwich

Matt

I would disagree

There are plenty of people who consider them a separate entity of sub sandwiches or open faced sandwiches

Sam

A submarine sandwich, also known as a sub, hoagie, hero, filled roll, grinder, wedge, spukie, poorboy, po'boy or Italian sandwich, is the name given in the United States to a type of sandwich that consists of a length of bread or roll split crosswise and filled with a variety of meats, cheeses, vegetables, and condiments.

Sam

That was the first definition I found

Matt

Yes

That is a sub sandwich

It is not a subset of sandwich

Hence why it has its own definition

Sam

"is the name given to a TYPE OF SANDWICH that..."

Matt

Tru, my b

I still disagree

Sub != Sandwich

Sam

Again, My point isn't that most people think a sub is a sandwich, it's that there's disagreement on the definition of sandwich

Matt

I would like to note that the definition given has a picture of a sub sandwich with the bun cut into two pieces, which is indeed a sandwich

Sub*

On the Wikipedia page

If the bun is cut then it's a sandwich

Sam

in a way wide disagreement on whether a sub or a hotdog is a sandwich shows that the definition isn't widely agreed upon, which means that (at least for arbitrary terms) you can't find a definitive answer without changing most people's minds

Matt

In that case to obtain a definition to answer the question what would you change in my definition?

We can't prove anything without an agreed upon definition

Sam

That's exactly what I'm saying 😊

There is no widely agreed upon definition, therefore you can't definitively prove anything

Matt

If it isn't widely agreed upon then why is it listed as a definition on Wikipedia? 🤔

Wouldn't it have been peer edited or marked as misleading then ?

If there was a large set of people who disagreed ?

Wikipedia and other sources *

Sam

If you want to take the wikipedia definition to be the widely agreed upon definition then we can conclusively determine coffee to not be a soup. Tomato soup would also not be a soup unless it had other vegetables added.

also it is debated on wikipedia

<https://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=Sandwich&action=history>

[Sandwich: Revision history - Wikipedia](#)

en.wikipedia.org

Matt

We actually used wiki definitions strictly and came to the conclusion that coffee is a soup as is tomato soup

Sam

but how, that doesn't make any sense. the wikipedia definition specifically says "made by combining ingredients of meat or vegetables with stock, juice, water, or another liquid", so unless it has meat or vegetables it's not a soup. Neither plain tomato soup nor coffee have either, therefore they are not soups. Where is my mistake?

Matt

Broth/stock on it's own is under the clear soup category. Broth/stock is made by boiling meat, veggies, fish. By definition of vegetable, any seeds are considered vegetables. Coffee beans are seeds of the coffee plant and thus are considered vegetables by this definition. Therefore coffee is a stock and is a clear soup

Sam

Well reasoned, you've convinced me that wikipedia defines coffee to be a type of soup.

Do also notice that it defines soup to be any combination of edible plant matter with a liquid

Matt

Yes I agree

We came to that conclusion as well

Although the process is important as per the definition of broth, there is a cooking / near boiling component required

I.e putting a fruit in glass of water is not soup

Boiling/simmering fruit + juices is a soup

Fruit + it's juices

*

Sam

nope, broth is not required for soup, it can be any liquid

"made by combining ingredients of meat or vegetables with stock, juice, water, or another liquid."

motor oil with a rose petal in it is soup

Matt

Oh yeah that correct

I was referring to the clear soup argument

That broth alone is a soup

Sam

or falafel in a pita

or jam on bread

Matt

Jam on bread I consider open faced sandwich

Which I currently have as separate sets

Sam

Wikipedia calls it a sandwich

Matt



Sam

while also saying it must have two slice in a different part

Matt

Yeah

That's why the sandwich one is more complicated

Matt

Far more contradictions

Jrod

How ducking high are u guys