

Threshold behavior of a epidemic vector plant model: The Tomato Yellow Curl Virus

Asymptotic analysis and simulation.

Gabriel A. Salcedo Varela · Saúl Díaz-Infante

Received: date / Accepted: date

Abstract BACKGROUND
PROBLEM SETUP
FINDINGS
IMPLICATIONS

1 Introduction

2 Model formulation

2.1 Deterministic base dynamics

3 Deterministic base dynamics

$$\begin{aligned} \dot{S}_p &= -\beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v} + \tilde{r}_1 L_p + \tilde{r}_2 I_p \\ \dot{L}_p &= \beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v} - b L_p - \tilde{r}_1 L_p \\ \dot{I}_p &= b L_p - \tilde{r}_2 I_p \\ \dot{S}_v &= -\beta_v S_v \frac{I_p}{N_p} - \tilde{\gamma} S_v + (1 - \theta) \mu \\ \dot{I}_v &= \beta_v S_v \frac{I_p}{N_p} - \tilde{\gamma} I_v + \theta \mu \end{aligned} \quad (1)$$

F. Author
first address
Tel.: +123-45-678910
Fax: +123-45-678910
E-mail: fauthor@example.com

S. Author second address

Gabriel:
Aqui anexa los paquetes y contenido de lo que llevas escrito. Si necesitas carpetas agrégalas. También sube el archivo bib y las figuras en extensión eps de la simulación del modelo determinista que estamos perturbando.

translate
this section

Make a table for description of all parameters

Theorem 1 With the notation of ODE (1), let

$$N_v(t) := S_v(t) + I_v(t)$$

$$N_v^\infty := \frac{\mu}{\gamma}.$$

Then for any initial condition $(S_p(0), L_p(0), I_p(0), S_v(0), I_v(0))^\top \in (0, \infty) \times (0, N_v^\infty)$, the plant and vector total populations respectively satisfies

$$\frac{dN_p}{dt} = \frac{d}{dt}(S_p + L_p + I_p) = 0,$$

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} N_v(t) = N_v^\infty.$$

Redact this conservation law to the entire system (1). Write a introductory paragraph to Thm 1

Following ideas from [referencia], we quantify uncertainty in replanting rate of plants, and died rate of vector, r_1 , r_2 and γ , to this end, we perturb parameters $r_1 \dots$ whit a Wiener process to obtain a stochastic differential equation(SDE). Here, the perturbation describe stochastic environmental noise on each population. In symbols $dB(t) = B(t + dt) - B(t)$ denotes the increment of a standard Wiener process, thus we perturb potentially replanting r_1 , r_2 , and vector death γ in the infinitesimal time interval $[t, t + dt)$ by

$$\begin{aligned} r_1 dt &\rightsquigarrow r_1 dt + \sigma_L dB_p(t), \\ r_2 dt &\rightsquigarrow r_2 dt + \sigma_I dB_p(t), \\ \gamma dt &\rightsquigarrow \gamma dt + \sigma_v dB_v(t). \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

Why we want to normalize?

write here the parameters

Note that right hand side of (2) is a random perturbations of parameters r_1 , r_2 , γ , with mean $\mathbb{E}[r_1 dt + \sigma_L dB_p(t)]$ and variance $\text{Var}[r_1 dt + \sigma_L dB_p(t)] = \sigma_L^2 dt$, $\mathbb{E}(\tilde{r}_2 dt) = r_2 dt$ and $\text{Var}(\tilde{r}_2 dt) = \sigma_I^2 dt$ and $\mathbb{E}(\tilde{\gamma} dt) = \gamma dt$ and $\text{Var}(\tilde{\gamma} dt) = \sigma_v^2 dt$. Thus, we establish an stochastic extencion from deterministic tomato model (1) by the Itô SDE

Note that here we will use the latex proba package, plase use the same commands in the remain of the manuscript

$$\begin{aligned} dS_p &= \left(-\beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v} + r_1 L_p + r_2 I_p \right) dt + (\sigma_L L_p + \sigma_I I_p) dB_p(t) \\ dL_p &= \left(\beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v} - b L_p - r_1 L_p \right) dt - \sigma_L L_p dB_p(t) \\ dI_p &= (b L_p - r_2 I_p) dt - \sigma_I I_p dB_p(t) \\ dS_v &= \left(-\beta_v S_v \frac{I_p}{N_p} - \gamma S_v + (1 - \theta) \mu \right) dt - \sigma_v S_v dB_v(t) \\ dI_v &= \left(\beta_v S_v \frac{I_p}{N_p} - \gamma I_v + \theta \mu \right) dt - \sigma_v I_v dB_v(t). \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

4 Deterministic fixed points

Fix notation to distinguish between free disease and endemic

Here we compute the determinsitic fixed points of system (1) and show that its unicity. Thus by definition of we solve

$$\begin{aligned}
 -\beta_p S_p^* \frac{I_v^*}{N_v} + r(N_p - S_p^*) &= 0 \\
 \beta_p S_p^* \frac{I_v^*}{N_v} - bL_p^* - rL_p^* &= 0 \\
 bL_p^* - rI_p^* &= 0 \\
 -\beta_v S_v^* \frac{I_p^*}{N_p} - \gamma S_v^* + (1 - \theta)\mu &= 0 \\
 \beta_v S_v^* \frac{I_p^*}{N_p} - \gamma I_v^* + \theta\mu &= 0.
 \end{aligned} \tag{4}$$

to determine our fixed points. There is two fixed points—free disease equilibrium and the endemic equilibrium. We characterize the fist the relation $L_p^* = I_p^* = I_v^* = 0$, wich implies that

$$r(N_p - S_p^*) = 0,$$

and therefore, we obtain $S_p^* = N_p$. For the vector population we have by Theorem (1) that $S_v^* + I_v^* \rightarrow \frac{\mu}{\gamma}$ as $\rightarrow \infty$, then $S_v^* \rightarrow \frac{\mu}{\gamma}$ when we have $I_v^* = 0$. The free disease equilibrium point is $(N_p, 0, 0, \frac{\mu}{\gamma}, 0)^\top$. For the case of endemic equilibrium point, we need suppose that $L_p^*, I_p^*, I_v^* \neq 0$ and solve each right hand side of system (1) in terms of other variable. From S_p^* , we can obtain

$$S_p^* = \frac{rN_p N_v}{rN_v + I_v^* \beta_p},$$

and similar for the other equations we obtain

$$L_p^* = \frac{\beta_p S_p^* I_v^*}{N_v(b+r)},$$

$$I_p^* = \frac{bL_p^*}{r},$$

$$S_v^* = \frac{(1-\theta)\mu N_p}{\gamma N_p + I_p^* \beta_v},$$

Expressing the above coordinate in terms of I_v , we obtain

$$S_p^* = \frac{rN_p N_v}{rN_v + I_v^* \beta_p},$$

$$L_p^* = \frac{\beta_p r N_p I_v^*}{(b+r)(rN_v + I_v^* \beta_p)},$$

$$I_p^* = \frac{b\beta_p N_p I_v^*}{(b+r)(rN_v + I_v^* \beta_p)},$$

$$S_v^* = \frac{(1-\theta)\mu(b+r)(rN_v + \beta_p I_v^*)}{\gamma(b+r)(rN_v + \beta_p I_v^*) + b\beta_p \beta_v I_v^*},$$

We only need substituting the above expression into the differential equation of I_v and solve the following quadratic equation

$$\begin{aligned} & -N_p(b\gamma^2 r I_v^* N_v + b\gamma^2 (I_v^*)^2 \beta_p - b\gamma \mu r \theta N_v - b\gamma \mu \theta I_v^* \beta_p + b\gamma (I_v^*)^2 \beta_p \beta_v + b\mu \theta I_v^* \beta_p^2 \\ & - b\mu \theta I_v^* \beta_p \beta_v + \gamma^2 r^2 I_v^* N_v + \gamma^2 r (I_v^*)^2 \beta_p - \gamma \mu r^2 \theta N_v - \gamma \mu r \theta I_v^* \beta_p - b\mu I_v^* \beta_p^2) = 0 \end{aligned}$$

In sake of clearnes we define

$$\begin{aligned} a_1 &:= b\gamma^2 \beta_p + b\gamma \beta_p \beta_v + \gamma^2 r \beta_p, \\ a_2 &:= -b\gamma \mu \theta \beta_p + b\mu \theta \beta_p^2 - b\mu \theta \beta_p \beta_v + \gamma^2 r^2 N_v - \gamma \mu r \theta \beta_p - b\mu \beta_p^2 + \gamma^2 r N_v, \\ a_3 &:= -b\gamma \mu r \theta N_v - \gamma \mu r^2 \theta N_v. \end{aligned}$$

and rewrite the above equation in this new notation as

$$\underbrace{() I_v^{*2}}_{:=a_1} + \underbrace{() I_v}_{:=a_2} + \underbrace{()}_{a_3} = 0 \quad (5)$$

Fill according to each term

We need a positive solution, then according to discriminant, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \Delta &= a_2^2 - 4a_1 a_3 \\ &= (-b\gamma \mu \theta \beta_p + b\mu \theta \beta_p^2 - b\mu \theta \beta_p \beta_v + \gamma^2 r^2 N_v - \gamma \mu r \theta \beta_p - b\mu \beta_p^2 + \gamma^2 r N_v)^2 \\ &\quad + 4(b\gamma^2 \beta_p + b\gamma \beta_p \beta_v + \gamma^2 r \beta_p)(b\gamma \mu r \theta N_v + \gamma \mu r^2 \theta N_v), \end{aligned}$$

which ever is positive, then we have two different real solution, since we require the positive, we deduce that

$$I_v^* = \frac{-a_2 + \sqrt{a_2^2 - 4a_1 a_3}}{2a_1}.$$

5 Existence of a unique positive solution

Theorem *.* of [Mao Book] assures the existence of unique solution of (3) in a compact interval. Since we study asymptotic behaviour, we have to assure the existence of unique positive invariant solution to SDE (*). To this end, let \mathbb{R}_+^n the first octant of \mathbb{R}^n and consider

$$\mathbf{E} := \left\{ (S_p, L_p, I_p, S_v, I_v)^\top \in \mathbb{R}_+^5 : \begin{aligned} & S_p + L_p + I_p \geq N_p, \quad S_v + I_v \leq \frac{\mu}{\gamma} \end{aligned} \right\},$$

the following result prove that this set is positive invariant.

Theorem 2 For any initial values $(S_p(0), L_p(0), I_p(0), S_v(0), I_v(0)) \in \mathbf{E}$, exists unique invariant global positive solution to SDE (3) $(S_p(t), L_p(t), I_p(t), S_v(t), I_v(t))^\top$ with probability one, that is,

$$\mathbb{P}[(L_p(t), I_p(t), S_v(t), I_v(t)) \in \mathbf{E}, \quad \forall t \geq 0] = 1.$$

Proof

6 Extinction of the disease

Our analysis needs the following hypotesis.

(H-1) According to SDE (3), replatin rates satisfies $r_1 = r_2 = r$.

(H-2) The replanting noise intesities are equal $\sigma_L = \sigma_I = \sigma$.

We define the reproductive number of our stochastic model in SDE (*) by

$$\mathcal{R}_0^s := \frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma r}. \quad (6)$$

Define here the infinitesimal operator \mathcal{L} .

As our deterministic base structure this paramenteres summarizes the behavior of extinction and persistence according with a threshold.

Theorem 3 Let $(S_p(t), L_p(t), I_p(t), I_v(t))$ be the solution of (3) with initial condition $(S_p(0), L_p(0), I_p(0), I_v(0)) \in \mathbf{E}$. If $0 \leq \mathcal{R}_0^s < 1$ then, infected individuals in SDE (*) tends to zero exponentially a.s, that is, the disease will extinguishes with probability one.

Proof The proof consitst verify the hypotheses of Khasminskii Theorem [*] for the Lyapunov function

$$V(S_p, L_p, I_p, S_v, I_v) = \left(S_p - S_p^0 - S_p^0 \ln \left(\frac{S_p}{S_p^0} \right) \right) + L_p + I_p + \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v} I_v. \quad (7)$$

Let f, g respectively be the dirft and difussion of SDE(*). Applyng the inifinitesimal opreator \mathcal{L} we have

In the following step apply the operator \mathcal{L}

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f &= \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right) \left(-\frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v + r N_p - r S_p\right) + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v - (b + r) L_p \\
&\quad + b L_p - r I_p + \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \left(\frac{\beta_v N_v}{N_p} I_p - \frac{\beta_v}{N_v^\infty} I_v I_p - \gamma I_v\right) \\
&= -r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} I_v S_p^0 + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v - r(L_p + I_p) \\
&\quad + \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \left(\frac{\beta_v N_v}{N_p} I_p - \frac{\beta_v}{N_v^\infty} I_v I_p - \gamma I_v\right) \\
&= -r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} I_v S_p^0 - r(L_p + I_p) + \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \frac{\beta_v N_v}{N_p} I_p \\
&\quad - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \frac{\beta_v}{N_v^\infty} I_v I_p - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \gamma I_v.
\end{aligned}$$

Then,

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f &= -r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - \left[\frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \gamma - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{N_v^\infty}\right] I_v + \left[\frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \beta_v \frac{N_v^\infty}{N_p} - r\right] I_p \\
&\quad - r L_p - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \\
&= -r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + \left[\frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \beta_v \frac{N_v^\infty}{N_p} - r\right] I_p - r L_p - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \\
&= -r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + r \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma r} - 1\right] I_p - r L_p - \frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v I_p.
\end{aligned}$$

Expressing the right hand side of above equation in term of the basic reproductive number, \mathcal{R}_0^s we get

$$V_x f = -r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + r [\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1] I_p - r L_p - \frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v I_p.$$

Moreover,

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{1}{2} \text{trace}(g^T V_{xx} g) &= \frac{1}{2} \sigma^2 N_p \left(\frac{N_p - S_p}{S_p}\right)^2 \\
&\leq \frac{1}{2} \sigma^2 N_p.
\end{aligned}$$

The stochastic terms are not necessary, because they do a martingale process and therefore, when we use integral and expectation they vanishing. Incorporation all terms calculate above, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
dV(X) &= -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + r[\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1]I_p - rL_p - \frac{\beta_p\beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v I_p + \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2 N_p \left(\frac{N_p - S_p}{S_p}\right)^2 \\
&\leq -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + r[\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1]I_p - rL_p - \frac{\beta_p\beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v I_p + \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2 N_p.
\end{aligned}$$

Define $LV(X)$ as

$$LV(X) = -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + r[\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1]I_p - rL_p - \frac{\beta_p\beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v I_p + \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2 N_p.$$

Using Itô's formula and integrating dV from 0 to t as well as taking expectation yield the following

$$\begin{aligned}
0 &\leq \mathbb{E}V(t) - \mathbb{E}V(0) \leq \mathbb{E} \int_0^t LV(X(s))ds \\
&\leq -\mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left[rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - r[\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1]I_p + rL_p + \frac{\beta_p\beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v I_p \right] ds + \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2 N_p t
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{t} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left[-rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + r[\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1]I_p - rL_p - \frac{\beta_p\beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v I_p \right] ds \leq \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2 N_p.$$

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{t} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left[r[\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1]I_p - rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - rL_p - \frac{\beta_p\beta_v}{\gamma} I_v I_p \right] dr \leq \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2 N_p, a.s.$$

Theorem 4 Let $(S_p(t), L_p(t), I_p(t), I_v(t))$ be the solution of SDE (3) with initial values $(S_p(0), L_p(0), I_p(0), I_v(0)) \in (0, N_p) \times (0, N_p) \times (0, N_p) \times (0, N_v)$. If $0 \leq \mathcal{R}_0^s < 1$, then the following conditions holds

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{t} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left[r[\mathcal{R}_0^s - 1]I_p - rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - rL_p - \frac{\beta_p\beta_v}{\gamma} I_v I_p \right] dr \leq \frac{1}{2}\sigma^2 N_p, a.s.,$$

namely, the infected individual tends to zero exponentially a.s, i.e the disease will die out with probability one.

Write a paragraph to describe why the limit above exponentially goes to zero.

Proof The proof consistst verify the hypotheses of Khasminskii Theorem [*] for the Lyapunov function

$$V(S_p, L_p, I_p, S_v, I_v) = \left(S_p - N_p - N_p \ln \frac{S_p}{N_p} \right) + L_p + I_p + \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} I_v \\ + \left(S_v - N_v - N_v \ln \frac{S_v}{N_v} \right),$$

Let f , g respectively be the dirft and difussion of SDE (??). Applying the infinitesimal opeator \mathcal{L} we have

$$V_x f = \left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p} \right) \left(-\frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v + r N_p - r S_p \right) + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v - (b + r) L_p \quad (8)$$

$$+ b L_p - r I_p + \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right) \left(-\frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p - \gamma S_v + (1 - \theta) \mu \right) \quad (9)$$

$$+ \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \left(\frac{\beta_v S_v}{N_p} I_p - \gamma I_v + \theta \mu \right) \quad (10)$$

$$(11)$$

Expanded the first term and factoring the term S_p , we obtain

$$\left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p} \right) \left(-\frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v + r N_p - r S_p \right) = \left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p} \right) \left(-r S_p \left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p} \right) - \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v \right) \\ = -r S_p \left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p} \right)^2 - \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p I_v + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} N_p I_v \quad (12)$$

For the second term, since $(1 - \theta) \mu \leq \gamma N_v$ we can bounded by the following

$$\left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right) \left(-\frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p - \gamma S_v + (1 - \theta) \mu \right) \leq \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right) \left(-\frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p - \gamma S_v + \gamma N_v \right) \\ \leq \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right) \left(-\gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right) - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p \right) \\ \leq -\gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right)^2 - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} N_v I_p \quad (13)$$

Same way from above calculation, and since $\theta \mu \leq \theta \gamma N_v$, we obtain

$$\frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \left(\frac{\beta_v S_v}{N_p} I_p - \gamma I_v + \theta \mu \right) \leq \frac{\beta_p N_p}{\gamma N_v^\infty} \left(\frac{\beta_v S_v}{N_p} I_p - \gamma I_v + \theta \gamma N_v \right) \\ \leq \frac{\beta_p \beta_v S_v I_p}{\gamma N_v} - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{N_v^\infty} I_v + \beta_p \theta N_p \quad (14)$$

Then, sustituting (12)-(14) into $V_x f$

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f \leq & -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p}\right)^2 + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} N_p I_v - r(L_p + I_p) \\
& - \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} N_v I_p \\
& + \frac{\beta_p \beta_v S_v I_p}{\gamma N_v} - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{N_v^\infty} I_v + \beta_p \theta N_p
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f \leq & -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p}\right)^2 + \left[\frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} N_p - \frac{\beta_p N_p}{N_v^\infty} \right] I_v - r(L_p + I_p) \\
& - \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} N_v I_p \\
& + \frac{\beta_p \beta_v S_v I_p}{\gamma N_v} + \beta_p \theta N_p
\end{aligned}$$

Moreover, since $S_v + I_v \leq N_v$, we can obtain the following relation

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f \leq & -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{N_p}{S_p}\right)^2 - r(L_p + I_p) \\
& - \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \\
& + \frac{\beta_p \beta_v I_p}{\gamma} - \frac{\beta_p \beta_v I_v I_p}{\gamma N_v} + \beta_p \theta N_p
\end{aligned}$$

Expressing the right hand side of above equation in term of the basic reproductive number, \mathcal{R}_0^s we get

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f = & -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 - rL_p - r[1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s] I_p \\
& - \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} \right] I_v I_p - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p + \beta_p \theta N_p.
\end{aligned}$$

Moreover,

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{1}{2} \text{trace}(g^T V_{xx} g) &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{(\sigma_p(L_p + I_p))^2}{N_p} + \frac{1}{2} \sigma_v^2 N_v \\
&\leq \frac{1}{2} \sigma_p^2 N_p + \frac{1}{2} \sigma_v^2 N_v.
\end{aligned}$$

The stochastic terms are not necessary, because they do a martingale process and therefore, when we use integral and expectation they vanishing.

Incorporation all terms calculate above, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{L}V(X) \leq & -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 - rL_p - r[1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s]I_p \\ & - \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p}\right] I_v I_p - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p + \beta_p \theta N_p + \frac{1}{2} \sigma_p^2 N_p + \frac{1}{2} \sigma_v^2 N_v.\end{aligned}$$

Define $\sigma_{p,v} := \beta_p \theta N_p + \frac{1}{2} \sigma_p^2 N_p + \frac{1}{2} \sigma_v^2 N_v$, then

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{L}V(X) \leq & -rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 - \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 - rL_p - r[1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s]I_p \\ & - \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p}\right] I_v I_p - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p + \sigma_{p,v}.\end{aligned}$$

Since $V(x) \geq 0$, and using Itô's formula and integrating dV from 0 to t as well as taking expectation yield the following

$$\begin{aligned}0 \leq \mathbb{E}V(t) - \mathbb{E}V(0) & \leq \mathbb{E} \int_0^t \mathcal{L}V(X(s)) ds \\ & \leq -\mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left[rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 + rL_p + r[1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s]I_p \right. \\ & \quad \left. + \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p}\right] I_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p - \sigma_{p,v} \right] ds\end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{1}{t} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t & \left[rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 + rL_p + r[1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s]I_p \right. \\ & \quad \left. + \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p}\right] I_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p \right] ds \leq \sigma_{p,v}\end{aligned}$$

This implies that,

$$\begin{aligned}\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{t} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t & \left[rS_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p}\right)^2 + \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v}\right)^2 + rL_p + r[1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s]I_p \right. \\ & \quad \left. + \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p}\right] I_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p \right] ds \leq \sigma_{p,v}\end{aligned}$$

Taking θ, σ_p , and σ_v such that $0 < \sigma_{p,v} < 1$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{t} \log \mathbb{E} \int_0^t & \left[r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p} \right)^2 + \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right)^2 + r L_p + r [1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s] I_p \right. \\ & \left. + \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} \right] I_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p \right] ds \leq \log \sigma_{p,v} < 0. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t & \left[r S_p \left(1 - \frac{S_p^0}{S_p} \right)^2 + \gamma S_v \left(1 - \frac{N_v}{S_v} \right)^2 + r L_p + r [1 - \mathcal{R}_0^s] I_p \right. \\ & \left. + \left[\frac{\beta_p \beta_v}{\gamma N_v^\infty} + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} \right] I_v I_p + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} S_v I_p \right] ds \leq \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} e^{\sigma_{p,v} t} = 0 \end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$\begin{aligned} S_p & \rightarrow N_p \quad L_p \rightarrow 0 \quad I_p \rightarrow 0 \\ S_v & \rightarrow N_v \quad I_v \rightarrow 0. \end{aligned}$$

exponentially a.s.

7 Persistence

Theorem 5 *Let $(S_p(t), L_p(t), I_p(t), I_v(t))$ be the solution of (3) with initial values $(S_p(0), L_p(0), I_p(0), I_v(0)) \in (0, N_p) \times (0, N_p) \times (0, N_p) \times (0, N_v)$. If $\mathcal{R}_0^s > 1$, then the system (3) is globally asymptotically stable at endemic equilibrium point if*

$$\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{t} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left[\frac{r S_p^*}{S_p S_p^*} (S_p^* - S_p)^2 + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v} S_p^* I_v^* A_1 + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} \frac{I_p}{I_v} (I_v - I_v^*)^2 + \gamma I_v^* A_2 \right] dr \leq A_3.$$

namely, the disease will persist with probability one.

Proof Let us define the following Lyapunov function $V : \mathbb{R}_+^4 \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_+$

$$\begin{aligned} V(S_p, L_p, I_p, I_v) &= (S_p + L_p + I_p + I_v) - (S_p^* + L_p^* + I_p^* + I_v^*) \\ &\quad - \left(S_p^* \ln \frac{S_p}{S_p^*} + L_p^* \ln \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} + I_p^* \ln \frac{I_p}{I_p^*} + I_v^* \ln \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} \right). \end{aligned}$$

Computing the Itô formula terms as:

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f = & \left(1 - \frac{S_p^*}{S_p}\right) \left(rN_p - \beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v^\infty} - rS_p\right) + \left(1 - \frac{L_p^*}{L_p}\right) \left(\beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v^\infty} - (r+b)L_p\right) \\
& + \left(1 - \frac{I_p^*}{I_p}\right) (bL_p - rI_p) + \left(1 - \frac{I_v^*}{I_v}\right) \left(\beta_v N_v \frac{I_p}{N_p} - \beta_v \frac{I_p}{N_p} I_v - \gamma I_v\right).
\end{aligned}$$

The system (3) satisfy the following relations at equilibrium point

$$\begin{aligned}
rN_p &= \beta_p S_p^* \frac{I_v^*}{N_v^\infty} + rS_p^* \\
(r+b) &= \beta_p S_p^* \frac{I_v^*}{L_p^* N_v^\infty} \\
r &= b \frac{L_p^*}{I_p^*} \\
\beta_v \frac{N_v}{N_p} &= \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v^* + \gamma \frac{I_v^*}{I_p^*}
\end{aligned}$$

Moreover,

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f &= \left(1 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) \left(\beta_p S_p^* \frac{I_v^*}{N_v^\infty} + r S_p^* - \beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v^\infty} - r S_p\right) \\
&+ \left(1 - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*}\right) \left(\beta_p S_p \frac{I_v}{N_v^\infty} - \beta_p S_p^* \frac{I_v^*}{L_p^* N_v^\infty} L_p\right) + \left(1 - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*}\right) \left(b L_p - b \frac{L_p^*}{I_p^*} I_p\right) \\
&+ \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*}\right) \left(\frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v^* I_p + \gamma \frac{I_v^*}{I_p^*} I_p - \beta_v \frac{I_p}{N_p} I_v - \gamma I_v\right) \\
&= r S_p^* \left(1 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) \left(1 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* \left(1 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) \left(1 - \frac{S_p I_v}{S_p^* I_v^*}\right) \\
&+ \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* \left(1 - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*}\right) \left(\frac{S_p I_v}{S_p^* I_v^*} - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*}\right) + b L_p^* \left(1 - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*}\right) \left(\frac{L_p}{L_p^*} - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*}\right) \\
&+ \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*}\right) \left(-\frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*}\right) + \gamma I_v^* \left(\frac{I_p}{I_p^*} - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*}\right)\right) \\
&= r S_p^* \left(2 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*} - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} \left(\frac{S_p}{S_p^*} - 1\right) - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) \\
&+ \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* \left(\frac{S_p I_v}{S_p^* I_v^*} \left(1 - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*}\right) - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} \left(1 - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*}\right)\right) + b L_p^* \left(1 + \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*} - \frac{I_p^* L_p}{I_p L_p^*}\right) \\
&- \frac{\beta_v}{N_v} I_v I_p \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*}\right)^2 + \gamma I_v^* \left(\frac{I_p}{I_p^*} - \frac{I_v I_p}{I_v^* I_p^*} - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} + 1\right) \\
&= r S_p^* \left(2 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*} - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* \left(1 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*} - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} \left(\frac{S_p}{S_p^*} - 1\right)\right) \\
&+ \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* \left(1 - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} - \frac{S_p I_v}{S_p^* I_v^*} \left(\frac{L_p}{L_p^*} - 1\right)\right) + b L_p^* \left(1 - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*} + \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} \left(1 - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*}\right)\right) \\
&- \frac{\beta_v}{N_v^\infty} I_v I_p \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*}\right)^2 + \gamma I_v^* \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*} \left(\frac{I_v}{I_v^*} - 1\right)\right).
\end{aligned}$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned}
V_x f &= r S_p^* \left(2 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*} - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*}\right) + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* \left(2 - \frac{S_p}{S_p^*} - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} \left(\frac{S_p L_p^*}{S_p^* L_p} - 1\right)\right) \\
&+ b L_p^* \left(1 - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*} + \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} \left(1 - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*}\right)\right) - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*}\right)^2 \\
&+ \gamma I_v^* \left(1 - \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} - \frac{I_p}{I_p^*} \left(\frac{I_v}{I_v^*} - 1\right)\right).
\end{aligned}$$

Now we need compute the term $g^T V_{xx}g$,

$$g^T V_{xx}g = \begin{bmatrix} \sigma^2 \left(\frac{N_p - S_p}{S_p} \right)^2 S_p^* + \sigma^2 L_p^* & 0 \\ 0 & I_p^* \sigma^2 + I_v^* \sigma_v^2 \end{bmatrix}$$

therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{2} \text{trace}(g^T V_{xx}g) &= \frac{1}{2} \left(\sigma^2 \left(\frac{N_p - S_p}{S_p} \right)^2 S_p^* + \sigma^2 L_p^* + \sigma^2 I_p^* + \sigma_v^2 I_v^* \right) \\ &\leq \frac{1}{2} (\sigma^2 S_p^* + \sigma^2 L_p^* + \sigma^2 I_p^* + \sigma_v^2 I_v^*) \end{aligned}$$

The stochastics terms are not necessary, because they are a martingale and therefore, when we use integrating and expectation they vanishing, obtaining the following $LV(X)$ operator

$$\begin{aligned} LV(X) &= -rS_p^* \frac{(S_p^* - S_p)^2}{S_p S_p^*} - \frac{\beta_p}{N_p^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* A_1 - bL_p^* A_2 - \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \left(1 - \frac{I_v^*}{I_v} \right)^2 \\ &\quad - \gamma I_v^* A_3 + A_4. \end{aligned}$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} A_1 &= \left(\frac{S_p^*}{S_p} + \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} + \frac{I_v}{I_v^*} \left(\frac{S_p L_p^*}{S_p^* L_p} - 1 \right) - 2 \right) > 0, \\ A_2 &= \left(\frac{I_p}{I_p^*} - \frac{L_p}{L_p^*} \left(1 - \frac{I_p^*}{I_p} \right) - 1 \right) > 0, \\ A_3 &= \left(\frac{I_v}{I_v^*} + \frac{I_p}{I_p^*} \left(\frac{I_v^*}{I_v} - 1 \right) - 1 \right) > 0, \\ A_4 &= \frac{1}{2} (\sigma^2 S_p^* + \sigma^2 L_p^* + \sigma^2 I_p^* + \sigma_v^2 I_v^*) > 0. \end{aligned}$$

Applying Itô formula, integrating dV from 0 to t and taking expectation gives the following

$$\begin{aligned} 0 \leq \mathbb{E}V(t) - \mathbb{E}V(0) &= \mathbb{E} \int_0^t LV(s) ds \\ &= \mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left(rS_p^* \frac{(S_p^* - S_p)^2}{S_p S_p^*} + \frac{\beta_p}{N_p^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* A_1 + bL_p^* A_2 + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \left(1 - \frac{I_v^*}{I_v} \right)^2 + \gamma I_v^* A_3 \right) ds \\ &\quad + A_4 t. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{t} \mathbb{E} \int_0^t \left(r S_p^* \frac{(S_p^* - S_p)^2}{S_p S_p^*} + \frac{\beta_p}{N_v^\infty} S_p^* I_v^* A_1 + b L_p^* A_2 + \frac{\beta_v}{N_p} I_v I_p \left(1 - \frac{I_v^*}{I_v} \right)^2 + \gamma I_v^* A_3 \right) ds \\ \leq A_4. \end{aligned}$$

8 Numerical Results

9 Conclusions

Reference	Priority	Observation
[1]		
[2]	**	See Lyapunov Function.
[3]	**	For persistence def
[4]	*	Dengue
[5]	*	Mobility
[6]		
[7]		
[8]		
[9]		
[10]		
[11]	***	Review
[12]	***	Review
[13]	**	Review
[14]	*	Vaccination
[15]	**	General ideas
[16]	***	For extinction by noise
[17]	***	Threshold behaviour
[18]	***	Good idea for COVID 19
[19]	**	Lie approach
[20]	**	Threshold
[21]	***	Thickbone with CMCM deduction
[22]	***	Permanence
[23]	*	Degenerate Diffusion
[24]	*	General force of infection

References

1. Y. Zhao, D. Jiang, D. O'Regan, *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications* **392**(20), 4916 (2013). DOI 10.1016/j.physa.2013.06.009. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.physa.2013.06.009>
<http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0378437113005074>
2. X.B. Zhang, H.F. Huo, H. Xiang, Q. Shi, D. Li, *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications* **482**, 362 (2017). DOI 10.1016/j.physa.2017.04.100. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.physa.2017.04.100>
3. Q. Liu, D. Jiang, N. Shi, T. Hayat, A. Alsaedi, *Mathematics and Computers in Simulation* **144**, 78 (2018). DOI 10.1016/j.matcom.2017.06.004. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.matcom.2017.06.004>
<http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S037847541730232X>
4. Q. Liu, D. Jiang, T. Hayat, A. Alsaedi, *Journal of the Franklin Institute* **355**(17), 8891 (2018). DOI 10.1016/j.jfranklin.2018.10.003. URL <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0016003218306227?via%3Dihub>
<https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0016003218306227>
5. Y. Cai, W. Wang, *International Journal of Biomathematics* **10**(07), 1750100 (2017). DOI 10.1142/S1793524517501005. URL <http://www.worldscientific.com/doi/abs/10.1142/S1793524517501005>
6. Q. Lu, *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications* **388**(18), 3677 (2009). DOI 10.1016/j.physa.2009.05.036. URL <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0378437109004178>
<http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0378437109004178>
7. M. El Fatini, A. Lahrouz, R. Pettersson, A. Settati, R. Taki, *Applied Mathematics and Computation* **316**, 326 (2018). DOI 10.1016/j.amc.2017.08.037. URL <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S009630031730588X>
<https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S009630031730588X>
8. Q. Liu, D. Jiang, *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications* **526**, 120975 (2019). DOI 10.1016/j.physa.2019.04.211. URL

- https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0378437119305801?dgcid=raven_sd_recommender_email
<https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0378437119305801>
9. A. Lahrouz, A. Settati, A. Akharif, *Journal of Mathematical Biology* **74**(1-2), 469 (2017). DOI 10.1007/s00285-016-1033-1. URL <http://link.springer.com/10.1007/s00285-016-1033-1>
 10. W. Wang, Y. Cai, Z. Ding, Z. Gui, *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications* **509**, 921 (2018). DOI 10.1016/j.physa.2018.06.099. URL <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physa.2018.06.099>
<https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0378437118308240>
 11. Y. Cao, D. Denu, *Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems - Series B* **21**(7), 2109 (2016). DOI 10.3934/dcdsb.2016039. URL <http://www.hindawi.com/journals/ddns/2010/679613/>
<http://www.aims sciences.org/journals/displayArticlesnew.jsp?paperID=12924>
 12. T. Tang, Z. Teng, Z. Li, *Stochastic Analysis and Applications* **33**(6), 994 (2015). DOI 10.1080/07362994.2015.1065750. URL <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/07362994.2015.1065750>
 13. C. Ji, D. Jiang, *Applied Mathematical Modelling* **38**(21-22), 5067 (2014). DOI 10.1016/j.apm.2014.03.037. URL <http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0307904X14001401>
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2014.03.037>
 14. Y. Zhao, D. Jiang, *Applied Mathematics and Computation* **243**(11371085), 718 (2014). DOI 10.1016/j.amc.2014.05.124. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.amc.2014.05.124>
<http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0096300314008248>
 15. Y. Cai, Y. Kang, M. Banerjee, W. Wang, *Journal of Differential Equations* **259**(12), 7463 (2015). DOI 10.1016/j.jde.2015.08.024. URL <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0022039615004271>
<http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0022039615004271>
 16. Y. Zhang, Y. Li, Q. Zhang, A. Li, *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications* **501**, 178 (2018). DOI 10.1016/j.physa.2018.02.191. URL https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0378437118302474?dgcid=raven_sd_recommender_email
<https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0378437118302474>
 17. Y. Zhao, D. Jiang, *Applied Mathematics Letters* **34**(1), 90 (2014). DOI 10.1016/j.aml.2013.11.002. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.aml.2013.11.002>
<http://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0893965913003200>
 18. Z. Chang, X. Meng, X. Lu, *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications* **472**, 103 (2017). DOI 10.1016/j.physa.2017.01.015. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.physa.2017.01.015>
<https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0378437117300171>
 19. N.T. Dieu, *Journal of Dynamics and Differential Equations* **30**(1), 93 (2018). DOI 10.1007/s10884-016-9532-8. URL <http://link.springer.com/10.1007/s10884-016-9532-8>
 20. Y. Lin, D. Jiang, *Journal of Dynamics and Differential Equations* **26**(4), 1079 (2014). DOI 10.1007/s10884-014-9408-8. URL <http://link.springer.com/10.1007/s10884-014-9408-8>
 21. M. Maliyoni, F. Chirove, H.D. Gaff, K.S. Govinder, *Bulletin of Mathematical Biology* **79**(9), 1999 (2017). DOI 10.1007/s11538-017-0317-y
 22. H. Qiu, J. Lv, K. Wang, *Advances in Difference Equations* **2013**(1), 37 (2013). DOI 10.1186/1687-1847-2013-37. URL <http://advancesindifferenceequations.springeropen.com/articles/10.1186/1687-1847-2013-37>
 23. Y. Lin, M. Jin, L. Guo, *Advances in Difference Equations* **2017**(1), 341 (2017). DOI 10.1186/s13662-017-1355-3. URL <http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/s13662-017-1355-3>
<http://advancesindifferenceequations.springeropen.com/articles/10.1186/s13662-017-1355-3>
 24. Y. Cai, X. Wang, W. Wang, M. Zhao, *Abstract and Applied Analysis* **2013**, 1 (2013). DOI 10.1155/2013/172631. URL <http://www.hindawi.com/journals/aaa/2013/172631/>

A Background