Dr. Yuan and colleagues provided a meta-analysis to evaluated adoptive immunotherapy for postoperative hepatocellular carcinoma. The study was performed rigorously and the findings are interesting. Although there are still lots of problems, it was worth to be publish to provide the quantitative evaluation to adoptive immunotherapy for postoperative hepatocellular carcinoma if the authors could make the following changes.

1, Since there have been already two meta-analyses to this problem, the current study is only the update to the previous study, the present manuscript should be change to ‘brief report’ and the manuscript should be as short as possible. For the tables and figures, only table 1, figure 2 and figure 3 can be kept in the main-test, other tables and figures should be remove to supplementary. Or else, it cannot be accepted since the content has been overlapped with previous study. Please be sure to remove non-related contents in background, discussion and reference section and make the manuscript as compact as possible.

2. Majority of the samples/studies are from East Asian population which might be have great bias, please check whether there are not Caucasia population study.

3, Please explain why short-term outcome is significant while long-term outcome is not so significant.

4, Please provide exact Review Manager 5.3 input as the supplementary so that the readers could check the result and make the manuscript more reproducible.