Study notes on "Stochastic Polyak Step-size, a simple step-size tuner with optimal rates" by F. Pedregosa

Shuvomoy Das Gupta

March 29, 2024

Here are my study notes for Fabian Pedregosa's amazing blog on Stochastic Polyak Step-size; the full citation of Pedregosa's blog is: Stochastic Polyak Step-size, a simple step-size tuner with optimal rates, Fabian Pedregosa, 2023 available at https://fa.bianp.net/blog/2023/sps/.

## **Contents**

Problem setup

Notation

Stochastic Gradient Descent with Polyak Stepsize

Assumptions 2

Convergence analysis

Problem setup

We are interested in solving the problem

$$p^* = \left( \begin{array}{cc} \underset{x \in \mathbb{R}^d}{\text{minimize}} & \left\{ f(x) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n f^{[i]}(x) \right\} \end{array} \right) \dots (\mathcal{P})$$

where the optimal solution is achieved at  $x_{\star}$ . We have the following assumptions regarding the nature of the problem.

#### **Notation**

Inner product between vectors x,y is denoted by  $\langle x \mid y \rangle$  and Euclidean norm of x is denoted by  $||x|| = \sqrt{\langle x \mid y \rangle}$ . We let  $[1:n] = \{1,2,\ldots,n\}$  and  $z_+ = \max\{z,0\}$ . Also, for notational convenience we denote:  $\operatorname{sqd}(x) = ||x||^2$  and  $\operatorname{ReLU}(z) = \max\{z,0\}$ . Comments are enclosed in /\* this is a comment \*/.

# Stochastic Gradient Descent with Polyak Stepsize

The algorithm called Stochastic Gradient Descent with Stochastic Polyak Stepsize (SGD-SPS) to solve  $(\mathcal{P})$  is described by Algorithm 1. The uniform distribution with support  $\{1,\ldots,n\}$  is denoted by unif[1:n]. One subgradient of the function  $f^{[i]}$  evaluated at x is denoted by  $\widetilde{\nabla} f(x)$ .

# **Algorithm 1** SGD-SPS to solve (P)

**input:** the functions  $f^{[i]}$  for  $i \in [1:n]$ , iteration limit T

```
algorithm: 1. initialization: pick x_0 \in \mathbb{R}^d arbitrarily 2. main iteration: for t=0,1,2,\ldots,T-1 sample a function f_i uniformly at random i \sim \operatorname{unif}[1:n] set Polyak stepsize \gamma_t = \begin{cases} \frac{\operatorname{ReLU}\left(f^{[i]}(x_t) - f^{[i]}(x_\star)\right)}{\|\tilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x_t)\|^2}, & \text{if } \tilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x_t) \neq 0 \| \\ 0, & \text{else,} \end{cases} update iterate x_{t+1} = x_t - \gamma_t \tilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x_t)(x_t) end for 3. return x_T
```

# Assumptions

We assume that for all  $i, f^{[i]} : \mathbb{R}^d \to (-\infty, \infty]$  is a nonsmooth, subgradient bounded, and star-convex function, i.e,

## • Star-convexity.

$$\forall_{i \in [1:n]} f^{[i]} \text{ star-convex around } x_{\star}$$

$$\overset{\text{def}}{\Leftrightarrow}$$

$$\forall_{x \in \text{dom} f} f^{[i]}(x) - f^{[i]}(x_{\star}) \leq \left\langle \widetilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x) \mid x - x_{\star} \right\rangle.$$

• Subgradient-boundedness.

$$\forall_{i \in [1:N]} \ \forall_{x \in \mathcal{B} = \{y | \|y - x_{\star}\| \le \|x_0 - x_{\star}\|\}} \ \forall_{\widetilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x) \in \partial f^{[i]}(x)} \ \|\widetilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x)\| \le G.$$

## Convergence analysis

Consider an arbitrary iteration number t and we want to compute iterate  $x_{t+1}$  from  $x_t$ . Going from  $x_t$  to  $x_{t+1}$  the randomness lies in the selection of the function  $f_i$  by  $i \sim \mathsf{unif}[1:N]$ . We will come up with an inequality that works for any value of i. We will use the notation  $\widetilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x_t) \triangleq g_t^{[i]}, \widetilde{\nabla} f(x_t) \triangleq g_t, f^{[i]}(x_t) \triangleq f_t^{[i]}$ .

Consider the case  $\|g_t^{[i]}\| \neq 0$ . We have

$$||x_{t+1} - x_{\star}||^{2}$$

$$= ||x_{t} - \gamma_{t}g_{t}^{[i]} - x_{\star}||^{2}$$

$$= ||(x_{t} - x_{\star}) - \gamma_{t}g_{t}^{[i]}||^{2}$$

$$= ||x_{t} - x_{\star}||^{2} + \gamma_{t}^{2}||g_{t}^{[i]}||^{2} - 2\gamma_{t} \left\langle g_{t}^{[i]} \mid x_{t} - x_{\star} \right\rangle$$

$$\begin{split} & \text{we have } f^{[i]}(x) - f^{[i]}(x_\star) \leq \left\langle \widetilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x) \mid x - x_\star \right\rangle \\ & \overset{x \coloneqq x_t}{\Rightarrow} f^{[i]}(x_t) - f^{[i]}(x_\star) \leq \left\langle \widetilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x_t) \mid x_t - x_\star \right\rangle \\ & \Leftrightarrow f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \leq \left\langle g_t^{[i]} \mid x_t - x_\star \right\rangle \\ & \Leftrightarrow - \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right) \geq - \left\langle g_t^{[i]} \mid x_t - x_\star \right\rangle \\ & \overset{\cdot}{\Rightarrow} - 2\gamma_t \left\langle g_t^{[i]} \mid x_t - x_\star \right\rangle \\ & \leq \|x_t - x_\star\|^2 + \gamma_t^2 \|g_t^{[i]}\|^2 - 2\gamma_t \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right) \\ & = \|x_t - x_\star\|^2 + \frac{\left( \operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU} \right) \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right)}{\|g_t^{[i]}\|^4} \|g_t^{[i]}\|^2 - 2 \frac{\operatorname{ReLU} \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right)}{\|g_t^{[i]}\|^2} \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right) \\ & \text{we have } z \times \operatorname{ReLU}(z) = z \times \max\{z, 0\} = \begin{cases} z^2, & \text{if } z \geq 0 \\ 0, & \text{else} \end{cases} = (\max\{z, 0\})^2 = (\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU}) \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right) \\ & */ \\ & = \|x_t - x_\star\|^2 + \frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU} \right) \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right)}{\|g_t^{[i]}\|^2} - 2 \frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU} \right) \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right)}{\|g_t^{[i]}\|^2} \\ & = \|x_t - x_\star\|^2 - \frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU} \right) \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right)}{\|g_t^{[i]}\|^2}} \dots (1) \end{split}$$

Now consider the case  $||g_t^{[i]}|| = 0$ , then  $x_{t+1} = x_t$  and

$$||x_{t+1} - x_{\star}||^2 = ||x_t - x_{\star}||^2 \dots (2)$$

Thus from (1) and (2), we have

$$\|x_{t+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \leq \begin{cases} \|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} - \frac{(\operatorname{sqdo-ReLU})\left(f_{t}^{[i]} - f_{\star}^{[i]}\right)}{\|g_{t}^{[i]}\|^{2}}, & \text{with } i \sim \operatorname{unif}[1:n] \text{ and } \|g_{t}^{[i]}\| \neq 0, \\ \|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2}, & \text{with } i \sim \operatorname{unif}[1:n] \text{ and } \|g_{t}^{[i]}\| = 0. \end{cases} \dots (3)$$

From (3), we see that irrespective of the randomness in selecting i, we always have  $\|x_{t+1} - x_\star\|^2 \le \|x_t - x_\star\|^2 \le \cdots \le \|x_0 - x_\star\|^2$ , hence we have  $x_t \in \mathcal{B} = \{y \mid \|y - x_\star\| \le \|x_0 - x_\star\|\}$  no matter what. As a result, for the case  $\|g_t^{[i]}\| \ne 0$ , using the gradient-boundedness assumption we have

$$\begin{split} & \|\boldsymbol{g}_{t}^{[i]}\|^{2} \leq G^{2} \\ \Leftrightarrow & \frac{1}{\|\boldsymbol{g}_{t}^{[i]}\|^{2}} \geq \frac{1}{G^{2}} \\ \Leftrightarrow & -\frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_{t}^{[i]} - f_{\star}^{[i]}\right)}{\|\boldsymbol{g}_{t}^{[i]}\|^{2}} \leq -\frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_{t}^{[i]} - f_{\star}^{[i]}\right)}{G^{2}}.\dots(4) \end{split}$$

Next, for the case  $\|g_t^{[i]}\|=0 \Leftrightarrow g_t^{[i]}=0$ , using star-convexity, we have

$$\begin{split} f^{[i]}(x) - f^{[i]}(x_\star) &\leq \left\langle \widetilde{\nabla} f^{[i]}(x) \mid x - x_\star \right\rangle \\ \stackrel{x := x_t}{\Rightarrow} f^{[i]}(x_t) - f^{[i]}(x_\star) &\leq \left\langle g_t^{[i]} \mid x_t - x_\star \right\rangle = 0 \\ \Rightarrow f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} &\leq 0 \\ \Rightarrow &\operatorname{ReLU}\left(f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]}\right) = \max\left\{f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]}, 0\right\} = 0 \\ \Rightarrow \frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]}\right)}{G^2} = 0 \dots (5) \end{split}$$

So, using (4) and (5) in the cases of (3) we get

$$\|x_{t+1}-x_\star\|^2 \leq \|x_t-x_\star\|^2 - \frac{(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU})\left(f_t^{[i]}-f_\star^{[i]}\right)}{G^2} \text{ with } i \sim \operatorname{unif}[1:n].\dots(6)$$

Next, on both sides of (6), we take conditional expectation with respect to i given  $x_t$ , which we denote by  $\mathbf{E}\left[\cdot \mid x_t\right] \triangleq \mathbf{E}_{i \sim \mathsf{unif}\left[1:N\right]}\left[\cdot \mid x_t\right]$ , and the resultant inequality is:

$$\begin{split} &\mathbf{E}\left[\|x_{t+1}-x_{\star}\|^{2}\mid x_{t}\right]\\ &\leq \mathbf{E}\left[\|x_{t}-x_{\star}\|^{2}-\frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_{t}^{[i]}-f_{\star}^{[i]}\right)}{G^{2}}\mid x_{t}\right]\\ &=\mathbf{E}\left[\|x_{t}-x_{\star}\|^{2}\mid x_{t}\right]-\mathbf{E}\left[\frac{\left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_{t}^{[i]}-f_{\star}^{[i]}\right)}{G^{2}}\mid x_{t}\right]\\ &=\|x_{t}-x_{\star}\|^{2}-\frac{1}{G^{2}}\,\mathbf{E}\left[\left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_{t}^{[i]}-f_{\star}^{[i]}\right)\mid x_{t}\right]\ldots(7) \end{split}$$

> using linearity of expectation

ightharpoonup using "taking out what's known" rule  $\mathbf{E}\left[h(X)Y\mid X\right]=h(X)\mathbf{E}\left[Y\mid X\right]$ 

Recall now Jensen's inequality: if  $\phi$  is a convex function and Z is a random variable, then  $\phi$  ( $\mathbf{E}[Z]$ )  $\leq \mathbf{E}[\phi(Z)]$ . Setting  $\phi := \mathsf{sqd} \circ \mathsf{ReLU} = \mathsf{sqd} (\mathsf{ReLU}(\cdot))$ , which is convex (see Boyd Vandenberghe, Convex Optimization, Figure 3.7) and  $Z := \left[ (\mathsf{sqd} \circ \mathsf{ReLU}) \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right) \mid x_t \right]$  we have

$$\begin{split} & \left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(\mathbf{E}\left[\left(f_t^{[i]}-f_\star^{[i]}\right)\mid x_t\right]\right) \leq \mathbf{E}\left[\left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_t^{[i]}-f_\star^{[i]}\mid x_t\right)\right] \\ & \Leftrightarrow -\left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(\mathbf{E}\left[\left(f_t^{[i]}-f_\star^{[i]}\right)\mid x_t\right]\right) \geq -\mathbf{E}\left[\left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_t^{[i]}-f_\star^{[i]}\mid x_t\right)\right] \\ & \Leftrightarrow -\frac{1}{G^2}(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU})\left(\mathbf{E}\left[\left(f_t^{[i]}-f_\star^{[i]}\right)\mid x_t\right]\right) \geq -\frac{1}{G^2}\,\mathbf{E}\left[\left(\operatorname{sqd}\circ\operatorname{ReLU}\right)\left(f_t^{[i]}-f_\star^{[i]}\mid x_t\right)\right].\ldots.(8) \end{aligned}$$

Now notice the LHS term in (8):

$$\mathbf{E}\left[\left(\left(f_t^{[i]} - f_{\star}^{[i]}\right) \mid x_t\right)\right]$$

$$= \underset{i \sim \text{unif}[1:n]}{\mathbf{E}} \left[ \left( \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right) \mid x_t \right) \right]$$

$$= \left( \left( \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \left( f_t^{[i]} - f_\star^{[i]} \right) \right) \mid x_t \right)$$

$$= f(x_t) - f(x_\star),$$

where the last term is a random variable in  $x_t$  (recall that  $\mathbf{E}[Y \mid X]$  is a random variable in X).

From (7), (8), and (9), we have

$$\begin{split} &\mathbf{E}\left[\|x_{t+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \mid x_{t}\right] \\ \leq &\|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} - \frac{1}{G^{2}}(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU})\left(\mathbf{E}\left[\left(f_{t}^{[i]} - f_{\star}^{[i]}\right) \mid x_{t}\right]\right) \\ = &\|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} - \frac{1}{G^{2}}(\operatorname{sqd} \circ \operatorname{ReLU})\left(f(x_{t}) - f(x_{\star})\right) \\ = &\|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} - \frac{1}{G^{2}}\left(\max\{f(x_{t}) - f(x_{\star}), 0\}\right)^{2} \\ = &\|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} - \frac{1}{G^{2}}\left(f(x_{t}) - f(x_{\star})\right)^{2} \dots (10) \end{split}$$

$$\triangleright$$
 as  $f(x_t) - f(x_\star) \ge 0$ 

Now taking expectation with respect to  $x_t$  on both sides of (10) and then using Adam's law  $\mathbf{E} [\mathbf{E} [Y \mid X]] = \mathbf{E} [Y]$ , we get:

$$\mathbf{E} \left[ \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \mid x_{t} \right] \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} - \frac{1}{G^{2}} \left( f(x_{t}) - f(x_{\star}) \right)^{2} \right] 
\Leftrightarrow \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \frac{1}{G^{2}} \left( f(x_{t}) - f(x_{\star}) \right)^{2} \right] 
\Leftrightarrow \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \frac{1}{G^{2}} \mathbf{E} \left[ \left( f(x_{t}) - f(x_{\star}) \right)^{2} \right] 
\Leftrightarrow \frac{1}{G^{2}} \mathbf{E} \left[ \left( f(x_{t}) - f(x_{\star}) \right)^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{t+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] \dots (11)$$

 $\rhd$  using linearity of expectation on RHS and Adam's law on LHS

Now, let us do a telescoping sum on (11) for t = 0, ..., T

$$\frac{1}{G^{2}} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_{0}) - f(x_{\star}))^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{0} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] 
\frac{1}{G^{2}} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_{1}) - f(x_{\star}))^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{2} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] 
\frac{1}{G^{2}} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_{2}) - f(x_{\star}))^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{2} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{3} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] 
\vdots 
\frac{1}{G^{2}} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_{T-1}) - f(x_{\star}))^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{T-1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{T} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] 
\frac{1}{G^{2}} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_{T}) - f(x_{\star}))^{2} \right] \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{T} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{T+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right]$$

which yields:

$$\frac{1}{G^2} \sum_{k=0}^{T} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}))^2 \right] \le \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_0 - x_{\star}\|^2 \right] - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{T+1} - x_{\star}\|^2 \right]$$

$$= \|x_{0} - x_{\star}\|^{2} - \mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{T+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right]$$
  $\Rightarrow$  as  $x_{0}$  is deterministic 
$$\leq \|x_{0} - x_{\star}\|^{2}$$
  $\Rightarrow$  as  $-\mathbf{E} \left[ \|x_{T+1} - x_{\star}\|^{2} \right] \leq 0$  
$$\Rightarrow \sum_{k=0}^{T} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_{k}) - f(x_{\star}))^{2} \right] \leq G^{2} \|x_{0} - x_{\star}\|^{2}$$
 
$$\therefore \frac{1}{T+1} \sum_{k=0}^{T} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_{k}) - f(x_{\star}))^{2} \right] \leq \frac{G^{2} \|x_{0} - x_{\star}\|^{2}}{T+1} \dots (12)$$

Recall now Jensen's inequality again: if  $\phi$  is a convex function and Z is a random variable, then  $\phi(\mathbf{E}[Z]) \leq \mathbf{E}[\phi(Z)]$ . Setting  $\phi := \mathsf{sqd}$  and  $Z := f(x_k) - f(x_\star)$  we have

$$\operatorname{sqd} \left( \mathbf{E} \left[ f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}) \right] \right) \leq \mathbf{E} \left[ \operatorname{sqd} \left( f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}) \right) \right] \\ \Rightarrow \min_{k \in [0:T]} \left( \mathbf{E} \left[ f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}) \right] \right)^2 \leq \min_{k \in [0:T]} \mathbf{E} \left[ \left( f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}) \right)^2 \right] \dots (13)$$

Also,

$$\sum_{k=0}^{T} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}))^2 \right] \ge \sum_{k=0}^{T} \left( \min_{k \in [0:T]} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}))^2 \right] \right)$$

$$= \left( \min_{k \in [0:T]} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}))^2 \right] \right) \sum_{k=0}^{T} 1$$

$$= (T+1) \left( \min_{k \in [0:T]} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}))^2 \right] \right)$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{1}{T+1} \sum_{k=0}^{T} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}))^2 \right] \ge \min_{k \in [0:T]} \mathbf{E} \left[ (f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}))^2 \right] \dots (14)$$

From (13) and (14), we have

$$\min_{k \in [0:T]} \left( \mathbf{E} \left[ f(x_k) - f(x_\star) \right] \right)^2 \le \min_{k \in [0:T]} \mathbf{E} \left[ \left( f(x_k) - f(x_\star) \right)^2 \right] \le \frac{1}{T+1} \sum_{k=0}^T \mathbf{E} \left[ \left( f(x_k) - f(x_\star) \right)^2 \right] \dots (15)$$

Now, from (15) and (12), we have

$$\min_{k \in [0:T]} \left( \mathbf{E} \left[ f(x_k) - f(x_\star) \right] \right)^2 \le \frac{G^2 \|x_0 - x_\star\|^2}{T + 1}.$$

Let the min be achieved at index  $\ell \in [0:T]$ , hence using the fact that  $\sqrt{\cdot}$  is monotonically increasing on  $\mathbb{R}_+$  (hence would not change direction of inequalities when both sides are nonnegative), we have

$$(\mathbf{E}[f(x_{\ell}) - f(x_{\star})])^{2} \leq \frac{G^{2} \|x_{0} - x_{\star}\|^{2}}{T + 1}$$
  
$$\Rightarrow \mathbf{E}[f(x_{\ell}) - f(x_{\star})] \leq \frac{G \|x_{0} - x_{\star}\|}{\sqrt{T + 1}}.$$

Thus we have proven that:

$$\min_{k \in [0:T]} \left( \mathbf{E} \left[ f(x_k) - f(x_{\star}) \right] \right) \le \frac{G \|x_0 - x_{\star}\|}{\sqrt{T+1}}.$$