MPS¹ Protocol – BAN logic

Sign Up Real Protocol

$$M_1: A \rightarrow S: K_a, E_{k_a}(A, N_a, S(K_a)) | | S(A, N_a)$$

$$M_2: S \to A: E_{k_a}(N_a, N_s) | |E_{k_a}(S(E_{k_a}(N_a, N_s)))|$$

$$M_3: A \to S: E_{k_s}(N_s, g_a, p_a) | |E_{k_a^-}(S(E_{k_a}(N_s, g_a, p_a)))$$

$$M_4: S \to A: E_{k_a}(S(N_s, g_a, p_a)) | |E_{k_s^-}(S(E_{k_a}(S(N_s, g_a, p_a))))$$

Sign Up Idealized Protocol

$$M_1: A \rightarrow S: \{A, N_a\}_{k_c}$$

$$M_2 \colon \mathsf{S} \to \mathsf{A} \colon \{\, N_a, \ \#(N_a), N_s \ \}_{k_a} | \ | \left\{ S(\{\, N_a, \ \#(N_a), N_s \ \}_{k_a}) \right\}_{k_s^-}$$

$$M_3: A \rightarrow S: \{N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a\}_{k_s} | |\{S(\{N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a\}_{k_s})\}_{k_s}|\}$$

$$M_4 : S \to A : \{S(N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a)\}_{k_a} | |\{S(\{S(N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a)\}_{k_a})\}_{k_s} | \}$$

Sign Up Protocol Analysis

Objectives

 $S \models (g_a, p_a)$

Diffie Hellman Parameters

 $A \models S \models (g_a, p_a)$

DH Parameters confirmation

Assumptions

$$A \models \stackrel{k_S}{\rightarrow} S$$

Hardcoded Server's Public Key

$$S \models^{k_a} A$$

Alice's Public Key sent in plaintext in the first message

 $S \models A \Rightarrow g_a, p_a$

After M_1 :

$$S \triangleleft \{A, N_a\}_{k_s}$$

After M_2 :

$$\frac{A \vDash \stackrel{k_s}{\to} S , A \vartriangleleft \{N_a, \#(N_a), N_s\}_{k_s^-}}{A \vDash S \mid \sim (N_a, \#(N_a), N_s)}$$

¹ Magherini – Pochiero – Sieni (MPS)

$$\frac{A = S \mid \sim (N_a, \#(N_a), N_s), A = \#(N_a)}{A = S = (N_a, \#(N_a), N_s)}$$

After M_3 :

$$S \stackrel{k_a}{\longrightarrow} A, S \triangleleft \{N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a\}_{k_a^-}$$

$$S \models A \mid \sim (N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a)$$

$$S \models A \mid \sim (N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a), S \models \#(N_s)$$

$$S \models A \models g_a, p_a$$

$$S \models A \Rightarrow g_a, p_a, S \models A \models (N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a)$$

$$S \models (g_a, p_a)$$

After M_4 :

$$\frac{A \vDash \stackrel{k_s}{\to} S , A \vartriangleleft \{S(N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a)\}_{k_s^-}}{A \vDash S \mid \sim (S(N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a))}$$

$$\frac{A \vDash S \mid \sim (S(N_s, \#(N_s), g_a, p_a)), A \vDash \#(N_s)}{A \vDash S \vDash g_a, p_a}$$

Authentication Real Protocol

$$\begin{split} &M_1 \colon \mathsf{A} \to \mathsf{S} \colon E_{k_S}(\ A, N_a\) \,|\, |E_{k_a^-}(S(E_{k_S}(\ A, N_a))) \\ &M_2 \colon \mathsf{S} \to \mathsf{A} \colon E_{k_a}(\ N_a, N_s, K_{as}) \,|\, |E_{k_s^-}(S(E_{k_a}(\ N_a, N_s, K_{as}))) \\ &M_3 \colon \mathsf{A} \to \mathsf{S} \colon E_{k_{as}}(\ N_s) \end{split}$$

Authentication Idealized Protocol

$$\begin{split} &M_{1} \colon \mathsf{A} \to \mathsf{S} \colon \{A, N_{a}\}_{k_{S}} | \ | \left\{ S(\{A, N_{a}\}_{k_{S}}) \right\}_{k_{a}^{-}} \\ &M_{2} \colon \mathsf{S} \to \mathsf{A} \colon \left\{ N_{a}, \#(N_{a}), N_{S}, \ (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S) \right\}_{k_{a}} | \ | \left\{ S(\left\{N_{a}, \#(N_{a}), N_{S}, \ (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S) \right\}_{k_{a}}) \right\}_{k_{s}^{-}} \\ &M_{3} \colon \mathsf{A} \to \mathsf{S} \colon \left\{ N_{S}, \#(N_{S}), \ (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S) \right\}_{k_{as}} \end{split}$$

Authentication Analysis

Objectives

$$A \vDash \#(N_S)$$
, $S \vDash A \vDash \#(N_S)$ # Session ID
$$A \vDash A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S \qquad A \vDash \#(A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)$$
 # Session Key

$$S \models A \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$$

Assumptions

$$S \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$$

$$A \models \stackrel{k_S}{\rightarrow} S$$

$$S \models^{k_a} A$$

$$A \models S \Rightarrow N_s$$

$$A \models S \Rightarrow A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$$

After M_1 :

$$\frac{S \rightleftharpoons^{k_a} A, S \vartriangleleft \{A, N_a\}_{k_a^-}}{S \vDash A \mid \sim (A, N_a)}$$

After M_2 :

$$\frac{A \vDash \stackrel{k_s}{\to} S , A \vartriangleleft \left\{ N_a, \#(N_a), N_s, (A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S) \right\}_{k_s^-}}{A \vDash S \mid \sim (N_a, \#(N_a), N_s, (A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S))}$$

$$\frac{A \models S \mid \sim \left(N_a, \#(N_a), N_s, \ (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)\right), \ A \models \#(N_a)}{A \models S \models \left(N_a, \#(N_a), N_s, \ (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)\right)}$$

$$\frac{A \models S \models N_S, \ A \models S \Rightarrow N_S}{A \models N_S}$$

$$\underline{A \vDash S \vDash (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S), \ A \vDash S \Rightarrow (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)}$$

$$\underline{A \vDash (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)}$$

$$\frac{A \vDash N_s, A \vDash \#(N_a)}{A \vDash \#(N_s)}$$

$$\frac{A \vDash A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S, \ A \vDash \#(A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)}{A \vDash \#(A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)}$$

After M_3 :

$$\frac{S \vDash A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S, S \vartriangleleft \left\{ N_s, \#(N_s), (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S) \right\}_{k_{as}}}{S \vDash A \mid \sim (N_s, \#(N_s), (A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S))}$$

Session Key confirmation

Session Key

Hardcoded Server's Public Key

Alice's Public Key

Nonce Authority

Session Key Authority

$$\frac{S \models A \mid \sim (N_S, \#(N_S), (A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)), S \models \#(N_S)}{S \models A \models \#(N_S)}$$

$$S \models A \mid \sim (N_s, \#(N_s), (A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S)), S \models \#(N_s)$$

$$S \models A \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$$

Online Key Exchange Real Protocol

$$M_1: A \rightarrow S: E_{k_{as}}(A, B, N_{sa})$$

$$M_2: S \rightarrow A: E_{k_{as}}(N_{sa}, g_b, p_b, k_b, E_{k_{bs}}(k_a, N_{sb}, N_{sa}))$$

$$M_3: A \to B: E_{k_b}(A, B, Y_A, E_{k_{bs}}(k_a, N_{sb}, N_{sa})) | E_{k_a}(S(E_{k_b}(A, B, Y_A, E_{k_{bs}}(k_a, N_{sb}))))$$

$$M_4 \colon \mathsf{B} \to \mathsf{A} \colon E_{k_a} \Big(Y_B, N_{sa}, E_{k_{ab}}(N_b) \Big) | | E_{k_b^-} (S(E_{k_a} (Y_B, E_{k_{ab}}(N_b))))$$

$$M_5$$
: A \rightarrow B: $E_{k_{ab}}(N_b)$

$$M_x$$
: A \rightarrow B: $E_{k_{ab}}(data, SeqNum)$

Online Key Exchange Idealized Protocol

$$M_1: A \rightarrow S: \{A, B, N_{sa}\}_{k_{as}}$$

$$M_2 \colon \mathsf{S} \to \mathsf{A} \colon \left\{ \left. N_{sa}, g_b, p_{b_s} \stackrel{k_b}{\to} B, \left\{ \stackrel{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sa}) \right\}_{k_{as}}$$

$$M_3 \colon \mathsf{A} \to \mathsf{B} \colon \left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{ \overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sb}) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid \left\{ S(\left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb} \right\}_{k_b}, \#(\overset{k_a}{\to} A) \right\}_{k_b} \mid$$

$$M_4 \colon \mathsf{B} \to \mathsf{A} \colon \big\{ Y_b, N_{sa}, \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}} \, \big\}_{k_a} \, | \, | \, \Big\{ S(\big\{ \, Y_b, \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}} \, \big\}_{k_a}) \Big\}_{k_a^-}$$

$$M_5$$
: A \rightarrow B: $\{N_b\}_{k_{ab}}$

Online Key Exchange Analysis

Objectives

$$A \models A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B$$
, $B \models A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B$

$$B \models A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} I$$

Key Authentication

$$A \vDash B \vDash A \overset{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B, \qquad B \vDash A \vDash A \overset{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B$$

$$B \vDash A \vDash A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B$$

Key Confirmation

Assumptions

$$A \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$$
, $S \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$
 $B \models B \stackrel{k_{bs}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$, $S \models B \stackrel{k_{bs}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$

$$S = \#(N_{sa}), A = \#(N_{sa}), B = \#(N_{sb})$$

$$S \models (g_h, p_h)$$

$$A \vDash B \Rightarrow Y_B$$
, $B \vDash A \Rightarrow Y_A$

A-S Session keys (authentication protocol)

B-S Session keys (authentication protocol)

Freshness session ids (authentication protocol)

Diffie Hellman's parameters

Authority on Y parameters

After M_1 :

$$\frac{S \vDash A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S , S \vartriangleleft \{A, B, N_{sa}\}_{k_{as}}}{S \vDash A \mid \sim (A, B, N_{sa})}$$

$$\frac{S \models A \mid \sim (A, B, N_{sa}), \quad S \models \#(N_{sa})}{S \models A \models (A, B, N_{sa})}$$

After M_2 :

$$\frac{A \vDash A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S, A \lhd \left\{ N_{sa}, g_b, p_b, \overset{k_b}{\to} B, \left\{ \overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sa}) \right\}_{k_{as}}}{A \vDash S \mid \sim (N_{sa}, g_b, p_b, \overset{k_b}{\to} B, \left\{ \overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa} \right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sa}))}$$

$$\frac{A \models S \mid \sim (X), \ A \models \#(N_{Sa})}{A \models S \models (X)}$$

$$\frac{A \models S \models \stackrel{k_b}{\rightarrow} B, \ A \ trusts \ S \ on \ k_b}{A \models \stackrel{k_b}{\rightarrow} B}$$

$$\frac{A \models S \models (g_b, p_b), A trusts S on (g_b, p_b)}{A \models (g_b, p_b)}$$

After M_3 :

$$\frac{B \models B \overset{k_{bs}}{\longleftrightarrow} S , B \lhd \left\{\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa}\right\}_{k_{bs}}}{B \models S \mid \sim \left(\overset{k_a}{\to} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa}\right)}$$

$$\frac{B \models S \mid \sim \left(\stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A\right), B \models \#(N_{Sb})}{B \models S \models \left(\stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A\right)}$$

$$B \models S \models \stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A, \quad B \text{ trusts } S \text{ on } k_a$$

$$B \models \stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A$$

$$B \models \stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A, \quad B \triangleleft \left\{A, B, Y_A, \left\{\stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa}\right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sb})\right\}_{k_a^-}$$

$$B \models A \mid \sim (A, B, Y_A, \left\{\stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa}\right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sb}))$$

$$B \models A \mid \sim (A, B, Y_A, \left\{\stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa}\right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sb})), \quad B \models \#(N_{sb})$$

$$B \models A \models (A, B, Y_A, \left\{\stackrel{k_a}{\rightarrow} A, N_{sb}, N_{sa}\right\}_{k_{bs}}, \#(N_{sb}))$$

$$B \models A \models Y_A, \quad B \models A \Rightarrow Y_A$$

$$B \models Y_A, \quad B \Rightarrow Y_B$$

$$A \models A \Rightarrow A \Rightarrow A \Rightarrow B$$

After M_4 :

After
$$M_4$$
.

$$A \models \stackrel{k_b}{\rightarrow} B, \quad A \triangleleft \{Y_b, N_{sa}, \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}}\}_{k_b^-}$$

$$A \models B \mid \sim (Y_b, N_{sa}, \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}})$$

$$A \models B \mid \sim (Y_b, N_{sa}, \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}}), \quad A \models \#(N_{sa})$$

$$A \models B \models (Y_b, N_{sa}, \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}})$$

$$A \models B \models Y_B, \quad A \models B \Rightarrow Y_B$$

$$A \models Y_B$$

$$A \models Y_B, \quad A \Rightarrow Y_A$$

$$A \models A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B$$

$$A \models A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B, \quad A \triangleleft \{N_b\}_{k_b}.$$

$$\frac{A \vDash A \overset{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B, A \vartriangleleft \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}}}{A \vDash B \mid \sim (N_b)}$$

$$\frac{A \models B \mid \sim (N_b), \ A \models \#(N_{sa})}{A \models B \models A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B}$$

After M_5 :

$$\frac{B \vDash A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B, B \vartriangleleft \{N_b\}_{k_{ab}}}{B \vDash A \mid \sim (N_b)}$$

$$\frac{B \vDash A \mid \sim (N_b), B \vDash \#(N_b)}{B \vDash A \vDash A \stackrel{k_{ab}}{\longleftrightarrow} B}$$

Offline Communication Real Protocol

$$M_1$$
: A \rightarrow S: $E_{k_{as}}(A, B, N_{sa})$

$$M_2: S \rightarrow A: E_{k_{as}}(N_{sa}, k_b)$$

$$M_x$$
: A \rightarrow S: E_{k_b} $\Big(data, SeqNum, \ E_{k_a^-}(S(data, SeqNum)) \Big)$ $\Big| \Big| \Big| E_{k_a^-}(S(data, SeqNum, \ E_{k_a^-}(S(data, SeqNum)))) \Big)$

Offline Communication Idealized Protocol

$$M_1: A \rightarrow S: \{A, B, N_{sa}\}_{k_{as}}$$

$$M_2 \colon \mathsf{S} \to \mathsf{A} \colon \left\{ N_{sa}, \overset{k_b}{\to} B, \#(N_{sa}) \right\}_{k_{as}}$$

Offline Communication Analysis

Objective

$$A \models \stackrel{k_b}{\rightarrow} B$$

Bob's Public Key

Assumptions

$$A \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$$
, $S \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S$

Session key (authentication protocol)

$$S \models \#(N_{sa}), A \models \#(N_{sa})$$

Freshness session ids (authentication protocol)

After M_1 :

$$\frac{S \models A \stackrel{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S, S \triangleleft \{A, B, N_{sa}\}_{k_{as}}}{S \models A \mid \sim (A, B, N_{sa})}$$

$$\frac{S \models A \mid \sim (A, B, N_{sa}), S \models \#(N_{sa})}{S \models A \models (A, B, N_{sa})}$$

After M_2 :

$$\frac{A \vDash A \overset{k_{as}}{\longleftrightarrow} S, A \vartriangleleft \left\{ N_{sa}, \overset{k_b}{\to} B, \#(N_{sa}) \right\}_{k_{as}}}{A \vDash S \mid \sim (N_{sa}, \overset{k_b}{\to} B, \#(N_{sa}))}$$

$$\frac{A \models S \mid \sim (X), \ A \models \#(N_{Sa})}{A \models S \models (X)}$$

$$\frac{A \models S \vDash \stackrel{k_b}{\rightarrow} B, \ A \ trusts \ S \ on \ k_b}{A \vDash \stackrel{k_b}{\rightarrow} B}$$