

Paper 1

First Paper: Due Mon. Feb 9th at the end of lecture to Carmen (our TA). (Note the change in due date from the syllabus)

The essays should be **at least 4 pages long but no more than 5 pages**, double-spaced, one-inch margins, and 10 or 12 point font. This paper is worth 25% of your course grade.

Excellent advice about writing philosophy is available on the James Pryor website:

<http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/guidelines/writing.html> . Carmen and I can give you further tips as well. Unexcused late papers will be penalized one-third grade for each day they are late.

Write on **ONE** of the following topics, answering each part of that topic:

1. Thomson and Marquis topic:

- (a) What conclusion about abortion does JTT argue for in cases of pregnancy due to rape and how does she argue for it? Be sure to discuss the Violinist Case.
- (b) What would Marquis' argument be concerning cases of pregnancy due to rape?
- (c) Identify *at least one* problem with both philosophers' arguments and consider one reply on their behalf. Are those replies satisfactory? Why or why not?

2. Imagine that a couple has a child named Jenny with a rare disorder that requires her to have monthly blood transfusions. Without a cure, Jenny's life on the whole will be filled with a lot of suffering. A bone marrow transplant from a donor that shares Jenny's bone marrow DNA will most likely cure her. Her parents consider Jenny's older sister as a possible donor but unfortunately she is not a genetic match. The parents have also tried, unsuccessfully, to create embryos that would be a genetic match via in vitro fertilization. Their doctor has informed them that human reproductive cloning is now a safe and relatively easy procedure. They could clone Jenny giving them a child that would be a definite genetic match for her. The parents obviously have moral concerns about this, despite the fact that they want to do everything they can to help their daughter.

Their concerns are the following:

- (i) They have a suspicion that cloning is morally impermissible because it seems so unnatural.
- (ii) If Jenny wasn't sick, they wouldn't entertain thoughts about having another child. So if they do clone her, they feel as though they would just be *using (exploiting)* the clone, which of course they don't want to do.

They are torn as to what to do, and they are willing to hear arguments either way on the matter.

- (a) Explain how Gillon would respond to the parent's two concerns.
- (b) Explain **why** you think Gillon has (or has not) given the parents compelling reasons to clone.
- (c) Explain what other **reasons** you would give to the parents for why they should or should not clone Jenny.