book reviews

Edward E. Andrews
Native Apostles. Black and Indian Missionaries in the British Atlantic World

Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2013. 336 pp. Illustrations.
$39.95 (cloth) ISBN 9780674072466.

Non-Europeans contributed in vital ways to Christian missionary expansion in the non-European world, as linguists, informants for ethnographies, and cultural intermediaries, and as missionaries themselves. Until recently these diverse roles have been generally overlooked within the historiography, yet this has changed through the influence of postcolonial and subaltern studies on secular mission and religious history. The works of scholars such as Peggy Brock, Patrick Harries, and Jane Samson are testament to this, having uncovered the pivotal roles of non-Europeans within the Christian mission. In following this research agenda, Edward Andrews examines the lives of Native American and black missionaries in the British Atlantic World, focusing mainly upon the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries and in doing so opens up broader discourses on the role of non-Europeans particularly within North American missions. For Andrews the term "native" refers not just to indigenous people; rather it describes people who preach among their own.

The difficulties in writing such a book are clear to Andrews insofar as he notes, "we can only trace the indigenous preachers that *[sic]* left behind some sort of documentary trail" (5), or, indeed the documentary trail of those people who wrote about them. To this end Andrews focuses upon case studies of men. Women are conspicuously absent in his book due to restrictions against them becoming preachers, although they were able to become teachers. Case studies include such men as Philip Quaque, an African Anglican missionary in West Africa, or John Quamine and Yamma, both African slaves in North

America who desired to go back to Africa and saw Christian preaching as a means to do so. Their sincerity of conversion and conviction were questioned at the time, yet these men, argues Andrews, "were not simply participants in, but rather organizers and initiators of, African missions" (221). That the mission never eventuated was due to Quamine's untimely death and the outbreak of the American Revolution. Such case studies provide insight into the liminal positions in which these native preachers found themselves and the difficulties that they faced in finding few converts among their own people just as they were not being fully accepted into white society. The studies also reveal the challenges that Europeans faced as well as the opportunities that they gained when relying upon native preachers, as native missionaries were valued for their access to kinship networks, their cost effectiveness compared to Europeans, and their perceived hardy, physical nature.

The chapters of the book reflect a geographical movement between North America and Africa, moving through "Apostles to the Indians," "The Expansion of the Indigenous Missionary Enterprise," "Slave Preachers and Indian Separatism," "Blacks among Blacks," "Native Evangelists in the Iroquoian Borderlands," and "Afro-Christian Evangelism and Indian Missions." The last chapter draws on the finding of the previous ones to argue that the missionary work of Native Americans had an influence on how missions among black Americans and Africans were conceived of and implemented.

Andrews slips between the usage of the terms "preachers," "apostles," and "missionaries"—and even "teachers"—and it is never really clear who is defined as a "Native Apostle." The definition is made more diffuse in comments such as "Many Moravians believed every baptized convert would have to be a preacher at some point or another" (259), potentially opening up the category even further. Merely disseminating Christian knowledge to one's own people can surely not be enough to be classified as a "Native Apostle." In the oral traditions of many nonliterate societies the dissemination of Christian knowledge was not necessarily connected with a belief in Christianity itself, but rather it simply served to spread what one Wemba Wemba man in nineteenth-century South Eastern Australia called a "good story." Yet at times Andrews provides convincing evidence that the Christian message was more than just a good story for native missionaries, as it became a way to legitimate their own place within a "'sacred genealogy.' That is, the ways in which Protestant neophytes were cast—and cast themselves—as part of a larger Christian lineage that was both spatially expansive . . . as well as temporally far-reaching" (11).

Andrews provides a table of "Native Missionaries" at the end of the book that "represents [his] aggregate research" (231–61). Some 275 names are given with, where available, denominational affiliations, broad time frames in which they worked, and further notes upon each person. The list itself is a feat to be commended. However, it has no references, but rather is prefaced with a scant list of sources. For "other suggested scholarly works" (231) the curious reader is directed to the footnotes and the "Notes on Sources" (three and a half pages of prose as a substitute for a bibliography). The absence of systematic referencing prevents inspection or cross-referencing of sources from which the information on the "Native Missionaries" is drawn, significantly limiting future use of this table as a research source. The information provided is often very vague, which is understandable given how infrequently nonnatives thought to include native voices in their writings.

In examining case studies from both North America and Africa, Andrews's work follows recent trends in scholarship that look beyond national borders and link geographically disparate locations through concepts such as evangelical missionary work (examples include works by Elizabeth Elbourne, Ian Tryell, and Jeffrey Cox). Despite its occasional lack of in-depth analysis, this book is a stimulating foray into relationships between non-Europeans, who were inspired and perhaps committed Christians, and both their own people as well as the Europeans who encouraged Christian belief among these non-Europeans.

FELICITY JENSZ
Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster

Christian Soboth, Udo Sträter, eds.
"Aus Gottes Wort und eigener Erfahrung gezeiget." Erfahrung—Glauben, Erkennen und Handeln im Pietismus. Beiträge zum III. Internationalen Kongress für Pietismusforschung 2009

Halle: Verlag der Franckeschen Stiftungen Halle, 2012. 2 volumes. 913 pp. €124.00 (cloth) ISBN 978-3-447-06800-0.

If one is seeking for evidence that Pietism scholarship has entered a new phase, marked by liberation from the "monopoly" of church historians, then a collection such as this would be a good place to begin. In the foreword, Christian Soboth points to the multidisciplinary background of the contributors to the volume, and their rejection of the earlier emphasis upon "the [Pietist] man and his work." "The variety of content in the present volume illustrates a disciplinary change of emphasis." The new questions and methods substantially change and enrich the very notion of Pietism as previously understood by church historians.

These two books, and the conference on which they are based, have a thematic focus upon Pietism and personal experience. This focus offers rich possibilities for a variety of disciplinary approaches and questions. The notion of experience has varying meanings in different eighteenth-century contexts, such as theology, medicine, pedagogy, natural science, literature, politics, and civil society. These contexts are reflected in the books' seven sections: theological and philosophical notions of experience; phenomena of religious experience; applied experience in homiletics, pedagogy, and medicine; experience and written communication; artistic expressions of experience; experience in the context of communities and institutions; and experience in space and time. Chapters address issues such as experience in radical Pietism and the Enlightenment; spiritual "possession" and prophetic experience in Pietism; autonomy and social experience among Pietist craftsmen; the category of experience in Dutch Pietist pedagogy; experience and independence among the sisters in the Herrnhut community; Pietism and experience in the eighteenth-century novel; the theology

of experience in Freylinghausen's hymnbooks; and narratives of experience among Pietist Jewish converts.

The two volumes comprise sixty-three chapters, selected from eighty-two conference papers. Only six chapters are in English—the rest are in German—which means the collection will have a limited readership in North America. The English contributions are by Joseph Freedman, Richard Gawthrop, Benjamin Marschke, Dianne McMullen, Jonathan Strom, and Eric Jonas Swensson. Three more North American contributors offer their chapters in German: Gerald MacDonald, Lucinda Martin, and Paul Peucker. The low number of North American contributors can be attributed to the difficulty American scholars face in attending the Congress; typically scheduled in late August and early September, it falls in the first week of classes in many American colleges and universities.

Six of the chapters are more substantial in length, based as they are on "Hauptvorträge," or plenary addresses, and three will receive attention here. Jonathan Strom's contribution deals with the construction of religious experience in conversion narratives within the orbit of Halle Pietism. Strom shows that A. H. Francke himself was reluctant to publish conversion accounts, either because of the problem of feigned conversions or the danger of converts falling away. "No great collections of conversion narratives emerged directly out of Halle during Francke's lifetime" (110). It was only after Francke's death that his own conversion story became widely known. In the 1730s conversion narratives were published in growing numbers. These publications typically set the narratives in a confessional or clerical context, with clergy prominent in the accounts as subjects, actors, and authors. The revival-oriented Pietism of Dargun developed a tradition of conversion accounts that was highly schematized, with special emphasis upon the *Bußkampf*, a period of repentance followed by a breakthrough to grace and assurance. These accounts were clearly framed to serve as models of religious experience for others.

Jürgen Helm writes on the role of observation and experience in eighteenth-century medicine in Halle. One source of information lies in the 1702 report on cures brought about by the famous *Essentia dulcis*, a medicine produced and widely sold by the Halle Foundations. These case histories were used to advertise the cure and promote sales. A more scholarly use of case studies is found in the Halle physician and medical professor Friedrich Hoffmann, who sought to provide an empirical foundation for his medical theory and practice. He did this primarily through gathering

case histories, and through development of a medical model based upon observation, collection of individual cases, and finally, generalization (374). His twelve-volume *Medicina rationalis systematica* offered a systematic evaluation of some 600 case histories.

Jan Harasimowicz's chapter deals with Christoph Leonhard Sturm (1669–1719), master builder, architect, mathematician, theologian, and millenarian. In the field of architectural theory alone he published some fifty works. In March 1711 Duke Friedrich Wilhelm of Mecklenburg offered Sturm the position of director of construction, entrusting him with building a new ducal castle in Neustadt-Glewe. Besides the classic architectural virtues of permanence, suitability, and beauty, Sturm promoted "well-founded learning" (605). The latter reflected Sturm's incorporation of observations from his travels through Germany, the Netherlands, and France. He was especially taken with the New Evangelical Church in Amsterdam (1668). Thanks to Sturm, Protestant churches began to experiment with new oval and rectangular shapes in place of the traditional cross shape.

Among other substantial chapters is the one by Ferdinand van Ingen on Karl Philipp Moritz's *Anton Reiser*, a work that has been called "the greatest of all autobiographies ever written" (587). Van Ingen argues that *Anton Reiser* is more than a Pietist "*Bildungsroman*," in which the tragic hero fails to find happiness in life after going through various stages of self-alienation. In fact, we see a secularization of Pietism in the direction of a new science of the mind, now known as empirical psychology. It is a psychological case study of childhood and youthful experiences, which shows how a radical Pietist upbringing leads to intellectual and social isolation (597).

Peter Vogt considers the place of religious experience in Count Ludwig von Zinzendorf. Zinzendorf promoted at once a Christocentric faith and an experience-centered piety, which gave rise to some tensions. His emphasis upon experience arises in the context of his theology of the heart. The heart is a complex notion in Zinzendorf, with at least three important dimensions: the heart as an anthropological category, soteriological category, and epistemological category. First, the heart represents the inner identity of a person, his or her essential being, which includes the will, feelings, and thoughts. Second, faith is a matter of the heart, the whole inner being. Third, the act of faith finds confirmation in the heart as a source of spiritual knowledge and intuitive knowing. It is the heart that responds to the message of salvation in the gospel.

The main drawback of this publication, and one that is significant, is its failure to reflect the vibrancy of the new interdisciplinary Pietism scholarship

in North America and England. Also problematic is the decision to include such a large number of contributions, many of which are quite short—only six to eight pages in length—and make a very limited contribution to scholarship.

All told, the two volumes go a long way in enriching our understanding of Pietism. The scholarly community owes a debt of thanks to the Interdisciplinary Centre for Pietism Research and the Francke Foundations in Halle for organizing the conference and producing the books.

DOUGLAS H. SHANTZ
University of Calgary

Charlotte Yeldham
Maria Spilsbury (1776–1820): Artist and Evangelical

Farnham: Ashgate, 2010. 216 pp. €65 (cloth) ISBN 978-0-75466-991-3.

Too often historical writing tends to flatten and simplify the much more charming and complicated individual personalities of the past. The practical concerns of the philosopher's life can be left unconsidered—so too the eternal spiritual concerns of the political pragmatist. It is a more ambitious, but also a more humane sort of historical writing that works to take full account of a person's life—his or her work, mind, faith, and the times in which that person lived. Charlotte Yeldham's *Maria Spilsbury* aims admirably in this direction.

Rebecca Maria Ann Spilsbury (known as Maria) was the daughter of the minor British engraver and painter Jonathan Spilsbury. Because of her father she was raised with access to the London art scene of the late eighteenth century. She also had deep roots within British evangelicalism. Her mother, Rebecca, though tending toward Calvinism, had strong personal links with John Wesley. When Maria was five her father became a member of the Moravian Church at Fetter Lane, which meant that she entered the Little Girls' Choir and began to experience the distinctive Zinzendorfian education of Moravian choir life. She was expelled from

the Moravian Church at the age of fifteen for having only "some grace in her heart," but still being "uneasy in her mind" (25). Later the whole family spent about a year living in Ireland at the Rossana estate of Sarah Tighe, also an associate of the Wesleys. Maria's time at Rossana is noteworthy because she attended the school that Tighe ran on the estate, which was guided by principles taken from Rousseau's *Emile*.

After leaving the Moravian Church, Maria remained a lifelong evangelical within the established church, but thereafter always retained discernable "Moravianisms" in her life and work. Throughout her twenties, she lived with her parents, struggling to make a living as an artist. During this time she began exhibiting her work at the Royal Academy. In 1808 she married the devoutly evangelical John Taylor who was nine years her junior. The two struggled financially and a few years later moved to Dublin. During just twelve years of marriage Maria had six pregnancies, the last of which ending in miscarriage in the autumn of 1819. "Greatly reduced" by this (158), she died about eight months later in June 1820 with her husband singing a hymn at her bedside. On her gravestone we read "I know that Jesus Christ is my Saviour: were the dying words of Rebecca Maria Ann Taylor." Not only are these final details evangelical in spirit, they are characteristically Moravian.

Yeldham's study is more than a biography. While it has a chronological structure, the historical life under consideration always serves the further purpose of contextualizing Spilbury's art. It is in this regard that Yeldham puts such emphasis on Spilsbury's biographical connection to the Moravians, and her brief time at Sarah Tighe's Rousseauian school in Ireland, and then her lifelong evangelical faith. Yeldham finds that the philosophical and theological themes that suffuse Spilsbury's art can only be understood in light of these biographical threads. This is why earlier considerations of Spilsbury's art have lacked interpretive and explanatory power. In fact, for far too many Spilsbury's work has been appreciated only as decorative art. Against this tendency Yeldham argues persuasively that for Spilsbury there was always a capacious and intentional mind guiding her work.

For example, Spilsbury frequently placed children at the center of her paintings, sometimes journeying along a path, other times in family and home scenes. Almost without exception, she presents children dressed in white and illuminated by a source of light from outside the painting. When Spilsbury's art is taken as a body of work, Yeldham views it as something of a commentary on Zinzendorfian and Rousseauian philosophies of the

moral standing of children and, more broadly, on the Christian life as a whole. In chapter 2 on "A Moravian Childhood," Yeldham offers a cursory overview of Count Zinzendorf's theology of the fall and the empiricism of Rousseau. On the one hand, Zinzendorf saw the atoning work of Jesus as having done away with the effects of Adam's original sin so that children were born morally innocent and spiritually neutral— neither inclined toward good nor evil, but always vulnerable to corruption. For this reason Moravian children were to be sheltered from the natural lusts of the world. On the other hand, Rousseau considered the child a blank slate, born in moral innocence. Careful nurture of children was necessary, but one was to do so on the understanding that nature as such is good and that the natural inclinations of a child are oriented toward what is good. Though similar, these are not identical views. Still, they seem central in Spilsbury's art.

Yeldham does well in making these kinds of connections (about children, women, Protestant union, and so on) and in doing so gives us a Maria Spilsbury who was up to much more than perhaps we had thought. At times, however, Yeldham's analysis seems overly speculative, finding connections to hymns and biblical texts that do not always seem warranted. A tree branch hints at Isaiah 4:2 (71); a cottage covered in vines points to John 15 (63). These examples, however, disappear in the context of her outstanding analysis of so many individual works, most of which are pictured (though unfortunately only in black and white). Scholars of Moravian History may find Yeldham's summarizing of the origins of the Moravian Church (15–17) to lack sufficient awareness of scholarly debate, but this is a book about Maria Spilsbury and not a history of the church. However, as it is narrative about Spilsbury a few of the chapters (2, 5, and 6) got to be a bit slowgoing in the number of names, often unfamiliar to us, that pile up on a page and make harder work of the reading.

This book, as a whole, is a very attractive and compelling account of a relatively minor artist who nevertheless exemplifies the major interaction of evangelicals with the broader world of art and culture. It is also a terrific contribution to our understanding of a historical setting within which, more and more, we are finally hearing what women were saying; and, in particular, what they are saying about themselves.

JONATHAN YONAN
Eastern University