Review on Polychrony detection in biological and artificial raster plots

This manuscript (permalink) was automatically generated from SpikeAl/polychronies@837fcef on January 5, 2022.

Authors

- Camille Besnainou
 - · Camillebesnainou

Institut de Neurosciences de la Timone, CNRS / Aix-Marseille Université · Funded by Grant AgileNeuroBot

- Antoine Grimaldi
- Laurent U Perrinet · https://laurentperrinet.github.io/
 perrinet.github.io/
 perrinet.github.io/perrinet.github.io/perrinet.github.io/perrinet.github.io/<a hre

Institut de Neurosciences de la Timone, CNRS / Aix-Marseille Université \cdot Funded by Grant APROVIS3D; Grant AgileNeuroBot

Abstract

TODO: rewrite - The response of a biological neuron depends largely on the precise timing of presynaptic spikes when they reach the basal dendritic tree. This temporal aspect of the neuronal code is essential in understanding information processing and also applies to the output of an eventbased camera. However, most neuronal models do not take advantage of this minute temporal dimension, especially in exploiting the variety of synaptic delays on the dendritic tree. A notable exception is the polychronization model of Izhikevich (2006), which combined the construction of a random recurrent model of spiking neurons including such delays and whose weights evolved with a Spike-Time Dependent Plasticity (STDP) learning rule. In this model, raster plot analysis showed repeated activation of Polychronous Groups (PGs), i.e., specific spike patterns with a specific sequence of activations. Here, we develop a model for the efficient detection of such PGs based on the inversion of a probabilistic model defining the generation of the raster plot as a combination of such groups. We show that such an inference can be achieved by a neural-like computation that could itself be used as a spiking neuron, as can be implemented in a neuromorphic chip for instance. A first result is to show the efficiency of such a scheme in detecting different PGs occurring at specific times in synthetic data. The representational capacity of the PGs is particularly interesting compared to traditional models of neuronal encoding using spiking frequency. Our second result is to propose a novel learning method for learning PGs in raster plots in a self-supervised manner. Finally we demonstrate the use of this algorithm to the output of an event-based camera and how this may separate independent components from the stream of events. This end-to-end event-based computational brick could help improve the performance of current Spiking Neural Network solution currently used in neuromorphic chips. - A crucial advantage of Spiking Neural Networks (SNNs) architectures lies in its processing of temporal information. Yet, most SNNs encode the temporal signal as an analog signal and try to "cross-compile" classical Neural Network to a spiking architecture. To go beyond the state-of-the-art, we will review here on one core computation of a spiking neuron, that is, is its ability to switch from the classical integrator mode (summing analog currents on its synapses) to a synchrony detector where it emits a spike whenever presynaptic spiking inputs are synchronized. To overcome the diversity of input presynaptic patterns, we will explore different existing architectures to learn to detect stable "polychronous" events, that is, volleys of spikes which are stable up to certain synaptic delays. These models will be compared in light of neuroscientific and computational perspectives.

introduction: precise temporal patterns in the brain

ultra fast neural codes

Most importantly, it will provide with a detection ability requiring only a few spikes, and therefore in line with the performance observed in biological systems, like the ability for humans to detect the presence of an animal in an image in a few milliseconds (Thorpe et al (1996). Speed of processing in the human visual system. Nature, 381(6582), 520-522). Such biological observations would serve as benchmarks to compare our proposed architecture to conventional solutions. (1] S Thorpe, D Fize, and C Marlot, Nature 381.6582 (1996), pp.520-522.

The approach which is currently most prominent in the Spiking Neural Networks community is to use existing algorithms from machine learning and to adapt them to the specificity of spiking architectures. One such example is to adapt the successes of deep learning algorithms and to transfer the back-propagation algorithm to SNNs, for instance with a surrogate gradient. This approach is quite successful, and SNNs approach in some case the performance of Deep Learning algorithms, for instance on the N-MNIST dataset for categorizing digits in a stream of events. However, most biological neural systems use spikes and are obviously more efficient than current state-of-the-art

vision systems, both in terms of efficiency (accuracy), in speed (latency), and energy consumption. There is therefore an immense gap in the way we understand biology to translate it to the efficiency of SNNs. Our approach will be to focus on the temporal representation of information directly. In particular, our objective is to fully exploit the capacity of spiking neurons to detect synchronous patterns.

While my previous expertise was based on the modeling of how SNNs process information (Perrinet, Samuelides and Thorpe, 2004) and how these networks may be tuned in a unsupervised manner to their input (Perrinet, Samuelides and Thorpe, 2003), many different SNN architectures may provide robust solutions. Since that time, I have worked on exploring the space of all solutions which are the most efficient to solve a given problem using Bayesian methods. This culminated in defining a hierarchical model performing predictive coding (Boutin et al, 2020). However, this network is analog and simulations perform too slowly, even on advanced GPU architectures, to be used for real life situation. We have recently developed a similar architecture but based on a SNN architecture. In particular, this model is event-based from one end (sensory input from event-based cameras) to the other (classification) and its intermediate layers are learned in a self-supervised fashion (Grimaldi et al, 2021: a, b).

timing encodes profile

timing in natural images

in [1], we generate raster plots from natural images

Note also that timing is not entirely sensorial or internal but in [2], they found that "timing accuracy was improved when the environment afforded cues that rats can incorporate into motor routines. Timing, at least in animals, may thus be fundamentally embodied and situated."

delays

Our approach would be distinct than these approaches from us and colleagues as we will directly deal with delays in the system at the presynaptic level. I have an extensive expertise in the domain of temporal delays in the nervous system, both at the neural [3] and behavioral [4] levels. Extending this knowledge to the optimization of delays in a SNN will provide a breakthrough in the efficiency of these networks. Our expertise in reproducing the HOTS network [doi:Grimaldi2022pami?] will be crucial in the swift realization of this project.

Celebrini [6]

[7/science.1149639] T Gollisch and M Meister, Science 319.5866 (2008), pp. 1108-1111.

synfire chains

In [8] corticonics: The book gradually leads the reader from the macroscopic cortical anatomy and standard electrophysiological properties of single neurons to neural network models and synfire chains

sparse in time and space [2] AL Barth and JF Poulet Trends in Neurosciences 35.6 (2012), pp. 345-355. [3] CC Petersen and S Crochet, Neuron 78.1 (2013), pp. 28-48.

M. Diesmann, M. O. Gewaltig, A. Aertsen, Nature 402, 529 (1999).

- [9]: from synfire chains to Synfire braids
- recent theories of binding by synchrony: Fries 2005 trends cog neuro with spikes arriving at peak susceptibility (top of a cycle) or down, van Rullen, Laura Dugué

cortical songs [10]

- Ikegaya and colleagues worked on spontaneous activity in vitro and in vivo. They demonstated that
 in cortical activity, we can find a repetition of several motifs. In PSCs, but also in spike activity.
 These sequences repeat after minutes and have a precise spatio temporal structure with a ms
 precision. They can be specific of a particular layer or colomn, are synchronized with network
 activity oscillation and can involve several cells. They also demonstated that these sequences can
 form supersequences: the cortical songs. It consist of the assemblie of several sequences which
 repeat in a specific order with a compressed timing.
- "We find precise repetitions of spontaneous patterns of synaptic inputs in neocortical neurons in vivo and in vitro. These patterns repeat after minutes, maintaining millisecond accuracy."
- Precisely repeating motifs of spontaneous synaptic activity in slices: duration around 1s +/- .5 s. Some events in motifs are of similar size but sometimes absent better described by Bernouilli than SE (and covariance)
- *in vivo* spontaneous activity also reveals repeating sequences. About 3000 sequences, each involving 3-10 cells out of about 900, and last up to 3 seconds
- topography: "Sequences had specific topographic structures, in some cases involving only a particular layer or a vertical column of cells or cells located in a cluster (Fig. 4, A and B, and fig. S3B). (...) Therefore, repeating temporal patterns of activation (...) were associated with a structured spatial organization of the neurons that formed them."
- "Cortical songs: modular assemblies of repeated sequences": hierarchical detection.
- in cotical songs, there is a "compressing timing" which may be taken into account by a similar mechanism as maxpooling in CNNs for space, but in time. Or there may be a mechanism for controlling the replay speed (pulvinar, ..., ?)



Fig. 1. from [10] Repeated motifs of spontaneous synaptic activity in vitro and in vivo. (A) Repeated motifs of intracellular activity from layer 5 pyramidal neurons in slices. Panels show segments (red) of the same voltage-clamp recording from the same cell repeating seconds or minutes after the initial occurrence (blue). Arrows indicate timings of repeated PSCs. (i) Upper trace: low-temporal resolution display of spontaneous activity of a neuron. Lower traces: higher resolution display of the repeated motif at indicated regions of the trace (a to c). (ii) Example of a longer motif. (B) Three repetitions of a motif. The top traces show the motifs superimposed on each other (blue, green, and red), the middle traces show these same traces individually, and the bottom traces show temporally magnified regions of the motifs (a to c). (C) Repeated sequences of intracellular current-clamp recordings in vivo. Two (i) and three (ii) repetitions of motifs are shown. Shuffle tests were performed on traces (i), a to c, yielding significantly fewer repeats (fig. S2, P < 0.02). In (i), the blue trace is shifted –2.75 mV; in (ii), the blue trace is shifted –1.58 mV, and the green +0.79 mV.

TODO read [11]

[11] Luczak A, McNaughton BL, Harris KD. Packet-based communication in the cortex. Nat Rev Neurosci. 2015;16(12):745–55.

polychronization

Rapid Formation of Robust Auditory Memories: Insights from Noise [12]

outline

This section has provided evidence that polychronous groups are an important apsect of information representation in biology with important application in data analysis and neuromorphic engineering. The rest of this review paper is organized as follows.

First, we will review models for the detection of polychronous groups:

- We review theoretical and computational foundations of PG detection in models.
- Application to Image processing using sparse spiking representations: Using the core
 computational unit defined, extension of the computation to a topographic representation similar
 to that observed in the primary visual cortex of mammals. design of micro-circuits with specific
 lateral interactions will allow us to design efficient micro-circuits for the sparse representation of
 images.

Finally we will discuss future avenues for effective PG detection and learning in event streams.

Models of polychronization detection in models

Izhikevitch

spike distances

Detecting patterns in biological raster plots

decoding neural activity

In generic linear non linear lnl models, the output is assumed to be poisson. As such a simple decoding strategy is to asscume it is to b inferned for a given tuning curves (Jayazeri) or simply by a

simple regression [13]. This latter model assumes a Bernoulli model for the generation of spikes such that the decoding amounts to a single-layer logistic regression.

Rastermap: decoding large-scale data

- https://www.janelia.org/lab/stringer-lab
- described in [14]
- rastermap
- deconvolution strategy
- based on a linear model

Stringer et al 2019, Nature [15]

- "A neuronal population encodes information most efficiently when its stimulus responses are highdimensional and uncorrelated, and most robustly when they are lower-dimensional and correlated. Here we analysed the dimensionality of the encoding of natural images by large populations of neurons in the visual cortex of awake mice."
- Data availability: All of the processed deconvolved calcium traces are available on <u>figshare</u>, together with the image stimuli.
- Code availability: The code is available on GitHub.

Stringer et al 2019, Science [16]

- Stringer et al. analyzed spontaneous neuronal firing, finding that neurons in the primary visual cortex encoded both visual information and motor activity related to facial movements. The variability of neuronal responses to visual stimuli in the primary visual area is mainly related to arousal and reflects the encoding of latent behavioral states.
- see also the work showing that you can encode very precise orientation information by using many neurons: [17]

detecting structured temporal patterns

Paper by Grossberger, 2018 [18]

- Temporally ordered multi-neuron patterns likely encode information in the brain. We introduce an
 unsupervised method, SPOTDisClust (Spike Pattern Optimal Transport Dissimilarity Clustering), for
 their detection from high-dimensional neural ensembles. SPOTDisClust measures similarity
 between two ensemble spike patterns by determining the minimum transport cost of transforming
 their corresponding normalized cross-correlation matrices into each other (SPOTDis).
- Detecting these temporal patterns represents a major methodological challenge.
- Many approaches to this problem are supervised, that is, they take patterns occurring concurrently with a known event, such as the delivery of a stimulus for sensory neurons or the traversal of a running track for hippocampal place fields, as a "template" and then search for repetitions of the same template in spiking activity:
- Nadasdy Z, Hirase H, Czurko A, Csicsvari J, Buzsaki G. Replay and time compression of recurring spike sequences in the hippocampus. J Neurosci. 1999;19(21):9497–507. pmid:10531452
- Lee AK, Wilson MA. A combinatorial method for analyzing sequential firing patterns involving an arbitrary number of neurons based on relative time order. J Neurophysiol. 2004;92(4):2555–73. pmid:15212425
- Davidson TJ, Kloosterman F, Wilson MA. Hippocampal replay of extended experience. Neuron. 2009;63(4):497–507. pmid:19709631

- only one spike per neuron: fig 1A = "For each pattern and each neuron, a random position was chosen for the activation pulse."
- t-SNE projection with HDBSCAN labels shows that our clustering method can retrieve all patterns from the data.
- data available @ https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1006283.s013



■ INUISC ■ I at. ∠	▼ 1 at. T	1	100	200	000	000	•	000
Pat. 1Pat. 3	Pat. 5		Epo	ch			Sample offset	

Figure 1: Fig 1 of [18]: "Simulated example illustrating the steps in SPOTDisClust. A) Structure of five "ground-truth" patterns (...). For each pattern and each neuron, a random position was chosen for the activation pulse. B) Neuronal output is generated according to an inhomogeneous Poisson process, with rates dictated by the patterns in (A)." (© Authors under a <u>CC licence</u>)

Paper by Russo et al 2017 [19]

- "Here we present such a unifying methodological and conceptual framework which detects assembly structure at many different time scales, levels of precision, and with arbitrary internal organization." by [19]
- sliding window as in [20] ("Numerous other statistical procedures for detecting assemblies or sequential patterns have been proposed previously") extended to multiple lags [21]
- based on a "non-stationarity-corrected parametric test statistic for assessing the independence of pairs" and "an agglomerative, heuristic clustering algorithm for fusing significant pairs into higherorder assemblies"

Paper by [22]

On Stability of Distance Measures for Event Sequences Induced by Level-Crossing Sampling

Neural Variability and Sampling-Based Probabilistic Representations in the Visual Cortex [23]

- Stochastic sampling links perceptual uncertainty to neural response variability
- Model accounts for independent changes in strength and variability of responses
- Model predicts relationship between noise, signal, and spontaneous correlations
- Stimulus statistics dependence of response statistics is explained

Learning to detect polychronous groups

Learning delays: STDP

spike time coding in a neuron: We will describe the Spike-Time Dependent Plasticity (STDP) rule which implement an unsupervised learning aiming at optimizing the detection of polychronous patterns, that is volleys of spikes which are synchronized, up to some stable pattern of pre-synaptic delays. This STDP rule will be based by the inversion of the generative model for spike formation and will therefore be derived by a Bayesian approach. This will decouple the active synapses (similarly to a logistic regression) from the values of possible synaptic delays.

[24]: coherence detection [25]: STDP

Learning sequences

Learning compositional sequences with multiple time scales through a hierarchical network of spiking neurons. Maes A, Barahona M, Clopath C.PLoS Comput Biol. 2021

Characteristics of sequential activity in networks with temporally asymmetric Hebbian learning. Gillett M, Pereira U, Brunel N.Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2020

Unsupervised Learning of Persistent and Sequential Activity. Pereira U, Brunel N.Front Comput Neurosci. 2020

From space to time: Spatial inhomogeneities lead to the emergence of spatiotemporal sequences in spiking neuronal networks. Spreizer S, Aertsen A, Kumar A.PLoS Comput Biol. 2019

Fast and flexible sequence induction in spiking neural networks via rapid excitability changes. Pang R, Fairhall AL.Elife. 2019 May

Emergence of spontaneous assembly activity in developing neural networks without afferent input. Triplett MA, Avitan L, Goodhill GJ.PLoS Comput Biol. 2018

Training and Spontaneous Reinforcement of Neuronal Assemblies by Spike Timing Plasticity. Ocker GK, Doiron B.Cereb Cortex. 2019.

learning pattern detection on natural images / event-based cameras sparse coding on spatio-temporal data

HOTS

Grimaldi CBMI / PAMI

Discussion

dynamical models

Dumas and colleagues [26]: three levels / fourth paradigm [27] i.e., data exploration in which the scientific models are fit to the data by learning algorithms.

References

1. Statistics of the natural input to a ring model

Laurent Perrinet, Hugo Ladret *Scientific Blog* (2018) https://laurentperrinet.github.io/sciblog/posts/2018-11-05-statistics-of-the-natural-input-to-a-ring-model.html

2. Turning the body into a clock: Accurate timing is facilitated by simple stereotyped interactions with the environment

Mostafa Safaie, Maria-Teresa Jurado-Parras, Stefania Sarno, Jordane Louis, Corane Karoutchi, Ludovic F Petit, Matthieu O Pasquet, Christophe Eloy, David Robbe *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* (2020-06-09) https://doi.org/gnqsmh
DOI: 10.1073/pnas.1921226117 · PMID: 232434909 · PMCID: PMC7293717

3. Active inference, eye movements and oculomotor delays

Laurent U Perrinet, Rick A Adams, Karl J Friston *Biological Cybernetics* (2014-12) https://doi.org/f6skjg
DOI: 10.1007/s00422-014-0620-8 · PMID: 25128318 · PMCID: PMC4250571

4. The Flash-Lag Effect as a Motion-Based Predictive Shift

Mina A Khoei, Guillaume S Masson, Laurent U Perrinet

PLOS Computational Biology (2017-01-26) https://doi.org/b2t5

DOI: 10.1371/journal.pcbi.1005068 · PMID: 28125585 · PMCID: PMC5268412

5. A homeostatic gain control mechanism to improve event-driven object recognition

Antoine Grimaldi, Victor Boutin, Laurent Perrinet, Sio-Hoi leng, Ryad Benosman 2021 International Conference on Content-Based Multimedia Indexing (CBMI) (2021-06-28) https://doi.org/gkzcrv

DOI: <u>10.1109/cbmi50038.2021.9461901</u> · ISBN: 9781665442206

6. Dynamics of orientation coding in area V1 of the awake primate

Simona Celebrini, Simon Thorpe, Yves Trotter, Michel Imbert *Visual Neuroscience* (1993-09) https://doi.org/dqt5cm
DOI: 10.1017/s0952523800006052 · PMID: 8217934

7. Eye Smarter than Scientists Believed: Neural Computations in Circuits of the Retina

Tim Gollisch, Markus Meister

Neuron (2010-01) https://doi.org/c7qkwh

DOI: 10.1016/j.neuron.2009.12.009 · PMID: 20152123 · PMCID: PMC3717333

8. Corticonics: neural circuits of the cerebral cortex

Moshe Abeles

Cambridge University Press (1991)

ISBN: 9780521374767

9. A model of neocortex

Elie Bienenstock

Network: Computation in Neural Systems (1995-01) https://doi.org/gm6nn3

DOI: 10.1088/0954-898x 6 2 004

10. Synfire Chains and Cortical Songs: Temporal Modules of Cortical Activity

Yuji Ikegaya, Gloster Aaron, Rosa Cossart, Dmitriy Aronov, Ilan Lampl, David Ferster, Rafael Yuste

Science (2004-04-23) https://doi.org/djckcn

DOI: <u>10.1126/science.1093173</u> · PMID: <u>15105494</u>

11. Packet-based communication in the cortex.

Artur Luczak, Bruce L McNaughton, Kenneth D Harris

Nature reviews. Neuroscience (2015-10-28) https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/26507295

DOI: <u>10.1038/nrn4026</u> · PMID: <u>26507295</u>

12. Rapid Formation of Robust Auditory Memories: Insights from Noise

Trevor R Agus, Simon J Thorpe, Daniel Pressnitzer

Neuron (2010-05) https://doi.org/dc3r2d

DOI: 10.1016/j.neuron.2010.04.014 · PMID: 20510864

13. A Fast and Simple Population Code for Orientation in Primate V1

P Berens, AS Ecker, RJ Cotton, WJ Ma, M Bethge, AS Tolias

Journal of Neuroscience (2012-08-01) https://doi.org/f365rn

DOI: 10.1523/jneurosci.1335-12.2012 · PMID: 22855811 · PMCID: PMC3506189

14. Robustness of Spike Deconvolution for Neuronal Calcium Imaging

Marius Pachitariu, Carsen Stringer, Kenneth D Harris

The Journal of Neuroscience (2018-09-12) https://doi.org/gd9mcx

DOI: 10.1523/jneurosci.3339-17.2018 · PMID: 30082416 · PMCID: PMC6136155

15. High-dimensional geometry of population responses in visual cortex

Carsen Stringer, Marius Pachitariu, Nicholas Steinmetz, Matteo Carandini, Kenneth D Harris *Nature* (2019-07-18) https://doi.org/gf4cfi

DOI: 10.1038/s41586-019-1346-5 · PMID: 31243367 · PMCID: PMC6642054

16. Spontaneous behaviors drive multidimensional, brainwide activity

Carsen Stringer, Marius Pachitariu, Nicholas Steinmetz, Charu Bai Reddy, Matteo Carandini, Kenneth D Harris

Science (2019-04-19) https://doi.org/gfz6mh

DOI: 10.1126/science.aav7893 · PMID: 31000656 · PMCID: PMC6525101

17. High-precision coding in visual cortex

Carsen Stringer, Michalis Michaelos, Dmitri Tsyboulski, Sarah E Lindo, Marius Pachitariu *Cell* (2021-05) https://doi.org/giqbid

DOI: 10.1016/j.cell.2021.03.042 · PMID: 33857423

18. Unsupervised clustering of temporal patterns in high-dimensional neuronal ensembles using a novel dissimilarity measure

Lukas Grossberger, Francesco P Battaglia, Martin Vinck

PLOS Computational Biology (2018-07-06) https://doi.org/gdvbsx

DOI: 10.1371/journal.pcbi.1006283 · PMID: 29979681 · PMCID: PMC6051652

19. Cell assemblies at multiple time scales with arbitrary lag constellations

Eleonora Russo, Daniel Durstewitz

eLife (2017-01-11) https://doi.org/f9kxd8

DOI: 10.7554/elife.19428 · PMID: 28074777 · PMCID: PMC5226654

20. Unitary Events in Multiple Single-Neuron Spiking Activity: II. Nonstationary Data

Sonja Grün, Markus Diesmann, Ad Aertsen

Neural Computation (2002-01-01) https://doi.org/ffvbkp

DOI: 10.1162/089976602753284464 · PMID: 11747535

21. ASSET: Analysis of Sequences of Synchronous Events in Massively Parallel Spike Trains

Emiliano Torre, Carlos Canova, Michael Denker, George Gerstein, Moritz Helias, Sonja Grün

PLOS Computational Biology (2016-07-15) https://doi.org/gnpx4q

DOI: <u>10.1371/journal.pcbi.1004939</u> · PMID: <u>27420734</u> · PMCID: <u>P</u>MC4946788

22. On Stability of Distance Measures for Event Sequences Induced by Level-Crossing Sampling

Bernhard A Moser, Thomas Natschlager

IEEE Transactions on Signal Processing (2014-04) https://doi.org/gnpb7w

DOI: <u>10.1109/tsp.2014.2305642</u>

23. Neural Variability and Sampling-Based Probabilistic Representations in the Visual Cortex

Gergő Orbán, Pietro Berkes, József Fiser, Máté Lengyel

Neuron (2016-10) https://doi.org/f88725

DOI: 10.1016/j.neuron.2016.09.038 · PMID: 27764674 · PMCID: PMC5077700

24. Coherence detection in a spiking neuron via Hebbian learning

L Perrinet, M Samuelides

Neurocomputing (2002-06) https://doi.org/fsk9mk

DOI: <u>10.1016/s0925-2312(02)00374-0</u>

25. Networks of integrate-and-fire neuron using rank order coding A: How to implement spike time dependent Hebbian plasticity

L Perrinet, A Delorme, M Samuelides, SJ Thorpe

Neurocomputing (2001-06) https://doi.org/d5p6b2

DOI: <u>10.1016/s0925-2312(01)00460-x</u>

26. **Generative Models of Brain Dynamics -- A review**

Mahta Ramezanian Panahi, Germán Abrevaya, Jean-Christophe Gagnon-Audet, Vikram Voleti, Irina Rish, Guillaume Dumas

arXiv(2021-12-24) https://arxiv.org/abs/2112.12147

27. The Fourth Paradigm: Data-Intensive Scientific Discovery [Point of View]

Kristin M Tolle, DStewart W Tansley, Anthony JG Hey

Proceedings of the IEEE (2011-08) https://doi.org/dfggjc

DOI: <u>10.1109/jproc.2011.2155130</u>