

# A Multi-start Variable Neighborhood Tabu Search Algorithm for the Cyclic Bandwidth Problem - Supplementary Material

Yuan Wang, Jianhang Sun, Zhipeng Lü, Zhouxing Su, Junwen Ding, and  
Qingyun Zhang<sup>(✉)</sup>

School of Computer Science and Technology, Huazhong University of Science and  
Technology, Wuhan, China

{wang\_yuan, sunjianhang, zhipeng.lv, suzhouxing, junwending,  
qingyun\_zhang}@hust.edu.cn

## 1 Detailed Experimental Results

The results of our algorithm MVNTS and its competitors (ITPS and NILS) on 202 instances are presented in Tables 3 to 5. Columns  $|V|$  and  $|E|$  represent the number of vertices and edges in the graph. Column  $Cb_b$  denotes the best cyclic bandwidth found by corresponding algorithm, while column  $Cb_a$  indicates the average value obtained over 20 runs. Column *time* gives the average runtime over 20 runs for ITPS, NILS, and MVNTS. Instances with runtime less than 0.01 seconds are marked as “< 0.01”. Notably, the best solution value among MVNTS and the reference algorithms is highlighted in bold. Note that the name of graphs from families caterpillars, 2D meshes, 3D meshes and hypercubes are abbreviated as “cp”, “m2D”, “m3D” and “hc”, respectively.

**Table 1.** Detailed results for the small-scale instances.

Graph	V	E	ITPS			NLS			MVNTS			Graph	V	E	ITPS			NLS			MVNTS		
			$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time				$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time
cp3	9	8	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<0.01	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<0.01	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<0.01	jgl009	9	32	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01
rgg010	10	45	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	jgl011	11	49	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01
cp4	14	13	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<0.01	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<0.01	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<0.01	cp5	20	19	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01
cycle20	20	20	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.05	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D5x4	20	31	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	0.06	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01
path20	20	19	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.06	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	can_24	24	68	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.42	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01
cycle25	25	25	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.11	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.06	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D5x5	25	40	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.06	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01
path25	25	24	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.19	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	cp6	27	26	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01
cycle30	30	30	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.26	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.04	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D5x6	30	49	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.11	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01
path30	30	29	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.44	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	pores_1	30	103	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	0.02	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<0.01	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<0.01
tree2x4	31	30	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<0.01	ibm32	32	90	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	0.02	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<0.01	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<0.01
cp7	35	34	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<0.01	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<0.01	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<0.01	cycle35	35	35	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.53	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.22	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
m2D5x7	35	58	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.23	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	path35	35	34	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.72	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.02	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
bcspr01	39	46	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	3.69	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	0.18	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	0.04	cycle40	40	40	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1.0	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.28	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
m2D5x8	40	67	<b>5</b>	5.1	56.35	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<0.01	path40	40	39	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1.53	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.08	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
tree3x3	40	39	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<0.01	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<0.01	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<0.01	bcsstk01	48	176	<b>12</b>	<b>12</b>	0.05	<b>12</b>	<b>12</b>	0.01	<b>12</b>	<b>12</b>	0.01
bcspr02	49	59	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	0.02	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<0.01	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<0.01	curtis54	54	124	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	0.39	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	0.04	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	0.05
will57	57	127	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.14	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.17	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.09	dwt_59	59	104	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.21	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.1	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.06
impcol_b	59	281	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	0.03	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	0.01	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	<0.01	can_61	61	248	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	0.02	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<0.01	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<0.01
can_62	62	78	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.41	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.46	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.15	m3D4	64	144	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	12.89	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	0.19	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	0.5
dwt_66	66	127	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	0.32	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	0.09	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	0.02	dwt_72	72	75	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.68	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.25	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.13
can_73	73	152	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	0.43	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	0.03	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	0.02	ash85	85	219	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	0.26	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	0.09	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	0.06
dwt_87	87	227	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.25	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.34	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.13	can_96	96	336	<b>7</b>	7.05	198.05	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	0.53	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	0.89
cycle100	100	100	<b>1</b>	1.1	22.42	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1.13	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D10x10	100	180	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	0.46	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.02	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<0.01
nos4	100	247	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.38	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.02	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<0.01	path100	100	99	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	22.4	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.44	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
cp13	104	103	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	1.98	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.05	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.08	tree10x2	111	110	<b>28</b>	<b>28</b>	<0.01	<b>28</b>	<b>28</b>	<0.01	<b>28</b>	<b>28</b>	<0.01
dwt_234	117	162	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	5.18	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	0.22	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	0.18	bcspr03	118	179	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	2.24	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	1.56	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.31
cp14	119	118	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	0.58	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	0.13	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	0.07	tree3x4	121	120	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	0.63	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	0.01	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	<0.01
cycle125	125	125	<b>1</b>	2.1	45.89	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.88	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D5x25	125	220	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	0.73	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.37	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	0.74
m3D5	125	300	<b>21</b>	21.25	138.69	<b>21</b>	<b>21</b>	0.17	<b>21</b>	<b>21</b>	0.27	path125	125	124	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	25.55	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.59	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
bcsstk04	132	1758	<b>37</b>	<b>37</b>	0.46	<b>37</b>	<b>37</b>	0.13	<b>37</b>	<b>37</b>	0.18	can_144	144	576	<b>7</b>	8.5	162.45	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	1.36	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	1.6
lund_a	147	1151	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	0.92	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	0.19	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	0.18	lund_b	147	1147	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	0.69	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	0.15	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	0.28
cycle150	150	150	<b>1</b>	2.75	25.47	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1.6	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D10x15	150	275	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	31.46	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.09	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	0.03
path150	150	149	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	84.01	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.63	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	cp16	152	151	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	0.36	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	0.32	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	0.26
bcsstk05	153	1135	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	1.19	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	0.59	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	0.09	tree5x3	156	155	<b>26</b>	<b>26</b>	0.06	<b>26</b>	<b>26</b>	<0.01	<b>26</b>	<b>26</b>	<0.01
can_161	161	608	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	10.75	<b>18</b>	<b>18</b>	2.53	<b>18</b>	<b>18</b>	1.83	dwt_162	162	510	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	84.43	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	2.83	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	0.78
cp17	170	169	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	0.35	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	0.45	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	0.31	cycle175	175	175	<b>1</b>	2.85	99.42	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1.83	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
m2D7x25	175	318	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	55.51	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	0.23	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	0.46	path175	175	174	<b>1</b>	1.15	131.27	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	0.7	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
tree13x2	183	182	<b>46</b>	<b>46</b>	<0.01	<b>46</b>	<b>46</b>	<0.01	<b>46</b>	<b>46</b>	<0.01	can_187	187	652	<b>8</b>	10.1	4.88	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	1.99	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	21.85
dwt_193	193	1650	<b>32</b>	<b>32</b>	2.74	<b>32</b>	<b>32</b>	0.68	<b>32</b>	<b>32</b>	0.26	cycle200	200	200	<b>1</b>	2.5	24.21	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	2.23	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
m2D8x25	200	367	<b>9</b>	9.25	65.95	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	0.37	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	0.3	path200	200	199	<b>1</b>	1.15	101.06	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1.33	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01

**Table 2.** Detailed results for the medium-scale instances.

Graph	V	E	ITPS			NILS			MVNTS			Graph	V	E	ITPS			NILS			MVNTS		
			$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time				$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time
cp19	209	208	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	70.37	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	1.44	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	0.93	dwt_209	209	767	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	89.44	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	3.01	<b>23</b>	<b>23</b>	0.94
m3D6	216	540	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	150.94	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	0.87	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	0.36	dwt_221	221	704	<b>13</b>	14.4	152.47	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	2.23	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	4.2
can_229	229	774	<b>28</b>	28.45	160.31	<b>28</b>	28.3	218.61	<b>28</b>	<b>28</b>	1.09	dwt_245	245	608	<b>21</b>	<b>21</b>	78.16	<b>21</b>	<b>21</b>	5.68	<b>21</b>	<b>21</b>	2.92
tree2x7	255	254	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	0.89	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	0.24	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	0.22	can_256	256	1330	<b>59</b>	<b>59</b>	92.38	<b>59</b>	<b>59</b>	21.17	<b>59</b>	<b>59</b>	8.8
lshp_265	265	744	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	28.25	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	0.33	<b>17</b>	<b>17</b>	0.09	can_268	268	1407	<b>52</b>	<b>52</b>	32.09	<b>52</b>	<b>52</b>	2.14	<b>52</b>	<b>52</b>	0.93
bcsprw04	274	669	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	47.82	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	5.29	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	2.81	ash292	292	958	<b>19</b>	19.75	12.97	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	5.22	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	5.05
can_292	292	1124	<b>38</b>	39.65	181.6	<b>38</b>	<b>38</b>	120.09	<b>38</b>	<b>38</b>	6.22	cp23	299	298	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	5.85	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	2.71	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	2.51
cycle300	300	300	<b>1</b>	3.8	34.74	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	3.29	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D15x20	300	565	17	17	39.83	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	1.34	<b>15</b>	<b>15</b>	0.64
path300	300	299	<b>1</b>	1.3	171.1	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	1.78	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	dwt_307	307	1108	<b>26</b>	29.35	42.33	<b>26</b>	<b>26</b>	7.63	<b>26</b>	<b>26</b>	19.44
tree17x2	307	306	<b>77</b>	<b>77</b>	0.05	<b>77</b>	<b>77</b>	0.02	<b>77</b>	<b>77</b>	<0.01	dwt_310	310	1069	<b>12</b>	12.35	45.49	<b>12</b>	<b>12</b>	1.78	<b>12</b>	<b>12</b>	0.86
m3D7	343	882	<b>41</b>	43.25	240.51	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>	2.76	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>	1.3	dwt_361	361	1296	15	15	56.13	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	2.89	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	0.07
plat362	362	2712	<b>34</b>	34.9	104.92	<b>34</b>	<b>34</b>	29.69	<b>34</b>	<b>34</b>	8.0	plskz362	362	880	<b>18</b>	<b>18</b>	54.47	<b>18</b>	<b>18</b>	3.65	<b>18</b>	<b>18</b>	2.75
lshp_406	406	1155	<b>21</b>	21.85	64.77	<b>21</b>	<b>21</b>	1.66	<b>21</b>	<b>21</b>	0.73	dwt_419	419	1572	39	42.1	246.78	<b>25</b>	25.1	310.51	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>	33.12
bcsstk06	420	3720	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	172.12	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	27.71	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	32.61	bcsstk07	420	3720	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	171.05	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	27.64	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	32.36
bcsstk07	420	3416	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	143.84	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	30.28	<b>45</b>	<b>45</b>	33.2	impeol_d	425	1267	<b>35</b>	39.7	136.64	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>	27.69	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>	25.14
bcsprw05	443	590	28	32.25	323.91	<b>27</b>	<b>27</b>	37.83	<b>27</b>	<b>27</b>	18.29	can_445	445	1682	<b>46</b>	60.15	211.64	<b>46</b>	<b>46</b>	16.76	<b>46</b>	<b>46</b>	12.79
tree21x2	463	462	<b>116</b>	<b>116</b>	0.12	<b>116</b>	<b>116</b>	0.06	<b>116</b>	<b>116</b>	<0.01	cp29	464	463	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	39.54	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	10.13	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	6.45
nos5	468	2352	64	64	114.52	<b>63</b>	63.75	60.76	<b>63</b>	<b>63</b>	20.8	cycle475	475	475	<b>1</b>	5.75	181.01	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	5.36	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
m2D19x25	475	906	21	21.45	49.21	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	2.93	<b>19</b>	<b>19</b>	2.88	path475	475	474	<b>1</b>	2.05	237.51	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	3.52	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
494_bus	494	586	36	44.75	220.99	29	29	181.01	<b>28</b>	28.05	96.44	dwt_503	503	2762	41	62.1	86.25	41	41	10.24	<b>40</b>	40.2	195.9
m3D8	512	1344	53	102.35	85.42	<b>52</b>	<b>52</b>	9.06	<b>52</b>	<b>52</b>	2.5	sherman4	546	1341	<b>27</b>	27.7	112.35	<b>27</b>	<b>27</b>	4.32	<b>27</b>	<b>27</b>	2.73
lshp_577	577	1656	26	26.05	236.2	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>	5.4	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>	1.71	dwt_592	592	2256	<b>29</b>	31.65	333.25	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	14.54	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	12.41
can_634	634	3297	74	191.7	101.3	73	73.3	221.69	<b>72</b>	<b>72</b>	98.25	cycle650	650	650	<b>1</b>	5.9	348.8	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	8.79	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
m2D25x26	650	1249	27	27.6	179.67	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>	14.36	<b>25</b>	<b>25</b>	8.97	path650	650	649	<b>1</b>	3.35	450.56	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	6.19	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
tree25x2	651	650	<b>163</b>	<b>163</b>	0.29	<b>163</b>	<b>163</b>	0.14	<b>163</b>	<b>163</b>	<0.01	662_bus	662	906	56	69.75	326.56	39	43.85	283.31	<b>38</b>	<b>38</b>	56.39
cp35	665	664	<b>29</b>	29.95	167.6	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	26.75	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	8.42	nos6	675	1290	18	19.35	170.89	<b>16</b>	<b>16</b>	37.82	<b>16</b>	<b>16</b>	27.42
685_bus	685	1282	40	71.25	308.66	<b>32</b>	<b>32</b>	47.02	<b>32</b>	<b>32</b>	35.51	can_715	715	2975	<b>60</b>	109.25	359.06	<b>60</b>	<b>60</b>	76.28	<b>60</b>	<b>60</b>	64.92
m3D9	729	1944	66	153.95	38.4	<b>65</b>	<b>65</b>	26.67	<b>65</b>	<b>65</b>	4.04	nos7	729	1944	66	66.3	280.71	<b>65</b>	<b>65</b>	17.95	<b>65</b>	<b>65</b>	8.83
dwt_758	758	2618	<b>20</b>	25.65	447.46	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	16.72	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	3.33	lshp_778	778	2247	30	184.75	201.28	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	12.33	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	5.39
tree5x4	781	780	<b>98</b>	<b>98</b>	2.1	<b>98</b>	<b>98</b>	0.45	<b>98</b>	<b>98</b>	0.13	bcsstk19	817	3018	26	120.65	244.13	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	24.38	<b>14</b>	<b>14</b>	0.5
cp39	819	818	<b>33</b>	39.7	163.54	<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	33.37	<b>33</b>	<b>33</b>	12.75	cycle825	825	825	6	10.25	460.64	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	12.1	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01
path825	825	824	3	9.4	490.31	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	8.97	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	can_838	838	4586	59	107.45	400.12	<b>58</b>	58.05	78.91	<b>58</b>	<b>58</b>	59.49
m2D28x30	840	1622	30	40.2	262.13	<b>28</b>	<b>28</b>	31.08	<b>28</b>	<b>28</b>	31.64	young1c	841	1624	30	31.5	307.54	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	12.15	<b>29</b>	<b>29</b>	4.25
young3c	841	1671	32	33.25	407.02	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	59.16	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	188.49	dwt_869	869	3208	30	34.95	191.14	29	29.45	173.45	<b>28</b>	28.1	116.92
dwt_878	878	3285	26	40.3	298.85	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	49.4	<b>24</b>	<b>24</b>	7.54	gr_30_30	900	3422	34	34.9	301.91	<b>31</b>	31.95	40.61	<b>31</b>	<b>31</b>	5.19
dwt_918	918	3233	34	55.1	149.72	<b>32</b>	32.75	126.34	<b>32</b>	<b>32</b>	10.75	jagmesht1	936	2664	<b>20</b>	31.95	311.24	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	21.39	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	36.77
nos3	960	7442	46	54.1	413.67	<b>43</b>	<b>43</b>	106.7	<b>43</b>	<b>43</b>	13.58	dwt_992	992	7876	37	50.55	377.42	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>	52.55	<b>35</b>	<b>35</b>	12.36
cycle1000	1000	1000	7	16.75	533.51	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	17.02	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01	m2D20x50	1000	1930	23	24.45	208.69	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	21.34	<b>20</b>	<b>20</b>	13.42
m3D10	1000	2700	82	192.1	130.74	<b>80</b>	<b>80</b>	104.55	<b>80</b>	<b>80</b>	11.68	path1000	1000	999	7	14.65	542.93	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	14.14	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<0.01

**Table 3.** Detailed results for the large-scale instances.

Graph	V	E	ITPS			NILS			MVNTS			Graph	V	E	ITPS			NILS			MVNTS			
			$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time				$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	$Cb_b$	$Cb_a$	time	
dwt_1005	1005	3808	47	59.75	272.44	47	47	107.81	47	47	7.63	dwt_1007	1007	3784	28	42.25	305.46	28	28	43.38	28	28	1.02	
jagmesht2	1009	2928	34	37.9	367.55	33	33	26.11	33	33	33.45	tree2x9	1023	1022	58	58	41.13	57	57	10.51	57	57	2.77	
cp44	1034	1033	38	42.8	248.96	37	37	49.31	37	37	16.68	can_1054	1054	5571	80	144.5	324.41	79	79	93.29	79	79	20.91	
can_1072	1072	5686	117	263.85	217.9	115	115.65	294.5	115	115	128.24	bcsstk09	1083	8677	66	68.3	398.39	62	62	74.09	61	61	62.27	
jagmesht3	1089	3136	35	39.55	391.31	33	33	31.68	33	33	3.54	1138_bus	1138	1458	134	159	256.85	49	50.5	309.48	49	49.95	198.82	
jagmesht7	1138	3156	30	46	418.02	25	25.15	212.47	25	25.35	226.43	jagmesht8	1141	3162	48	65	336.59	32	32.2	234.02	32	32.4	183.91	
jagmesht5	1180	3285	25	37.65	488.89	20	20.1	203.16	20	22.95	296.28	bcsstk27	1224	27451	51	150.95	342.9	45	45.3	251.32	45	49.25	150.32	
dwt_1242	1242	4592	105	23.12	104.53	55	56.65	293.29	54	54.05	206.22	ls1p1270	1270	369	30	128.1	43.19	37	37	64.12	37	37	75.1	
md311	1331	3630	100	298.45	323.29	96	96.97	255.29	96	96	14.18	jagmesht9	1349	3876	31	54.7	504.08	25	25.15	303.31	25	25.7	156.54	
cp1377	1377	32	49.7	535.5	18.9	18	18.9	10.97	18	18	200.68	jagmesht10	1440	380	38	53.7	524.4	20	20	143.59	20	20	10.9	
jagmesht6	1414	1923	83	242.7	222.73	81	81.09	101.97	49	49	200.68	ls1p1561	1561	4560	66	115.5	312.21	61	61	148.09	41	41.6	76.69	
bcsprw07	1612	2106	231	254	302.63	51	51	78.19	51	51	93.16	bcsprw08	1624	2123	232	265.9	341.2	61	61.35	373.72	60	61.05	308.59	
bcsprw09	1723	2394	288	293.75	334.46	63	63.57	294.31	63	63.95	93.86	md312	1728	4752	433	343	226.76	114	114.25	302.04	114	114	27.84	
ls1p1882	1882	511	87	600.95	41.62	45	45.65	230.7	45	45.1	100.29	platin1919	1919	15240	103	589.8	342.92	69	71.05	341.34	69	69.55	183.19	
ls1p1919	1919	4831	480	480	167.75	35	35.67	261.77	35	35.7	177.57	bcsstk26	1922	14207	3204	463.3	310.8	122	143.3	383.79	119	123.25	264.75	
bcsstk13	2009	4084	671	677.35	337.53	317	317.49	338.53	264	329.3	312.97	hc11	2048	11264	547	557.2	4307	535	541.1	352.35	529	534.5	343.15	
md313	2197	6080	550	550.9	323.63	336	336	278.05	214.04	133	133	ls1p2233	2233	6552	745	745	2093	49	50.95	279.29	49	49.05	12.69	
ls1p2233	2233	7602	551	551	222.73	317	317.53	268.0	117.73	268.0	117.73	ls1p2245	2245	11173	545	545	2245	41	41	148.09	41	41	76.69	
ls1p3025	3025	8904	1009	1009	54.53	57	57.48	353.06	57	58.85	62.26	bcsstk123	3124	21022	897	918.1	551.3	303	306.75	453.93	302	310.65	302.52	
ls1p4636	3466	10215	1156	1156	81.66	62	62.45	265.69	61	61.5	100.05	bcsstk24	3562	78174	1195	1195	487.85	1193	1193	1498.5	567	1608	44.15	
hc12	4096	24576	1389	1416.55	595.91	1096	1106.45	500.87	1060	1080.95	428.74	bcsstk28	4041	107307	2003	2112.25	598.4	562	1431.25	101.13	192	282.75	53.63	
bcsprw10	5300	8271	1114	1284.1	414.72	153	153.93	512.53	142	142.05	426.05	hc13	8192	52348	3828	3828	247.8	584.1	2819	2838.25	589.48	1272	2178.75	638.19