# CCRB INVESTIGATIVE RECOMMENDATION

Investigator:		Team:	CCRB Case #:	V	Force	<b>V</b>	Discourt.	U.S.
Samrawit Tadesse		Team # 7	200614294	V	Abuse		O.L.	☐ Injury
Incident Date(s)		Location of Incident:		P	recinct:	18	Mo. SOL	EO SOL
Wednesday, 01/18/2006 4:15 PM		42 Clason Point Lane		Ī	43	7,	/18/2007	7/18/2007
Date/Time CV Reported		CV Reported At:	How CV Reported	: Date/Time Received at Co		eived at CCI	RB	
Tue, 10/24/2006 5:00 PM		CCRB In-person			Tue, 10/24/2006 5:00 PM			
Complainant/Victim	Type	Home Addre	ess					
Subject Officer(s)	Shield	TaxID	Command					
1. POM Miguel Santiago	31625	904998	043 PCT					
2. LT Christophe Mccormack	00000	895704	NARCBBX					
Witness Officer(s)	Shield N	o Tax No	Cmd Name					
1. POM Samuel Newton	15972	915152	043 PCT					
Officer(s)	Allegatio	on			Inve	stiga	ator Recon	nmendation
A.POM Miguel Santiago	Abuse: P	O Miguel Santiago stop	ped § 87(2)(b)					
B.POM Miguel Santiago	Force: PO Miguel Santiago used physical force against \$\sec{87(2)}{10}\$							
C.LT Christophe Mccormack	Abuse: Lt. Christopher McCormack frisked § 87(2)(b)							
D.LT Christophe Mccormack	Abuse: Lt. Christopher McCormack strip-searched [8] 87(2)							
E.LT Christophe Mccormack	Discourtesy: Lt. Christopher McCormack spoke rudely to § 87(2)(b)							

# **Synopsis**

On January 18, 2006, at approximately 4:15pm, \$87(2)(0) was walking home when he alleged that he was stopped by an officer, identified through this investigation as PO Miguel Santiago (Allegation A) at 42 Clason Point Lane in the Bronx. alleged that PO Santiago pushed him against the car PO Santiago came out of (Allegation B). alleged that an officer, who was identified through this investigation as Lt. Christopher McCormack, frisked the crotch and buttocks area of his pants (Allegation C). Lt. McCormack then allegedly pulled down \$87(2)(0) so pants and long johns to his knees, leaving \$87(2)(0) with just his boxers on, and proceeded to search his buttocks area through \$87(2)(0) so boxers (Allegation D). When \$87(2)(0) so protested having his underwear exposed, Lt. McCormack allegedly told \$87(2)(0) to "shut up," (Allegation E).						
§ 87(2)(g)						
Summary of Complaint  \$87(2)(b)  filed his complaint in person at the CCRB on October 24, 2007 (enc. 7a-e).  Sometime in mid-January of 2006, on a weekday, at approximately 5:30pm, \$87(2)(b)  got food from his mother's residence at \$87(2)(b)  s mother's nother's nother's like \$100 (enc. 7a-e).						
mother's home and his home, when he saw a black Chevy Malibu pass by. As \$37(2)(0) was crossing the Cross-Bronx Expressway at Croes Avenue, \$37(2)(b) noticed the black Chevy Malibu, which was going in the same direction he was going in. \$37(2)(b) saw the three people inside looking at him and he knew they were police officers because they had stopped him before. The officers stopped \$37(2)(b) in the middle of the Clason Point Projects. \$37(2)(b) usually cuts across the Clason Points Projects to get home more quickly. From the time \$37(2)(b) left his mother's residence and the police stopped him, \$37(2)(b) did not make any stops, speak to anybody, or make any purchases.						
A short Hispanic male officer, who was identified through this investigation as PO Miguel Santiago, exited the Chevy Malibut and told \$87(2)(b)  "Stop right there." The car was stopped in the middle of street, which \$87(2)(b)  described as being narrow. \$87(2)(b)  did as he was directed and PO Santiago grabbed \$87(2)(b)  by his left bicep and pushed him back onto the back passenger side door of the black Chevy Malibu. The driver of the Chevy Malibu, who was identified through this investigation as Lt. Christopher McCormack, exited the car, and walked to where \$87(2)(b)  was standing. Without any warning, Lt. McCormack grabbed \$87(2)(b)  s crotch and felt around to search for any contraband and repeated the same action near \$87(2)(b)  s pants. When Lt. McCormack could not find anything, he undid \$87(2)(b)  s belt and lowered \$87(2)(b)  s pants and long johns, which \$87(2)(b)  was also wearing since it was winter, down to the knees. As Lt. McCormack was lowering \$87(2)(b)  s pants, he realized that he did not have any gloves and he called over a van from the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct. A minute later a black van arrived. A tall white officer in uniform, PO3, who remains unidentified, came over in the black van and exited the van. PO Santiago got a single blue glove from the white officer and gave it to Lt. McCormack who put the glove on his right hand.						
was wearing boxers underneath the long johns. Lt. McCormack did not take off \$87(2)(b) s boxers at any point during the search. \$87(2)(b) asked the officers why they had stopped him, while Lt. McCormack was searching him. \$87(2)(b) started protesting that the officers are not supposed to take off his pants in the middle of the street. Lt. McCormack told \$87(2)(b) "Shut up. It's not my problem," and kept searching him. While Lt. McCormack was conducting the search, PO Santiago asked \$87(2)(b) if he had anything on him. \$87(2)(b) was standing against the car on his own, but PO Santiago and a dark Hispanic male officer, who was identified through this investigation as PO Samuel Newton, were standing on either side of him as Lt. McCormack was conducting the search. PO Santiago stood on \$87(2)(b) s left side and PO Newton was on \$87(2)(b) s right side.						
Lt. McCormack did not say anything while conducting the search. Lt. McCormack put on plastic gloves and searched \$\\\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \						

Santiago was the officer who completed the paperwork on \$37(2)(b) s arrest. \$37(2)(b) was arrested for marijuana possession and was taken to Bronx Central Booking once his arrest was processed. The next day, at 5am, an officer came and told \$37(2)(b) that he could go. \$37(2)(b) asked why he did not see a judge and he was not given an answer. \$37(2)(b) does not know what happened to his charges.

described PO Santiago as a short, Hispanic, male, chubby, had slightly darker skin, brown hair, and light colored eyes, was 34 years old, dressed in plain clothes, and was sitting in the passenger seat of the Chevy Malibu. Lt. McCormack was a white, male, with red hair, blue eyes, very pale complexion, and his nickname is "Redneck," which is what prisoners call him because of his hair color and complexion, was in his forties, was dressed in plain clothes, and was the driver of the Chevy Malibu. PO3 was a white, male, dressed in uniform, had light brown hair, 5'9" to 5'10" tall, with a silver colored shield. PO Newton was a very dark skinned, Hispanic male, with black hair, was over 6' tall, muscular, 34 years old, dressed in plain clothes, sitting in the rear seat of the Chevy Malibu.

#### **Results of Investigation**

#### Officer Identification:

s arrest report listed PO Samuel Newton as his arresting officer (enc. 11a). PO Newton confirmed that he was working with PO Miguel Santiago on the date in question. PO Miguel Santiago stated that Lt. Christopher McCormack came to the incident location to verify sarrest during his CCRB interview. The 43<sup>rd</sup> Precinct's finalized Tour 2 roll call indicated that PO Santiago was working SNEU on the date in question.

Complaint report for § 87(2)(b) completed by PO Samuel Newton (enc. 9a-b):

was observed entering and exiting a Clean Halls location without permission or authority to do so and was found to be in possession of a razor blade and a bag of marijuana.

## On-Line Booking Sheet (enc. 10a):

Contains the same narrative as the complaint report. The OLBS specifies that \( \)87(2)(b) was seen entering and exiting 42 Clason Point Lane in the Bronx. Sgt. Martine Materasso of the 43<sup>rd</sup> Precinct is listed as the supervisor on scene. The drugs recovered from \( \)87(2)(b) were vouchered under Invoice #: \( \)87(2)(b)

Property Clerk's Invoice completed by PO Samuel Newton (enc. 12a):

One silver razor blade was vouchered as arrest evidence against §87(2)(b)

### Bronx Field Test Report completed by PO Samuel Newton (enc. 13a):

PO Newton conducted a field test of the drugs recovered from which were positive as marijuana. The marijuana was contained in a plastic bag. The weight of the marijuana was not greater than  $1/8^{th}$  oz. Sgt. Martine Materasso of the  $43^{rd}$  Precinct verified the accuracy of the field test.

Arrest report for \$87(2)(b) completed by PO Samuel Newton (enc. 11a):

Contains the same narrative as the complaint report.

Criminal Court Complaint completed for § 87(2)(b) by PO Samuel Newton (enc. 9a):

On January 18, 2006, at approximately 4:15pm, in front of 42 Clason Point Lane in the Bronx, PO Newton recovered a blade knife and a bag of marijuana. The drugs were recovered from §87(2)(b) solutions as left sock.

## PO Newton was interviewed at the CCRB on January 3, 2007 (enc. 15a-c):

On January 18, 2006, PO Newton worked from 9:30am to 6:05pm. PO Newton was assigned to the observation car for the 43<sup>rd</sup> Precinct's SNEU team. PO Newton was working by himself and was dressed in plainclothes. PO Newton was assigned to an unmarked black vehicle. (PO Newton provided a different account of his assignment within the SNEU team than PO Santiago and as well as who he was working with.)

PO Newton did not have his memo book at the time of his interview but the entries for the incident in question are (enc. 8a-b):

1615: 1 under from F/o Clason Point Lane

At approximately 4:15pm, PO Newton and the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct SNEU team were doing observations at the Clason Point developments for Clean Halls and NYCHA trespassing. The SNEU team was concentrating their observations to a particular side of the Clason Point housing complex, which is a known drug location. PO Newton was observing from the car at the intersection of Soundview Avenue and Story Avenue. PO Newton was observing the right hand side of the Clason Point Housing Complex, which is "literally" a block away from the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct stationhouse, and is an enclosed area with a walk through. The buildings in the housing complex are two or three floor buildings that have backyards and alleyways, which a also NYCHA/ Clean Halls property. PO Newton explained that people use the backyard for marijuana sales and the area nearby to conduct transactions for crack cocaine. PO Newton was only observing the backyard of the Clason Point housing development. PO Newton saw \$37(2)(6) enter the Clason Point development from the Soundview Avenue entrance and walk toward where PO Newton was parked, which was right by 42 Clason Point Lane. When \$37(2)(6) got to the middle of the Clason Point complex, he disappeared into the rear backyard of one of the buildings in the housing complex. PO Newton saw \$37(2)(6) stop and have a two or three minute conversation with a black male. The black male, who was not apprehended, put his hands in his pocket and started walking into the rear of the housing complex. The black male handed \$37(2)(6) a small object, which was about ½" and based on PO Newton's experience appeared to be a bag of marijuana since the clear plastic bag contained an item with a distinctive green/brown color. PO Newton did not see \$37(2)(6) came back out from the backyard and started walking back towards the exit on the Soundview Avenue side of the development.
PO Newton radioed his observation over to the apprehension officer, who was PO Miguel Santiago, to stop \$87(2)(b) and verify where he was coming from and the reason for his presence in the housing development. When \$87(2)(b) cut through into an area where PO Newton's vehicle could not get into, PO Newton lost sight of \$87(2)(b) for "a couple of seconds." PO Newton got back in his car, reversed the car to Story Avenue, parked it there, and went to where \$87(2)(b) was exiting the development. PO Newton arrived where \$87(2)(b) was before PO Santiago. PO Newton verbally identified himself as police officer and showed \$87(2)(b) his shield right before \$87(2)(b) exited onto Soundview Avenue. It was at this point that PO Santiago and his partner, who PO Newton did not remember, arrived at the scene in an unmarked vehicle. PO Santiago and his partner were dressed in uniform. When PO Newton asked \$87(2)(b) explained that he housing development, \$87(2)(b) explained that he was going to go inside the housing development but changed his mind and decided to walk through to Soundview Avenue. Based on \$87(2)(b) s response that he had never been in the housing development, PO Newton decided to frisk \$87(2)(b) s value \$87(2)(b) s val
PO Newton did not know who actually handcuffed \$\frac{87(2)(b)}{87(2)(b)}\$ but stated that it may have been one of the officers from the apprehension team. \$\frac{87(2)(b)}{87(2)(b)}\$ never resisted and no force was used to effect his arrest. \$\frac{87(2)(b)}{87(2)(b)}\$ was not searched any further on the scene after he was arrested. PO Newton stated that \$\frac{87(2)(b)}{87(2)(b)}\$ s pants or long johns were never lowered or removed. PO Newton explained that the incident took place, which was a block down and across the street from the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct stationhouse. PO Newton never called for any additional vehicles to come to the scene other than the apprehension team. PO Newton did not recall if he made any arrests from that location that day. \$\frac{87(2)(b)}{87(2)(b)}\$ was taken to the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct stationhouse although PO Newton did not know how. PO Newton suspected that \$\frac{87(2)(b)}{87(2)(b)}\$ might have been walked over to the stationhouse since his arrest location was so close.
Pursuant to search incident to \$87(2)(b) s arrest at the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct stationhouse, the marijuana \$87(2)(b) purchased at the housing development was recovered from the rear waistband area of \$87(2)(b) s long johns. The bag of marijuana war rolled into the waistband of the long johns. The only items of clothing that \$87(2)(b) removed were his jacket, socks, shoes, belt, and shoelaces. \$87(2)(b) was searched in the designated stationhouse search area, which is the muster room. A supervisor was present when \$87(2)(b) was searched but PO Newton did not know if it was his immediate supervisor, Sgt. Martine Materasso, or a lieutenant. PO Newton stated that there might have been other people around while \$87(2)(b) was being searched since the muster room is a common area. \$87(2)(b) was never strip-searched.
PO Newton was presented with a copy of the supporting deposition he completed for \$87(2)(b)  PO Newton reviewed the document and stated that his earlier statement about finding the bag of marijuana in \$87(2)(b)  The supporting deposition accurately reflects where the marijuana was found on \$87(2)(b)  Newton explained that he was thinking of \$87(2)(b)  s other arrest on \$87(2)(b)

## PO Santiago was interviewed at the CCRB on February 1, 2007 (enc. 16a-b):

On January 18, 2006, PO Santiago worked from 8am to 4:35pm. PO Santiago was assigned to the apprehension car for the 43<sup>rd</sup> Precinct's SNEU team. PO Santiago was working with PO Samuel Newton and was dressed in uniform. PO Santiago was assigned to an unmarked black Ford, vehicle number 977. PO Santiago was the operator and PO Newton was the recorder.

PO Santiago forgot his memo book.

PO Santiago was working as part of the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct's SNEU team when the observing officer, whom PO Santiago did not
know, observed \$87(2)(b) exchange U.S. currency for small objects at the housing project. PO Santiago did not
remember the exact location of the observation. The observing officer described \$87(2)(b) as a Hispanic male using a
point-to-point radio. PO Santiago stated that he did receive a description of the clothes \$87(2)(b) was wearing but he could
not remember what it was and to the best of his recollection the description fit \$87(2)(b) PO Santiago and PO Newton
approached \$87(2)(b) a block from where he was observed doing the hand-to-hand transaction and stopped him. PO
Santiago stopped the car in front of where § 87(2)(b) was walking at Noble Avenue and Story Avenue. They asked §
§ 87(2)(b) "Excuse me. Can you come over here?" They asked § 87(2)(b) for his name, which § 87(2)(b) provided. When
PO Santiago and PO Newton asked \$87(2)(b) where he was coming from, \$87(2)(b) told them that he was coming from
the train station coming back from work. PO Santiago told \$87(2)(b) that he was lying since he went through the housing
projects but \$87(2)(b) said, "no" and stated that he never went through the housing projects. \$87(2)(b) asked PO
Santiago and PO Newton why they were stopping him and told them that they had no right to stop him. PO Santiago stated
that he did not grab §87(2)(b) to effect the stop, but did so to effect §87(2)(b) s arrest. PO Santiago stated that he never
pushed \$87(2)(b) against their car to effect a stop. PO Santiago and PO Newton noticed a bulge on \$87(2)(b) s right hip
waistband area. The bulge was 3" to 4" wide and 2" to 3" long. PO Santiago suspected that the bulge was a gun because the
shirt that \$87(2)(b) was wearing was lifted up by where the bulge was located on his waistband.
PO Newton reached over and took out a gravity knife and the holster it was in from \$87(2)(b) s right waistband, which was
the area where the bulge was. PO Newton did not frisk or touch the bulge prior to taking out the knife. When PO Newton
took the knife out of the holster and flicked it open, the blade on the knife was the approximate length of four fingers. PO
Santiago explained that it was clear that the bulge was a pocketknife. PO Santiago told \$87(2)(b) to turn around and face
the car because he was under arrest. PO Santiago took out his handcuffs and placed 887(2)(b) under arrest. 887(2)(b)
told the officers, "This is messed up. You shouldn't be arresting me for this; for a knife." PO Santiago and PO Newton
removed all of \$87(2)(b) s property from his pockets and put it on the car. There was nothing recovered as a result of the
search at \$87(2)(b) s arrest location. \$87(2)(b) was put in PO Santiago and PO Newton's car and they transported
837(2) to the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct stationhouse, which was right across the street. PO Santiago called for Lt. Christopher

While PO Santiago was processing \$87(2)(b) s information, \$87(2)(b) was being searched. PO Santiago did not know who searched \$87(2)(b) PO Newton told PO Santiago that a bag of marijuana was recovered from \$87(2)(b) s left sock during the search at the stationhouse.

s pants. No officer was provided with gloves to search the inside of \$87(2)(b) spants. PO Santiago

McCormack to the scene to verify \$87(2)(b) s arrest. Lt. McCormack arrived at the scene in a car by himself after PO Santiago stated that no officer ever put his hands

stated that no officer ever pulled down \$87(2)(b) states and searched the inside of his underwear. PO Santiago explained that the only officers at the scene other than him were PO Newton and Lt. McCormack, whom he

# Lt. Christopher McCormack was interviewed at the CCRB on March 9, 2007 (enc. 17a-b):

On January 18, 2006, Lt. McCormack did not recall what hours he was working or what his tour was. Lt. McCormack was the Special Operations Lieutenant for the 43<sup>rd</sup> Precinct at the time of the incident. Lt. McCormack was the supervisor for Anti-Crime, SNEU, School Safety, Highway Safety, and the Community Policing Unit. Lt. McCormack did not remember with whom he was working and was most likely dressed in plainclothes. Lt. McCormack did not remember if he was working in a vehicle during the incident date.

Lt. McCormack had no memo book entries for the incident in question.

described as a white, male, 5'10' to 5'11' tall, with reddish blond hair.

Lt. McCormack had no independent recollection of the incident in question. Lt. McCormack did not recognize when presented with a NYS driver license photo of \$87(2)(b) Lt. McCormack was shown \$87(2)(b) s arrest report but still did not remember the incident. Lt. McCormack stated that \$87(2)(b) s name or the circumstances of his arrest did not look familiar to him.
Lt. McCormack did not recall being at the incident location, frisking, or searching \$87(2)(b) s crotch or buttocks area. Lt. McCormack stated that he never pulled down \$87(2)(b) s pants, exposing his underwear, and searching him while standing in the Clason Point Projects. Lt. McCormack stated that he did not recover marijuana from between \$87(2)(b) s buttocks.
NYPD Documents:  According to the 43 <sup>rd</sup> Precinct's finalized Tour 2 roll call, PO Samuel Newton and PO Miguel Santiago were assigned to SNEU (enc. 18a). PO Newton lodged \$87(2)(b) in the prisoner holding pen (enc. 19a). According to the command log, sarrest was noted as a SNEU arrest and it charges \$87(2)(b) only with NYS Penal Law 140.10 (enc. 18a), which is criminal trespassing.
Civilian's Criminal History (enc. 21a-b):  \$87(2)(b) pled guilty to disorderly conduct on \$87(2)(b) and was ordered to pay a \$75 fine as well as associated court costs for the above incident (enc.).
Civilians CCRB History (enc. 5a):  § 87(2)(b)
Officers' CCRB History (enc. 2a-4b):  No allegations have been substantiated against PO Samuel Newton or PO Miguel Santiago. Lt. Christopher McCormack had an allegation of "Abuse-Other- Abuse" substantiated against him in CCRB 9703208 by the CCRB but the NYPD disposition was "Department Unable to Prosecute." Lt. McCormack had an allegation of property seizure substantiated in CCRB 9803109 but was found not guilty by the NYPD. Lt. McCormack had four allegations of frisk and search, two allegations of threats of arrest, two allegations of "Abuse-Other," an allegation of a vehicle search, a refusal to provide his name and shield number substantiated against him in CCRB 200300663. §87(4-b). §87(2)(9)  The NYPD found Lt. McCormack not guilty of all the allegations. §87(4-b). §87(2)(9)  Lt. McCormack had an allegation of a frisk substantiated §87(4-b). §87(2)(9)  in CCRB 200602000. The discipline recommendation was charges.
Conclusions and Recommendations <u>Disputed/ Undisputed Facts:</u> It is undisputed that §87(2)(b) was stopped by PO Miguel Santiago and arrested for possession of marijuana. It is disputed whether or not PO Santiago used physical force against §87(2)(b) and if Lt. Christopher McCormack frisked, stripsearched, and spoke discourteously to §87(2)(b)
<u>Credibility Analysis:</u> § 87(2)(9)
§ 87(2)(g)

Allegation (A) PO Miguel Santiago	
Encounters (enc. 1a), "It should be suspicion to stop an individual. The suspicion will arise if the exchange	There copped and questioned. According to Barry Kamin's Search and Seizure: Street moted that in drug cases, certain activity observed by the police may provide reasonable as, where an officer observes an exchange of money for an unidentified object, reasonable occurs in drug prone area." PO Santiago's stated that the reason he and PO Newton was because he was seen doing a hand to hand transaction at the incident location, which was observed being handed a small package by an unidentified male (a)
Allegation (D) Lt. Christopher McC	
	alleged that he nat runs through the Clason Point Housing Projects at 4:15pm. According to the United ne sun set at 4:56pm on January 18, 2006 in the Bronx (enc. 2a). §87(2)(g)
	PO Newton and PO Santiago ormack, who had no independent recollection of the above incident, stated that he would ok place. It should also be noted that the command log entry for \$87(2)(5) did not list \$87(2)(9)
Allegation (B) PO Miguel Santiago Allegation (C) Lt. Christopher McC Allegation (E) Lt. Christopher McC  § 87(2)(9) and Lt. McCormack because § 87(2)(b) to "shut up." In addition, PO Santia	ormack frisked §87(2)(b) ormack spoke rudely to §87(2)(b) These allegations were pled against PO Santiago
Investigator:	Date:
Supervisor:	Date:
Reviewed by:	Date:
Reviewed by:	Date: