## CCRB INVESTIGATIVE RECOMMENDATION

Investigator:		Team:	CCRB Case #:	<b>▼</b> Force	☐ Discourt.	
				-	_	<u> </u>
Julian Phillips		Squad #5	201807936	✓ Abuse	O.L.	☐ Injury
Incident Date(s)		Location of Incident:		Precinct:	18 Mo. SOL	EO SOL
Sunday, 09/16/2018 10:21 PM, 09/17/2018 1:00 AM	Monday,	Over the phone: \$87(2)(b)		115	3/16/2020	3/16/2020
Date/Time CV Reported		CV Reported At:	How CV Reported	d: Date/Tim	e Received at CCI	RB
Mon, 09/17/2018 2:00 AM		IAB	Phone	Tue, 09/2	5/2018 11:13 AM	I
Complainant/Victim	Type	Home Addr	ess			
Witness(es)		Home Addr	ess			
Subject Officer(s)	Shield	TaxID	Command			
1. POM Scott Hampton	01822	960635	115 PCT			
2. POM Anthony Romano	11416	964737	115 PCT			
3. POM Juan Lucio	01819	938890	115 PCT			
4. POM Luis Guevara	06435	958661	115 PCT			
Witness Officer(s)	Shield N	o Tax No	Cmd Name			
1. POM Brennan Smith	20959	963283	115 PCT			
2. POM James Vasek	01950	962147	115 PCT			
3. POM John Christensen	25625	962316	115 PCT			
4. DTS Randall Litrell	04168	928302	115 PCT			
5. POM Matthew Collins	25972	963922	115 PCT			
Officer(s)	Allegatio	on		Inv	estigator Recon	nmendation
A.POM Luis Guevara		On September 16, 2018, Luis Guevara threatened		ice		
B.POM Luis Guevara	Officer I	On September 16, 2018, Luis Guevara threatened property.		ice		
C.POM Scott Hampton		On September 17, 2018, Police Officer Scott Ha \$87(2)(b)		in arrest		
D.POM Juan Lucio		On September 17, 2018, Police Officer Juan Luc \$ 87(2)(b)		in est		

Officer(s)	Allegation	Investigator Recommendation
E.POM Scott Hampton	Force: On September 17, 2018, at Ser(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton used physical force against Ser(2)(b)	
F.POM Scott Hampton	Abuse: On September 17, 2018, Police Officer Scott Hampton entered 87(2)(b), in Queens.	
G.POM Anthony Romano	Abuse: On September 17, 2018, Police Officer Anthony Romano entered \$87(2)(5), in Queens.	
H.POM Scott Hampton	Abuse: On September 17, 2018, at \$87(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton threatened to arrest \$87(2)(b)	
I.POM Scott Hampton	Force: On September 17, 2018, at Ser(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton used physical force against Ser(2)(b)	
J.POM Scott Hampton	Abuse: On September 17, 2018, at \$87(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton damaged \$87(2)(b) property.	
K.POM Scott Hampton	Force: On September 17, 2018, at Set(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton used physical force against Set(2)(b) set(2)(b)	
L.POM Scott Hampton	Abuse: On September 17, 2018, Police Officer Scott Hampton entered the basement of \$87(2)(b) in Queens.	
§ 87(4-b), § 87(2)(g)		

Case Summary  On September 17, 2018, 887(2)(b) filed this complaint with IAB by phone, generating original log number 2018-36407. The CCRB received the complaint on September 25, 2018.
On September 16, 2018, at approximately 10:21 p.m., Police Officer Luis Guevara and other officers from the 115 <sup>th</sup> Precinct responded to a landlord-tenant dispute at in Queens. Earlier that evening, the leaseholder of \$37(2)(b)
On September 17, 2019, at approximately 1 a.m., \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ s wife, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ and their daughter, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ arrived at \$\frac{8}{37(2)}\$, where they met officers including Police Officers Scott Hampton, Juan Lucio, and Anthony Romano, all from the \$15^{th}\$ Precinct. PO Hampton and PO Lucio told \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ that she would be arrested for illegal eviction if she did not grant \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ access to \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ (Allegations C-D: Abuse of Authority, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ PO Hampton and PO Romano entered \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ (Allegations F-G: Abuse of Authority, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ PO Hampton threatened to arrest, and then shoved, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ s mother (Allegation H: Abuse of Authority, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ Allegation I Force, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ PO Hampton allegedly shoved \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ PO Hampton allegedly shoved \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ (Allegation J: Abuse of Authority, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$ PO Hampton entered the building's basement (Allegation L: Abuse of Authority, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{37(2)}\$

The investigation obtained BWC footage of both incidents, and cellphone footage and audio from the second incident (**Board Review 01-08**).

This case was reassigned from Inv. Mancini to Inv. Phillips on October 30, 2018.

## **Findings and Recommendations**

Allegation (A) Abuse of Authority: On September 16, 2018, over the phone, Police Officer Luis Guevara threatened to arrest \$\frac{87(2)(6)}{2018}\$

Allegation (B) Abuse of Authority: On September 16, 2018, over the phone, Police Officer Luis Guevara threatened to damage \$\frac{87(2)(6)}{2018}\$

It is undisputed that \$\frac{87(2)(6)}{2018}\$ and \$\frac{87(2)(6)}{2018}\$ told PO Guevara that \$\frac{87(2)(6)}{2018}\$ had resided in the apartment for several months before the date of the incident. It is also undisputed that \$\frac{87(2)(6)}{2018}\$ and told him that he would be arrested if he did not grant entry to \$\frac{87(2)(6)}{2018}\$

Page 2

testified ( <b>Board Review 09</b> ) that several minutes after the call in which PO Guevara threatened him with arrest, PO Guevara called him again and threatened to force open the door if he did not come to the scene to open the door.
PO Guevara ( <b>Board Review 12</b> ) denied that he told \$87(2)(b) that officers would force open the building door if \$87(2)(b) did not open it.
PO Guevara did not activate his BWC during the incident. BWC footage from other officers on scene captured a brief snippet of PO Guevara's telephone call to \$87(2)(0) but no BWC captured the portion of the call in which PO Guevara threatened \$87(2)(0) with arrest and allegedly threatened to make forced entry into the building.
New York City Administrative Code §26-521 ( <b>Board Review 13</b> ) states that, when an occupant of a dwelling unit has been unlawfully evicted, "[I]t shall be unlawful for an owner of a dwelling unit to fail to take all reasonable and necessary action to restore to occupancy an occupant of a dwelling unit." Patrol Guide Procedure 214-12 and NYPD Legal Bureau Bulletin Vol. 49 No. 3 (Aug. 2019) confirm that a person is an occupant of a dwelling if she has lawfully occupied it for at least 30 days, and that officers may threaten to arrest a landlord wherefuses to return access to the dispossessed occupant ( <b>Board Review 40-41</b> ).
§ 87(2)(g)
Allegation (C) Abuse of Authority: On September 17, 2018, at \$87(2)(5) in Queens, Police Officer
Scott Hampton threatened to arrest \$87(2)(b) Allegation (D) Abuse of Authority: On September 17, 2018, at \$87(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer
It is undisputed that \$87(2)(b) was an owner of the property at the time of the incident. It is undisputed that \$87(2)(b) told the officers that she could not unlock the doors to the building and apartment to grant \$87(2)(b) entry, and that PO Hampton and PO Lucio both told her that she would be subject to arrest if she refused to do so.
An audio recording provided by \$87(2)(b) captured a portion of her conversation with the officers (Board Review 07). The audio shows that \$87(2)(b) told the officers that she could not allow point to enter the apartment because she did not know \$87(2)(b) PO Hampton repeatedly stated that \$7(2)(c) would be arrested if \$87(2)(b) access to the apartment. PO Lucio stated a single time that \$87(2)(b) would be arrested if \$87(2)(b) did not grant \$87(2)(c) did not grant \$87(2)(c) access to the apartment.
testified that she told the officers that she could not unlock the doors because she did not possess keys to the new locks. \$87(2)(b) similarly testified that \$87(2)(b) told the officers that she could not comply because she did not possess keys to the new locks. \$87(2)(b) added that \$7(2)(b) Page 3

also told the officers that she did not wish to grant \$87(2)(b) access because she did not know to be a tenant.
PO Hampton and PO Lucio both testified ( <b>Board Review 14-15</b> ) that \$87(2)(b) said she did not want to allow \$87(2)(b) to access the building. PO Hampton recounted that he knocked on the window of the first floor apartment, and that the tenant, \$87(2)(b) confirmed to PO Hampton that \$87(2)(b) had resided in the building for more than 30 days.
§ 87(2)(g)
New York City Administrative Code §26-521 (Board Review 13) states that, when an occupant of a dwelling unit has been unlawfully evicted, "[I]t shall be unlawful for an owner of a dwelling unit to fail to take all reasonable and necessary action to restore to occupancy an occupant of a dwelling unit." Patrol Guide Procedure 214-12 and NYPD Legal Bureau Bulletin Vol. 49 No. 3 (Aug. 2019) confirm that a person is an occupant of a dwelling if she has lawfully occupied it for at least 30 days, and that officers may threaten to arrest a landlord who refuses to return access to the dispossessed occupant (Board Review 40-41).
§ 87(2)(g)
Allegation (E) Force: On September 17, 2018, at §87(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton
used physical force against \$87(2)(b)
testified that she, \$87(2)(b) and two relatives who had arrived on scene went to the common hallway to open the door of \$87(2)(b) while the officers remained outside the building. \$12(2)(c) then went downstairs to the first floor hallway to notify the officers that the apartment door was open. PO Hampton then shoved \$87(2)(b) to the side in the hallway before going upstairs. \$12(2)(c) did not indicate that there was anyone present for this force besides herself, PO Hampton, and PO \$12(2)(b)
testified ( <b>Board Review 17</b> ) that \$87(2)(b) later told her that PO Hampton had pushed her, but \$87(2)(b) did not witness this herself.
PO Hampton denied shoving \$87(2)(b) and denied that he was in the first floor hallway when a civilian opened the door to \$87(2)(b) . He recounted that he was standing in the common hallway on the \$87(2)(b) at that time. PO Romano also testified that he was standing in the common hallway on the \$87(2)(b) . He did not recall seeing PO Hampton shove \$87(2)(b) PO Lucio testified that he left the scene before this portion of the incident and denied seeing PO Hampton shove \$87(2)(b)
This portion of the incident was not captured on any officer's BWC.
§ 87(2)(g)
Page 4

Allegation (F) Abuse of Authority: On September 17, 2018, Police Officer Scott Hampton entered 887(2)(b)
in Queens. Allegation (G) Abuse of Authority: On September 17, 2018, Police Officer Anthony Romano entered
in Queens.
It is undisputed that PO Hampton and PO Romano entered the apartment. It is also undisputed that an occupant of the apartment, told the officers that they could not enter the apartment.
PO Hampton testified that he informed \$87(2)(b) that he would help her reenter her apartment and that stated that she appreciated this. PO Hampton then knocked on the second floor apartment door for approximately 30 to 45 minutes. \$87(2)(b) opened the door, but said that PO Hampton could not enter the apartment. PO Hampton immediately stepped into the apartment. As will be described in greater detail in the section regarding Allegations H-I, PO Hampton recounted that \$87(2)(b) yelled at him after he entered the apartment, and the investigation determined that he physically forced her to go back into her bedroom.
PO Romano similarly recounted that he entered the apartment in order to escort sar(2)(5) to her room. He could not recall if anyone inside the apartment objected to the officers entering the apartment.
Absent an emergency, it is NYPD policy that officers are not permitted to physically assist an illegally evicted occupant in gaining entry to her dwelling unit. NYPD Legal Bureau Bulletin Vol. 49 No. 3 (Aug. 2019) (Board Review 41). If any co-tenant of a residence is present and objects to officers entering that residence, then officers are not permitted to enter, regardless of whether another co-tenant consents to the entry. People v. Watson, 101 A.D.3d 913 (2 <sup>nd</sup> Dept. 2012) (Board Review 42); Georgia v. Randolph, 547 U.S. 103 (2006) (Board Review 43)
§ 87(2)(g)
Allegation (H) Abuse of Authority: On September 17, 2018, at \$87(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer
Scott Hampton threatened to arrest \$87(2)(b) Allegation (I) Force: On September 17, 2018, at \$87(2)(b) in Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton
used physical force against §87(2)(b)
It is undisputed that PO Hampton threatened to arrest \$87(2)(b)
(Board Review 18) testified that, when she heard the apartment door open, she walked into the living room and saw PO Hampton standing in the doorway. PO Hampton ordered \$87(2)(5) to to room to hear hear hear hear hear hear hear hear
responded by asking PO Hampton if he possessed a court order. Statements to PO Hampton, and she did not indicate that she raised her voice. Statements to PO Hampton, and she did not indicate that she raised her voice. Statements to PO Hampton, and she did not indicate that she raised her voice. Statements to PO Hampton, and she did not indicate that she raised her voice. Statements to PO Hampton, and she did not indicate that she raised her voice. Statements to PO Hampton or made contact with him. PO Hampton grasped statements to PO Hampton or made sarm and escorted her to her bedroom door before shoving her through the doorway. Statements to PO Hampton did not testify that she physically obstructed PO Hampton or made reported that she sustained bruising to her arm from PO Hampton grabbing her, and she provided a photograph of this bruising (Board Review 35). Statements of the provided and to grab onto nearby furniture to keep herself from falling. Statements of the possessed a court order. Statements of PO Hampton or made contact with him. PO Hampton or made sarm and escorted her to her bedroom door before shoving her through the doorway. Statements of the physical provided and physically obstructed PO Hampton or made sarm and escorted her to her bedroom door before shoving her through the doorway. Statements of the physical physi
Page 5

handcuffed." PO Hampton closed the bedroom door, and \$87(2)(6) did not have any further interaction with the officers.
both testified that, after PO Hampton entered the apartment, told PO Hampton to leave because he did not possess the necessary paperwork to enter the apartment. \$87(2)(b) also recounted that \$87(2)(b) and \$87(2)(b) also recounted by grasping \$87(2)(b) also recounted that she told PO Hampton, "Don't push the lady," in reference to PO Hampton having pushed \$87(2)(b)
PO Hampton testified that, after the apartment door was opened, \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ told him that he could not enter the apartment. PO Hampton replied, "Ma'am, we're coming in," and he stepped inside. PO Hampton did not testify that \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ stood in front of him and yelled. PO Hampton did not testify that \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ made any physical contact with him, and he did not testify that she made any verbal threats. PO Hampton assessed that \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ s yelling would impede the officers from granting \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ access to the apartment. PO Hampton ordered \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ to reenter her bedroom and informed \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ reentered her bedroom. PO Hampton denied that he shoved \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ and further denied making any physical contact with her. PO Hampton recounted that the door to \$\frac{87(2)(0)}{2}\$ s bedroom was closed after she went back into her bedroom, but PO Hampton could not recall if he closed the door himself.
PO Romano recalled that individuals inside the apartment were unhappy about the officers' presence, but he could not recall if anyone inside the apartment objected to the officers' entry. He reported that no other issues arose in escorting to her bedroom. PO Romano did not recall seeing PO Hampton shove, threaten with arrest, or otherwise interact with \$87(2)(0)
The investigation obtained BWC and cellphone footage showing the conclusion of PO Hampton's interaction with \$57(2)(b)  The investigation did not obtain footage showing the period in which PO Hampton allegedly shoved and threatened to arrest \$57(2)(b)  (Board Review 29), shows PO Hampton standing briefly in the threshold of \$7(2)(b)  s bedroom door, with \$57(2)(b)  immediately inside the bedroom, before PO Hampton closes the bedroom door immediately reopening and \$57(2)(b)  standing immediately inside the bedroom asking for "an order" and stating that there are small children on scene. \$57(2)(b)  speaks at a normal volume and does not yell at PO Hampton. PO Hampton immediately approaches the bedroom door and closes it a second time. PO Hampton's BWC footage also shows that \$57(2)(b)  called 911 shortly after PO Hampton closed \$57(2)(b)  s bedroom door a second time, and that in recounting the incident to the 911 operator she reported that PO Hampton had pushed \$57(2)(b)
§ 87(2)(g)

PO Hampton's testimony made it clear that \$87(2)(6) did not physically obstruct him from entering the apartment, nor did she make physical contact with him or threaten him.
and \$37(2)(b) all consistently testified that PO Hampton physically escorted \$87(2)(b) to her bedroom and shoved her inside. PO Hampton, in contrast, denied that he made any physical contact with \$37(2)(b) He recounted that \$37(2)(b) simply reentered her bedroom after being ordered to do so. The video footage showed that PO Hampton's interaction with \$37(2)(b) led him to stand briefly in the threshold of her bedroom doorway while facing into her bedroom, after which point he closed her bedroom door.
A person is guilty of obstructing governmental administration ("OGA") in the second degree when she prevents or attempts to prevent a public servant from performing an official function, by means of intimidation, physical force or interference, or by means of any independently unlawful act. New York State Penal Law §195.05 (Board Review 32). The interference must be in part, at least, physical in nature, but criminal responsibility should attach to minimal interference set in motion to frustrate police activity. People v. Dumay, 23 N.Y.3d 518 (2014) (Board Review 19). In some instances, courts have found that an individual's behavior constituted OGA, even when the individual did not make physical contact with an officer or when the individual did not place her body in a position to physically prevent an officer from performing an official function. However, in those instances, the individual engaged in behavior which evinced a clear intent to obstruct police activity, such as by disobeying orders to leave a specific area and verbally warning others of imminent police enforcement, by cursing at officers while throwing objects at them, or by repeatedly disobeying orders not to approach a struggle between officers and an arrestee. See In re Davan L., 91 N.Y.2d 88 (1997) (Board Review 36); People v. Covington, 18 A.D.3d 65 (1st Dept. 2005) (Board Review 37); People v. Tisdale (Julius), 21 Misc. 3d 141(A) (2nd Dept. 2008) (Board Review 38); People v. Romeo, 9 A.D.3d 744 (3rd Dept. 2004) (Board Review 39).
NYPD Patrol Guide Procedure 221-01 notes that an officer may use reasonable physical force "to ensure the safety of a member of the service or a third person or when it is reasonable to place a person in custody or to prevent escape from custody" ( <b>Board Review 33</b> ).
§ 87(2)(g)

	ity: On September 17, 2018, at § 87(2)(b)	in Queens, Police Officer
	after PO Hampton shoved her into her observed a crack in the do	bedroom, PO Hampton slammed the door oor, which she believed had been caused he damage ( <b>Board Review 20</b> ).
	both testified that PO Hamptified that PO Hampton's action damage	
	ations H and I, above, video footage showice. The footage showed PO Hampton	
PO Hampton did not recall wheth damage. PO Romano denied that		became aware that the door sustained any
§ 87(2)(g)		
Allegation (K) Force: On September 2015		Queens, Police Officer Scott Hampton
push the lady," in reference to PC approaching \$87(2)(b) PO Hampton shoved \$87(2)(b)	t, after PO Hampton entered the apartment of Hampton having pushed \$187(2)(5) grasping both of her arms, and attemp against a wall. While shoving s left foot, which can be seen as a self-transfer of the self-transfer of	PO Hampton responded by ting to shove her out of the apartment.  887(2)(b) PO Hampton
Hampton, "Step out, calm down, grasping both of PO Hampton shoved §87(2)(b)	after PO Hampton entered the apartment and then come back in." PO Hampton references for her arms, and attempting to shove against a wall and stepped on hever saw \$87(2)(6) on the sealleged.	out of the apartment.
requested an eva	ecords from (Board I aluation because she was pregnant and empton. The records do not indicate that the	

back and she complied. PO Hampton prepared a TRI Report ( <b>Board Review 21</b> ) which noted that he unintentionally stepped on some stepped on som
PO Romano did not recall PO Hampton shoving \$87(2)(6) or stepping on her foot.
§ 87(2)(g)
Allegation (L) Abuse of Authority: On September 17, 2018 Police Officer Scott Hampton entered the basement of saze in Queens.  It is undisputed that PO Hampton entered the basement of the building without possessing a warrant to do so.
Video footage from PO Hampton's BWC ( <b>Board Review 22</b> ) shows that walked along the exterior of the building to a locked door leading to the basement area, followed by PO Hampton. Sar(2)(b) asked PO Hampton, "Do you have to follow me?" and PO Hampton replied, "Ma'am, you're the suspect in a criminal complaint." Sar(2)(b) unlocked the basement door and stepped inside, but did not hold the door open for PO Hampton. PO Hampton pushed the door open before it closed fully, and followed Sar(2)(b) into the basement. Sar(2)(b) retrieved the tools within a few seconds, and both she and PO Hampton exited the basement.
testified ( <b>Board Review 17</b> ) that only she, her husband, and the building superintendent had access to the basement. S87(2)(b) recounted that PO Hampton told her that he was following her to the basement because she was a "criminal." S87(2)(b) account of this portion of the incident was consistent with that of S87(2)(b)
PO Hampton testified that he accompanied \$87(2)(6) to the basement in order to ensure that she was complying with her legal obligation to grant \$87(2)(6) access to the apartment. He could not recall whether he entered the basement or waited outside the basement door.
Absent consent, exigent circumstances, or emergency circumstances, an officer may not make a warrantless entry into a given premises in which an individual has a legitimate expectation of privacy. Factors germane to determining whether an individual has such an expectation include whether the individual took precautions to maintain privacy in the premises, and whether the individual possessed the right to exclude others from the premises. People v. Rodriguez, 69 N.Y.2d 159 (1987) (Board Review 23).
§ 87(2)(g)

§ 87(2)(g)
§ 87(4-b), § 87(2)(g)
Civilian and Officer CCRB Histories

- This is the first CCRB complaint to which \$87(2)(5) (Board Review 25), \$87(2)(5) (Board Review 26), \$87(2)(5) (Board Review 27), and \$87(2)(5) (Board Review 28) have been party.
- PO Guevara has been a member of the NYPD for four years and this is the first CCRB complaint in which he has been a subject.
- PO Lucio has been a member of the NYPD for 14 years and has been a subject in one additional CCRB complaint and two allegations, neither of which was substantiated. §87(2)(9)
- PO Hampton has been a member of the NYPD for three years and has been a subject in one additional CCRB complaint and 17 allegations, none of which was substantiated.
  - 201905096 involves allegations of entry of premises, threat of arrest, threat of force, discourtesy, and detention pleaded against PO Hampton. To date this investigation is still open.
- PO Romano has been a member of the NYPD for one year and this is the first CCRB complaint in which he has been a subject.

## **Mediation, Civil and Criminal Histories**

- This complaint was not suitable for mediation.
- On September 17, 2019, the NYC Office of the Comptroller confirmed that no Notice of Claim had been filed regarding this incident (**Board Review 31**).

9 67 (2)(0), 9 67 (2)(0)			
Squad No.:			
Investigator:	Signature	Print Title & Name	Date
Squad Leader:	Signature	Print Title & Name	Date
Reviewer:	Signature	Print Title & Name	Date

Page 11