CCRB INVESTIGATIVE RECOMMENDATION

		ESTIGATIVE I					D .	
Investigator:		Team:	CCRB Case #:	1	Force	$\overline{\mathbf{V}}$	Discourt.	_
Matthew Donaghy		Squad #14	201904830		Abuse		O.L.	✓ Injury
Incident Date(s)		Location of Incident:		P	recinct:	18	Mo. SOL	EO SOL
Saturday, 05/25/2019 8:30 PM, 05/25/2019 8:50 PM, Saturday, 10:00 PM		East 26th Street and Ne East 26th Street and Fla 67th Precinct stationho	atbush Avenue;		67	11	/25/2020	7/12/2021
Date/Time CV Reported		CV Reported At:	How CV Reported	:	Date/Time	Rece	ived at CCI	RB
Sun, 05/26/2019 1:10 AM		IAB	Phone		Tue, 06/04	1/2019	9 11:18 AM	I
Complainant/Victim	Туре	Home Addre	ess					_
TY		<u> </u>						
Witness(es)		Home Addre	ess					
Subject Officer(s)	Shield	TaxID	Command					
1. POM Fabian Modesto	08846	950897	067 PCT					
2. POM James Lukeson	08840	935216	067 PCT					
3. CPT Andrew Tolson	00000	933412	067 PCT					
4. POM Richard Ortega	02674	956991	067 PCT					
Witness Officer(s)	Shield N		Cmd Name					
1. LT Matthew Oetting	00000		067 PCT					
Officer(s)	Allegatio	on			Inve	estiga	tor Recon	nmendation
A.POM Fabian Modesto		East 26th Street and No Ficer Fabian Modesto p						
B.POM Fabian Modesto	Brooklyn	Discourtesy: At East 26th Street and Newkirk Avenue in Brooklyn, Police Officer Fabian Modesto spoke discourteously to §87(2)(b)						
C.POM Fabian Modesto		t East 26th Street and N ficer Fabian Modesto th f force.		_	klyn with			
D.POM Fabian Modesto		East 26th Street and Fl Ficer Fabian Modesto po						
E.POM Fabian Modesto		East 26th Street and Fl Ficer Fabian Modesto u						
F.POM Fabian Modesto	Brooklyn	esy: At East 26th Street , Police Officer Fabian ously to \$87(2)(b)		ie in				
G.POM Fabian Modesto		t East 26th Street and F ficer Fabian Modesto re						
H.POM Fabian Modesto	Brooklyn	t East 26th Street and F , Police Officer Fabian number to \$87(2)(b)		prov	ride			

Officer(s)	Allegation	Investigator Recommendation
I.CPT Andrew Tolson	Discourtesy: At the 67th Precinct stationhouse in Brooklyn, Captain Andrew Tolson spoke discourteously to §87(2)(b)	
§ 87(4-b), § 87(2)(g)		
§ 87(4-b), § 87(2)(g)		
§ 87(4-b), § 87(2)(g)		

Case Summary

On May 26, 2019, Captain Andrew Tolson of the 67th Precinct reported the following complaint to IAB on behalf of §87(2)(b) On June 4, 2019, the CCRB received this complaint from IAB. On May 25, 2019, at approximately 8:30 p.m., § 87(2)(b) was driving on a Tail-G electric scooter on single-lane East 26th Street between Newkirk Avenue and Avenue D in Brooklyn. An unmarked black Impala, driven by PO James Lukeson, with passengers PO Richard Ortega and PO Fabian Modesto, all of the 67th Precinct, suddenly drove past \$87(2)(5) The black Impala stopped in front of \$87(2)(b) and \$87(2)(b) swerved towards parallel parked vehicles on the left side of the road and continued driving. PO Modesto exited the unmarked vehicle and allegedly pointed his gun at § 87(2) (Allegation A: Force, § 87(2)(9)), § 87(2)(b) made a U-turn on East 26th Street and began driving against traffic, at which time PO Modesto allegedly stated, "You better fucking stop before I shoot you in your back" (Allegation B: Discourtesy,) (Allegation C: Abuse of Authority, § 87(2)(9) gsy(2)(b) drove two blocks in the wrong direction on East 26th Street, before turning right onto the sidewalk on the northwestern side of the intersection of East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue. §87(2)(b) then got off his scooter and laid on the ground with his arms and legs extended from his body. PO Modesto ran towards \$37(2)(b) with his gun, pointing it at \$37(2)(b) and ultimately placing it against his back (Allegation D: Force, \$87(2)(9)). PO Modesto then allegedly struck [307(2)(b)] in the face with his knee, causing [307(2)(b)] s face to collide with the). § 87(2)(b) asked why PO Modesto had kicked ground (Allegation E: Force, § 87(2)(9) him in his face, and PO Modesto replied, "I didn't kick you in your fucking face," and "You're a fucking liar" (Allegation F: Discourtesy, \$87(2)(9) asked PO Modesto for his name and shield number, which PO Modesto allegedly failed to provide (Allegation G: Abuse of Authority, \$87(2)(9) (Allegation H: Abuse of Authority, \$87(2)(9)). After \$87(2)(5) arrested, additional officers, including Lieutenant Matthew Oetting, arrived on scene. § 87(2)(b) was arrested for § 87(2)(b) (Board Review 13) and transported to the 67th Precinct stationhouse. At the 67th Precinct stationhouse, Captain Tolson spoke to \$87(2)(6) in the holding cell area and allegedly stated, "You're \$87(2)(b) You're the one that said my officers hit you? They say you're a fucking liar. You're just trying to get rich" (Allegation I: Discourtesy, § 87(2)(g) § 87(2)(g) § 87(2)(b)

The investigation obtained body-worn camera (BWC) footage of this incident; from PO James Lukeson (Board Review 01), PO Fabian Modesto (Board Review 02), PO Richard Ortega (Board Review 03), and Lieutenant Matthew Oetting (Board Review 04), the relevant aspects of which are discussed in further detail below.

Page 2

Findings and Recommendations

Allegation (A) Force – At East 26th Street and Newkirk Avenue in Brooklyn, Police Officer Fabian Modesto pointed his gun at §87(2)(b)

It is undisputed that \$87(2)(b) was operating a motorized scooter without a license plate or a helmet. It is undisputed that PO Lukeson was driving the officers' unmarked black Impala, with PO Modesto sitting in the front seat on the passenger's side and PO Ortega sitting in the back seat on the driver's side. It is undisputed that \$87(2)(b) fled from PO Modesto, PO Lukeson, and PO Ortega after being told to stop. It is undisputed that, in the vicinity of East 26th Street and Newkirk Avenue in Brooklyn, PO Modesto drew his gun after exiting the black Impala.

During his CCRB interview, \$87(2)(5) stated that he was driving his Tail-G electric scooter on East 26th Street, a one-way single lane road, between Newkirk Avenue and Avenue D in Brooklyn. At that time an unmarked NYPD black Impala carrying PO Lukeson, PO Modesto, and PO Ortega, suddenly drove in front of him. \$87(2)(5) swerved to the left and continued on East 26th Street. After the unmarked vehicle pulled to a stop, PO Modesto exited the vehicle and pointed his gun at \$87(2)(5) Upon seeing this, \$37(2)(5) made a U-turn on 26th Street and began to drive against traffic to the south away from PO Modesto and the Impala.

During their CCRB interviews, PO Lukeson, PO Modesto, and PO Ortega stated that, after observing \$87(2)(6) and drive against traffic on one-way streets, PO Lukeson drove the Impala after \$87(2)(6) to the north onto East 26th Street. PO Lukeson brought the Impala to a stop on East 26th Street to the south of \$87(2)(6) and his electric scooter. \$87(2)(6) then made a U-turn and began to drive his electric scooter against traffic at the Impala. PO Modesto stated that as \$100 was driving towards the Impala, PO Lukeson and PO Ortega exited the Impala and told \$100 to stop. Though during his CCRB interview, PO Lukeson stated that he himself did not exit the Impala, but affirmed that PO Ortega exited the vehicle and told \$100 cortega stood between the stopped Impala and a row of vehicles that were parallel parked on the western side of East 26th Street.

PO Modesto, PO Lukeson, and PO Ortega stated that \$37(2)(b) then rapidly drove through the gap between the parallel parked cars on the western side of East 26th Street and the stopped Impala, almost hitting PO Ortega in the process. PO Ortega stated that \$37(2)(b) came approximately two feet from striking him while passing through this space.

PO Modesto stated that he exited the passenger side of the Impala and moved on foot to the south. PO Modesto stated that \$87(2)(b) continued to drive to the south on East 26th Street against traffic, before turning onto the sidewalk on the western side of East 26th Street. PO Ortega, who was also pursuing \$87(2)(b) on foot, stated that he did not see \$87(2)(b) drive on the sidewalk, and that as \$87(2)(b) continued to the south he remained in the street. PO Modesto stated that he drew his gun, but did not point it at \$87(2)(b) PO Modesto drew his gun because he believed \$87(2)(b) to be fleeing from the police and because he saw \$87(2)(b) turn onto the sidewalk on the western side of East 26th Street and continue driving south, requiring pedestrians to get out of his way.

PO Modesto and PO Ortega also stated that, as \$37(2)(b) drove past them, saw that had only one hand on the handlebar of the electric scooter. PO Ortega stated that he believed \$37(2)(b) s hand was inside his waistband, and PO Modesto stated that he believed that s hand was inside the jacket \$37(2)(b) was wearing. PO Modesto believed that this second hand may have been on a weapon because \$37(2)(b) was fleeing from the police. PO Modesto and PO Ortega saw this as \$37(2)(b) was driving away from them in light conditions that they both described as dark.

Page 3

Neither PO Ortega nor PO Lukeson observed PO Modesto draw his gun, or what actions PO Modesto took once his gun was drawn.

PO Modesto completed a Threat, Resistance, and Injury (TRI) Worksheet for this incident (Board Review 06). However, PO Modesto stated that this TRI refers to the use of force at the intersection of Flatbush Avenue and East 26th Street. This use of force, which is the subject of **Allegation D**, occurred after a vehicular chase which culminated two blocks away from East 26th Street and Newkirk Avenue.

§ 87(4-b), § 87(2)(g)
§ 87(2)(g)
Allegation (B) Discourtesy – At East 26 th Street and Newkirk Avenue in Brooklyn, Police
Officer Fabian Modesto spoke discourteously to \$37(2)(b)
Allegation (C) Abuse of Authority – At East 26 th Street and Newkirk Avenue in Brooklyn,
Police Officer Fabian Modesto threatened \$87(2)(b) with the use of force.
\$87(2)(b) stated that, at the same time that PO Modesto exited the Impala and allegedly
pointed his gun at him, PO Modesto stated, "You better fucking stop before I shoot you in your
back."
PO Modesto stated that, immediately after exiting the Impala and drawing his gun, he
yelled at \$87(2)(b) to, "Get on the ground." PO Modesto also stated that he likely told \$87(2)(b)
to "fucking stop." PO Modesto stated that he did not remember verbally threatening to shoot
in the back.
PO Lukeson stated that he did not hear any officer state, "You better fucking stop before
I shoot you in your back," nor did he hear any officer verbally threaten to shoot or threaten to use
any amount of force on 887(2)(b) PO Ortega stated that he did not hear recall what, if anything, PO Lukeson stated to 887(2)(b) after 887(2)(b) drove past the Impala.
As discussed, there is no body-worn camera footage of this aspect of the incident.
In all circumstances, any application or use of force must be reasonable under the
circumstances, under the standards of <u>Patrol Guide Procedure 221-01</u> (Board Review 07).
Though officers are generally held to a higher standard of etiquette, the NYPD's
disciplinary decisions have found that otherwise discourteous statements that are made in the
context of stressful or dangerous law enforcement activities do not rise to the level of actionable
misconduct. NYPD Disciplinary Case No. 2013-10143 (Board Review 08).
§ 87(2)(g)

Page 4

Allegation (D) Force – At East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn, Police Officer Fabian Modesto pointed his gun at § 87(2)(b) Allegation (E) Force – At East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn, Police Officer Fabian Modesto used physical force against § 87(2)(b) It is undisputed that PO Ortega, PO Modesto, and PO Lukeson attempted to stop at East 26th Street and Newkirk Avenue, resulting in **Allegations A**, **B**, and **C** and that instead of stopping, \$87(2)(b) fled on his electric scooter down East 26th Street while driving the wrong away against traffic. As \$87(2)(b) fled, PO Modesto and PO Lukeson and pursued by vehicle on East 26th Street, while PO Ortega pursued on foot for two blocks until dismounted his electric scooter on East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue. stated that, after turning onto Flatbush Avenue and dismounting from his electric scooter, he took two "dimes" of marijuana that he had on his person and threw them away from him. § 87(2)(b) then laid on the sidewalk on the northern side of Flatbush Avenue, facedown on his stomach, with his arms and legs extended from his body. At that time, PO Modesto exited the Impala and walked towards 337(2)(5) PO Modesto drew his gun and pointed it at 3 as he approached him. PO Modesto then allegedly struck \$87(2)(6) s head with his knee. After striking § 87(2)(b) in the head, PO Modesto placed his gun between § 87(2)(b) s shoulder blades and held it against \$87(2)(b) s back until he placed \$87(2)(b) into handcuffs. The CCRB obtained \$87(2)(b) s medical records from \$87(2)(b) (Board Review 19, Board Review 20), where \$87(2)(b) was treated while in police custody. stated that a police officer had kneed him in the head, and he complained of a headache. CT scans identified that \$87(2)(b) s nose was fractured, with the fracture extending into the maxilla bone. § \$7(2)(b) was prescribed Tylenol and Reglan, and was then discharged within six hours. PO Modesto stated that, after PO Lukeson turned the Impala onto Flatbush Avenue in pursuit, he observed [27/2] kneeling in front of a parked vehicle on the northern side of Flatbush Avenue. PO Modesto stated that \$87(2)(b) had his hand in the parked vehicle's front passenger's side wheel well, which, combined with his prior observation of §87(2)(b) reaching inside of his jacket, made him think that \$87(2)(b) had a gun. PO Modesto then exited the Impala, whereupon he saw \$87(2)(6) slide a "plastic object" underneath the same parked vehicle. PO Modesto did not observe a bulge or any object in \$87(2)(b) s jacket pockets. As PO Modesto believed that \$87(2)(b) had a gun, he pointed his gun at \$87(2)(b) Modesto approached \$87(2)(b) who was laying on the ground, told \$87(2)(b) not to move, and placed his weapon on \$87(2)(b) for approximately ten seconds because he was not sure if still had a weapon. PO Modesto then holstered his weapon and put his knee on \$37(2)(b) back and shoulder area. PO Modesto and PO Lukeson, who at this point had exited the Impala, then placed § 87(2)(b) into handcuffs. PO Lukeson stated that, while approaching Flatbush Avenue, he was informed by PO Modesto that [887(2)] was lying on the ground near a vehicle. PO Lukeson pulled the Impala to a stop to allow for PO Modesto to exit. PO Lukeson then turned onto Flatbush Avenue, parked the Impala, and only then exited on foot. PO Lukeson estimated that one minute elapsed between when PO Modesto exited the vehicle and when he exited the Impala. At the time PO Lukeson first saw §87(2)(b) he was already on the ground in handcuffs. §87(2)(b) was yelling that PO Modesto had struck him in the head and hurt him. PO Lukeson did not observe PO Modesto with his gun out or pointed at § 87(2)(b) PO Ortega arrived at the intersection of East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue, and first

Page 5

saw § 87(2)(b) there after § 87(2)(b) had already been placed into handcuffs.

Both PO Modesto and PO Lukeson completed TRI reports for this incident (Board
Review 06). PO Lukeson reported that no force was used by any officer to place \$87(2)(b) under
arrest. PO Modesto, however, reported that he "placed knee on back/pointed gun of subject [sic],"
and that the reason for the force was that §87(2)(b) was a fleeing suspect. The TRI report contains
three photos of \$87(2)(b) none of which clearly show bleeding or visible injuries to \$87(2)(b)
head or nose. § 87(2)(b) s arrest photo (Board Review 21) also does not show blood or visible
injuries to \$87(2)(b) s head or nose.
As PO Modesto's BWC video begins, PO Modesto can clearly be seen to hold his gun in
his right hand. At the player timecode 0:04, §87(2)(b) is first seen in the footage, and he appears
to be lying on the ground on his stomach in a spread-eagle position, with his arms and legs
extended from his body. PO Modesto approaches \$87(2)(b) as he remains motionless on the
ground, pointing his gun at \$87(2)(b) At player timecode 0:08, PO Modesto presses his gun into
s lower back, as his left-hand rests on \$87(2)(b) s upper back. PO Modesto appears to
finally withdraw and holster his gun at player timecode 0:13, at the same time as PO Lukeson can
be seen to approach and place his knee on \$87(2)(b) support back. PO Modesto and PO Lukeson
then take \$87(2)(b) s hands behind his back and, at player timecode 0:37, PO Modesto places
into handcuffs. At no point during this interaction does \$87(2)(b) visibly resist in any way,
and at no point can the position of either of PO Modesto's knees on \$87(2)(6) s person be seen.
Patrol Guide Procedure 221-01 states that the decision to display and draw a gun should
be based on an articulable belief that the potential for serious physical injury is present (Board
Review 07). Further, upon determining that the potential for serious physical injury is no longer
present, the uniformed member of the service will holster the gun as soon as practicable.
Law enforcement encounters are dynamic, and the Patrol Guide requires NYPD officers
to adjust their use of force in accordance with changes in the circumstances of the encounter.
§ 87(2)(g)
§ 87(2)(g)
3 07(2)(9)
SONON Allowed that DO Made to the standard Sonon Allowed the standard Sono Allowed the sta
alleged that PO Modesto struck \$87(2)(b) with his knee while placing \$87(2)(b)
into custody. §87(2)(b) was diagnosed with a fractured nose following this incident. However, PC
Modesto stated that he only placed his knee on \$87(2)(b) s back to assume physical control over
Page 6

BWC footage does not capture the location of PO Modesto's knee at the time of the
alleged strike. § 87(2)(9)
Allegation (F) Discourtesy – At East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn, Police Officer Fabian Modesto spoke discourteously to §87(2)(b)
§87(2)(b) stated that after PO Modesto allegedly kneed him in the head, §87(2)(b)
verbally objected, and PO Modesto replied, "I didn't kick you in your fucking face." After
was handcuffed, \$87(2)(b) continued to state that PO Modesto struck him in his head, and
PO Modesto stated, "You're a fucking liar".
PO Modesto stated that he did not, while arresting §87(2)(b) state, "I didn't kick you in
your fucking face." However, PO Modesto affirmed that he possibly stated, "You're a fucking
liar," though he was not certain. PO Modesto stated that he "most likely" used "curse words" in
the context of commands to § 87(2)(b)
PO Lukeson, PO Ortega, and Lieutenant Oetting, who had arrived on scene by this point, did not hear any officer state, "I didn't kick you in your fucking face," or "You're a fucking liar,"
to \$87(2)(b)
PO Lukeson's BWC footage captures multiple statements made by PO Modesto during
and immediately after \$87(2)(b) was placed into handcuffs. At player timecode 0:30, as \$87(2)(b)
is being handcuffed without resistance, §87(2)(b) states that PO Modesto kneed him in the face.
PO Modesto replies, "No I didn't, shut the fuck up!" At player timecode 1:16, as PO Modesto
remains on top of \$87(2)(b) continues to state that PO Modesto kneed him in the face.
PO Modesto replies, "I didn't fucking knee him in the face. Relax."
As per Patrol Guide Procedure 200-02 (Board Review 09), the values of the NYPD
include the pledge to "maintain a higher standard of integrity than is generally expected of
others" and to "respect the dignity of each individual and render [their] services with courtesy and
civility" Though the NYPD's disciplinary decisions have found that profane remarks made during
a stressful situation or while trying to get a chaotic situation under control are not misconduct,
they have limited this exception. In NYPD Disciplinary Case 2017-17005, an officer who replied,
"Shut the fuck up," to an individual complaining about the officers' use of force was found guilty
of misconduct, as there was no evidence that the individual was trying to interfere in police action
(Board Review 10).
§ 87(2)(g)
Allegation (G) Abuse of Authority - At East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn,
Police Officer Fabian Modesto refused to provide his name to § 87(2)(b)

Page 7

Allegation (H) Abuse of Authority – At East 26th Street and Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn,
Police Officer Fabian Modesto refused to provide his shield number to 887(2)(b)
stated that, shortly after being arrested and before being removed from the
scene, he asked PO Modesto to provide his name and shield number. PO Modesto ignored
and did not verbally provide his name or shield number.
PO Modesto, PO Ortega, and PO Lukeson did not recall if \$87(2)(b) requested the name
or shield number of any officer.
PO Modesto's BWC footage, which recorded until after \$87(2)(b) was placed in a police
vehicle for transport to the stationhouse, did not capture the alleged request for, or refusal to
provide, PO Modesto's name and shield number.
stated that he requested the name and shield number of PO Modesto before
being removed from Flatbush Avenue. However, BWC footage that captured the relevant time
period did not find any ignored request for a name and shield number. \$87(2)(9)
Allegation (I) Discourtesy – At the 67th Precinct stationhouse in Brooklyn, Captain Tolson
spoke discourteously to § 87(2)(b)
stated that he was transported to the 67 th Precinct stationhouse and lodged into
a holding cell, where he reported that he had pain to his nose and head. Approximately two hours
after being lodged in the holding cell area of the 67 th Precinct stationhouse, Captain Tolson,
identified by the investigation, came alone to speak with \$87(2)(b) Captain Tolson allegedly
stated, "You're \$87(2)(b) You're the one that said my officers hit you? They say you're a fucking
liar. You're just trying to get rich."
The NYPD Booking, Arraignment, and Disposition System identified \$87(2)(b)
as present in the holding cell at the same time as \$87(2)(b) However, despite numerous contact
attempts to \$87(2)(b) he remained unavailable to the investigation.
Captain Tolson testified that he spoke to \$87(2)(b) in the holding cells at the 67 th Precinct
stationhouse. Captain Tolson stated that he interviewed \$87(2)(b) in regards his allegations of
excessive force, and kept his questions narrowly focused to those allegations. Captain Tolson
stated that he did not recall if he heard any officer call \$87(2)(b) a "fucking liar," or if he or any
other officer called \$87(2)(b) a "fucking liar."
§ 87(2)(g)
3 01 (2)(9)
§ 87(4-b), § 87(2)(g)
5 O. (1 J) 5 O. (2 / (3) /

Page 8

§ 87(4-l	o), § 87(2)(g)
ani i	Civilian and Officer CCRB Histories
	is the second CCRB complaint to which \$87(2)(b) has been a party (Board lew 11).
	EW 11). ○ §87(2)(b)
,	3 01 (2)(0)
PO I	Modesto has been a member-of-service for nine years and has been a subject in si
	RB cases and nineteen allegations, none of which have been substantiated.
§ 87(2)	—
PO I	Lukeson has been a member-of-service for sixteen years and has been a subject in
	n cases and nineteen allegations, of which five have been substantiated:
	200716565 involved substantiated allegations of stop, question, search (of
	person) against PO Lukeson. The Board recommended charges and the NYP
	gave command discipline.
	200901903 involved substantiated allegations of refusal to provide name/shie
	number and discourtesy word against PO Lukeson. The Board recommended
	charges and the NYPD gave command discipline.
	§ 87(2)(g)
PO 0	Ortega has been a member-of-service for six years and has been a subject in three
CCF	RB cases and six allegations, none of which have been substantiated. §87(2)(9)
	ain Tolson has been a member-of-service for seventeen years and has been a sub
in si	x cases and ten allegations, of which one has been substantiated:
	201007012 involved a substantiated allegation of authorizing improper
	summonses against Captain Tolson. The Board recommended instructions an
	the NYPD concurred.
	§ 87(2)(g)

Mediation, Civil and Criminal Histories
 This complaint was not suitable for mediation.

Page 9

§ 87(2)(b)			
	ovember 11, 2020, the New of Claim being filed in rela	York City Office of the Comptration to this complaint.	oller has no record of
Squad No.:	<u>14</u>		
Investigator:	Matthew Donaghy Signature	Inv. Matthew Donaghy Print Title & Name	March 2, 2021 Date
Squad Leader: _	Cassandra Fenkel Signature	IM Cassandra Fenkel Print Title & Name	March 2, 2021 Date
Reviewer: _	Signature	Print Title & Name	Date