

ATP – Culminating Reflection Project

Scoring Notes for Rubric Usage to Assess ATP Manuscript Example

Additional Notes Relevant to ATP Manuscript Example:

The example does not include an “Abstract” page as deemed required per Kettering’s “Written Thesis Document Requirements”.

Scoring Notes Per Rubric for Assessment of Manuscript Content:

I. Connectivity of Skills and Outcomes

“Relevant professional goals and skills are clearly identified, analyzed, and explained in relation to both undergraduate career and long term personal, professional, and academic goals. Connections are strong.”

Scoring Notes:

-- Goals should be specific and detailed.

--Avoid Vague, Over General, and Unexplained Aspirations

Example (Weak): As an undergraduate I wanted to develop my skills at communication, become a good leader, and team building.

Example (Stronger): As a mechanical engineering major with aspirations for a management position, my goal has been to develop my skills in cross-functional teamwork and professional communication. When I came to Kettering University I sought out experiences that would help me learn how to communicate effectively with team managers in production, sales, and information technology.

This is better, more specific, as a starting point that would be developed fully in the introduction. What the writer means by these terms and the specific ways these skill are manifest in their development will be developed through examples in the chapters.

II. Rationale/ Motivation for Specific Projects

“Persuasive and compelling rationale provided for why all of the selected learning experiences and artifacts are included.”

Scoring Notes:

--Needs to be a specific and detailed explanation *of the reasons why* the writer chose these experiences

--Should link goals with experiences to demonstrate how experiences align with the writer's stated professional goals.

Example (Weak):

I will discuss my work for a cooperative employer and in a manufacturing capstone design class, MECH-472. These experiences gave me adequate opportunities to increase my ability to communicate and to problem solve.

Example (Stronger):

I came to Kettering as a strong student with limited "real world" experience. I knew that if I was going to become a successful mechanical engineer and project leader, I would need to develop my ability to communicate with a wide variety of professionals from different backgrounds. Two of the experiences that have best helped me develop my skills at technical communication were at my cooperative employer, and extracurricular work with SAE Baja.

III. Context of Selected Learning Experiences

"Author not only provides context for all of the selected learning experiences, including a description of the assignment and criteria for success for each selected learning experiences but also relates work to broader academic context beyond an individual course or learning experience."

Scoring Notes:

-- A strong explanation of context will include very specific and detailed descriptions of the assignments including criteria for success. Context primarily descriptive.

--Relate assignment to other academic and professional contexts experience.

Example (Weak)

My cooperative employer is a tier-one automotive supplier. I was part of the Advanced team as well as the Process Engineering team. My responsibilities included but were not limited to project management, product design, research and development, validation, and value analysis/value engineering.

IV. Progress Towards Self-Actualization

“Author presents an introspective and insightful discussion of own personal, academic, and professional growth during undergraduate studies, with creative and unique insights regarding meeting their own full potential.”

Scoring Notes:

--Strong response *reflects* on experiences to support, clarify, and enhance discussion of professional and academic growth.

--Whereas the discussion of the experience and its context is primarily descriptive, this section provides analysis and evaluation of the nature of the experience.

--Avoids superficial reflections --“By working with a number of people from different backgrounds, I became better at talking to professionals in a work environment”

--Strong reflection draws on specific events and experiences as the basis for developing new insights about the writer’s growth.

For example, one author described a project worked on in which a team developed safety procedures for the use of a fork lift in the plant. The author detailed a review of this project that identified its strengths and weaknesses as a particularly important moment for his development as an effective communicator.

V. Argument

“The main arguments are valid, systematic, well supported, and contextualized effectively.”

Scoring Notes:

--Includes *clear claims, sufficient support (evidence), and insightful analysis.*

--Argument should develop through a logical progression of ideas.

--Should be specific. A common problem is for students is to identify a fairly general goal like, “I wanted to develop my ability to communicate with different people” and then cherry pick a few instances that describe ways they interacted with others.

--Stronger thesis will discuss specific experiences to clarify, expand, and enhance their discussion of their goals. For example, a student who identifies technical communication as a goal may use one experience to discuss their ability to write to a broad audience, another to discuss new media, and another to discuss writing for highly technical manuals. In the end, the student may conclude that effective technical communication is multi-faceted. By going from writing to multi-faceted writing, the author’s argument has progressed.

VI. Use of Evidence to Support Argument

“Evidence is appropriately selected and the author fully exploits the richness of the data/evidence/ ideas.”

Scoring Notes

--The writer should use evidence that is sufficient, relevant, and appropriate to support the claims they are making.

--Evidence should be drawn from a variety of sources.

--Evidence should be relevant to the focus of the thesis. For the Alternative Thesis Project, then, students should select evidence that is best suited to their discussion of their goals.

--A student recently produced a thesis draft in which he went into great detail describing the success of a quality control project in terms of the overall objectives of the project and its contribution to the firm. While some of this discussion was appropriate as showcased a positive experience for the student, much of the information was unnecessary and took attention away from the focus of the thesis (student goals).