



Question 3:

Using only the five axioms and two theorems stated above as assumptions, prove that there are at least four students in the club.

Justify why each line of your proof follows from the assumptions or previous lines.

[Note: your proof may not require the use of all of the axioms and theorems; do not worry if one or more of the axioms/theorems seem irrelevant to your answer to this question.]

Prove:

Since proving “there are at least 4 student in the club” is the same as proving “there cannot less than 4 student in the club” \cap “there can be 4 student in the club”;

\

- **Part 1: Proving there can be 4 member in a club**

Let K representing the club, assume there are 4 members in the K , the members are x, y, z, w such that $\exists! x, y, z, w \in K$.

Given by axiom ©, every pair of student have one committee in common $\therefore \exists$ committee A, B, C, D, E, F such that $\{\exists! x, y \in A \cap \exists! x, z \in B \cap \exists! x, w \in C \cap \exists! y, z \in D \cap \exists! y, w \in E \cap \exists! z, w \in F\}$

The relation can be shown in the following graph

Club	Committee	student
K	A	x, y
K	B	x, z
K	C	x, w
K	D	y, z
K	E	y, w
K	F	z, w

Checking for each axiom:

(a) Since there are 4 student in the club, the statement follows the axiom a

(b) In this case every committee is made of 2 student, the statement follows the axiom b

© In this case for each pair of student $\{x, y; x, z; x, w; y, z; y, w; z, w\}$ there is one committee every pair both serve which is $\{A, B, C, D, E, F\}$, the statement follows the axiom c

(d) Here no committee is no such committee G such that $\{x, y, z, w \in G\}$, the statement follows the axiom d

(e) For committee A , z, w are members that is not in it, both z, w have one and only committee F such that $\{x, y \in A \cap x, y \in F\}$; similarly, for $\{x, z \in B\} \{y, z \in C\} \{x, z \in D\} \{y, w \in E\} \{z, w \in F\}$, there are respectively $\{x, z \in E\} \{x, w \in D\} \{y, z \in C\} \{y, w \in B\} \{z, w \in A\}$, the statement follows the axiom e/
 \therefore the previous distribution of 4 student into 6 committees in 1 club flows all the axioms.

\therefore the statement is true.

• Part 2: Proving there cannot be only 3 members in a club

Let K representing the club, assume there are 3 members in the K , the members are x, y, z such that $\exists! x, y, z \in K$.

Given by axiom ©, every pair of student have one committee in common: $\therefore \exists$ committees A, B, C , such that $\{A : x, y \in A\} \cap \{B : x, z \in B\} \cap \{C : y, z \in C\}$;

Given by axiom (d), there is no single committee containing all the members of the club $\therefore \nexists$ committee containing members x, y, z at the same time

Given by axiom (e), \forall members not in a committee, \exists a committee that none of the members in first committee are contained: \exists committee $\therefore \exists$ committees

D, E, F such that $\{z \in D, x, y \in D\} \cap \{y \in E, x, z \in E\} \cap \{x \in F, y, z \in F\}$

Also given by the axiom (e), there is only one committee containing the members not in the committee \therefore here $\{x \in C \cap x \in D \cap x \in E\}$ violate the axiom given

$\therefore \nexists$ a club K made of exactly three members

- **Part 3: Proving there cannot be only 2 members in a club**

Let K representing the club, assume there are 2 members in the K , the members are x, y such that $\exists! x, y \in K$.

Given by the axiom © for each pair of student, there is one committee they both serve $\therefore \exists$ such committee A such that $\{x, y \in A\}$

Given by the axiom (d) no committee can have all the student in club \therefore the existence of $\{\exists! x, y \in A \cap \exists! x, y \in K\}$ violate the axioms

$\therefore \nexists$ a club K made of exactly two members

\

- **Part 4: Proving there cannot be only 1 members in a club**

Let K representing the club, assume there are 1 members in the K , the members are x such that $\exists! x \in K$.

Given by axiom (a), there are at least two student in one club \therefore the assumption that $\{\exists! x \in\}$ violate the axiom

$\therefore \nexists$ a club K made of exactly one member

Here, in Part 1, there is such configuration that follows all the configurations, therefore proves the first statement "there can be four student in the club";

Since number of student is discrete, there cannot be non-interger number of student such as a half student or a quater of student, and cannot be less than zero, "less than 4 student" is the same as "one or two or three student". Part 1,2,3 combines and proves "there cannot be less than four student in a club".

Therefore "there are at least four student in the club" is a true statement \square
