



---

Review

Reviewed Work(s): We are playing football: sport and postcolonial subjectivity, Panapompom, Papua New Guinea by Will Rollason

Review by: Harry Walker

Source: *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, Vol. 19, No. 2 (June 2013), pp. 437-438

Published by: Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/42001624>

Accessed: 08-10-2023 07:57 +00:00

---

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

*Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*

'swarm-like' presence of the shamanic spirits themselves in all their assumed multiplicity.

DAMIAN WALTER *School of Oriental and African Studies*

ROLLASON, WILL. *We are playing football: sport and postcolonial subjectivity, Panopompom, Papua New Guinea*. x, 250 pp., map, figs, illus., bibliogr. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011. £39.99 (cloth)

It is occasionally suggested that sport is a sorely neglected topic in anthropology, though a recent surge of interest would seem well on the way to rectifying this. Rollason's innovative account of football on the island of Panopompom, Papua New Guinea, is an intelligent and nuanced contribution to this movement – even if one ultimately senses that this is not, in fact, a book 'about' football as such, so much as an attempt to use football as a prism for examining the ways in which Panopompom people today seek to manage and transform their sense of self in a globalizing world. There is relatively little ethnographic description or analysis of the sport itself; the reader is instead offered fascinating reflections on, among other things, the considerable efforts made by one team to procure matching uniforms; the occasional outbreaks of violence on the pitch, provoking much soul-searching and moral debate; and racializing discourses on 'natives' as opposed to *dimdins* or 'white people', for example as they figure in projects of 'development'.

The fact that football does not form part of Panopompom 'culture', and indeed is explicitly seen as external and foreign by Panopompom people themselves, is central to the story being told here and precisely what makes its performance of such interest for all concerned. The knowledge of 'custom' that pervades activities such as ritual, canoe manufacture, or kinship relations is quite consciously opposed to the 'law' that is held to govern football. For this reason, playing football – or, more precisely, *appearing* to play football, that is, creating a satisfactory visual image for a real or imagined audience – is all about becoming 'developed', like the white people with whom the game originates. The question being posed here, in other words, is not what the people of Panopompom have done to football, in the sense of adapting or incorporating it into their own local 'culture' (the act of contextualization, as it were), but rather what playing football has

done, or might do, to rework people's understandings of their place in the world (which involves a kind of decontextualization). The discussions of the development industry cleverly tie football in to other aspects of life on the island, for example through the concept of 'counterparts', prevalent in development discourse, in which black people are trained eventually to 'replace' white people. In examining how football makes them who they are, Rollason develops an insightful analysis of Panopompom subjectivity through the lens of poststructuralist critical theory, arguing that football effectively disembods subjects from 'culture', conceived of as local and specific, displacing them from their past and recontextualizing them as cosmopolitans. As such, his approach runs almost precisely counter to a dominant anthropological approach to sport at least since the classic film *Trobriland cricket* (1975), in which this gentleman's game is thoroughly reworked to fit local cultural idioms. This leads to reflections on important broader questions about the practices of cultural contextualization that lie at the core of the anthropological endeavour.

This is a compelling argument, though one wonders about the untold stories that might complement the portrait of football as generic and universalizing. Rollason emphasizes the essential similarity of football as it is played on Panopompom and elsewhere, including the United Kingdom, but occasionally hints at differences in, for example, playing style, and pursuing these further might lead the analysis in a different (if more conventional) direction. A more detailed exploration of the history of organized team sports, both in Papua New Guinea and in Western Europe, would also help to evaluate their degree of foreignness to the former while embedding them in the modernist nation-building projects of the latter, and to recognizable 'football cultures' that may ultimately be far from homogeneous. The codification and standardization of football, like the development industry, could presumably be considered as a part of the specific cultural formations of modern Western Europe, even if these now appear to many as global and cosmopolitan. The analysis of violence is intriguing, and neatly shows how strategies of self-improvement are often condemned to fail, though I wonder whether on-field violence could not also be seen as something akin to a strategy of resistance, to the modernizing project and the hegemony of 'law'. Recognizing the multiplicity of possible interpretations of the

phenomenon of football might add ethnographic complexity to what is nevertheless already an insightful analysis, one which opens up a number of stimulating lines of inquiry that significantly push forward the anthropology of sport while also managing to extend well beyond it.

HARRY WALKER *London School of Economics and Political Science*

SKINNER, JONATHAN (ed.). *Writing the dark side of travel*. ix, 209 pp., illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2012. £15.50 (paper)

Why do travellers seek out destinations marked by violence and suffering? What is the allure of these 'dark' sites, and how should they be represented? Do travellers' encounters with the 'dark side' ultimately lead to the commodification of human misery and a blunting of historical consciousness? Or might such encounters inspire human beings towards greater sensitivity, creativity, and change? These are the central questions explored in this unusual, yet thought-provoking, interdisciplinary collection of essays.

Skinner probes the allure of such sites by reviewing the literature on dark tourism and 'thanatourism'. As he notes, while some scholars argue that dark travel 'has evolved for millennia, particularly out of the Christian cult of death and preoccupation with pain and suffering for our sins', others propose that its appeal stems from particular changes associated with late modernity. Dark tourism, he suggests, may be symptomatic of the affective estrangement that characterizes everyday life in the 'postemotional society' (Stjepan G. Meštrović, *Postemotional society*, 1997). Moffat, by contrast, questions whether human beings are drawn to 'the horrific' by an unsettling 'morbid curiosity', or by a 'more compassionate desire to acknowledge the intensity of such atrocity'. Similarly, Isle argues that tourists' attraction to dark places may have less to do with a 'ghoulish' interest 'in death and disaster' than it does with experiencing a sense of emotional engagement and identification that can often take visitors by surprise. Though written from different vantage-points, all of these essays prompt us to ask: Does the allure of dark travel primarily stem from its ability to facilitate an encounter with a suffering Other? Or might it also derive from the way it entices, if not requires, travellers to re-encounter *themselves* through a searching interrogation of their own motives, desires, and emotions?

The idea that the appeal of trauma is linked to quests for self-discovery and self-transformation is also richly explored in the essays by Egan, Elliott, Nagle, and Murphy. Murphy provides a moving analysis of Aboriginal women from 'the Stolen Generation' who attempt to relieve their suffering by journeying back to the childhood institutions in which they were abused. While the journey is cathartic, she also notes the pressure these women feel to synchronize their personal narratives of suffering with public ones. This opens the door to a much larger set of questions regarding the politics of representation, a theme which is pursued with great nuance by other contributors to the volume (Hepburn, Nagle, Cooke, Walker).

For instance, in examining how trauma is used as a tourism marketing strategy in Belfast, Nagle explores the precarious line between representations of the city that promote a 'social amnesia' and those that remain 'too fixated' on the traumas of the past, thereby making possibilities for future peace and healing less likely. As he guides us through the debates surrounding the branding of Belfast, he expertly captures the complex ways in which trauma can emerge as both an impediment to, and a lucrative source of, value creation. Indeed, from my perspective, one of the greatest strengths of this volume is that it demonstrates how experiences of trauma take on multiple forms of significance as both individuals and collectivities attempt to mobilize them towards ends that are at once political, ethical, commercial, and even therapeutic.

Throughout these essays we discover that debates about the representation of suffering are intimately tied to the forms of value they are perceived as generating. This is rendered particularly clear in the essays by Cooke and Walker. Both examine how dark travel writers negotiate the tensions between upholding an ethical commitment to memory and documentation, on the one hand, and perpetuating a highly profitable 'pornography of suffering', on the other.

Of the nine essays gathered in this collection, some are truly excellent and others are less compelling, mostly for stylistic reasons. Yet all of the contributions are thought-provoking. In fact, reading this collection has the quality of participating in a journey. The greatest insights and discoveries come from actively exploring and mapping out the fertile connections between the different essays. If readers are willing to do this, they will, I think, ultimately find that the book provides a very stimulating engagement with both the dark side of travel,